



MICROCOPY RESOLUTION TEST CHART NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS-1963-A

### David W. Taylor Naval Ship Research and Development Center

Bethesda, MD 20084-5000

# STHE FILE COPY

DTNSRDC-SME-87/41 June 1987

Ship Materials Engineering Department Research and Development

## High Temperature Hot Corrosion Control by Fuel Additives (Contaminated Fuels)

by

Dasara V. Rathnamma David Taylor Naval Ship R&D Center and R. Nagarajan West Virginia University

Morgantown, West Virginia 26505





Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.

87 7 14 056

ECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF THIS PAGE		A.	D-11	18299	<u>&gt; 8 </u>
	REPORT DOCU	MENTATION	PAGE		
a. REPORT SECURITY CLASSIFICATION	16 RESTRICTIVE	MARKINGS			
a. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION AUTHORITY		3 DISTRIBUTION	AVAILABILITY	OF REPORT	
b DECLASSIFICATION / DOWNGRADING SCHED	ULE	Approved	l for publi mited.	c release; d	listribution
Cleared for public release	E P/S)		ORGANIZATION		
DTNSRDC/SME-87/41	54(3)	3 MONTORING	ORGANIZATION		(3)
a NAME OF PERFORMING ORGANIZATION David W. Taylor Naval Ship R&D Center	6b OFFICE SYMBOL (If applicable) Code 2813	7a NAME OF M	ONITORING OR	GANIZATION	<u></u>
c. ADDRESS (City, State, and ZIP Code)	-	7b. ADDRESS (Cr	ity, State, and 2	IP Code)	<u></u>
Bethesda, MD 20084-5000					
a NAME OF FUNDING/SPONSORING ORGANIZATION Office of Naval Research	8b. OFFICE SYMBOL (If applicable) R1232	9 PROCUREMEN	IT INSTRUMENT	IDENTIFICATION N	NUMBER
c. ADDRESS (City, State, and ZIP Code)	-	10 SOURCE OF	FUNDING NUME	BERS	
		PROGRAM	PROJECT	TASK	WORK UNIT
(See reverse side)		ELEMENT NO	NO	NO	
(See reverse side) TITLE (Include Security Classification) High Temperature Hot Corrosi PERSONAL AUTHOR(S) Rathnamma, Dasara V. and Nag	on Control by Fu arajan, R.	ael Additives	NO R0838	NO R0838SL	DNS 7815
(See reverse side) 1 TITLE (Include Security Classification) High Temperature Hot Corrosi 2 PERSONAL AUTHOR(S) Rathnamma, Dasara V. and Nag 3a TYPE OF REPORT Final 3a TYPE OF REPORT Final 5 SUPPLEMENTARY NOTATION This paper is prepared for p Corrosion from Nov 7-11, 198 7 COSATI CODES FIELD GROUP SUB-GROUP SUB-GROUP The potential of fuel a been analyzed by the followi	on Control by Fu arajan, R. OVERED t 85 TO Dec 86 resentation at to 7 in Madras, Inc 18 SUBJECT tows of Fuel addit: Thermodynar _(continued and identify by block of dditives to mini-	telement no 63724N ael Additives 14 DATE OF REPO 1987 Jun the 10th Inte ives, Blade m nic corrosion on reverse s humber) imize corrosi	NO R0838 s (Contamir ORT (rear, Monine ernational se if necessary a material, Monine o predictions side) C	NO RO838SL hated_Fuels) (h, Day) 15 PAG 29 Congress on Molten Solut (olten Solut on, Chemical de-material program Was	DNS 7815: E COUNT Metallic ock number) ion, equilibrium has em-
(See reverse side) 1 TITLE (Include Security Classification] High Temperature Hot Corrosi 2 PERSONAL AUTHOR(S) Rathnamma, Dasara V. and Nag 3a. TYPE OF REPORT Final 13b TIME OF From OC 5 SUPPLEMENTARY NOTATION This paper is prepared for p Corrosion from Nov 7-11, 198 7 COSATI CODES FIELD GROUP 9 ABST CC (Continue on reverse if necessary The potential of fuel a been analyzed by the followi ployed for an equilibrium-th next relevant physico-chemic on predicted equilibrium com calculated for this solution our predicted oxide dissolut rate data, seeking verificati oxide dissolution - in hot c	on Control by Fu arajan, R. OVERED t 85 TO Dec 86 resentation at fr 7 in Madras, Inc 18 SUBJECT towns of Fuel addit: Thermodynamic continued and identify by block of dditives to mini- ng series of ste ermodynamic pred al properties of position; then of in contact with ion-rate result: on of the model orrosion.	telement no 63724N nel Additives 14 DATE OF REPO 1987 Jun the 10th Inte ives, Blade m nic corrosion on reverse s humber) imize corrosi pumber) imize corrosi on reverse s humber) imize corrosi on reverse s humber) imize corrosi on reverse s humber)	NO R0838 (Contamin PRT (Year, Monu- ernational se if necessary a material, Monu- material, Monu- se if necessary a material, Monu- se if necessary a solution of black solution o	NO RO838SL hated_Fuels) (h, Day) (15 PAG) 29 Congress on Mod identify by bloc folten Solut on, Chemical de-material program was olution composere estimat issolution r . Finally, w imental hot ing process	DNS 7815: E COUNT Metallic E count Metallic Metallic ion, equilibrium has em- osition; ed based ates are e compare corrosion - i.e.,
(See reverse side) 1 TITLE (Include Security Classification) High Temperature Hot Corrosi 2 PERSONAL AUTHOR(S) Rathnamma, Dasara V. and Nag 3a TYPE OF REPORT Final 13b TIME OF From OC 6 SUPPLEMENTARY NOTATION This paper is prepared for p Corrosion from Nov 7-11, 198 7 COSATI CODES FIELD GROUP 9 ABSTUCC (Continue on reverse if necessary The potential of fuel a been analyzed by the followi ployed for an equilibrium-th next relevant physico-chemic on predicted equilibrium com calculated for this solution our predicted oxide dissolut rate data, seeking verificati oxide dissolution - in hot c	on Control by Fu arajan, R. OVERED t 85 TO Dec 86 resentation at fr 7 in Madras, Inc 18 SUBJECT LEMAS of Fuel addit: Thermodynar (continued and identify by block of dditives to min: ng series of sto ermodynamic pred al properties of position; then of in contact with ion-rate result: on of the model orrosion.	telement no 63724N ael Additives 14 DATE OF REPO 1987 Jur the 10th Inte ives, Blade r nic corrosion on reverse s humber) imize corrost eps: first, a diction of co f the molten oxide solubi n various so s with availa for the rate	NO RO838 s (Contamir ORT (rear, Monine ernational se if necessary a naterial, Monine ion of black a computer ondensed so solution to lity and d lid oxides able exper- e determin	NO RO838SL hated_Fuels) (h, Day) (15 PAG 29 Congress on ond identify by blo Molten Solut on, Chemical de-material program was olution comp were estimat issolution r . Finally, w imental hot ing process	DNS 7815: E COUNT Metallic boxk number) ion, equilibrium has em- osition; ed based ates are e compare corrosion - i.e.,

UNCLASSIFIED

(Block 18 Continued)

Oxide solubility, solution properties, Brownian High Schmidt number diffusional flux of oxide, Dissolution rate, Hot corrosion rate, Mass transfer, Concentration gradient, Oxide solvent interface, Multicomponent liquids, Life prediction.

(Block 8c.)

ONR Office of Energy and Natural Resources Technology Department of the Navy 800 N. Quincy Street Arlington, Virginia 22217



Accesson For	1
NTIS CRA&I	M
DTIC TAB	
Ununnout red	L)
Just Doctors	
E	
Det dy des el	
a gradbaty	Codes
- A	ារបា
$\mathbf{F} \mathbf{D}_{i} \mathbf{U}_{i} = \mathbf{U}_{i} \mathbf{U}_{i} \mathbf{U}_{i}$	scal
A-/'	
したれ ちょう あっき	

#### CONTENTS

00002222

11.022323-0

**CORALIN** 

and the second second second second

	Page
NOTATION	v
ABSTRACT	1
ADMINISTRATIVE INFORMATION	1
INTRODUCTION	1
THEORY OF HOT CORROSION: THE OXIDE DISSOLUTION CRITERION	2
OXIDE DISSOLUTION RATE (ODR) CALCULATION: SINGLE LIQUIDS	3
ODR CALCULATION: MULTICOMPONENT LIQUIDS	6
EFFECT OF ADDITIVES	7
EQUILIBRIUM THERMODYNAMIC PREDICTION OF SOLUTION COMPOSITION	8
ESTIMATION OF SOLUTION/OXIDE DISSOLUTION PROPERTIES BASED ON	
PREDICTED EQUILIBRIUM COMPOSITION	10
OXIDE SOLUBILITY AND DISSOLUTION RATE CALCULATIONS BASED ON PREDICTED	
SOLUTION PROPERTIES	11
CORRELATION OF COMPUTED OXIDE DISSOLUTION RATE WITH EXPERIMENTAL HOT	
CORROSION DATA	13
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE WORK	17

#### FIGURES

1.	Relative c	alculated (	model re	sults	for	the	three	binary	solutions	of	
	the sodium	sulfate-v	anadium	oxide	syst	e <b>n.</b> .	• • • • • •				12

1.0

· . /.

.

~

. •

and the second

#### FIGURES (Continued)

#### Page

TRUTY

2.	Calculated corrosion relative to the no-additive corrosion rate	
	of 910 mg/in <sup>2</sup> x 100 hr	14
3.	Corrosion of 310 alloy with organo-metallic additives	15

Contraction of the second

Carrier and

#### TABLES

1.	NSFO fuel	composition	for	burner rig	tests	3	,
----	-----------	-------------	-----	------------	-------	---	---

#### NOTATION

Symbol

	A	Pre-exponential constant in eq. (4), $kg/(ms)$
	D	Diffusion coefficient, m <sup>2</sup> /s
	Eμ	Fluidization-energy parameter in eq. (4)
	j"o,w	Oxide dissolution flux $kg/(m^2 s)$
	k m	Mass transfer coefficient $kg/(m^2 s)$
	Μ	Molecular weight, kg/kg mol
	R	Universal gas constant, J/(kg mol K)
	8	Streamline distance, m
	Т	Temperature, K
	X	Mole fraction in liquid phase
	٨	Latent heat, of fusion, J/kg mol
	*	Dynamic viscosity, kg/(ms)
	e	Density, kg/m <sup>3</sup>
	σ	Molecular diameter, Å
	7	Shear stress, $kg/(ms^2)$
	ω	Mass fraction
Su	bscripts	
	Ъ	Bulk liquid
	dp	Dew point

eff Effective Mass transfer

mp Melting point

o Oxide solute

v

#### NOTATION (Continued)

← → function of

CONTRACT TRACE COLOR MODERS & AM

ç

#### ABSTRACT

The potential of fuel additives to minimize corrosion of blade material in gas turbine engines has been analyzed by the following series of steps: first, a computer program was employed for an equilibrium thermodynamic prediction of condensed solution composition; next relevant physicochemical properties of the molten solution were estimated based on predicted equilibrium composition; then oxide solubility and dissolution rates were calculated for this solution in contact with various solid oxides. Finally, we compared our predicted oxide dissolution-rate results with available experimental data on hot corrosion rates. seeking verification of the model for the ratedetermining process -- i.e., oxide dissolution in hot corrosion.

#### ADMINISTRATIVE INFORMATION

This work was supported under the Navy Energy Research and Development Program, Mobility Fuels Program Element 63724N, Task Area R0838SL, Work Unit DN578153. The Program sponsor is Dr. Allen Roberts, Office of Naval Research, Code R1232 and the David Taylor Naval Ship Research and Development Center (DTNSRDC) task sponsor is Mr. Richard Strucko, DTNSRDC Code 2759. The work was conducted in the Marine Corrosion Branch.

#### INTRODUCTION

High chrome steels and superalloys, which are used extensively for high temperature boilers and gas turbine (GT) engines and related components because of their superior high temperature mechanical properties, are susceptible to a form of environmental attack known as "hot corrosion." Hot corrosion is encountered when, for example, liquid ( $\ell$ ) Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> is deposited either as a pure phase or in solution with vanadium compounds from combustion gases onto turbine blades and other hot components. Among the factors expected to affect the corrosion resis-

tance of the normally protective oxide coatings are the effective solubilities in the deposited molten salts of protective oxide coatings, and accompanying rate of "dissolution" of the oxide layer. At locations where the oxide scale is partially dissolved, the underlying metal is more accessible, and hence more vulnerable, to corrosive attack.

#### THEORY OF HOT CORROSION: THE OXIDE DISSOLUTION CRITERION

A model has been developed [1] for life prediction for AISI 310 alloy and Navy special fuel oil (NSFO, composition shown in table 1) based on statistical analysis of an extensive body of data available from burner rig tests covering a wide variety of metallic fuel additives [2]. Although current interest is in superalloys for gas turbine applications, far more data for testing prospective models exist for AISI 310 steel. Further,  $Cr_2O_3$  is the major protective oxide, and more data are available for that oxide than for other oxides which play an important role in protective coatings of superalloys. This research [2] has concentrated on understanding the aggravating effects of trace vanadium in the fuel, and relatively little data are available for model comparison with superalloy corrosion.

The approach described in this paper was to develop a model from theoretical principles and then verify it by comparison with the experimental results, the emphasis being on modeling the effect of fuel additives on hot corrosion. Our modeling of the rate of the hot corrosion process is based on the following important hypothesis [3]: There is a strong correlation between regions on a blade where the predicted oxide dissolution rate is high and regions which ultimately exhibit severe hot corrosion. Corrosion "maps," which have been reported for a few test turbine blades [4], have been found to agree reasonably well with our predicted relative oxide dissolution rate (RODR) profiles for the same blade.

Carbon (wt%)	87.2
Hydrogen (wt%)	10.8
Sulfur	1.83
Water & Sediment (wt%)	0.10
Ash (wt%)	0.043
Vanadium (ppm)	170
Sodium (ppm)	22
Other Metals (ppm)	47
Heating Value (Btu/1b)	18,617
	1

Table 1. NSFO fuel composition for burner rig tests.

#### OXIDE DISSOLUTION RATE (ODR) CALCULATION: SINGLE LIQUIDS

We assume the oxide dissolution rate in the flowing molten salt solvent layer (solution) to be limited by the rate of oxide (solute) diffusion from the oxide/solvent interface to the bulk-liquid. The Brownian high-Schmidt number diffusional flux of oxide into the liquid may be represented as a product of a mass transfer coefficient and a concentration gradient:

 $j"o,w = k_m \cdot (\omega_{o,w} - \omega_{o,b} \quad (1)$ Where  $\omega_o$  is the oxide mass fraction at the melt/oxide interface ( $\omega$ ) or in the bulk liquid solution b, and  $k_m$ , the mass transfer coefficient,\* is estimated to be:

Our convective diffusion mass transfer approach to the prediction of the steady-state oxide dissolution rate is patterned after that of Stewart [11].

$$k_{\rm m} = 0.53837 \qquad \frac{D_{\rm o,\ell} \ell_{\ell}}{\left[D_{\rm o,\ell} \left(\frac{\tau_{\rm W}}{\mu_{\ell}}\right)^{-3/2} \int_{\rm o}^{\rm s} \left(\tau_{\rm W}/\mu_{\ell}\right)^{1/2} {\rm ds}\right]^{1/3}} \qquad (2)$$

The Brownian diffusion coefficient,  $D_{o,\ell}$ , of the oxide solute in the condensed liquid is calculated according to the Stokes-Einstein equation [5]:

$$D_{o,l} \cong \frac{k T_{W}}{3 \pi \mu_{l} \sigma_{o,eff}}$$
(3)

where k is the Boltzmann constant,  $T_w$  is the local blade surface temperature,  $\mu_l$ is the viscosity of the liquid phase, and  $\alpha_{o,eff}$ , the effective size of the solute molecule in the solvent, is tentatively estimated as the "hard-sphere" diameter of the corresponding metal element (e.g., Cr in the case of  $Cr_2O_3$  protective coating).\*\* Molten sulfate, vanadate and oxide viscosities have been measured over a wide temperature range [6,7] and can be expressed as a function of temperature in the following activation-energy formulation:

Personal Production

$$\mu_{\ell}(T_{u}) = A \exp(-E_{\mu}/T_{u}).$$
(4)

Other factors involved in the estimation of  $k_m$  (eq. (2)) include the liquid density,  $e_{\ell}$ , and the shearing stress due to the mobile liquid layer,  $\tau_{\omega}$ . Condensate layer flow due to gas aerodynamic, centrifugal (in the case of rotor blades), and surface-tension shear forces provide a continuous "fluxing" mechanism by which fresh solvent is supplied to the dissolution site and the dissolved oxide is transported away toward the tip and trailing edge of the blade [8]. This appears to be a more logical framework to explain why the melt does <u>not</u> saturate

<sup>\*\*</sup> In view of the limited experimental data and consequent uncertainty regarding the identity of the oxide species in solution, we here estimate in effect its "maximum" diffusion coefficient in order to provide a safe or conservative estimate of life.

locally with the oxide than proposed explanations involving local oxide dissolution/reprecipitation processes sustained, by a negative (normal) gradient of oxide solubility at the oxide/salt interface [9], or by a thermally-induced surface tension gradient [10].

The integral in the denominator of the right-hand side of eq. (2) is to be performed along streamlines of the shear-driven condensate flow. Thus s stands for the <u>streamwise</u> distance. The oxide mass fractions in the liquid that provide the concentration gradient for the dissolution process are estimated as follows: The oxide saturation mass fraction at the melt/oxide interface,  $\omega_{0,W}$ , is taken to be the following "ideal-solubility" ("seturation") value [12] in the absence of inherent interfacial kinetic limitations to the maximum local dissolution rate [13]

$$\omega_{o,w} = \omega_{o,w,sat} \cong \frac{M_{o}}{M_{\ell}} \exp\left(\frac{\Lambda_{o}}{R} \cdot \left(\frac{1}{T_{mp,o}} - \frac{1}{T_{w}}\right)\right) .$$
(5)

 $M_{o}$  and  $M_{\ell}$  are the molecular weights of the oxide and liquid, respectively;  $\Lambda_{o}$  is the latent heat of oxide fusion, R the universal gas constant, and  $T_{mp,o}$  is the melting-temperature of the oxide. For a given oxide/solvent combination, this saturation mass fraction is then a function only of local surface temperature. However, the oxide mass fraction in bulk liquid,  $\omega_{o,b}$ , depends on the relative rates of local solvent deposition and solute dissolution, as well as the streamline inflow of material from upstream locations. In the present analysis, we assume that  $\omega_{o,b}$  is negligible compared to  $\omega_{o,w}$ , thereby suppressing a major flow effect but biasing for maximum dissolution rates, which are of interest to design engineers.

#### ODR CALCULATION: MULTICOMPONENT LIQUIDS

Once physico-chemical properties of pure liquids, e.g.,  $Na_2SO_4$ ,  $NAVO_3$ , and  $V_2O_5$ , have been obtained, properties of <u>ideal</u> multicomponent solutions between these may subsequently be approximated as arithmetic (weighted) means of the constituent properties, i.e.,

$$e_{\ell} \cong X_{1} e_{\ell,1} + X_{2} e_{\ell,2}$$

$$\mu_{\ell} \cong X_{1} \mu_{\ell,1} + X_{2} \mu_{\ell,2}$$

$$M_{\ell} \cong X_{1} M_{\ell,1} + X_{2} M_{\ell,2} .$$
(6)

where 1 and 2 are the components in a binary solution, and X's represent liquid compositions. The effect of nonideality, neglected here, can be incorporated as a correction factor that is related closely to the heat of mixing [14].

The composition dependence of a solution's freezing point is determined from available phase diagrams [15], and may also be obtained using computer programs written to generate phase diagrams (e.g., POTCOMP [16]). The effect of lowering the melting point of solution condensates below the pure-component values is important in view of the fact that solid condensed phases on turbine blades are relatively benign with respect to hot corrosion. Typical illustrations of this effect are low-temperature hot corrosion by  $CoSO_4 - Na_2 SO_4$  mixtures [17] and corrosion by  $Na_2SO_4 - V_2O_5 - Na_2V_2O_6$  solutions in gas turbines burning liquid fuels containing sodium and vanadium [18,19].

In addition to lowering the freezing point, solution-forming contaminants increase the solution dew point, thereby further widening the potentially dangerous temperature interval  $(T_{dp} - T_{mp})$  in which hot corrosion can occur. Introduction of a second trace species can potentially lower the vapor pressure of the

primary species at the gas/condensate interface (w) if the introduced species forms a solution condensate with primary species, and the effect would increase the vapor-diffusional flux of that species toward (w). In our present theory, single species diffusional deposition fluxes, e.g.,  $Na_2SO_4$  (t) on the surface, are taken as single vapor (precursor, e.g.,  $Na_2SO_4(g)$ ) concentration diffusion through a chemically frozen boundary layer (CFBL). In the multicomponent case, individual constituents still deposit by single species vapor diffusion, but their molar fluxes have to be in the same ratio as their mole fractions in the condensed phase. A more detailed discussion of these aspects, and other considerations and limitations of the total deposition rate calculation is available elsewhere [3,5,8,13]. The theoretical rate, j"o,m, (see figures la-c) is scaled proportionally by deposition rate calculated on the basis of trace vapor diffusion model.

#### EFFECT OF ADDITIVES

Modeling the effect of fuel additives in hot corrosion environments involves the following steps: (1) Calculate equilibrium thermodynamic compositions of the condensed solutions; (2) Obtain or estimate necessary physico-chemical properties of the molten equilibrium solutions; (3) Model oxide solubilities and dissolution rates for the various solid oxides in contact with the equilibrium solution, and (4) Compare the predicted oxide dissolution rates with available experimental data to verify this oxide dissolution model for the rate-determining process in hot corrosion.

#### EQUILIBRIUM THERMODYNAMIC PREDICTION OF SOLUTION COMPOSITION

The complex Chemical Equilibrium Calculation (CEC) computer program developed at NASA Lewis Research Center (LeRC) [20] makes use of an extensive thermodynamic database and an efficient free-energy minimization algorithm to make local thermochemical equilibrium (LTCE) calculations of gas and liquid compositions at assigned temperature, pressure, and elemental ratios, for example, of the fuel entering a combustor [21]. While a few generally available computer programs [22] apparently have the ability to consider solutions at other than unit activity of the components, they are unsuitable for computations of mixtures as complex as Navy fuel. Calculation of solutions at realistic activities is essential to avoid completely erroneous thermodynamic predictions. The NASA CEC program is being modified at LeRC\* and the current version, which treats ideal solution condensates, was used here to compute solution compositions. The LeRC solution-capable version of the CEC code certainly has limitations in its present form -- e.g., singular matrices are sometimes encountered when condensed phases are added, or reintroduced as the temperature is lowered from an all-vapor state; the code occasionally fails to converge, getting caught in an infinite cycle of condensed phase additions and removals. Avoiding these problems requires care. More serious is a failure to model the physical state in that the database form requires use of the most stable pure phase thermodynamic functions for all components in a solution. This results in the curious inclusion of solid species in a liquid

<sup>\*</sup> F.J. Zeleznik, unpublished work, National Aeronautics and Space Administration, Lewis Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio (1986)

solution. However, for this work, the temperatures considered are above, or near, all liquidus temperatures, so this problem is minor. In many respects, however the CEC code is still more robust than many other free-energy minimization codes, e.g., it aggressively selects the atomic/molecular basis to improve convergence and avoid singularities. It has been deliberately optimized to improve accuracy for parts-per-million level trace species. The CEC was used to compute mole fractions.

Equilibrium thermodynamic calculations were performed at a surface temperature of 1144 K and at atmospheric pressure. The additive level is expressed as the atomic ratio of metal additive to vanadium in the fuel. Results indicate that all additives considered tend to increase the mole fraction of  $Na_2SO_4$  (*t*) in solution, by preferentially forming gaseous and solid compounds with the vanadium present. Potassium, sodium, barium, iron, lead, and magnesium induce the greatest enrichment of the sulfate in the condensed phase, whereas introduction of Zn, Al, Nd, and Ce leads to least sulfate enrichment. The concentration of the corrosive sodium vanadate is reduced since vanadium forms vanadates with additive metals.

The phase fraction of entire condensed material as a function of the additive's metal concentration was also obtained from CEC calculations (plots not shown here). Except for Na and Zn, all other additives tend to depress the amount of condensed solution that forms. The less the amount of deposition of molten liquid phases, of course, the less the extent of hot corrosion initiated by oxide layer dissolution. It is worth noting that while nearly all additives considered here are quite effective in reducing net deposition of the molten phase, increasing the additive concentration beyond a certain level -- usually corresponding to a metal-to-vanadium atom ratio of about 2 -- is at best marginally successful, and often clearly counter-productive. Another interesting

observation is that zinc appears to be a "bad" additive based on this observation; however, a closer examination of condensed species formed reveals that the additional deposit is made up almost entirely of solid zinc vanadates which corrode surfaces only to a negligible extent. An analysis of the effect of metal additive concentration on  $Na_2SO_4$  (*t*) condensation indicates that the total amount (product of mole fraction and phase fraction) of  $Na_2SO_4$  (*t*) which condenses is raised to the greatest extent by zinc, barium, iron, and magnesium additives, whereas cerium, aluminum and nickel have the least effect.

## ESTIMATION OF SOLUTION/OXIDE DISSOLUTION PROPERTIES BASED ON PREDICTED EQUILIBRIUM COMPOSITION

Having acquired ideal solution composition data by using the CEC (solution) program, we proceed to estimate solution properties, such as density, viscosity and molecular weight, by the simple approximate "rules" stated in eq. (6). Among the pure liquids, considered here,  $Na_2SO_4$  (t) is the least dense and least viscous;  $NaVO_3$  (t) is the most viscous and  $V_2O_5$  (t) has the highest molecular weight and is most dense. Thus, in a  $Na_2SO_4$  (t) -  $NaVO_3$  (t) binary ideal solution, with increasing  $Na_2SO_4$  (t) concentration, the solution molecular weight increases, while the density and viscosity decrease; in a  $NaVO_3$  (t) -  $V_2O_5$  (t) solution with increasing  $NaVO_3$  (t) concentration, molecular weight and density decrease while viscosity increases; in the third binary solution in this ternary system,  $Na_2SO_4$  (t) -  $V_2O_5$  (t), with increasing  $Na_2SO_4$  (t) concentration, molecular weight, density and viscosity of the solution decrease.

OXIDE SOLUBILITY AND DISSOLUTION RATE CALCULATIONS BASED ON PREDICTED SOLUTION PROPERTIES

An examination of eqs. (2), (3) and (5) indicates that the dissolution rate of a given oxide\* should increase with

• decreasing liquid viscosity,

2443663.9

- increasing liquid density, and
- decreasing liquid molecular weight.

As the liquid phase composition changes, the oxide dissolution rate responds to physical-property changes acting in concert. The resulting relative oxide dissolution rate, liquid deposition rate, and oxide saturation mass fraction in solution profiles are plotted against composition for the three ideal binary solutions in figures 1a, 1b, and 1c. In solutions of  $Na_2SO_4$  (1) with  $NaVO_3$ and  $V_2O_5$ , as the sulfate mole fraction increases, so does the oxide dissolution rate; however, the oxide solubina2S04 (1) mole fraction in the Na2S04 - V26 Na2S04 (1) mole fraction in Na2S04 - V26 viewpoint of oxide solubility as the key may lead to serious errors in analysis a criterion, which incorporates in it the relevant. In the case of the NaV03 - V26 fraction in the solution increases with whereas the relative oxide dissolution to the vertex of the relevant of the relevant of the relevant of the solution increases with whereas the relative oxide dissolution to the solution of the sol solution rate; however, the oxide solubility decreases with increasing  $Na_2SO_4$  (1) mole fraction in the  $Na_2SO_4$  -  $NaVO_3$  solution and increases with  $Na_2SO_4$  (1) mole fraction in  $Na_2SO_4 - V_2O_5$  solution. Thus a simplistic viewpoint of oxide solubility as the key factor in determining hot corrosion rates may lead to serious errors in analysis should our more general dissolution-rate criterion, which incorporates in it the oxide solubility, prove to be more relevant. In the case of the NaVO<sub>3</sub> -  $V_2O_5$  liquid solution, the oxide mass fraction in the solution increases with increasing mole fraction of NaVO<sub>3</sub> (t), whereas the relative oxide dissolution rate decreases to a small extent initially,

and the state of the

<sup>\*</sup> When comparing different oxide species, smaller, faster-diffusing molecules of greater molecular weight, greater latent heat of fusion, and lower melting point appear to dissolve readily in a given molten-solvent liquid phase.



Solution Properties



and then increases slowly. The effect of composition change on the total solution deposition rate is minimal because the surface temperature is very low, presumably well below the dewpoint for the solution.

2022 12/20/100

202002

#### CORRELATION OF COMPUTED OXIDE DISSOLUTION RATE WITH EXPERIMENTAL HOT CORROSION DATA

The corrosion rate with no additive for a 310 alloy in a turbine burning Navy special grade fuel (see Table 1 for its composition) has been reported at 1600° F (1144 K) by Schab [2] to be 910  $mg/inch^2/100$  hours. This number is divided by the calculated oxide dissolution rate value in the presence of the appropriate liquid condensed phase and (no-additive) fuel make-up reported in table 1, to obtain a scale-up factor. Subsequent oxide dissolution rate predictions were multiplied by this scale-up factor in order to compare them directly with reported hot corrosion lata. In figures 2a, 2b, and 2c, we present scaled-up corrosion rates (computed values based on our oxide dissolution rate model) as a function of metal additive-to-vanadium atom ratio. In figure 3 we have reproduced the experimental results of Schab [2] pertaining to hot corrosion of 310 alloy in the presence of organo-metallic salt additives. Predicted trends indicate that magnesium, cadmium, cobalt, manganese, and nickel additives were the most effective suppressants of dissolution-controlled hot corrosion, whereas cerium and aluminum were among the less effective. Added sodium tends to enhance the corrosion rate considerably with respect to its zero-additive value; this appears reasonable in view of the fact that added sodium increases deposition rate of the condensed solution, as well as the fraction of solium sulfate in it. In addition, this prediction is in agreement with other reports of Na involvement in corrosion. However, most such reports are for Na at a few ppm. High sodium concentrations





Catal a la se a

14

Additive Effects

fig. 3. Corrosion of 310 allov Special Grade; Temperat 400 Sr ĸ - Cr Mn 2. — In 5 3 4 8 6 7 Ł CORROSION RATE WITH NO ADDITIVE TI • Co Li 6 LI ° Cđ ŝ 6 ATOMIC RATIO, ADDITIVE TO VANADIUM

Corrosion of 310 alloy with organo-metallic additives. Fuel -- Navy Special Grade; Temperature -- 1144 K (1600°F).

results reported by Schab [2] have also been reported elsewhere in literature [19]. Agreement between experimental hot corrosion rate results and our model predictions for the corrosion rate based on an oxide-dissolution criterion is encouragingly good; especially in a qualitative sense. Indeed, as per our theory, Mn, Cd, Co, Ni, Mg and Fe are found to be effective inhibitors of hot corrosion. There is a discrepancy between theory and experiments in the case of Na and K additives; potassium apparently has little influence on hot corrosion rates when used as an additive, and added sodium apparently decreases rates. These results are contrary to our findings. Perhaps, future refinements in our theory for hot corrosion and in the corrosion test procedures to obtain rate data would provide a closer match between theoretical expectations and experimental realizations.

In quantitative terms, predicted and observed corrosion rates are in closest agreement for tests involving magnesium, iron, cobalt, and nickel as additives, and in poorer agreement for sodium, potassium, and lanthanum additives. For some additives, e.g., Nd, La, Mn, experiments indicate a far greater corrosion suppression effect than the model predicts. Both experiments and model predictions show a leveling off in the reduction in corrosion rate beyond a certain concentration of the additive, but the leveling predicted by our model begins sooner (at an additive-to-vanadium atomic ratio of about 1 to 1.2) than observed experimentally. In addition, the predicted corrosion rate curves turn up eventually, corresponding to additive concentrations which continue to enrich the solution in the sulfate after an asymptotic limit to the total condensed-phase fraction has been reached. This behavior is not manifested by experimental hot corrosion rate data.

he following steps are expected to improve the agreement between theoretical model predictions and the experimental results [3]. First, instead of a single vapor diffusional model, the model can include multicomponent transport for boundary layer deposition suitable for the marine environment. Kinetic limitations to interfacial oxide/solvent rate process, if incorporated will reduce the maximum diffusion controlled oxide dissolution rate [8]. Also, additional experiments should be performed with modified additives which include compounds to deliberately promote or prevent the nucleation of inorganic condensates (aerosols). In addition, the CEC code needs improvement. Having more accurate thermodynamic data for all of the vanadium compounds used in the computer calculations is certainly the key to obtaining more accurate results. It is important to remember that the burner rig is not a research instrument and the corrosion measurements are only approximate. And finally, the estimation process is to be refined by using better support data like viscosities, shearing stresses and densities.

#### CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE WORK

The work presented here represents a new major effort to study the interrelated problems of molten-condensate deposition and subsequent hot corrosion. It is an attempt to apply a theoretically-based model of the deposition process, coupled with a thermodynamic equilibrium solution-based calculation of the liquid deposit to permit a dynamic dissolution model calculation. Previous work in this area has been confined predominantly to statistical regression analyses, coupled with simplified mechanistic models. The use of regression analyses to identify significant parameters or to provide working correlations has its values for analyzing the quality of experimental data as well as in identifying sensitive

model parameters. However, corrosion data continues to be accumulated at a steady pace, and unless theoretical or computer-modelling based efforts are undertaken, analyses of the data will remain a collection of empirical correlations. Several possible improvements in the theory presented here have been discussed elsewhere in other applications [8], and will be incorporated as data become available. Identification of underlying theoretical frameworks can only improve the use of such methods in analysis of experimental data. The use of local thermodynamic equilibrium codes, such as the NASA LERC CEC code used here, to predict gas and liquid phase compositions, and the development of a mass transfer model to predict the rate of oxide dissolution into the liquid phase constitute the first steps in what will undoubtedly be a continuous process of model refinement on the basis of feedback obtained from comparison with hot corrosion test data. The long term goal of this research is life prediction for turbine blades used in hot corrosive environments.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors acknowledge Dr. David W. Bonnell for critical reading of this manuscript. This work was supported by the Fuel Qualification Procedure Project (FQP), funded by the United States Navy's Office of Naval Research. The program sponsor is Allen Roberts, Code R1232, Energy and Natural Resources Technology Office, Washington, D.C.

#### REFERENCES

- Rathnamma, D. V. and D. W. Bonnell, "Contaminated Fuel Combustion and Material Degradation Life Prediction Model," <u>Proc., High Temperature Alloys</u> <u>for Gas Turbines and other Applications</u>, W. Betz et al, editors, D. Reidel Publishing Company, p. 1105-1116 (1986).
- Schab, H. W. and Frank R. Gessner, "Reduction of Oil-Ash Corrosion by Use of Additives in Residual Fuels," United States Naval Engineering Experiment Station, Research and Development Report 070034C, NS-072-504 (17 Apr 1957).
- Rosner, D. E. and R. Nagarajan, "Vapor Deposition and Condensate Flow on Combustion Turbine Blades: Theoretical Model to Predict/Understand Some Corrosion Rate Consequences of Molten Alkali Sulfate Deposition in the Field or Laboratory," <u>Int. J. Turbo Jet Engines</u> (1987) (in press).
- 4. Fryxell, R. E. and I. I. Bessen, "Coating Life Assessment in Gas Turbines Operated for Ship Propulsion," in: <u>Proc., of 1974 Gas Turbine Materials in</u> <u>the Marine Environment Conf</u>., 24-26 Jul, 1974 J. W. Fairbanks, editor, Marine Maritime Academy, Castine, Maine, p. 259-276 (1974).
- Rosner, D. E., <u>Transport Processes in Chemically Reacting Flow Systems</u>, Butterworth Publishers (1986).
- Cutler, A.J.B., "Molten Sulfates," in: <u>Molten Salt Techniques</u>, Plenum Press (1983).
- Janz, G. J., Molten Salts: vol. 5, Part 2. Additional Single and Multi-Component Salt Systems; Electrical Conductance, Density, Viscosity and Surface Tension Data, J. Phys. Chem. Ref. Data 12, p. 591-815 (1983).
- Nagarajan, R., "Theory of Multicomponent Chemical Vapor Deposition (CVD) Boundary Layers and Their Coupled Deposits," Dissertation Thesis, Dept. of Chemical Engineering, Yale University (May, 1986).

#### REFERENCES (Continued)

- 9. Rapp, R. A. and K. Goto, in: <u>Proc., Fused Salt Symp. II</u>, J. Braunstein, editor, The Electrochemical Society, Princeton (1979).
- 10. Lau, K. and S. C. Singhal, "Fluxing of Protective Oxide Scales on Superalloys via a Thermal Surface Tension Gradient," Westinghouse R&D Center, 82-104-Metal-PI (1982).
- 11. Stewart, W. E., "Convective Heat and Mass Transport in Three-Dimensional Systems with Small Diffusivities," <u>Physiochemical Hydrodynamics</u>, vol. 1, p. 23-63 (1977).
- Denbigh, K. G. and J.C.R. Turner, <u>Principles of Chemical Equilibrium</u>, second edition, p. 267, equation 8-83 (1966).
- Rosner, D. E. and R. Nagarajan, "Transport Induced Shifts in Condensate Dew-Point and Composition in Multicomponent Systems With Chemical Reaction", Chem. Eng. Sci., vol. 40 p. 177-186 (1985).
- Moelwyn Hughes, E. A., <u>Physical Chemistry</u>, second edition, Pergamon Press (1964).
- 15. <u>Phase Diagrams for Ceramists</u>, vol. I-V. 1964-1983. Compiled at the U.S. National Bureau of Standards. Edited and published by the American Ceramic Society.
- 16. Bale, C. W., A. D. Pelton, and W. T. Thompson, <u>F\*A\*C\*T (Facility for the</u> <u>Analysis of Chemical Thermodynamics) User's Guide</u>, McGill University/Ecole Polytechnic, Montreal, Quebec, Canada (1979).
- 17. Jones, R. L., "Hot Corrosion in Gas Turbines," <u>Proc., of the Symp. on</u> <u>Corrosion in Fossil Fuels Systems</u>, vol. 83-5, Electrochemical Society, Pennington, N.J., (1983).

#### REFERENCES (Continued)

- 18. Luthra, K. L. and H. S. Spacil, "Impurity Deposits in Gas Turbines from Fuels Containing Sodiumm Vanadium," <u>J. Electrochem. Soc, Solid-State Sci. Tech</u>. p. 649-656 (1982).
- 19. Lahiri, A. K., H. R. Thilakan, and T. Banerjee, "Oil-Ash Corrosion of Alloy Steels at High Temperatures," <u>Proc.</u>, 4th Int. Conf. on <u>Metallic Corrosion</u>, N. E. Hamner, editor, National Association of Corrosion Engineers p. 269-270 (1969).
- 20. Gordon, S. and B. J. McBride, "Computer Program for Calculation of Complex Chemical Equilibrium Compositions, Rocket Performance, Incident and Reflected Shocks, and Chapman-Jouguet Detonations," NASA SP-273, Interim Revision, National Aeronautics and Space Administration, Lewis Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio (Mar 1976).
- 21. Kohl, F. J., B. J. McBride, F. J. Zeleznik, and S. Gordon, "Use of NASA CEC Code for the Prediction of Combustion Gas Deposit Composition," presented at the Spring meeting of the Electrichemical Soc., San Francisco, Calif, U.S.A. (May 8-13, 1983).
- 22. G. Eriksson, Chemica Scripta, ud 8, p. 100 (1975).

#### INITIAL DISTRIBUTION

			INITIAL DIST	RIBUTION		
Copie	S			CEN	NTER DISTR	IBUTION
2	CONR			Copies	Code	Name
	1	R1232	Allen Roberts	10	2759	R. Strucko
	1	R1232	Wayne Vreatt	1	2809	
5	NAVSEA			1	281	
	1	SEA 05D		2	2812	
	1	SEA 05R	23	30	2813	
	2	SEA 996	12			
	1	SEA 56	x 31			
1	NRL 61	79		1	2803	J. Cavallaro
12	DTIC			2	2801	D. Ventriglio
				1	284	
				1.	5211	Knox
				1	522.2	TIC (A)
				1	5231	Office Servic
			24	ł		

1.5

