

AD-A211 079

# Some Clinical Diagnoses Are More Reliable Than Others

Brock Kilbourne, Ph.D.  
 Jerry Goodman, Ph.D.  
 Susan Hilton, M.A.

Health Services Research Department  
 Naval Health Research Center  
 P.O. Box 85122  
 San Diego, CA. 92138-9174



|                    |                                     |
|--------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Accession For      |                                     |
| FILE OF/AM         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| FILE OF/AM         | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| FILE OF/AM         | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| FILE OF/AM         | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| By _____           |                                     |
| Dist: Butler/      |                                     |
| Availability Codes |                                     |
| Dist               | Special                             |
| A-1                |                                     |

Report 89 11, was supported by the Naval Medical Research and Development Command, Department of the Navy under Work Unit No. N0002288WKW508. The views expressed are those of the authors and do not reflect the official policy or position of the Department of the Navy, Department of Defense, or the U.S. Government. The authors gratefully acknowledge the assistance of Michael McNally and Dr. D. Stephen Nice during different phases of this research.

## Summary

### Purpose

The purpose of the present study was to facilitate understanding of the nature of mental disorder diagnoses by examining the extent to which the degree of diagnostic specificity (i.e., group, type, or subtype) and the social context (i.e., certain circumstances under which diagnoses take place) affect diagnostic agreement (the reliability of measures across time). Also, the present study investigated the transformative nature of certain mental disorder diagnoses (i.e., how some mental disorder diagnoses change by their very nature) by tracking classifications both into and out of particular diagnostic categories.

### Approach

The approach of this study was to analyze data from the Navy Enlisted Career/Medical History File. The population consisted of all hospitalized cases of active duty, enlisted Navy personnel between 1981 and 1984, inclusive, with a mental problem as the primary diagnosis. Two nonexclusive subsamples were investigated. The first subsample (N=2,132) consisted of hospitalized cases which were later reviewed by a U.S. Navy Physical Evaluation (P.E.) Board. The second subsample (N=5,402) consisted of cases involving multiple hospital admissions for a mental disorder.

### Findings

Diagnostic group (i.e., psychotic versus nonpsychotic) was a more reliable measure than diagnostic type (e.g., schizophrenia versus personality disorder). Diagnostic type, in turn, was a more reliable measure than diagnostic subtype (e.g., chronic catatonic schizophrenic). And, certain diagnostic types and subtypes were consistently more reliable across time than others. Except for alcoholism and personality disorders, the Kappa values associated with diagnostic types and subtypes in the P.E. Board subsample were significantly larger than those in the multiple hospitalization subsample.

### Conclusions

The present study found that degree of diagnostic specificity and the social context affected the reliability across time of ICD-9 mental disorder diagnoses. Also, the nature of certain mental disorders (i.e., disorders which progressively deteriorate, those which resemble one another because of shared features, and those which occur in combination with other disorders) affects diagnostic reliability.

# Some Clinical Diagnoses Are More Reliable Than Others<sup>1</sup>

Brock Kilbourne, Ph.D.<sup>2</sup>

Jerry Goodman, Ph.D.

Susan Hilton, M.A.

Naval Health Research Center

## Introduction

In a recent article in Science, Faust and Ziskin (July, 1988) argued correctly that many studies have demonstrated the poor reliability of specific mental disorder diagnoses, but then also created the false impression that: 1) all mental disorder diagnoses are similarly unreliable, and 2) the inaccuracy of diverse forms of clinical judgement, as indicated by the inability of clinicians to achieve diagnostic agreement, to predict violence, feigned behavior, or brain damage, is attributable to a common set of limitations (i.e., the same factors explain problems in very different and complex areas of clinical judgement). Spitzer, Williams, and Pincus (Science, November, 1988) responded by saying that psychiatry has recognized the problem, is doing something about it, and that the "rest of medicine also has problems with reliability." Joseph Matarazzo (quoted by John Bales, Monitor, January, 1989), the current President of the American Psychological Association, responded by saying that Faust and Ziskin's (1988) conclusions were based on a narrow review of the literature (i.e., primarily negative studies) and ignored other studies which do not suffer from methodological flaws. However, neither the critique by Faust and Ziskin (1988), the defense by Spitzer et al. (1988), nor the corrective comments by Matarazzo (Bales, 1989) provide a clear agenda for understanding the nature of mental disorder diagnoses, or suggest ways to improve diagnostic reliability.

The purpose of the present study was to facilitate understanding of the nature of mental disorder diagnoses by examining the extent to which the degree of diagnostic specificity (i.e., group, type, or subtype) and the social context (i.e., the different conditions under which diagnoses take place) affects diagnostic agreement (i.e., the reliability of measures across time). Also, the present study investigated the transformative nature of certain mental disorder diagnoses (i.e., how some diagnoses may change by their very nature) by tracking classifications both into and out of particular diagnostic categories.

## Methods

### Subjects

The population consisted of all hospitalized cases of active duty, enlisted Navy personnel between 1981 and 1984, inclusive, with a mental problem as the primary diagnosis. Two non-exclusive subsamples of this population were investigated, which corresponded to different social contexts. The first social context subsample (N=2,132) consisted of hospitalized cases which were later reviewed by a U.S. Navy Physical Evaluation (P.E.) Board. The mean length of time between hospitalization and last P.E. Board review was 206.74 days (sd=214.45). The second social context subsample (N=5,402) consisted of cases involving multiple hospital admissions for a mental disorder. The mean lengths of time between hospitalizations were: 1) 143.55 days (sd=225.08) between first and second hospitalization, 2) 115.82 days (sd=187.59) between second and third hospitalization, 3) 91.00 days (sd=149.42) between third and fourth hospitalization, 4) 91.45 days (sd=139.05) between fourth and fifth hospitalization, and 5) 176.78 days (sd=251.13) between first and last hospitalization.

### Procedures

Data Collection Procedures. Data were obtained from the Navy Enlisted Career/Medical History File (NECMHF). NECMHF is based on two compiled files. One is the Service History File, which consists of demographic and military-service history data from Navy Military Personnel Command in Arlington, Virginia. The other is the Medical History File, which contains hospitalization, death, Medical Board action, and Physical Evaluation Board action data from Naval Medical Data Services Center in Bethesda, Maryland. NECMHF is compiled and maintained by the Naval Health Research Center, San Diego, California (Garland, Helmkamp, Gunderson, Gorham, Miller, McNally, & Thompson, 1987).

Coding Procedures. Primary mental disorders were based on ICD-9 codes and were coded to correspond to three levels of diagnostic specificity. The three levels, which are henceforth referred to as **group**, **type**, and **subtype**, correspond, respectively, to low, moderate, and high degrees of diagnostic specificity. At the lowest level of diagnostic specificity, the **group** level, all mental disorder diagnoses were relegated to either the psychotic (all psychotic diagnoses combined) or nonpsychotic (all nonpsychotic diagnoses combined) groups. At the moderate level of specificity, the **type** level, the range of possible mental disorder diagnoses included the following diagnostic types: 1) organic psychoses, 2) schizophrenia, 3) affective psychoses, 4) para-

noia, 5) other psychoses, 6) unspecified psychoses, 7) neurotic disorders, 8) personality disorders, 9) alcoholism, 10) transient situational disturbance, and 11) drunkenness. At the highest level of specificity, the **subtype** level, each **type** of mental disorder diagnosis was further classified into its specific **subtypes** (e.g., chronic catatonic schizophrenic). In both subsamples, five contrasts involving the three levels of diagnostic specificity (**group**, **type**, and **subtype**) were computed to assess diagnostic reliability across time: 1) psychotic group versus nonpsychotic group at Time 1 was compared to psychotic group versus nonpsychotic group at Time 2 (2 x 2 Table), 2) all types of mental disorders at Time 1 were compared to all types of mental disorders at Time 2, 3) all subtypes of mental disorders at Time 1 were compared to all subtypes of mental disorders at Time 2, 4) each type of mental disorder versus all other types combined at Time 1 was compared, respectively, to its corresponding type of mental disorder versus all other types combined at Time 2 (2 x 2 Tables), and 5) each subtype of mental disorder versus all other subtypes combined at Time 1 was compared, respectively, to its corresponding subtype of mental disorder versus all other subtypes combined at Time 2 (2 x 2 Tables).

## Results

The degree to which diagnosis at Time 1 agreed with diagnosis at Time 2 was assessed using the Kappa statistic. Kappa assesses the chance-corrected consistency (or reliability) of a set of measurements across time. Kappa equals zero when obtained agreement equals chance agreement. Greater than chance agreement leads to positive Kappa values, while less than chance agreement leads to negative Kappa values. With negative values, the degree of agreement has little practical importance (Cohen, 1960). Table 1 shows the Kappa values for different levels of diagnostic specificity across multiple hospital admissions and at time of hospitalization versus time of last P.E. Board review.

Two sets of analyses were conducted. The first set of analyses combined the P.E. Board subsample with the multiple hospital admissions subsample in order to assess the effect of diagnostic specificity on reliability across time. The Wilcoxon Signed-Ranks Test was used to compare the Kappa values for different levels of diagnostic specificity. The Kappa values comparing psychotic group versus nonpsychotic group at Times 1 and 2 were significantly

larger than the Kappa values comparing: 1) all types of diagnoses at Time 1 versus all types of diagnoses at Time 2, and 2) all subtypes of diagnoses at Time 1 versus all subtypes of diagnoses at Time 2 (both  $Z$  values = -2.20,  $p$  values [two-tailed] < .05). The Kappa values comparing all types of diagnoses at Time 1 versus all types of diagnoses at Time 2 were significantly larger than those comparing all subtypes of diagnoses at Time 1 versus all subtypes of diagnoses at Time 2 ( $Z$  = -2.20,  $p$  [two-tailed] < .05). The Kappa values (Tables 2 and 3) for each respective diagnostic type versus all other types at Times 1 and 2 were significantly larger than those for each respective diagnostic subtype versus all other subtypes at Times 1 and 2 ( $Z$  = -5.03,  $p$  [two-tailed] < .001).

The second set of analyses combined the diagnostic types and subtypes in the P.E. Board subsample, and combined the diagnostic types and subtypes in the multiple hospital admissions subsample. The Wilcoxon Signed-Ranks Test was used to compare the combined Kappa values of the two different subsamples in order to assess the effect of the social context on reliability across time. In subsample 1, Kappa values were computed to measure reliability at time of hospitalization versus time of last P.E. Board review. In subsample 2, Kappa values were computed to measure reliability at time of first hospital admission versus time of last hospital admission. The Kappa values of the two subsamples (types and subtypes combined, respectively) did not differ significantly ( $p$  = .16). However, two supplemental analyses were conducted to assess the possibility that opposing directional effects in the two subsamples masked a social context effect. The first supplemental analysis consisted of only the types and subtypes with larger P.E. Board subsample Kappa values (12 of the 16 ranks or all types and subtypes except alcoholism and personality disorders) and found a significant difference between the two subsamples ( $Z$  = -3.06,  $p$  [two-tailed] < .01). The second supplemental analysis consisted of only alcoholism and personality disorder types and subtypes (the remaining 4 ranks) and found a significant difference between the two subsamples ( $Z$  = -1.83,  $p$  [one-tailed] < .05). Except for alcoholism and personality disorders, Kappa values were significantly larger in the P.E. Board subsample than in the multiple hospitalization subsample. The Kappa values for alcoholism and personality disorder types and subtypes were significantly larger in the multiple hospitalization subsample than in the P.E. Board subsample. Thus, the impact of the social context on diagnostic reliability depended on the particular diagnostic type or subtype.

Table 1

## Reliability (Kappa) Across time of Mental Diagnosis by Level of Specificity

| Level of Specificity | Number of Hospital Admissions |        |        |        |             | Row Mean | Time of Hospitalization vs. Last PE Board |
|----------------------|-------------------------------|--------|--------|--------|-------------|----------|-------------------------------------------|
|                      | 1 vs 2                        | 2 vs 3 | 3 vs 4 | 4 vs 5 | 1st vs Last |          |                                           |
| Group vs. Group      | .56                           | .57    | .53    | .67    | .54         | .57      | .55                                       |
| Type vs. Type        | .36                           | .37    | .43    | .44    | .34         | .39      | .52                                       |
| Subtype vs. Subtype  | .01                           | .14    | .02    | .03    | .13         | .07      | .01                                       |

Table 2

## Reliability (Kappa) Across Time of Mental Diagnosis Type

| Type vs. Else                     | Number of Hospital Admissions |        |        |        |             | Row Mean | Time of Hospitalization vs. Last PE Board |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------|--------|--------|-------------|----------|-------------------------------------------|
|                                   | 1 vs 2                        | 2 vs 3 | 3 vs 4 | 4 vs 5 | 1st vs Last |          |                                           |
| Organic Psychoses                 | .15                           | .06    | .16    | .15    | .13         | .13      | .31                                       |
| Schizophrenia                     | .58                           | .61    | .63    | .73    | .58         | .58      | .72                                       |
| Affective Psychoses               | .42                           | .57    | .54    | .59    | .38         | .38      | .61                                       |
| Other Psychoses                   | .25                           | .30    | .16    | .66    | .21         | .21      | .35                                       |
| Neuroses                          | .26                           | .12    | .11    | .03    | .22         | .22      | .54                                       |
| Personality Disorders             | .35                           | .36    | .41    | .40    | .32         | .32      | .16                                       |
| Alcoholism                        | .52                           | .51    | .47    | .58    | .50         | .50      | .14                                       |
| Transient Situational Disturbance | .24                           | .22    | .39    | .26    | .20         | .20      | .33                                       |
| Drunkenness                       | .10                           | .10    | .49    | .26    | .09         | .09      | --                                        |

Table 3

## Reliability (Kappa) Across Time of Mental Diagnosis Subtype

| Subtype vs. Else                                | Number of Hospital Admissions |        |        |        |             | Row Mean | Time of Hospitalization vs. Last PE Board |
|-------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------|--------|--------|-------------|----------|-------------------------------------------|
|                                                 | 1 vs 2                        | 2 vs 3 | 3 vs 4 | 4 vs 5 | 1st vs Last |          |                                           |
| Organic Psychoses (14 subtypes)                 | .14                           | .07    | .07    | .09    | .10         | .10      | .23                                       |
| Schizophrenia (11 subtypes)                     | .44                           | .46    | .47    | .54    | .44         | .44      | .55                                       |
| Affective Psychoses (9 subtypes)                | .29                           | .36    | .29    | .41    | .26         | .26      | .40                                       |
| Other Psychoses (13 subtypes)                   | .19                           | .23    | .12    | .66    | .16         | .16      | .32                                       |
| Neuroses (8 subtypes)                           | .23                           | .13    | .13    | .02    | .19         | .19      | .50                                       |
| Personality Disorders (9 subtypes)              | .29                           | .32    | .44    | .40    | .26         | .26      | .15                                       |
| Alcoholism (6 subtypes)                         | .42                           | .42    | .43    | .50    | .39         | .39      | .08                                       |
| Transient Situational Disturbance (12 subtypes) | .10                           | .10    | .49    | .26    | .09         | .09      | .21                                       |
| Drunkenness (1 subtype)                         | .17                           | .16    | .32    | .12    | .15         | .15      | --                                        |

The pattern of diagnostic change was then assessed by examining classifications across time both into and out of a given type of mental disorder. The pattern of diagnostic change of primary mental disorder diagnoses was different in the two subsamples of the study. Tables 4-5 show the shift in diagnosis from time of hospitalization to time of last P.E. Board review. Tables 6-7 show the shift in diagnosis from time of first hospital admission to time of last hospital admission.

In the P.E. Board subsample, diagnostic change appeared to be due to the problem of differential diagnosis of psychotic mental disorders (the failure to distinguish between different mental disorders which share particular psychotic symptoms but which differ in the overall pattern of psychotic symptomatology) and the progressive deterioration of some nonpsychotic mental disorders. For example, Table 4 clearly shows that at time of last P.E. Board review, four of the six psychotic mental disorders (#1,4,5,6) were not well differentiated from schizophrenia and that all of the nonpsychotic disorders (#7-11) indicated some deterioration into a more severe mental (psychotic) disorder. Table 5 clearly shows a consistent trend toward classification into a new category of diagnosis at time of last P.E. Board review but cannot distinguish between problems of differential diagnosis and progressive deterioration.

In the multiple admission subsample, on the other hand, diagnostic change was more complex and appeared to be due to: 1) the problem of differential diagnosis for both psychotic and nonpsychotic disorders, 2) the problem of multiple diagnosis (clusters of disorders [e.g., certain personality disorders and substance abuse disorders] which are oftentimes related and which may alternate as the principal [primary] diagnosis), 3) and the progressive deterioration of some nonpsychotic disorders. For example, Table 6 shows clearly that schizophrenic and/or personality disorders were frequently confused with all seven psychotic mental disorders (#1-7). Table 6 also shows substantial diagnostic change among the nonpsychotic disorders that could be attributable to progressive deterioration, differential diagnosis, or multiple diagnosis. The pattern of diagnostic change for drunkenness (#11), improper use of drugs (#13), and nervousness/debility (#17) looks like movement toward a worsening of symptoms. The pattern of change for neuroses (#8), drug dependence (#12), physical disorder of psychogenic origin (#14), special symptoms (#15), and transient situational disturbance (#16) could be attributable to

Table 4  
Classification Out of a Diagnostic Type  
at Time of Last P.E. Board

| <u>Hospitalization Diagnosis</u>                               | <u>P.E. Board Diagnosis</u>                         |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|-----|
| (1) Psychosis associated with other physical conditions (n=24) | Psychosis associated with other physical conditions | 17% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 46% |
|                                                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 25% |
| (2) Schizophrenia (n=777)                                      | Schizophrenia                                       | 94% |
|                                                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 3%  |
| (3) Affective psychosis (n=352)                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 84% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 8%  |
|                                                                | Nervousness/debility                                | 4%  |
| (4) Paranoid (n=46)                                            | Paranoid                                            | 41% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 26% |
| (5) Other psychosis (n=67)                                     | Other psychosis                                     | 25% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 43% |
| (6) Unspecified psychosis (n=93)                               | Unspecified psychosis                               | 26% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 59% |
| (7) Neuroses (n=150)                                           | Neuroses                                            | 62% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 10% |
|                                                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 8%  |
| (8) Personality disorders (n=160)                              | Personality disorders                               | 13% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 32% |
|                                                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 18% |
|                                                                | Neuroses                                            | 11% |
| (9) Alcoholism (n=90)                                          | Alcoholism                                          | 8%  |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 20% |
|                                                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 31% |
| (10) Transient situational disturbance (n=135)                 | Transient situational disturbance                   | 25% |
|                                                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 21% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 14% |
|                                                                | Neuroses                                            | 19% |
| (11) Nervousness/debility (n=129)                              | Nervousness/debility                                | 27% |
|                                                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 30% |
|                                                                | Neuroses                                            | 11% |

**Table 5**  
**Classification Into a Diagnostic Type**  
**at Time of Last P.R. Board**

| <u>Hospitalization Diagnosis</u> |                                                                                                                           | <u>P.R. Board Diagnosis</u>                       |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|
| (1)                              | Schizophrenia 74%<br>Unspecified psychosis 5%<br>Personality disorders 5%<br>Other psychosis 3%<br>Affective psychosis 3% | Schizophrenia (n=984)                             |
| (2)                              | Affective psychosis 59%<br>Transient situational disturbance 6%<br>Personality disorders 6%<br>Alcoholism 6%              | Affective psychosis (n=502)                       |
| (3)                              | Paranoid 46%<br>Personality disorders 13%                                                                                 | Paranoid (n=41)                                   |
| (4)                              | Other psychosis 33%<br>Personality disorders 12%<br>Schizophrenia 8%                                                      | Other psychosis (n=52)                            |
| (5)                              | Unspecified psychosis 43%<br>Other psychosis 11%<br>Schizophrenia 11%                                                     | Unspecified psychosis (n=56)                      |
| (6)                              | Neuroses 54%<br>Transient situational disturbance 15%<br>Nervousness/debility 11%<br>Personality disorders 1%             | Neuroses (n=172)                                  |
| (7)                              | Personality disorders 39%<br>Affective psychosis 15%<br>Paranoid 13%<br>Schizophrenia 12%                                 | Personality disorders (n=52)                      |
| (8)                              | Physical disorder of psychogenic origin 57%<br>Neuroses 30%                                                               | Physical disorder of psychogenic origin (n=23)    |
| (9)                              | Special symptoms, not elsewhere classified 78%<br>Alcoholism 10%<br>Personality disorders 7%                              | Special symptoms, not elsewhere classified (n=41) |
| (10)                             | Transient situational disturbance 60%<br>Nervousness/debility 18%                                                         | Transient situational disturbance (n=57)          |
| (11)                             | Nervousness/debility 37%<br>Transient situational disturbance 16%<br>Affective psychosis 15%<br>Neuroses 13%              | Nervousness/debility (n=95)                       |

Table 6  
Classification Out of a Diagnostic Type  
at Time of Last Hospitalization

| <u>First Hospitalization Diagnosis</u>                         | <u>Last Hospitalization Diagnosis</u>               |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|-----|
| (1) Alcoholic psychosis (n=65)                                 | Alcoholism                                          | 74% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 9%  |
| (2) Psychosis associated with other physical conditions (n=37) | Psychosis associated with other physical conditions | 14% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 32% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 16% |
| (3) Schizophrenia (n=247)                                      | Schizophrenia                                       | 72% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 17% |
| (4) Affective psychosis (n=122)                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 43% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 19% |
| (5) Paranoid (n=21)                                            | Paranoid                                            | 14% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 33% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 29% |
| (6) Other psychosis (n=74)                                     | Other psychosis                                     | 14% |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 26% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 22% |
| (7) Unspecified psychosis (n=78)                               | Unspecified psychosis                               | 9%  |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 11% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 22% |
|                                                                | Affective psychosis                                 | 10% |
| (8) Neuroses (n=273)                                           | Neuroses                                            | 22% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 29% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 15% |
|                                                                | Transient situational disturb.                      | 13% |
| (9) Personality disorders (n=545)                              | Personality disorders                               | 57% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 13% |
|                                                                | Transient situational disturb.                      | 7%  |
|                                                                | Schizophrenia                                       | 6%  |
| (10) Alcoholism (n=1,517)                                      | Alcoholism                                          | 72% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 8%  |
|                                                                | Drunkenness                                         | 5%  |
|                                                                | Transient situational disturb.                      | 5%  |
| (11) Drunkenness (n=311)                                       | Drunkenness                                         | 11% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 71% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 8%  |
| (12) Drug dependence (n=54)                                    | Drug dependence                                     | 26% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 26% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 13% |
| (13) Improper use of drugs (n=29)                              | Improper use of drugs                               | 14% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 31% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 17% |
| (14) Physical disorder of psychogenic origin (n=27)            | Physical disorder of psychogenic origin             | 30% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 26% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 22% |
| (15) Special symptoms, not else where classified (NEC) (n=28)  | Special symptoms, NEC                               | 54% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 25% |
| (16) Transient situational disturbance (n=525)                 | Transient situational disturb.                      | 23% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 35% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 18% |
|                                                                | Neuroses                                            | 7%  |
| (17) Nervousness/debility (n=114)                              | Nervousness/debility                                | 20% |
|                                                                | Personality disorders                               | 26% |
|                                                                | Transient situational disturb.                      | 15% |
|                                                                | Alcoholism                                          | 13% |

Table 7

**Classification Into a Diagnostic Type  
at Time of Last Hospitalization**

| <u>First Hospitalization Diagnosis</u> |                                                                                                                        | <u>Last Hospitalization Diagnosis</u>                      |
|----------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|
| (1)                                    | Alcoholic psychosis 13%<br>Alcoholism 67%                                                                              | Alcoholic psychosis (n=46)                                 |
| (2)                                    | Psychosis associated with other physical conditions 21%<br>Alcoholism 25%<br>Drug dependence 17%                       | Psychosis associated with other physical conditions (n=24) |
| (3)                                    | Schizophrenia 53%<br>Personality disorders 10%<br>Unspecified psychosis 9%<br>Other psychosis 6%                       | Schizophrenia (n=336)                                      |
| (4)                                    | Affective psychosis 37%<br>Transient situational disturb. 11%<br>Personality disorders 10%<br>Nervousness/debility 10% | Affective psychosis (n=144)                                |
| (5)                                    | Other psychosis 22%<br>Personality disorders 28%<br>Alcoholism 13%                                                     | Other psychosis (n=46)                                     |
| (6)                                    | Unspecified psychosis 20%<br>Alcoholism 14%<br>Other psychosis 11%<br>Schizophrenia 11%                                | Unspecified psychosis (n=35)                               |
| (7)                                    | Neuroses 32%<br>Transient situational disturb. 21%<br>Alcoholism 19%<br>Personality disorders 11%                      | Neuroses (n=185)                                           |
| (8)                                    | Personality disorders 35%<br>Transient situational disturb. 21%<br>Alcoholism 14%<br>Neuroses 9%                       | Personality disorders (n=895)                              |
| (9)                                    | Alcoholism 67%<br>Drunkenness 13%<br>Transient situational disturb. 6%<br>Personality disorders 4%                     | Alcoholism (n=1,643)                                       |
| (10)                                   | Drunkenness 21%<br>Alcoholism 50%<br>Personality disorders 9%<br>Transient situational disturb. 7%                     | Drunkenness (n=157)                                        |
| (11)                                   | Drug dependence 30%<br>Alcoholism 26%                                                                                  | Drug dependence (n=47)                                     |
| (12)                                   | Improper use of drugs 10%<br>Alcoholism 30%<br>Drug dependence 18%                                                     | Improper use of drugs (n=40)                               |
| (13)                                   | Physical disorder of psychogenic origin 38%<br>Neuroses 33%                                                            | Physical disorder of psychogenic origin (n=21)             |
| (14)                                   | Special symptoms, not elsewhere classified (NEC) 65%<br>Neuroses 13%<br>Personality disorders 13%                      | Special symptoms, NEC (n=23)                               |
| (15)                                   | Transient situational disturb. 37%<br>Alcoholism 22%<br>Personality disorders 11%<br>Neuroses 11%                      | Transient situational disturbance (n=323)                  |
| (16)                                   | Nervousness/debility 26%<br>Transient situational disturb. 20%<br>Personality disorders 12%<br>Neuroses 12%            | Nervousness/debility (n=91)                                |

either differential diagnosis or multiple diagnoses. The consistent association of personality disorders (#9) and alcoholism (#10) suggests multiple diagnoses.

### Discussion

The present study found that degree of diagnostic specificity and the social context affected the reliability across time of ICD-9 mental disorder diagnoses. Diagnostic group (i.e., psychotic versus nonpsychotic) was a more reliable measure than diagnostic type (e.g., schizophrenic disorder or personality disorder). Diagnostic type, in turn, was a more reliable measure than diagnostic subtype (e.g., chronic catatonic schizophrenic). And, certain diagnostic types and subtypes (e.g., schizophrenic and chronic catatonic schizophrenic, respectively) were consistently more reliable across time than others (e.g., personality disorder and antisocial personality disorder, respectively). Except for alcoholism and personality disorders, the Kappa values associated with diagnostic types and subtypes in the P.E. Board subsample (time of hospitalization versus time of last P.E. Board review) were significantly larger than those in the multiple hospitalization subsample (i.e., time of first hospital admission versus time of last hospital admission). That social context effect was attributable to the fact that Navy P.E. Boards screen for more severe disorders as a primary basis for service discharge (Kilbourne, Hilton, and Goodman, 1988). Moderate to large Kappa values in the P.E. Board subsample indicated relative stability in the severity of a given mental disorder (especially for psychotic types and subtypes), while lower Kappa values generally indicated a shift from a less severe mental disorder to a more severe mental disorder. For example, alcoholism is treated on either an outpatient or inpatient basis in the U.S. Navy (e.g., there are treatment programs lasting for six weeks in many Navy hospitals, which increases the likelihood of diagnostic agreement while in the hospital) and is not routinely used as the basis for service discharge (which decreases the likelihood of diagnostic agreement if an individual initially hospitalized for alcoholism is later reviewed by a Navy P.E. Board).

Thus, the nature of certain mental disorders (e.g., disorders which progressively deteriorate, those which resemble one another because of shared features, and those which occur in combination with other disorders) affects diagnostic reliability. Diagnostic change and uncertainty (i.e., symptom change and symptom overlap) are an inherent aspect of some mental disorders.

It may only be after a battery of psychological tests has been administered or treatment has begun that a final diagnosis can be specified with some degree of confidence. Even then, the clinician might have to concede that the final diagnosis is not the only possible diagnosis but the most plausible working diagnosis. Notwithstanding, while problems with differential and multiple diagnosis are two areas that clinicians need to work on to improve diagnostic reliability (two areas that are emphasized in the revised third-edition of the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders [DSM-III-R, 1987]), it is also evident that diagnostic change can be affected by certain organizational settings and policies.

Taken together, these findings suggest that in actual practice a "close enough principle" steers most clinical diagnoses, and is probably the general rule regardless of the classification system or range of diagnostic types examined. That observation is by no means alarming since effective treatment is not contingent upon diagnostic exactness. The matching of specific psychotherapies or specific medications to specific mental disorders is not critical for the successful treatment of most mental disorders. Treatment success has resulted, in large part, from the nonspecific effects of therapy (e.g., expectations of help and hope, new learning experiences, successful outcomes, and increased self-mastery [Frank, 1974; Sloan, Stables, Cristol, Yorkston, & Whipple, 1975; Smith & Glass, 1977; Stiles, Shapiro, & Elliot, 1986]) and/or the general effects associated with a particular class of medication (e.g., neuroleptics, antidepressants, or sedatives/hypnotics). An individual suffering from a particular mental disorder may respond positively to any one of many different forms of psychotherapeutic intervention (e.g., psychodynamic, cognitive-behavioral, humanistic, etc.).

When specificity of treatment (e.g., behavioral or medical) has been indicated by the weight of empirical evidence, such specificity is really only approximate in application. For example, there are several techniques of the behavioral approach or different forms of a particular class of medication which produce similar effects, and the same technique or form of medication is not always administered in the same way. More importantly, such approximate specificity in application does not hold true for all people at all times with a particular mental disorder.

Thus, for all practical purposes, the belief that one has hit the diagnostic "bull's eye" may impose limitations upon the full range of psychotherapeutic intervention. On the other hand, the recognition that mental diagnoses

are inexact, but close enough, assures appropriate boundaries around the problem (e.g., the focus of treatment) as well as sufficient flexibility, given cultural and individual differences, in treating the problem. The acceptable range of diagnostic closeness is an empirical question that remains to be determined.

The therapeutic alliance (the special relationship that develops between the therapist and the client [Frank, 1974; Strupp, 1986; Kilbourne & Richardson, 1988]) is more important in the long run for helping most individuals deal with their psychological problems than either diagnostic or treatment exactness. It is within the context of the therapeutic alliance and certain common clinical strategies (e.g., corrective experiences and feedback [Goldfried, 1980]) that an individual learns new ways to tackle unmet needs and unresolved conflicts, distorted perceptions, irrational beliefs, negative affective states, faulty communication patterns, inappropriate behaviors, unrewarding relationships, and to acquire a positive sense of self.

### Footnotes

- 1 An earlier version of this paper was presented in a poster session at the Annual Meeting of the American Association for the Advancement of Science, San Francisco, CA., January 17, 1980.
- 2 Brock Kilbourne is a postdoctoral fellow with the National Research Council, National Academy of Sciences, and a licensed psychologist (CA. #PV10467). Jerry Goodman is a sociologist and a statistical consultant with the Naval Health Research Center, San Diego. Susan Hilton is a research psychologist and a member of the Health Services Research Department, Naval Health Research Center.

## References

- Bales, J. (January, 1989). Expert witness controversy continues. APA Monitor, 20(1), 21.
- Cohen, J. (1960). A coefficient of agreement for nominal scales. Educational and Psychological Measurement, 20, 37-46.
- Diagnostic and statistical manual of mental disorders (Third Edition Revised) (1987). Washington, DC.: American Psychiatric Association.
- Faust, D., & Ziskin, J. (1983). The expert witness in psychology and psychiatry. Science, 241, 31-35.
- Frank, J. (1974). Persuasion and healing: A comparative study of psychotherapy. New York: Schocken.
- Garland, F.C., Helmkamp, J.C., Gunderson, E.K.B., Gorham, E.D., Miller, M.M., McNally, M.S., & Thompson, F.A. (1987). A guide to the computerized medical data resources of the Naval Health Research Center (NHRC Tech. Rep. 87-13). San Diego, CA: Naval Health Research Center.
- Goldfried, M.R. (1980). Toward the delineation of therapeutic change principles. American Psychologist, 35, 991-999.
- Kilbourne, B.K., Hilton, S.M., & Goodman, J. (1988). Psychiatric and non-psychiatric predictors of disability discharge disposition for Navy personnel with a mental health problem: A replication and extension. (NHRC Tech. Rep. 88-40). San Diego, CA: Naval Health Research Center.
- Kilbourne, B.K., & Richardson, J.T. (1988). A social psychological analysis of healing. Journal of Integrative and Eclectic Psychotherapy, 1, 20-34.
- Sloan, R.B., Stables, F.R., Cristol, A.H., Yorkston, N.J., & Whipple, K. (1975). Psychotherapy versus behavior therapy. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Smith, M.L., & Glass, G.V. (1977). Meta analysis of psychotherapy outcome studies. American Psychologist, 32, 752-760.
- Spitzer, R.L., Williams, J.B., & Pincus, H.A. (4 November, 1988). Psychiatric Diagnosis. Science, 242, 651-652.
- Stiles, W.B., Shapiro, D.A., & Elliot, R. (1986). Are all psychotherapies equivalent? American Psychologist, 41(2), 165-180.
- Strupp, H.H. (1986). Psychotherapy: Research, practice, and public policy (how to avoid dead ends). American Psychologist, 41(2), 120-130.

UNCLASSIFIED

SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF THIS PAGE

## REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |       |                                           |                                                                                                                                        |                                                       |                         |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|-------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------|
| 1a REPORT SECURITY CLASSIFICATION<br>Unclassified                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |       |                                           | 1b RESTRICTIVE MARKINGS<br>None                                                                                                        |                                                       |                         |
| 2a SECURITY CLASSIFICATION AUTHORITY<br>N/A                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |       |                                           | 3 DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY OF REPORT<br>Approved for public release;<br>distribution unlimited                                        |                                                       |                         |
| 2b DECLASSIFICATION/DOWNGRADING SCHEDULE<br>N/A                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |       |                                           |                                                                                                                                        |                                                       |                         |
| 4 PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER(S)<br><br>NHRC Report No. 89 - 11                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |       |                                           | 5 MONITORING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER(S)                                                                                             |                                                       |                         |
| 6a NAME OF PERFORMING ORGANIZATION<br>Naval Health Research Center                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |       | 6b OFFICE SYMBOL<br>(If applicable)<br>40 | 7a NAME OF MONITORING ORGANIZATION<br>Commander, Naval Medical Command                                                                 |                                                       |                         |
| 6c ADDRESS (City, State, and ZIP Code)<br>P.O. Box 85122<br>San Diego, CA 92138-9174                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |       |                                           | 7b ADDRESS (City, State, and ZIP Code)<br>Department of the Navy<br>Washington, DC 20372                                               |                                                       |                         |
| 8a NAME OF FUNDING/SPONSORING ORGANIZATION<br>Naval Medical Research & Development Command                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |       | 8b OFFICE SYMBOL<br>(If applicable)       | 9 PROCUREMENT INSTRUMENT IDENTIFICATION NUMBER<br>Naval Military Personnel Command Reimbursable<br>Doc #N0002288WKWW508, Appro 1781804 |                                                       |                         |
| 8c ADDRESS (City, State, and ZIP Code)<br>Naval Medical Command National Capital Region<br>Bethesda, MD 29814-5044                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |       |                                           | 10 SOURCE OF FUNDING NUMBERS                                                                                                           |                                                       |                         |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |       |                                           | PROGRAM<br>ELEMENT NO                                                                                                                  | PROJECT<br>NO                                         | TASK<br>NO              |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |       |                                           | WORK UNIT<br>ACCESSION NO.                                                                                                             |                                                       |                         |
| 11 TITLE (Include Security Classification)<br><br>(U) SOME CLINICAL DIAGNOSES ARE MORE RELIABLE THAN OTHERS                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |       |                                           |                                                                                                                                        |                                                       |                         |
| 12 PERSONAL AUTHOR(S)<br>Brock Kilbourne, Jerry Goodman, and Susan Hilton                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |       |                                           |                                                                                                                                        |                                                       |                         |
| 13a TYPE OF REPORT<br>Interim                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |       | 13b TIME COVERED<br>FROM TO               |                                                                                                                                        | 14 DATE OF REPORT (Year, Month, Day)<br>1989 March 29 |                         |
| 15 PAGE COUNT                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |       |                                           |                                                                                                                                        |                                                       |                         |
| 16. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTATION                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |       |                                           |                                                                                                                                        |                                                       |                         |
| 17 COSATI CODES                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |       |                                           | 18 SUBJECT TERMS (Continue on reverse if necessary and identify by block number)                                                       |                                                       |                         |
| FIELD                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | GROUP | SUB-GROUP                                 | Mental Disorder Diagnoses                                                                                                              |                                                       |                         |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |       |                                           | Reliability                                                                                                                            |                                                       |                         |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |       |                                           | Clinical Judgement                                                                                                                     |                                                       |                         |
| 19 ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse if necessary and identify by block number)<br>The purpose of the present study was to facilitate understanding of the nature of mental disorder diagnoses by examining the extent to which the degree of diagnostic specificity and the social context impact on diagnostic agreement. Also, the present study investigated the transformative nature of certain mental disorder diagnoses. The population consisted of all hospitalized cases of active duty, enlisted Navy personnel between 1981 and 1984, inclusive, with a mental problem as the primary diagnosis. Two nonexclusive subsamples were investigated. Diagnostic group was a more reliable measure than diagnostic type. Diagnostic type, in turn, was a more reliable measure than diagnostic subtype. And, certain diagnostic types and subtypes were consistently more reliable across time than others. Kappa values associated with diagnostic types and subtypes differed significantly in the two samples. Thus, degree of diagnostic specificity and the social context affected the reliability across time of ICD-9 mental disorder diagnoses. |       |                                           |                                                                                                                                        |                                                       |                         |
| 20 DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY OF ABSTRACT<br><input type="checkbox"/> UNCLASSIFIED/UNLIMITED <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> SAME AS RPT <input type="checkbox"/> DTIC USERS                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |       |                                           | 21 ABSTRACT SECURITY CLASSIFICATION<br>Unclassified                                                                                    |                                                       |                         |
| 22a NAME OF RESPONSIBLE INDIVIDUAL<br>Brock Kilbourne                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |       |                                           | 22b TELEPHONE (Include Area Code)<br>(619) 553-9968                                                                                    |                                                       | 22c OFFICE SYMBOL<br>40 |