



Constitutive Model Parameter Study for Armor Steel and Tungsten Alloys

by Stephen J. Schraml

ARL-RP-351

January 2012

A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011.

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.

NOTICES

Disclaimers

The findings in this report are not to be construed as an official Department of the Army position unless so designated by other authorized documents.

Citation of manufacturer's or trade names does not constitute an official endorsement or approval of the use thereof.

Destroy this report when it is no longer needed. Do not return it to the originator.

Army Research Laboratory

Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005-5066

ARL-RP-351

January 2012

Constitutive Model Parameter Study for Armor Steel and Tungsten Alloys

Stephen J. Schraml Weapons and Materials Research Directorate, ARL

A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011.

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.

Index products for the object of a diamaters in semand to average 1 hours per sequence bedaug the time for revenues, and any other sequence in the section of the section internation. Section 1000000000000000000000000000000000000]	REPORT DO	OCUMENTATI	ION PAGE		Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188		
	Public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing the burden, to Department of Defense, Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports (0704-0188), 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington, VA 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to any penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number. PLEASE DO NOT RETURN YOUR FORM TO THE ABOVE ADDRESS.							
January 2012 Reprint 13-16 June 2011 4. TTLE AND NOTETLE So. CONTRACT NUMBER Constitutive Model Parameter Study for Armor Steel and Tungsten Alloys So. GRANT NUMBER 5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER Sc. ONTRACT NUMBER 5c. AUTHOR(S) Sc. FROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER Stephen J. Schraml Sc. TASK NUMBER 7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) Sc. TASK NUMBER 9. SPONSORINGMONITORING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) Sc. TASK NUMBER 13. SUPPLEMENTARY WOTES ARL -RP-351 14. SPONSORINGMONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) In SPONSORINGMONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSORINGMONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSORINGMONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSORINGMONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Areprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13-16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rod sensets the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rod seperimental prediction of protection depth over the other possible combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters on the nu	1. REPORT DATE (DD-M	1М-ҮҮҮҮ)	2. REPORT TYPE			3. DATES COVERED (From - To)		
A TITLE AND SUBTITLE Constitutive Model Parameter Study for Armor Steel and Tungsten Alloys Constitutive Model Parameter Study for Armor Steel and Tungsten Alloys Se, BRORAM FUMBER Se, BRORAM FUMBER Se, BRORAM FUMBER Se, BRORAM FUMBER Se, ARD FUMBER Se, ARD FUMBER Se, TASK NUMBER SECONTARCT NUMSER SECONTAR	January 2012		Reprint			13–16 June 2011		
6. AUTHOR(S) Sb. GRANT NUMBER 5. AUTHOR(S) Sc. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER 5. AUTHOR(S) Sd. PROJECT NUMBER 5. AUTHOR(S) Sd. PROJECT NUMBER 5. TASK NUMBER Sd. PROJECT NUMBER 5. MORK UNIT NUMBER Sd. PROJECT NUMBER 5. MORK UNIT NUMBER Sd. PROJECT NUMBER 5. MORK UNIT NUMBER Sd. PROJECT NUMBER 5. SPONSORING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) E. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION RAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of fungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for the tanget from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed than o single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for the tanget from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for the tanget for approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters fo	4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE Constitutive Model	E Parameter Stu	dv for Armor Stee	5a. CO		5a. CONTRACT NUMBER		
6. AUTHOR(S) Sc. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER 5. AUTHOR(S) 5d. PROJECT NUMBER Stephen J. Schraml 5d. PROJECT NUMBER 5. VORK UNIT NUMBER 5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER 5. VORK UNIT NUMBER 5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER 10. S. Army Research Laboratory ATTN: RDRL-WML-H ARL-RP-351 Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005-5066 10. SPONSORIMONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSORIMONITOR'S AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSORIMONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters so the numerical simulation of tungsten rold penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter sole study raved for approximately 1000 – 2000 mys. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook codes, Parameters for the tungsten rol anglen-to diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study rayed from approximately 1000 – 2000 mys. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for the tungsten rol anglen-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study rayed from approximately 1000 – 2000 mys. The study revealed thato no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameter	Constitutive model	r urumeter Stu		i una i ungoton i	moys	5b. GRANT NUMBER		
6. AUTHOR(8) 5d. PROJECT NUMBER Stephen J. Schraml 5d. PROJECT NUMBER 5r. VORK UNIT NUMBER 5d. VORK UNIT NUMBER 5r. VORK UNIT NUMBER 5d. VORK UNIT NUMBER 5d. Stephen J. Schraml 5d. VORK UNIT NUMBER 5d. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(5) AND ADDRESS(E5) 8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(5) AND ADDRESS(E5) 5d. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(5) AND ADDRESS(E5) 10. SPONSORING/MONITOR'S ACCONYM(5) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT ARL-RP-351 Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of ungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod sensers for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod sensers for MHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod senser provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for the study raved form approximately 1000 – 200 mys. The study ravealed thath to single combination of Johnson-Cook model						5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER		
Stephen J. Schraml 56. TASK NUMBER 51. WORK UNIT NUMBER 56. TASK NUMBER 51. WORK UNIT NUMBER 51. WORK UNIT NUMBER 7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 8. PEPORT NUMBER ATTN: RDR.U-WIL-H ARL-RP-351 Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005-5066 10. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSOR/ING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for the tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for HA, two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for the tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for HA, two sets of Joh	6. AUTHOR(S)					5d. PROJECT NUMBER		
5e. TASK NUMBER 5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER 5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER 7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) U.S. Army Research Laboratory ATTN: RDRL-WML-H Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005-5066 9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 n/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination saross the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 19.	Stephen J. Schraml							
5. WORK UNIT NUMBER 5. WORK UNIT NUMBER 1. S. Army Research Laboratory ATTN: RDRL-WL-H Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005-5066 3. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 11. SPONSOR/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters for the underlead studiation of fungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rode length-to-dimeter (L/D) rulos, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rode superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters for the tungsten rode superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination acros the full						5e. TASK NUMBER		
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER U.S. Army Research Laboratory ATTN: RDRL-WML-H ADDRL-WML-H ARL-RP-351 3. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncassville, CT, 13–16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of turgsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameters on the numerical simulation of ungsten rod material (LD) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS 19. SETRACT 19. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Siephen J. Schramil 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 11. LIMITA						5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER		
ARL-RP-351 ARL-RP-351 ARL-RP-351 ARL-RP-351 ARL-RP-351 ARL-RP-351 ARL-RP-351 ARL-RP-351 ARL-RP-351 III. SPONSORIMONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) III. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYMES UPPORTAINTS INTO THE SUPPORTAILS INTO THE SUPPORT OF A THE SUPPORT OF A THE SUPPORT OF A THE SUPPORT OF A STRACT ON OF: III. ASSTRACT C. THIS PAGE UNCLASSIFICATION OF: IIII. ASSTRACT C. THIS PAGE UNCLASSIFICATION OF: IIII. ASSTRACT C. THIS PAGE UNCLASSIFICATION OF: IIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIII	7. PERFORMING ORGA	NIZATION NAME((S) AND ADDRESS(ES)		8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER		
Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005-5066 9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(\$) AND ADDRESS(E\$) 10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACCONYM(\$) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACCONYM(\$) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVALLABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A computational parameters for K parameters so the nume	ATTN: RDRL-WM	ILaboratory IL-H				ARL-RP-351		
9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) 10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S) 11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 18. NUMBER OF PAGES LUC 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml 18. TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include area code) 410-278-6556 100 278-6556	Aberdeen Proving C	Ground, MD 2	21005-5066					
11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S) 12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 18. NUMBER OF PAGES 18 19a. NAME of RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml 19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include area code) 410-278-6556	9. SPONSORING/MONIT	ORING AGENCY	NAME(S) AND ADDRE	ESS(ES)		10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S)		
12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified								
12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. 13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified						NUMBER(S)		
Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.	12. DISTRIBUTION/AVA	ILABILITY STATE	MENT					
13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT 0. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE UU 18 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml 19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include area code) 410-278-6556	Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.							
A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011. 14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combination across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 18. NUMBER 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION Unclassified 18. NUMBER OF PAGES 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified 11. LIMITATION UN 18. 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml	13. SUPPLEMENTARY N	NOTES						
14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE UU 18 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml 19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include area code) 410-278-6556	A reprint from the Society for Experimental Mechanics 2011 Annual Conference and Exposition on Experimental and Applied Mechanics, Uncasville, CT, 13–16 June 2011.							
A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified	14. ABSTRACT							
parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled nomogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration.15. SUBJECT TERMS16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT Unclassified18. NUMBER OF PAGES UU19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schramla. REPORT Unclassifiedb. ABSTRACT Unclassifiedc. THIS PAGE UU18194. TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include area code) 410-278-6556	14. ABSTRACT A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model							
parameter's pare involved two sets of somison-cook indeer parameter's for RFPA, two sets of somison-cook parameter's for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified	parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The							
velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 – 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION of ABSTRACT Unclassified 17. LIMITATION of ABSTRACT Unclassified 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml 19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (<i>Include area code</i>) 410-278-6556	parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for KHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking							
of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT Unclassified 18. NUMBER OF PAGES UU 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml 19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (<i>Include area code</i>) 410-278-6556	velocities considere	d in the study	ranged from appro	$\Delta x_{\rm interval} = (1/2)^{1} = 1000$	2000 m/s. The	study revealed that no single combination		
combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration. 15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 17. LIMITATION OF: 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified	of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible							
15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified	combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material							
15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified	model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration.							
15. SUBJECT TERMS impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation 16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PAGE Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified								
16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT18. NUMBER OF ABSTRACT19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schramla. REPORTb. ABSTRACTc. THIS PAGE10018019b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include area code) 410-278-6556UnclassifiedUnclassifiedUnclassified190180190	impact, penetration, deformation, fracture, computer simulation							
a. REPORTb. ABSTRACTc. THIS PAGEUU18Description of SciencianUnclassifiedUnclassifiedUnclassifiedUU18410-278-6556	16. SECURITY CLASSIF	ICATION OF:		17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT	18. NUMBER OF PAGES	19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON Stephen J. Schraml		
Unclassified Unclassified Unclassified 00 18 410-278-6556	a. REPORT b.	ABSTRACT	c. THIS PAGE	TITT	19	19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include area code)		
	Unclassified Un	nclassified	Unclassified	00	10	410-278-6556		

andard Form 298 (Rev. 8/98) Prescribed by ANSI Std. Z39.18

Constitutive Model Parameter Study for Armor Steel and Tungsten Alloys

Stephen J. Schraml U.S. Army Research Laboratory Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21005-5066

Abstract

A computational parametric study was performed to assess the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the numerical simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. The parameter space involved two sets of Johnson-Cook model parameters for RHA, two sets of Johnson-Cook parameters for the tungsten rod material, four tungsten rod length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios, and two continuum mechanics codes. Striking velocities considered in the study ranged from approximately 1000 - 2000 m/s. The study revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook model parameters provides superior overall prediction of penetration depth over the other possible combinations across the full range of rod L/D considered. The study provides valuable guidance on the selection of material model parameters future studies of kinetic energy penetration.

1 Introduction

Numerical simulation is used extensively in the development of explosive warheads, kinetic energy (KE) penetrators, and armors to defeat such threats [1]. Simulations, when combined with judicious use of experimentation, can provide valuable insight into complex weapon/target interactions that is not possible through experimentation alone. The physics of shock wave propagation through various types of media, high-rate behavior of materials, and material failure are all essential characteristics of such interactions that must be captured in the computational methods.

This paper documents an extensive computational study to assess the influence of existing Johnson-Cook [2] constitutive model parameters on the simulation of tungsten rods penetrating rolled homogeneous armor (RHA) steel targets. One of the initial goals of the effort was to identify a "best possible" combination of tungsten and RHA model parameters to use for simulations across a wide range of conditions of interest to the development of KE penetrators and armor systems that are effective against KE penetrators. The study considered tungsten rods with length-to-diameter (L/D) ratios of 5, 10, and 15, and striking velocities of approximately 1000 - 2000 m/s. The study also included an L/D=30 rod at a striking velocity of 1500 m/s.

The metric used to evaluate the computational results was total penetration depth normalized by penetrator length (P/L). The computational results were compared to experimental data in the case of rods of L/D=5, 10, and 15. For the L/D=30 rods, the simulation results were compared to an empirical fit to an experimental database.

The study results revealed that no single combination of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters produces the best penetration depth results across the full range of parameters considered. However, the study does provide guidance on the use of constitutive model parameters when operating within the parameter space considered. This work also provides a foundation for additional study to include the evaluation of additional constitutive models, fracture models, etc.

2 Johnson-Cook Constitutive Model

The Johnson-Cook constitutive model describes the flow stress (σ) of a metal as a function of plastic strain (ε_p), plastic strain rate ($\dot{\varepsilon}_p$), and temperature (T), as defined in equations 1 and 2. In this model, the terms A, B, C, n and m are model parameters (constants), T_{melt} is the melt temperature of the material, T_{room} is the ambient temperature, and $\dot{\varepsilon}_0$ is a reference plastic strain rate. The model parameters are typically derived from material characterization experiments through a fitting process intended to reproduce the trends observed in the characterization experiments while minimizing error.

$$\sigma = \left(A + B\varepsilon_p^n\right) \left(1 + Cln\frac{\dot{\varepsilon}_p}{\dot{\varepsilon}_0}\right) (1 - T'^m) \tag{1}$$

$$T' = \frac{T - T_{room}}{T_{melt} - T_{room}} \tag{2}$$

2.1 RHA Model Parameters

RHA steel is a commonly used material in armor systems and ballistic testing. It is also a *de facto* standard in the assessment of ballistic performance. Penetration performance of KE penetrators, explosively formed penetrators, and shaped charge jets is typically described in terms of their depth of penetration into a thick stack of RHA target plates. Furthermore, the protection capability of an armor system is typically described in terms of "RHA equivalence" which typically represents the areal density of the armor system relative to the equivalent areal density of RHA that would be required to have the same level of protection. For these reasons, the ability to accurately model the performance of RHA in ballistic events is critical to many penetrator and armor development programs.

RHA is available in a variety of plate thicknesses from 6.4 mm (1/4 inch) to 152 mm (6 inches). As a result of the rolling process, thinner plates are observed to have a higher surface hardness than thicker plates. Meyer & Kleponis [3] provide an empirical relationship between RHA plate thickness and quasistatic yield strength based on experiments by Benck [4]. A common practice in modeling RHA in numerical simulations is to set the *A* parameter of the Johnson-Cook model according to this relationship. This practice was employed throughout the study described here.

Two different sets of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters for RHA were evaluated in this study [3, 5]. The Meyer & Kleponis parameters were derived from material characterization tests performed by Gray et al. [6] on 50.8-mm-thick RHA plates. The Weerasooriya & Moy parameters were developed from their own characterization tests on RHA plates ranging in thickness from 19.0 mm to 76.2 mm [7]. Like Benck, Weerasooriya & Moy observed that the quasi-static yield strength varied with plate thickness, further validating the approach of varying the *A* parameter in the Johnson-Cook model in accordance with the

RHA plate thickness.

Figure 1 provides a plot of flow stress vs. plastic strain at room temperature for the two sets of parameters for a quasi-static yield strength of 746 MPa which corresponds to a plate thickness of 63.5 mm. In this figure, the thin lines represent quasi-static ($\dot{\varepsilon}_p$ =0.002/s) deformation and the thick lines represent high-rate ($\dot{\varepsilon}_p$ =3000/s) deformation.



Figure 1. Flow stress at ambient temperature for 63.5-mm-thick RHA.

The curves in figure 1 illustrate the differences between the two sets of RHA parameters. The Meyer & Kleponis parameters and the Weerasooriya & Moy parameters produce similar work hardening behavior. Even though the trends are similar, the flow stress produced by the Weerasooriya & Moy parameters is less than that of the Meyer & Kleponis parameters. The gap between the thin (quasi-static) and thick (high-rate) curves for each parameter set indicate the rate hardening effect. The Weerasooriya & Moy parameter set has a larger C coefficient than the Meyer & Kleponis set, resulting in a slightly larger gap between the thin and thick curves.

2.2 Tungsten Model Parameters

Two tungsten penetrator materials were considered in the study. The first consisted of 90% tungsten (W), 7% nickel (Ni), and 3% iron (Fe) by volume and is denoted by 90W-7Ni-3Fe. The second consisted of 93% tungsten, 5% nickel, and 2% iron (93W-5Ni-2Fe). The Johnson-Cook parameters for these materials were derived by Johnson & Cook [2] and Weerasooriya [8], respectively.

A plot of flow stress as a function of plastic strain at room temperature for the two tungsten material parameter sets is provided in figure 2. As in figure 1, the thin lines represent quasi-static deformation and the thick lines represent high-rate deformation. The curves in figure 2 show that 90W-7Ni-3Fe parameter set produces negligible work hardening as compared to 93W-5Ni-2Fe. This is a result of significantly greater

B and *n* parameters for the 93W-5Ni-2Fe parameters as compared to 90W-7Ni-3Fe. The rate hardening effect produced by the 93W-5Ni-2Fe parameters is also greater as a result of the larger *C* parameter and is evidenced by the greater gap between the quasi-static and high rate curves as compared to the gap between the 90W-7Ni-3Fe curves.



Figure 2. Flow stress at ambient temperature for 90W-7Ni-3Fe and 93W-5Ni-2Fe.

3 Penetration Experiments

The goal of the study was to examine the trends in simulated penetration performance for each combination of tungsten and RHA Johnson-Cook parameter set across a wide variety of striking velocities and rod L/D. To this end, experimental data were obtained for rod L/Ds of 5, 10, and 15. The L/D=5 results were obtained from experiments by Enderlein [9] in which tungsten rods were fired into a stack of four RHA target plates at 0 degrees obliquity. The rods were right circular cylinders and were 100 mm long with a diameter of 20 mm. The target plates were each 63.5 mm thick.

The L/D=10 and 15 experimental data were obtained from experiments by Magness [10]. In these experiments, 93W-5Ni-2Fe tungsten rods with hemispherical noses were fired into 152-mm cubes of RHA at 0 degrees obliquity. In all the L/D=10 and 15 experiments, the rods were machined to have a constant mass of 65 g.

Experimental data were not used for the study of rods with L/D=30. Instead, the computational results were evaluated through comparison to an empirical expression for P/L. Lanz & Odermatt [11] developed this empirical relationship for penetration performance for rod L/D ranging from 11 to 32 and striking velocities ranging from 1100 to 1900 m/s. The current study considered only one striking velocity for L/D=30 (1500 m/s). Using the relationship derived by Lanz & Odermatt, the expected P/L is 0.836 for the L/D=30 rod with a striking velocity of 1500 m/s.

4 Numerical Simulations

Two continuum mechanics codes were used in the computational study. CTH [12] is an Eulerian finite volume code for modeling solid dynamics problems involving shock wave propagation, multiple materials, and large deformations in one, two, and three dimensions. CTH employs a two-step solution scheme – a Lagrangian step followed by a remap step. The conservation equations are replaced by explicit finite volume equations that are solved in the Lagrangian step. The remap step uses operator-splitting techniques to replace multidimensional equations with a set of one-dimensional equations. High-resolution material interface trackers are available to minimize material dispersion.

The arbitrary Lagrangian-Eulerian code ALE3D [13] is the other continuum mechanics code used in the study. ALE3D uses a hybrid finite element and finite volume formulation in an unstructured grid. ALE3D is a multi-physics code with features to support simulations involving wave propagation, material deformation and fracture, heat conduction, chemical kinetics, and magneto-hydrodynamics. Simulations involving modest amounts of deformation can be run Lagrangian, in which the unstructured mesh follows the material motion. For cases of larger deformation, advection can be employed to allow the mesh to relax in order to prevent tangling. It is possible to run an ALE3D simulation as an Eulerian simulation (i.e. in the same manner that CTH operates) by employing an advection step after each Lagrangian step and relaxing the mesh to its original position. All ALE3D simulations in this study were performed in this way.

A common set of characteristics was employed in all simulations in the study. The simulations were performed in two dimensions with a rectangular computational domain of uniform mesh resolution throughout. The mesh resolution was defined such that there were 10 computational cells/elements across the radius of the penetrator. A shock-particle velocity equation of state (EOS) was used for all materials in the simulations and a common set of EOS parameters was defined for all simulations. Similarly, the Johnson-Cook fracture model [14] was employed for for all materials in the simulations and a common set of fracture model parameters was employed in all cases.

The study involved the use of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters for two different tungsten rod materials. The different volume percentages of tungsten in each resulted in different densities. The density used in the study was 17.346 g/cm³ for 90W-7Ni-3Fe and 17.7 g/cm³ for 93W-5Ni-2Fe.

The simulations involving the L/D=5 rod used the dimensions and cylindrical geometry that were described previously. As a result, the 90W-7Ni-3Fe and 93W-5Ni-2Fe rods in the L/D=5 simulations had slightly different masses. For the L/D=10 and 15 rods, the hemispherical nose geometry was defined to reproduce the same 65-g rod mass that was used in the experiments. In this case, the 90W-7Ni-3Fe and 93W-5Ni-2Fe rods had identical masses but slightly different dimensions.

Because no experimental data were used for evaluation of the L/D=30 simulations, a notional rod geometry was employed. In this case, the rod mass was defined as 130 g with a hemispherical nose, resulting in rods that were approximately equal in diameter and double in length to the L/D=15 rods. The resulting L/D=30 rods were nominally 6.8 mm in diameter and 204 mm long.

5 **Results and Discussion**

Simulations were performed to replicate the L/D=5, 10, and 15 experiments. For each experiment, a family of simulations was performed such that every combination of continuum code (CTH and ALE3D), RHA parameter set (Meyer & Kleponis and Weerasooriya & Moy), and tungsten rod material parameter set (90W-7Ni-3Fe and 93W-5Ni-2Fe) were employed, resulting in eight simulations for each experimental measurement. Comparison of the simulation results to the experimental data are provided in the following subsections.

5.1 Results for L/D=5

Comparison of the L/D=5 simulations to the experimental results are provided in figure 3. This figure contains four plots in two rows and two columns. Each is a plot of P/L as a function of striking velocity. The plots are arranged with the 90W-7Ni-3Fe results in the left column and the 93W-5Ni-2Fe results in the right column. The ALE3D results are in the top row and the CTH results are in the bottom row.



Figure 3. Study results for L/D=5.

Common characteristics and trends are observed across all four plots in figure 3. The P/L results from the Weerasooriya & Moy parameter set are consistently greater than that of the Meyer & Kleponis set. This is a result of the overall greater strength flow strength produced by the Meyer & Kleponis parameter set. No single combination of continuum code, tungsten parameter set, and RHA parameter set matches the trend in change of P/L with increasing velocity.

An interesting trend observed in the L/D=5 study results is the lower simulated P/L from the 93W-5Ni-2Fe parameter set as compared to the results from the 90W-7Ni-3Fe set. One would expect 93W-5Ni-2Fe to yield a greater P/L because of its higher density (and therefore greater rod mass in the case of the constant-geometry L/D=5 rod). It appears that the difference in P/L between the two tungstens is a result of the difference in the Johnson-Cook model parameters. In figure 2, the 93W-5Ni-2Fe parameter set exhibited more strain hardening than 90W-7Ni-3Fe, but had a lower flow stress in the lower range of plastic strains ($\varepsilon_p < 0.25$).

Because of the limited availability of experimental data for L/D=5, the computational results do not yield a single set of parameters that provide a best match to the experimental results.

5.2 Results for L/D=10

The study results for L/D=10 are provided in figure 4. In this figure, the four plots are presented in the same 2X2 format as the L/D=5 results. The L/D=10 results show the Meyer & Kleponis parameters provide the best overall comparison to the experimental data. As in the L/D=5 results, the 93W-5Ni-2Fe tungsten parameter set produced a lower P/L than 90W-7Ni-3Fe and the P/L from the Weerasooriya & Moy RHA parameter set was consistently greater than that of Meyer & Kleponis.



Figure 4. Study results for L/D=10.

5.3 Results for L/D=15

The results for the L/D=15 simulations are presented in figure 5. The qualitative observations of these results are consistent with those of the L/D=5 and 10 results. Overall, all combinations of continuum code, tungsten parameter set, and RHA parameter set result in simulation results that capture the overall trends of the experimental data. Between the two RHA parameter sets, Meyer & Kleponis appears to provide the best overall comparison to the experiments.



Figure 5. Study results for L/D=15.

5.4 Summary of Results for L/D=5, 10, & 15

The presentation of the study results in figures 3, 4, and 5 provides a valuable qualitative comparison of the simulation results to the experimental data. These comparisons clearly illustrate the influence of the model parameters on the simulation results. However, these plots alone do not provide the quantitative information required to rank the simulation results for the purpose of selecting the best possible combination of parameter sets for simulating tungsten penetration of RHA.

To obtain this quantitative measure, the sum of squares of the errors (SSE) of the simulation results compared to the experimental results was performed. In this analysis, an SSE measure was obtained for every combination of continuum code, tungsten parameter set, and RHA parameter set. The results of this analysis are summarized in table 1. These results show that for three of the four combinations of continuum code and tungsten parameter set, Meyer & Kleponis produces the lowest SSE of the two RHA parameter sets. As a result of this quantitative analysis and the trends observed in figures 3, 4, and 5, the Meyer & Kleponis parameter set is found to provide the best overall results for rods with L/D in the range of 5 to 15.

	AL	E3D	CTH	
RHA Parameter Set	90W-7Ni-3Fe	93W-5Ni-2Fe	90W-7Ni-3Fe	93W-5Ni-2Fe
Meyer & Kleponis	0.0723	0.0445	0.0260	0.0589
Weerasooriya & Moy	0.4682	0.3496	0.2172	0.0941

Table 1. Sum of Squares of Errors for L/D=5, 10, & 15.

5.5 Results for L/D=30

Simulations were performed for the L/D=30 rods for a striking velocity of 1500 m/s. The simulation results were evaluated by comparison to an empirical model result of P/L=0.836. For each simulation, the percentage error of P/L was calculated relative to the empirical model. The results in table 2 show that the Weerasooriya & Moy RHA parameter set produces more accurate results than Meyer & Kleponis. This contradicts the results of the L/D=5, 10, and 15 rods described earlier in which Meyer & Kleponis generally produced more accurate results than the other two.

Table 2. P/L Errors for L/D=30 Simulations.

	P/L Error (%)					
RHA Parameter Set	CT	ΤH	ALE3D			
	90W-7Ni-3Fe	93W-5Ni-2Fe	90W-7Ni-3Fe	93W-5Ni-2Fe		
Meyer & Kleponis	-13.7	-14.9	-6.1	-11.4		
Weerasooriya & Moy	2.0	1.5	7.3	2.1		

6 Summary

This paper documents a computational study to identify the influence of the selection of Johnson-Cook constitutive model parameters on the penetration performance of tungsten rods into RHA steel targets in numerical simulations. The study encompassed two sets of model parameters for RHA, two sets for the tungsten rod material, two different continuum mechanics codes, four different rod L/Ds, and striking velocities ranging from 1000 – 2000 m/s. The original intent of the study was to identify an optimum set of tungsten and RHA model parameters for use in numerical simulations over a wide range of initial conditions.

The study revealed that no single combination of model parameters provided the best overall predictive capability over the entire range of rod L/D considered. The RHA parameter set by Meyer & Kleponis produced the best comparison to experimental penetration data for rods of L/D from 5 to 15. However, for rods of L/D=30, this parameter set yielded the least accurate computational results.

Even though this study did not yield an overall optimum set of RHA and tungsten Johnson-Cook parameters, it has provided valuable guidance in selection of model parameters for a variety of rod L/Ds.

References

- 1. K.D. Kimsey, S.J. Schraml, and E.S. Hertel. Scalable Computations in Penetration Mechanics. *Advances in Engineering Software*, 29(3–6):209–215, 1998.
- 2. G.R. Johnson and W.H. Cook. A Constitutive Model and Data for Metals Subjected to Large Strains, High Strain Rates and High Temperatures. In *Ballistics*, The Hague, The Netherlands, 1983. Seventh International Symposium on Ballistics.
- 3. H.W. Meyer and D.S. Kleponis. An Analysis of Parameters for the Johnson-Cook Strength Model for 2in-Thick Rolled Homogeneous Armor. Technical Report ARL-TR-2528, U.S. Army Research Laboratory, Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD, June 2001.
- R.F. Benck. Quasi-Static Tensile Stress Strain Curves II, Rolled Homogeneous Armor. Technical Report BRL-MR-2703, U.S. Army Ballistic Research Laboratory, Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD, November 1976.
- 5. T. Weerasooriya and P. Moy. RHA Constitutive Model Function of Hardness. Unpublished, April 2010.
- 6. G.T. Gray, S.R. Chen, W. Wright, and M.F. Lopez. Constitutive Equations for Annealed Metals Under Compression at High Strain Rates and High Temperatures. Technical Report LA-12669-MS, Los Alamos National Laboratory, NM, 1994.
- 7. T. Weerasooriya and P. Moy. Effect of Strain Rate on the Deformation Behavior of Rolled Homogeneous Armor (RHA) Steel at Different Hardnesses. Proceedings of the 2004 SEM International Congress and Exposition on Experimental Mechanics. Costa Mesa, CA, June 2004.
- 8. T. Weerasooriya. Deformation Behavior of 93W-5Ni-2Fe at Different Rates of Compression Loading and Temperatures. Technical Report ARL-TR-1719, U.S. Army Research Laboratory, Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD, July 1998.
- M.W. Enderlein. Armor Backpack Effectiveness Against Rod Penetrators at Ordnance Velocities. Technical Report BRL-MR-3939, U.S. Army Ballistic Research Laboratory, Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD, 1991.
- L.S. Magness. A Phenomenological Investigation of the Behavior of High-Density Materials Under the High Pressure, High Strain Rate Loading Environment of Ballistic Impact. PhD thesis, Johns Hopkins University, 1992.
- 11. W. Lanz and W. Odermatt. Penetration Limits of Conventional Large Caliber Anti Tank Guns/Kinetic Energy Projectiles. In *Ballistics*, Stockholm, Sweden, 1992. 13th International Symposium on Ballistics.
- 12. J.M. McGlaun and S.L. Thompson. CTH: A Three-Dimensional Shock Wave Physics Code. *International Journal of Impact Engineering*, 10:351–360, 1990.
- A.L. Nichols. Users Manual for ALE3D: An Arbitrary Lagrange/Eulerian 2D and 3D Code System. Technical Report LLNL-SM-433954, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, Livermore, CA, June 2010.
- 14. G.R. Johnson. Status of the EPIC Codes, Material Characterization and New Computing Concepts at Honeywell. In *Computational Aspects of Penetration Mechanics*, New York, 1982. Springer-Verlag.

NO. OF COPIES ORGANIZATION

- 1 DEFENSE TECHNICAL
- (PDF INFORMATION CTR
 only) DTIC OCA
 8725 JOHN J KINGMAN RD
 STE 0944
 FORT BELVOIR VA 22060-6218
 - 1 DIRECTOR US ARMY RESEARCH LAB IMNE ALC HRR 2800 POWDER MILL RD ADELPHI MD 20783-1197
 - 1 DIRECTOR US ARMY RESEARCH LAB RDRL CIO LL 2800 POWDER MILL RD ADELPHI MD 20783-1197
 - 1 DIRECTOR US ARMY RESEARCH LAB RDRL CIO MT 2800 POWDER MILL RD ADELPHI MD 20783-1197
 - 1 DIRECTOR US ARMY RESEARCH LAB RDRL D 2800 POWDER MILL RD ADELPHI MD 20783-1197

NO. OF COPIES ORGANIZATION

- 3 US ARMY ARDEC AMSRD AAR AEE W E BAKER A DANIELS W NG BLDG 3022 PICATINNY NJ 07806-5000
- 2 US ARMY ERDC CEERD GM R J CARGILE R MOXLEY 3090 HALLS FERRY RD VICKSBURG MS 39180-6199
- 3 US ARMY ERDC CEERD GM I S AKERS K DANIELSON A FRANK 3090 HALLS FERRY RD VICKSBURG MS 39180-6199
- 3 NAVSEA DAHLGREN C DYKA W CHEPREN M HOPSON 6138 NORC AVE STE 313 DAHLGREN VA 22448-5157
- 9 SANDIA NATIONAL LABORATORIES S ATTAWAY MS0847 A BRUNDAGE MS1160 A GULLERUD MS1185 E HERTEL MS1185 D LITTLEWOOD MS1322 J KORBIN MS0836 K MISH MS0380 S SCHUMACHER MS0836 S SILLING MS1322 1515 EUBANK SE ALBUQUERQUE NM 87123
- 2 LLNL D FAUX MS L140 R MCCALLEN MS L098 PO BOX 808 LIVERMORE CA 94551-0808

NO. OF COPIES ORGANIZATION

- 4 SOUTHWEST RESEARCH INST C ANDERSON G JOHNSON T HOLMQUIST J WALKER PO DRAWER 28510 SAN ANTONIO TX 78228-0510
- UNIV OF ALABAMA BIRMINGHAM HOEN 101
 D LITTLEFIELD
 1530 3RD AVE
 BIRMINGHAM AL 35294-4440

ABERDEEN PROVING GROUND

DIR USARL 48 RDRL CIH C J CAZAMIAS D GROVE RDRL WML J NEWILL M ZOLTOSKI RDRL WML H T BROWN T EHLERS T FARRAND M FERMEN-COKER E KENNEDY L MAGNESS C MEYER **R PHILLABAUM** N REICHENBACH **D SCHEFFLER** S SCHRAML **B SCHUSTER B SORENSEN R** SUMMERS C TEAL T THOMAS A ZETTS RDRL WMP B **R KRAFT** S SATAPATHY T WEERISOORIYA RDRL WMP C **R BECKER** S BILYK T BJERKE D CASEM J CLAYTON M GRAHAM J HOUSKAMP **B LEAVY**

NO. OF COPIES ORGANIZATION

> M RAFTENBERG S SEGLETES C WILLIAMS RDRL WMP D **R DONEY** D KLEPONIS H MEYER F MURPHY B VONK G VUNNI W WALTERS M ZELLNER RDRL WMP E **B** CHAMISH B LOVE C NICELY RDRL WMP G **R BANTON** S KUKUCK

INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK.