





RISK PERCEPTION IN PSYCHOLOGY AND ECONOMICS

Ъy

Kenneth J. Arrow



Technical Report No. 351

October 1981

A REPORT OF THE CENTER FOR RESEARCH ON ORGANIZATIONAL EFFICIENCY STANFORD UNIVERSITY

Contract ONR-N00014-79-C-0685, United States Office of Naval Research

Construction of the second second

THE ECONOMICS SERIES INSTITUTE FOR MATHEMATICAL STUDIES IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES Fourth Floor, Encina Hall Stanford University Stanford, California 94305

RISK PERCEPTION IN PSYCHOLOGY AND ECONOMICS*

by

Kenneth J. Arrow

The concept of rationality has been basic to most economic analysis Its content has been successively refined over the generations. As applied to the static world of certainty, it has turned out to be a weak hypothesis, not easily refuted and therefore not very useful as an explanation, though not literally a tautology. But recent decades have seen the development of stronger versions applied to a world in which time and uncertainty are real. Among its most important manifestations have been criteria for consistency in allocation over time, the expected-utility hypothesis of behavior under uncertainty, and what may be termed the Bayesian hypothesis for learning, that is the consistent use of conditional probabilities for changing beliefs on the basis of new information. These hypotheses have been used widely in offering explanations of empirically-observed behavior, though, as not infrequently in economics, the theoretical development has gone much further than the empirical implementation. These hypotheses have also been used increasingly in normative analysis a component of benefit-cost studies (therefore frequently referred to) benefit-risk studies). The value of reducing mortality rates from diseases, for example, has been

*Presidential address to the Western Economic Association, presented June 17, 1981. This research was supported by the Office of Naval Research Grant ONR NO0014-7-C-0685 at the Center for Research on Organizational Efficiency, Stanford University. studied by assuming that choice of occupations is made <u>inter alia</u> by comparing wage differences with mortality differences (Thaler and Rosen [1976], Viscusi [1979]).

Hypotheses of rationalilty have been under attack for empirical falsity almost as long as they have been employed in economics. Thorstein Veblen long ago had some choice scarcastic passages about the extraordinary calculating abilities imputed to the average individual in his or her daily economic life by economists. More recently, Herbert Simon and his colleagues have produced much evidence of the difficulties of human beings in arriving at rational choices even in rather simple contexts (for a survey, see Simon [1979]).

The rationality or irrationality of choice has become a leading interest of the branch of psychology called, "cognitive psychology." This field of inquiry studies the capacity of human beings for perception and judgment. In the last twenty years, it has become a major field of psychological research, in contrast to earlier work which tended to emphasize either the role of emotions or mechanistic models for learning. In good measure, the expected-utility hypothesis provided an important starting-point for these studies, in the sense that it provided a refutable hypothesis and indeed one for which the testing of implications was rather straightforward. The economist Jacob Marschak was a major link between the formal developments of John von Neumann and Oskar Morgenstern [1947, Appendix, pp. 617-632], which had such great influence on economic theory, and the experimental work of the psychologists (see the papers reprinted in [1974, Volume I]). The earliest

-2-

experiment testing the expected-utility hypothesis seems to be that of Mosteller and Nogee [1951]; for a particularly fine study, see Davidson, Suppes, and Siegel [1957]. Herbert Simon's exploitation of the analogy between information processing in computers and that in human beings has also been very influential.

-3.

000000

LIN

Recently, the controversy over nuclear power and its effects has sharpened interest in the way individuals form risk judgments and act on In particular, it has proved very difficult to reconcile changes them. in public opinion attendant on new events with Bayesian learning models in any form. There has been renewed testing of expected-utility theory; one striking result has been the series of stunning experiments on the so-called "preference reversal" phenomenon by Lichterstein and Slovic [1971]. The subject is offered the choice between a pair of gambles. He or she is also asked to name, for each gamble, what is the certainty equivalent, i.e., the amount of money payment for certain which is indifferent to having the gamble. In many cases, the preferred gamble is found to have a lower certainty equivalent. This is a flat contradiction to transitivity in a fairly straightforward way. More recently Grether and Plott [1979] have replicated the experiments; they found themselves unable to develop any explanation consistent with the usual postulates of rationality.

A striking real life situation has given grounds for doubt as to the validity of the expected utility hypothesis. Since 1969, the United States government has offered flood insurance at rates which are well below their actuarial value. The intention was to relieve the pressure for the government to offer relief when floods occurred. Under the usual hypothesis of risk aversion, any individual should certainly be willing to take a favorable bet, even more because it offsets an otherwise fluctuating income. Yet until the government increased the pressure by various incentives, very few took out this insurance. A careful study by Kunreuther [1978] failed to uncover any reason consistent with the usual explanations of economic rationality. The main distinguishing characteristic of those who took out flood insurance was acquaintance with others who took out insurance. This might be taken as an explanation in terms of information costs, but the information seems so easy to acquire and the stakes so large that this hypothesis hardly seems tenable.

Experiments and very special forms of insurance might be regarded as exceptions to an hypothesis which has turned out to be useful in more central features of economic life. Securities and futures markets might be taken as better exemplars. I have followed some of the research in these fields as someone interested in the extension of general equilibrium theory to transactions over time and under conditions of uncertainty. In these fields, there have been rich theoretical developments and equally rich empirical studies. The two types of research have not directly followed on each other, but there has certainly been a strong resonance between them. There are many aspects of the literature which bear strongly on rational behavior and on the rationality of the allocations brought about by these markets, for example, studies of the extent

-4-

to which the market price fully reflects all the information available to those in the market. But I wish here to concentrate on the rational behavior of the participants.

One standard implication of rationality which has been drawn repeatedly in current research, both empirical and theoretical, is that the price of a security or futures contract at any moment is an unbiased predictor of the price at a future moment, as adjusted for discounting and, possibly, uncertainty. This implies that the price change from the present to the future is uncorrelated with current price. This, it is argued, is a rationality condition, but it is one based on rational learning from experience. For if it were not true, the individual observing the correlation could use the information to forecast the price change and therefore increase his or her wealth.

This argument presupposes that full use of available information, in this case an observed correlation presumably derived from past experience, is an aspect of rationality. It is assumed, then, that the rational individual will recognize any correlation to be found in the data.

Stewart's [1949] study of the grain futures market brought some rather discouraging evidence on this assertion. Stewart divided the participants in the market into three categories: large hedgers, primarily millers; professional speculators; and non-professional speculators, typically small. The first group lost, as was to be expected; they were in effect buying insurance, and their behavior was compatible with rational risk aversion. The second group made money; this was to

-5-

be expected if only because they could not have survived otherwise. But the third group lost, especially surprising since they should be able to share with the professionals in receiving the net payments of the hedgers. In fact, the third group would have done better if, each time they decided to enter the market for a fixed commitment, they flipped a coin to determine whether to go long or short.

This observation certainly suggests an inability to recognize a rather simple empirical regularity, namely that outside speculators typically lose. Why did they enter the market at all?

Stewart's data, incidentally, were drawn from direct examination of customers' accounts, rather than indirect inferences calculated from market prices. To the best of my knowledge, his study has not been replicated and perhaps could not be with present privacy restrictions.

In the securities and futures markets, there are typically arbitrage possibilities. That is, there are a set of connected markets which provide substitute outlets for purchase or sale. Thus, ultimately a futures contract can be compared with a spot position; a long-term bond is an alternative to a planned sequence of investments in shortterm notes, or a short-term note is an alternative to purchase and planned future sale of a long-term bond; stock purchases and sales can be arbitraged with both bond and note transactions and with future dividend payments by the firms. Since the holder is presumed to be interested solely in the money income (certan or uncertain) and not in the instrument from which it is derived, rationality has strong implications for the prices at which these instruments can sell. In the case

-6-

of bonds, for example, under conditions of certainty about future shortterm interests rates, the long-term interest rate must be effectively an average of them. More generally, the possibilities of arbitrage between long- and short-term interest-bearing securities gives rise to strong implications for the whole term structure of interest rates. But these implications are not always borne out in reality. Many years ago, Macaulay [1938, pp. 29-32] examined simultaneous offers of bonds of varying maturities by the City of Detroit and by the New York Central Railroad and computed the implicit forecasts of one-year interest rates. Both series were quite irregular and differed sharply from each other as to pattern as well as level. He concluded that it would be difficult indeed to believe that the yields were the result of any deliberate forecasts.

Recently there has been a profiferation of new futures markets, mostly on financial instruments--Treasury bills, foreign exchange, and mortgage rates. It was expected that they would increase the efficiency of resource allocation, in particular because rational behavior on the part of participants would pool the information available and cause a futures price to be a best forecast, relative to the information available to the market. There has been considerable disappointment. Cagan [1981, pp. 170-172], quoting a large number of studies, holds that the futures price is no more accurate as a predictor of the future spot price than is a simple extrapolation from the current spot price. This, by itself, might mean only that there is no private information, that indeed all the information available at the present time is public

-7-

knowledge and already reflected in the current spot price. But then, since there is little knowledge about the future, there is also little change in that knowledge from one day to the next. Yet prices on these financial futures markets are highly volatile. Indeed, this is an impression which many students of these markets and practitioners in them seem to have.

To put the matter slightly differently, when participants in the market behave rationally, prices should change only when there is new information. The change in price from today to a future date, say one or two years off, will be the sum of a large number of daily changes, each reflecting new information as of that day. Rationally, it is clear from this that the change in any one day should be small, since it is merely one small piece of information among many. Hence, it seems intuitively clear that daily variations in the futures and securities markets are excessive relative to the daily changes in information.

Indeed, probability theory supplies necessary relations among the variances of prices at different times or of prices in different markets related by arbitrage possibililties. Consider the simple case of a security or futures contract which is valued today only for the purpose of selling tomorrow. If the market is efficient, then the price today is, as previously noted, the expected value of the future price. Both present and future prices are random variables. Then it is easy to see that the variance of today's price must be less than that of the future

-8-

price, since by the unbiasedness hypothesis the future price is the sum of today's price and the price difference, the latter being a random variable with mean zero uncorrelated with today's price.

There have been several studies suggesting that when tests of this general type applied to arbitrage situations, the proposed inequalilties are violated. Especially noteworthy are Shiller's [1979, 1981] studies of the bond and stock markets. For example, in the bond market, the variability of long-term interest rates is too great to be explained as resulting from changing rational anticipations of future short-term rates.

I suggest that these failures of the rationality hypothesis are in fact compatible with some of the specific observations of cognitive psychologists. I am drawing especially on the work of Tversky and Kahneman [1974, 1981]. They and others have identified several heuristic devices by which individuals form cognitive judgements and note that, while each has useful properties, each can also lead to biases in judgement.

One is the <u>representativeness</u> heuristic. The individual judges the likelihood of a future event by the similarity of the <u>present</u> evidence to it. There is a tendency to ignore both prior information, what the Bayesian would call probabililties, and the quality of the present evidence, for example, the size of the sample used as present evidence. Let me illustrate by quoting an experiment. "Subjects were presented with several paragraphs, each describing the performance of a student teacher during a particular practice lesson. Some subjects were asked to <u>evaluate</u> the quality of the lesson. Others were asked to <u>predict</u> the standing of each student teacher five years after the practice lesson. The judgements under the two conditions were identical."

This typifies very precisely the excessive reaction to current information which seems to characterize all the securities and futures markets. It is a plausible hypothesis that individuals are unable to recognize that there will be many surprises in the future; in short, as much other evidence tends to confirm, there is a tendency to underestimate uncertainties. In the case of the student teacher, clearly there are many grounds for uncertainty in projecting the quality of one lesson into a forecast of performance five years hence: even in the present, the student teacher undoubtedly varies in performance from one time to the next, so that the one lesson may actually not be good evidence for present performance; and certainly the student teacher's performance will change in unpredictable ways under the influence of five years' maturity and experience. The best point forecast may well be the mean performance of all teachers, perhaps modified very slightly in the direction of the quality of the single lesson, just as the current weather is useless in improving on the statistical normal in predicting weather ten days hence.

The business world's concern about profit and loss statements reflects its awareness that the stockholding public uses the representativeness heuristic. There are frequently some choices as to how to represent gains and losses, especially as to their timing. The alternatives have no bearing on the true value of the firm and therefore should

-10-

11 14 A

È

have no bearing on the value of the firm's stock; but in fact they are seriously explored with regard to the effect of the profit and loss statement on stock prices. The recent liberalization of depreciation allowances created a dilemma for some firms; to receive the tax benefits, it was necessary to report larger depreciation and therefore reduce reported profits or, in some cases, turn them into losses. Even though there was by any standards a clear net gain to the firms, some of them were by no means happy with the change.

The experiments cited also have direct evidence on the insensitivity of judgements to sample size. This is true among professionally trained groups as well as laymen. Indeed, the use among all statistical research workers, including econometricians, of a fixed level of significance regardless of sample size reflects this bias, even though it has been understood since the work of Neyman and E. S. Pearson some fortyfive years ago that optimal statistical testing of hypotheses should depend on a balancing of Type I and Type II errors.

Incidentally, the apparent inability to recognize the importance of sample size is again a contradiction to the implication of efficient markets and rational expectations theory, noted above, that economic agents will discover any profitable relation. The unreliability of small samples is demonstrated in any individual's experience; but we are apparently not programmed to group these instances appropriately and so do not make the general inference.

The drawing of inferences depends then on preconceptions, which may be true or false. The cognitive psychologists refer to the

-11-

"framing" of questions, the effect of the way they are formulated on the answers. A fundamental element of rationality, so elementary that we hardly notice it, is, in logicians' language, its extensionality. The chosen element depends on the opportunity set from which the choice is to be made, independently of how that set is described. To take a familiar example, consider the consumer's budget set. It is defined by prices and income. Suppose income and all prices were doubled. Clearly, the set of commodity bundles available for purchase is unchang-Economists confidently use that fact to argue that the chosen ed. bundle is unchanged, so that consumer demand functions are homogeneous of degree zero in prices and income. But the description of the budget set, in terms of prices and income, has altered. It is an axiom that the change in desription leaves the decision unaltered.

The cognitive psychologists deny that choice is in fact extensional; the framing of the question affects the answer. Let me draw a dramatic illustration from some unpublished work on choice of medical therapy by McNeill, Pauker, Sox, and Tversky [1981]. McNeill and some of her colleagues have had a program, which economists should applaud, of introducing the patients' values into medical decision-making. In this study, the comparison was being made between two therapies, surgery and radiotheraphy, for the treatment of certain forms of cancer. A therapy defines a set of probabilities of survival after varying lengths of time. In general, surgery has a distinct risk of mortality during the operation but a better survival rate thereafter. Different groups of individuals, including a group of physicians, were presented with the

والمنافعة أوالقا والمعالية والمعالية والمنافية المعالية المتحافية والمتحافية والمحافظ والمحافظ والمحافظ والمحافظ

-12-

probabilities of survival during treatment, for one year, and for five years for each of the two therapies. With these data, 84% of the physicians preferred surgery, 16% radiation therapy. Then another group was presented with the same data expressed differently: the probabilities of dying at each stage were given instead of the probabilities of survival. At each stage, the probability of dying is, of course, merely 1 minus the probability of survival, so that the two formulations are not merely logically equivalent but can be transformed into each other by a trivial calculation. Yet the proportion of physicians choosing surgery over radiation therapy dropped from 84% to 50%.

This experiment suggests the possibility that the implications of information in the market may change with alternative frames of reference, which may themselves change because of all sorts of outside and irrelevant events. In the modern era of high technology, a "breakthrough" by a firm may enhance estimates of its prospects, even among sophisticated investors, well beyond any objective measure of possible profits. The extraordinary prices paid for stock in new firms planning to use recombinant DNA technologies are surely due to the framing of the prospects in terms of technological possibilities rather than the profit perspectives for the firm.

Any argument seeking to establish the presence of irrational economic behavior always meets a standard counterargument: if most agents are irrational, then a rational individual can make a lot of money; eventually, therefore, the rational individuals will take over all the wealth. Hence, rational behavior will be the effective norm.

-13-

There are two rebuttals to the counterargument: (1) Not all arbitrage possibilities exist. For example, corporate profits, even though down, are very distinctly positive in real terms, after all necessary adjustments, including taxes. Yet there seems no way by which the average investor in corporate sescurities can get a positive real rate of return. (2) More important, if everyone else is "irrational," it by no means follows that one can make money by being rational, at least in the short run. With discounting, even eventual success may not be worthwhile. Consider for example a firm that engages in research and development which depresses the current profit and loss statement. Irrational investors look only at this information, and therefore the price of the stock is below the expected value of future dividends based on the profitable outcomes of the research and development. In a perfectly working market with rational individuals, stock prices would gradually rise as the realization date approaches, but prices in the actual market would be constant. A rational investor would understand the future value of the stocks, but he or she could not realize any part of this gain during the gestation period. While the rational investor may get rewarded eventually if the stock is held long enough, he or she is losing liquidity during an intervening period which may be long. Hence, the demand for the stock even by the rational buyers will be depressed. As Keynes argued long ago, the value of a security depends in good measure on other people's opinions.

-14-

I hope to have made a case for the proposition that an important class of intertemporal markets shows systematic deviations from individual rational behavior and that these deviations are consonant with evidence from very different sources collected by psychologists.

References

- Cagan, P. [1981], "Financial Futures Markets: Is More Regulation Needed?" Journal of Futures Markets, Vol. 1, pp. 169-190.
- Davidson, D., P. Suppes, and S. Siegel [1957], <u>Decision Making</u>: An Experimental Approach, Stanford University Press.
- Grether, D. and C. Plott [1979], "Economic Theory of Choice and the Preference Reversal Phenomenon," American Economic Review, Vol. 69, pp. 623-638.
- Kunreuther, H. et. al. [1978], <u>Disaster Insurance Protection: Public</u> Policy Lessons, Wiley.
- Lichtenstein, S. and P. Slovic [1971], "Reversal of Preferences between Bids and Choices in Gambling Decisions," Journal of Experimental Psychology, Vol. 89, pp. 46-55.
- Macaulay, F.R. [1938], Some Theoretical Problems Suggested by the Movements of Interest Rates, Bond Yields and Stock Prices in the United States Since 1856, National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Marschak, J. [1974], Economic Information, Decision, and Prediction, D. Reidel.
- McNeill, B., S.J. Pauker, H.C. Sox, and A. Tversky [1981], "Patient Preferences for Alternative Therapies," unpublished.
- Mosteller, F. and P. Nogee [1951], "An Experimental Measurement of Utility," Journal of Political Economy, Vol. 59, pp. 371-404.
- von Neumann, J. and O. Morgenstern [1947], <u>Theory of Games and Economic</u> Behavior, Second Edition, Princeton University Press.
- Shiller, R.J. [1979], "The Volatility of Long-Term Interest Rates and Expectations Models of the Term Structure," <u>Journal of Political</u> Economy, Vol. 87, pp. 1190-1219.
- Shiller, R.J. [1981], "Do Stock Prices Move Too Much to be Justified by Subsequent Changes in Dividends?" <u>American Economic Review</u>, Vol. 71, pp. 421-436.
- Simon, H.A. [1979], "Rational Decision Making in Business Organizations," <u>American Economic Review</u>, Vol. 69, pp. 493-513.
- Stewart, B. [1949], "An Analysis of Speculative Trading in Grain Futures," U.S. Department of Agriculture Technical Bulletin No. 1001.

Thaler, R. and S. Rosen [1976], "The Value of Saving a Life: Evidence from the Labor Market," in <u>Household Production and Consumption</u> (ed. N. Terleckyj), National Bureau of Economic Research.

Tversky, A. and D. Kahneman [1974], "Judgement under Uncertainty: Heuristics and Biases," Vol. 185, pp. 1124-1131.

Tversky, A. and D. Kahneman [1981], "The Framing of Decisions and the Psychology of Choice," <u>Science</u>, Vol. 211, pp. 453-458.

Viscusi, W.K. [1979], Employment Hazards: An Investigation of Market Performance, Harvard University Press.

.

-17-

REPORTS IN THIS SERIES

- "The Structure and Stability of Competitive Dynamical Systems, Fox David Cass and Karl Staff
 - "Won-polistic Competition and the Capital Market " by J. F. Snglitz-"The Corporation Law," by J. E. Stichtz-
- "Weasaring Returns to Scale in the Agergade and the Scale I freet of Public tooods," by David A. Starrett "Wenepoly, Quality, and Regulation " by Michael Spence
 - "A Note on the Budget Constrant in a Model of Borrowing " to Dairons K. Forey and Martin F. Hellwig
 - "Incentitives, Risk, and Information Notes Jowards a Theory of Hierarchy," by Joseph I Stabiliz
- "As appears, Expansions of the Distributions of Estimates in Sumultaneous Equations for Africe ative Parameter Sequences, "Is E.W. Anderson
- "Extendence of Energy Environal Relationships" Approximate Distributions and Connections with Superdianeous Loadness in Conferences, "55, 1–W. Anderson. 2222222222
 - "Monopoly and the Kate of Extraction of Exhaustible Resources," by Joseph I Stightiz-
- T qualibrium in Competitive Instraine Markets. An Essay on the Loonomics of Impetiest Information, "In Michael Rothschild and Toseph Singhre.
- "Strong Consistency of Least Squares Estimates in Normal Encar Regression," by 1, W. Anderson and John B. Lavlor
- The entries Schemes under Differential Information Structures. An Application to Trade Policy, 7 by Partia Daspiptia and Joseph Studitz ΞĒ
 - ΞĒ
 - "The Incidence and Efficiency Efficies of Eaxes on Income from Capital," by John B. Shoreit
- "Distribution of a Maximum Eikelihiood Estimate of a Slope Coefficient Elie EUNE Estimate for Known Constance Matrix," by E. W. Anderson and Edkamitsu Sawa.

 - "AC onment on the Test of Overdentifying Restrictions," by Joseph B. Kadane and F. W. Auderson,
 - "An Asymptotic Expansion of the Distribution of the Maximum Likelihood Estimate of the Slope Coefficient in a Linear Functional Relativisting," by 1, W. Anderson. "Some Experimental Results on the Statistical Properties of Least Squares Estimates in Control Problems," by E. W. Anderson and John & Layfor <u> 1 1 1</u>
 - - "A Note on "Fulfilled Expectations" Equilibria," by David M. Kreps
- "Incertainty and the Rate of Extraction under Attenuine Institutional Arrangements," in Partia Daspipta and Joseph E Studiet
 - Budget Displacement Effects of Inflationary Emance," by Jens Green and E. Sheshnishi
- "Fowards a Marxist Theory of Money." by Duncan K, Foley. "The Evistence of Futures Markets, Yony Rational Expectations and Informational Externalities." by Surford Grossman
- On the Efficiency of Competitive Stock Markets where Traders have Diverse Information." by Santord Grossman
 - "A Budding Model of Perfect Competition," by Robert Wilson
- "A Bayesian Approach to the Poduction of Intornation and Learning by Doing." by Santord J. Grossman, Richard F Kulturion and Learnard J. Mirman
 - Thequilibrium Allocations and Recontracting," by Jean-Michel Grandmont, Guy Laroque and Yves Younes
 - "Agreeing to Disagree," by Robert J. Aumann
- "The Maximum Likelihood and the Nonlinear Three Stage Least Squares Estimation in the Genetial Nonlinear Simultaneous Equation Model," by Lakebit Ameniya
 - The Modified Second Round Estimator in the General Qualitative Response Model," by Takeshi Anteniya
 - Some Theorems in the Linear Prohability Model," by Takeshi Amenista
- The Blinear Complementanty Problem and Competitive Equilibria of Linear Lomonic Models," by Robert Wilson

 - Noncooperative Equilibrium Concepts for Obgopoly. Theory, " by L. A. Gerard-Varet-
 - Power and Laxes in a Multi-Commodity Leonomy, " by R. J. Annunn and M. Kurz Inflation and Costs of Price Adjustment," by Eytun Sheshinski and Yoram Weiss
- Thereation of Preferences, Income Distribution and the Case for a Linear Income Lay," by Monlecus Kurz
 - "Search Strategies for Nonrenewable Resource Deposits," by Richard J. (officer
- "Denated for Erved Eactors, Inflation and Adjustment Costs," by Evian Sheshinski, and Youan Weiss
- Bargains and Ripotts A Wedel of Wottopolistically Competitive Price Dispersions," by Steve Sub-grand Tosept Stichtz
 - The Design of Lav Structure Direct Versus Inducer Lavation by A-B-Atkinson and J-F-Studitz "Warker Miscatta for the attent (how and Wedel with Lee Medical States and States).
 - Thractive in the Optimum Supply of Public Greads, 16v Lawrense E.Lee, Event Sheshenske and Useph L. Stichtz Risk Sharing. Share, regping and Uncertain Labor Markets, " by David M. G. Newberry, 222222222222222222222222
 - On New Widensign Equilibres 20 No. Frank Hafar
- A Note on Elasticity of Substitution Entrypoins, "by Environce E. Lau-
- Pruntice Constraints as Sub-Bitates for Dioperative Markets. The Coso of the Cosht Markets, "As Woole an Korz
 - The reconciled encoursed Surples and Below Proc. Adjustments for Robert D Willig

- "Optimal Depletion of an Uncertain Stock," by Richard Orbert
- Some Minimum the Sparae Estimators and Comparisons of Normal and Logistical Activity Constatute Response MidNess¹¹ by Konne Montanie 言葉

ł

-

- "AC fustacterization of the Optimulity of Equilibrium in the ouplete Markets," by Santord J. Grossman
- Tuthation and Laves in a Growniz Louionics with Refet and Equity Ensures "by M. Endistent: J. Green and E. Snestarson
 - "The Specification and Estimation of a Multivariate Logit Model." by Takesta America.
 - Physics and Queues as Scheening Devices in Competitive Markets $^{\rm T}$ by Joseph F. Sughtz
- "Couldatous for Micoug Coursisters, of Least Squaree Estanties in Enter Models." IN E. Anderson and J. et R. East of
 - 3) this taken and Heuropial Lyany Lie Case for Kanden. Lavarion, 20, Joseph 1. Sugar-
 - Scrupic Formulae for Optimal Breenie Lavato nane) the Measurement of Jucquality 775 Joseph E. Stightz
- "Temporal Resolution of Uncertainty and Dynamic Choice Relaxies "by David Wiley and Eval 1. Proving
- "The Estimation of Nonlinear Labor Supply Largeons with Laws from a Transated Sangle by Michael Hur L
- Keynesure Leoneanes and tenteral Lyanitman. Preox. Reflections on Sociect access Decases " by Frank Hate "The Weltare Euglications of the Unemploy search Rate 17 by Michael Hard
 - "The Core of an Exchange Economy with Datienerical Internation," "V. Robert Milco-
 - "A Competitive Wodel of Exchange " by Robert Wilson.

 - "Intermediate Preferences and the Magenty Rule," by Jean-Michel (number)
- "The Fried Price Equilibria Some Results in Local Comparatore Statics," by Give Laroyae
- "On Stockholder Unatomity in Making Production and Emandal Decisions, "by Santord J. Grossenar and Couple 4. Startiz
 - "Selection of Regressors," by Takeshi Amenaka-
- "A Note on A Random Coefficients Model " by Takesta America.
- "A Note on a Heteroscedastic Model," by Takeshi Amenaya-
- "Welture Measurement for Local Public Encarses " by David Statiett
- ¹⁴ neurglos ment Equilibrium with Rational Expectations, "Ey W. P. Heller and K. M. Stare "A Roots of Competition Equilibrium in Societ Market Lonemac," v. Sarte ed. D. to seema and Oliver D. Hart "A Roots of Competition Equilibrium in Societ Market Lonemac," v. Sarte ed. D. to seema and Oliver D. Hart
- An Application of Nem v Methods to the Problem of Single Period Control of Repression Models 7 by Avid Zarian
- "Second Best Weltare Economics in the Mixed Economy," by David Starrett
 - "The Logic of the Ery-Price Method," by Jean-Michel Grandmont-
- "Likes of the Distribution of the Maxim r.n.l. acidities I denote of the Solids A. actimed Approximations, "by I. W. Anderson and Lakanniss, Nas." 美国宗宗英帝帝与亲帝司司官官官官官官司司司司官官官官 的复数形式 法法法法法法法法法法
 - "I urther Results on the Informational Efficiency of Competitive Mock Markets" (by Santon (Grosse an
 - The Estimation of a Sunultaneous-Equation Lobit Model 7 by Takesta America.
- The Estimation of a Simultaneous I quartien forticialized Prefix, Modes Try, Likesta Arrey ava-
- The Consistency of the Maximum Likelihood Extination in a Disc_{opt}ublinatio Medial 2004. They may and G. S. n.
- Numerical Exploration of the Exist and Approximate Discribution Functions of the Two Niger Feast Squares Extrudie Is 1. W. Anderson and Takaninsu Sawa
 - "Risk Measurement of Public Projects," by Robert Wilson
- On the Capitalization Bypethesis in Closed Communities " by Davel Scarrer
- A Note on the Uniqueness of the Representation of Coun-
- of ty Anemerity, Technical Change " by Lawrence J. Lan-"The Property Rights Doctrine and Demand Revelation in devident hosespilets disconsistent 2 by Kenneth J. Arrow
 - "Optimal Capital Gams Lavation Under Ermited Internation," by Jerry R. Green and Evtan Sheshinski
 - "Straightforward Individual Incentive Compatibility in Large Usin, was "1953 Perio U. Ramond
 - "On the Rate of Convergence of the Core," by Robert J. Aurgan-
- "Unsatisfies Force Equilibria," by Ellank Hahn-
- Texpense Conditions for Aggregate Demand Emistrons . This travier's Surgh Texas, "18, 1 awerse J. 1 au
- Twitten of conditions for Aggregate Demand Lanctons Plact aveor Multiple Exdexies 7 by Lawrence J. Lan
 - V Note on Exact Index Numbers 7 by Lawrence 1 Lan-
- Lee is Recession Using Body Liongshifty Agreemed and Terrar ord v Disagrees to 11000 Tever Ocea Hsue-ŻΖ
- Existence of Concession Equilibrian Continuence of Mixed Sectospics, Participhysical Contraction Markin.
- At orightic this. Theorem for the Control Proclime and Earthier Resolutions Are assistent and Dimensionaly 250, Assi Za ear 171111
 - "Measure Broot Vid avoire Micket Games," by Second Herr-

(1) a fixed is a set of the entries of equilate found to well field (prodection). For the short crosses are fixed as a set of the short for the set of the set of

A Representation Discrete to Protocover to Hexerbox — 28 Daug M. Kreps

"Alteries, cass to Outcome of Social Inferior fact of Not Iscar Karz-

addity of here, size of C. P. C. et M. See ... A Suit of J. Gesserginger 1 weight. Angle:

The number document become with the equivation of the Harden decision

Ident Land the nucleage.

17

RIES
IIS SE
H N
RISI
REPO

i

rum in Economics with a Continuum of Eraders," by A. MayColell Takudawa ot Penzinte Normal Interatsh bi the Ewo Intompter Acartor Order Momento. "Is Aci Lakeach and Akimshi Lakemura "One Baritomana of a Sample with Binary. Espe Ouestoan in Licu of Collecting Observations." Is Aciment Eartow. Loon Revolutions and Mation Solved The Elucion of Denoid Net supply and a centralized Let functifie." By M. F. Diewort The englishmen and Denointy of Precisions R. E. Commund. Case. The Madera Mar. The n² - Order Wann Standard Licons of Meta-Amanual Logit (Di Square Futurior). In Labolit Anternas "Lables of the base Databases and unstreamed the Limited Internation Maximum Eductioned Estimator when the Constance Matters in Manan, "by 1, M, states and Laborated Saus. Takether Bush and the fluens of the Corputation. "Isy Stratioid Consonia and Oliver D. Hart The Namena a Valuent Some Ace Parameters in Econometer, Models." by E. W. Anderson, Annio Mormune and Takamitor Sowa "Two Representations of Internation State tures and their Companions," by Terry Green and Nam's Stockey. Newskymmetric Espansions of the Distributions of Estimations in a Linear Functional Relationship when the Sample Store is Larse "To Newskymmetric • A Optimization Problem Arrows in Arconomics: Approximate Solutions, Jinearity, and a Large Numbers, "in Secon Har "Osympticates Expansions of the Distribution of the Education of Certification of Solution Solution Solution" by Navieri Testionals, Rimar Warmer, Shorie Saturnian and Macathol Languality. "Asymptoche Expansions of the Owerboatcons of the Texi Stainstics (or Overdentitying Reversitions in a System of Stimultane quations, "by Kumiteme , Wortunnee, and Fuckuda The emplote Markets and the Observability of Rola Preference Properties," by H. H. Preferanchalss and L. Seiden Walkingeread Scrowies and the Mits and Albustien of Rola. A Comment on the Hask Scholes Option Prioring World, "D Doed M. Markets "As appears, I sparware of the Distributions of k Class Estimations when the Disturbances are Small," Di Naroto Kumtomo Komise Menimune, and Prodokto-Estivada "A Time Scriet Analysis of the Impact of Canadian Wage and Price Controls," by Cheng Historia Olluwara of Lakiyov Measurement Error in a Dynamic Simultaneous Equations Model without Stationary Distorbances." In Cheny Hyuo "Un the Bassian Selvition of North quality and "A Arris Lennoda" "Desquilibrium Lonometrics on Smultabeous Equations Systems" by C. Gourieroos. E.F. Lation) and A. Nontor "Datality Approvides to Macroeconomic Record" N.M. E. Dicarat "Were, an Swaat Churk and Young "Dis Peret Counding. Peretapende Experimental March Conduction for Equipment in a Source Model, "Dis Peret Fahrmond "Discretained and Exa State Conduction Worksholo, Workshold, "Dis Peret Gueblin and Shinda Nazar Pareto Optimul Nuch Equilibria are Competitive in a Repeated Economy. " Its Mordecui Kurz and Sergiu Hart An Introduction to find Person Zoro Sum Repeated Games with Incomplete Information " by Sylvain Soun Time Series Midelling and Causel Ordering of Canaduat Money. Income and Interest Rare "Its Chene Hsur-Temporal Von Neumann Worgenstein and Induced Preferences," hy David M. Kreps and Exan L. Posteus Values for Games Withou: Sudepayments Some Difficulties With Current Concepts." by Alvin F. Roth arbitrate and Equilbrium in Economics with Intimicly Mars Communities, To David M. Krefs Chemployment Equilbrium in an Economy with Enked Price, To Morde at Nurr "Werthagtes and the Naturent of Redundant Assets," Nr. I. Michael Harrivia and David M. Krieps "Autoregressive Midelling and Money – Toxonix Gausality, Detectural," Dr. Cheng Huao "Electoral Outcomer and Secial Low Erkelshood Maxima," by Peter Coughlin and Shmuel Nitzan "A Characterization of Actor Measure Games in 1954," by Jur Lauman "On the Method of Livation and the Processon of Local Public Goods." By David A. Statter "Autoregreave Misleins of Candian Nones and Income Data." In Chene Mario "We Can't Drugree Externet." In John D. Granakoplick and Heraklis Polemarchako. The Two State Lear Aboute Deruzhens krimulon, "his Takedo Amenika "Thee Kouro on Capital Muters, "his David M. Alices "Drinne Horson Diversio," his Michael J. P. Maetil Public Greeds and Rower "by R.I. Aumanne, M.Kurt and A. Nerman "An Assemutic Approvation for the Etherness of North-represented Equilibri "Constrained Excess Destand Functions," by Herkits W. Polemarchakis An Analysis of Power in Exchange Economics," by Martin J. (Mourne The Measurement of Deadweight Loss Revisited " by W. F. Diswerr Futuration of the Recipiocal of a Normal Near," by Acid Zaman Optimal & Voluntary Income Distribution." by K. J. Arrow Asymptotic Values of Mixed Games," by Abraham Neyman "A Strategic Theory of Inflation," by Mordecar Kurz Identification " In Chene Huan 意为贫困事故者知者有民可引 可药的 肉儿肉肉再来的用来有老师 男男子无爱死 表到 素头菌素素甘菜素 注意 车 333333

sto " e falasto bialitta falendar Nametuaty" (2010 - 2010 - 2010) E. Mendolak . 1910 - "Van Beefik Manyol, multingent banamila Falendariat 1919 - Dittation Efficiency" (2010 - 2010)

1

- 11 "In the Unit-Otore Faradox and Freistiana De Latina for Complement, by Jakin V. Freis and Societ And L.
- 1984 Mils the Kumter of Our estate. He paires to Prire ert & Market Games," Servis Hart.
- 330 Mevaluati a of toritoirentria kanni a ufterinnire3 Informati a Maximum Uikilling kanimatir," by T. N. Anderson. Naoto Kunitumu, and Takamiliku jawa.
- ¹ A Comparison of the last When, who acress builded and Kaniger Short Charteneous Christiane An Michael, "19 Conce-Rendom and University Concerts.
- Mart "A domparison of the Row-dom Wardaum Characteriza data the A domparison of the Powerdom Wardaum Characterization for A domain and Power (2) and a second second second second demains and Power (2) and a second second second second second demains and Power (2) and a second second second second second demains and Power (2) and a second se
- 3.3. "Comparison of the lensifies of the ICUL and DIMER of the statute for Comparison at Republication," by 12 and discoverships of the statute of and Takenstrain Camp.
- 3.4. "Admissibility of the Bayes freedure Corresponds to the four re-Felor distribution for the Control in the 1.5 or Chevrological Web in Five," by "Darbor Chevrolic short, "records"
- "Some Perent Eventy the the first first of the manual carts"
 "Some Perent," by "to "a Adversa."
 - 326. "กนไม่ถึงเข้าเนื้ะไว้ Feary Hart
- 3.7. Two Imports on Majurity Fulle: "Such Lucip, Intervention of Majurity Fulle with Thermachine Preference," by Fuller 1, units Annual for Sing with "Electrons" Proceeds with InterActional V. 101-101 Main Social, Netlene Mainew, "by Tonner 1, and the wald Funder," Main Social, Netlene Mainew, "by Tonner 1, and the wald Funder," Main.
- 328. "On the Endogenous Formation of Comitions," by Derriu Hart and Mordeosi Kurz.
- 329. "Controliability, Pecuniary Externalities and Ortimal Taxation," by David Starrett.
- (3.1. Provide Second to the motion of a structure of a Var why build \mathcal{W} by Herve Expension
- (3) Mar Weiddare Economic entry to capite to the march of an architecture Relate of Partice tablement and tag free of human co.
 - 3×4. "Mequiliburium Fritey Brogeraals Wite Aberentricas." Ag Peren 1. Countlin.
- 330. "Infinite Excersive and Invariant Meanures," by Michael L. Jaksun.
- ustino otto tatto kujuotan Baga nahenana naka kuno Baffenano ono to oko uteonan kuno no Perivenano tananana ono na Pemblan Construgano tan en en en enteona.
- ะสัง. "กฏรรฐานสุดธรรรษตรรร พ.ศ. 19. พ.ศ. 2014 มีเมรา
- 2.1. "Bayestan Inventive Chanactica Endier." A. Thair of a greater and Doube-Andre Demand-Variet.
- add. "Quantitative Pessense Weiter. А потеру " by Tankers America.

"Estimation of Dynamic V full ^{NU+1} Error Components," by T. W. Anderson and Cheng Holao.

> 323. 224.

The Pobust Estimation in Terrainty Equivalence Tentrol," By Ander: H. Westlund and Mane Stenlund.

and in "The Division of Berlin Program Regulation of August Frances" Analysis, 19, 881, 1998 A. Frances,

Reports in this Series

- 340. "Sequential Equilibria," by David M. Kreps and Robert Wilson.
- 341. "Enhancing of Semigroups," by Michael I. Taksar.
- 342. "Formulation and Estimation of Dynamic Models Using Panel Data," by T.W. Anderson and Cheng Hsiao.
- 343. "Ex-Post Optimality as a Dynamically Consistent Objective for Collective Choice Under Uncertainty," by Peter Hammond.
- 344. "Three Lectures In Monetary Theory," by Frank H. Hahn.
- 345. "Socially Optimal Investment Rules in the Presence of Incomplete Markets and Other Second Best Distortions," by Frank Milne and David A. Starrett.
- 346. "Approximate Purification of Mixed Strategies," by Robert Aumann, Yitzhak Katznelson, Roy Radner, Robert W. Rosenthal, and Benjamin Weiss.
- 347. "Conditions for Transitivity of Majority Rule with Algorithmic Interpretations," by Herve Raynaud.
- 348. "How Restrictive Actually are the Value Restriction Conditions," by Herve Raynaud.
- 349. "Cournot Duopoly in the Style of Fulfilled Expectations Equilibrium," by William Novshek and Hugo Sonnenschein.
- 350. "Law of Large Numbers for Random Sets and Allocation Processes," by Zvi Artstein and Sergiu Hart.
- 351. "Risk Perception in Psychology and Economics," by Kenneth J. Arrow.

THE RECEIPTION OF THE PARTY OF

