REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE						Form Approved OMB NO. 0704-0188		
The public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggesstions for reducing this burden, to Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports, 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington VA, 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to any oenalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number. PLEASE DO NOT RETURN YOUR FORM TO THE ABOVE ADDRESS.								
1. REPORT DATE (DD-MM-YYYY) 2. REPORT TYPE							3. DATES COVERED (From - To)	
30-07-2014 Final Report							1-Sep-2009 - 30-Sep-2013	
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE						5a. CONTRACT NUMBER		
Final Report: Visual Information Theory and Visual							W911NF-09-1-0449	
Representations for Achieving Provable Bounds in Vision-Based						5b. GRANT NUMBER		
Control and Decision								
					5c. PRO	5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER		
						611102		
6. AUTHORS						5d. PROJECT NUMBER		
Stefano Soa	tto							
					5e. TAS	5e. TASK NUMBER		
					5f. WO	5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER		
			ES AND ADDRESSES	2		0 1	PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT	
			25 AND ADDRESSE	3			MBER	
	of California - Lo	-						
11000 Kinr	oss Avenue, Suite	e 211						
Los Angele	s, CA	9009	5 -1406					
9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS (ES)							SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) RO	
U.S. Army Research Office						11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT		
P.O. Box 12211						NUMBER(S)		
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709-2211					:	56765-CS.16		
12. DISTRIBUTION AVAILIBILITY STATEMENT								
Approved for Public Release; Distribution Unlimited								
13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES								
The views, opinions and/or findings contained in this report are those of the author(s) and should not contrued as an official Department of the Army position, policy or decision, unless so designated by other documentation.								
of the Army	position, policy o	or decision, unles	s so designated by oth	er docun	nentation.			
14. ABSTRA	АСТ							
1 2	1	1	-				e for control and decision tasks. The	
fundamental premise is that traditional notions of information developed in support of communication engineering								
- where the task is reproduction of the source data, and nuisance factors can be easily characterized statistically -								
are unsuited to visual inference, where the task is decision or control, and the data formation process include								
scaling (that makes the continuous limit relevant) and occlusion (that makes control relevant).								
Sussificative the test (or classes of test) inform what nortion of the date is "informative" and what is "invisoned 15. SUBJECT TERMS								
Sensing, Control, Information, Visual Representations								
,	,	, <u>.</u>						
16. SECURI	16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION OF 15. NUMBER 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON							
			Stefano Soatto					
UU	UU	υυ	UU				19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER	
		_					310-825-4840	

Γ

٦

#### **Report Title**

Final Report: Visual Information Theory and Visual Representations for Achieving Provable Bounds in Vision-Based Control and Decision

#### ABSTRACT

This project pursued the development of representations of visual data suitable for control and decision tasks. The fundamental premise is that traditional notions of information developed in support of communication engineering – where the task is reproduction of the source data, and nuisance factors can be easily characterized statistically – are unsuited to visual inference, where the task is decision or control, and the data formation process include scaling (that makes the continuous limit relevant) and occlusion (that makes control relevant). Specifically, the task (or classes of task) inform what portion of the data is "informative" and what is "nuisance variability." One of the peculiarities of visual processing is that most of the complexity in visual data can be ascribed to nuisance factors that affect the data but are irrelevant to the task. This notion has been made precise in [16], preceding the commencement of this project, where it was shown that the quotient of the (infinite- dimensional) set of image modulo changes of viewpoint and illumination is supported on a set of measure zero of the image domain. So, for any task that requires invariance to viewpoint and illumination (such as object detection, localization, recognition, categorization), a zero- measure set contains as much "information" as the original data. In other words, information is a thin set of visual data, for decision and control tasks.

The development of a theory of information in support of decision and control tasks, specific to visual data, is a long-term goal that has been under development since 2007, and will continue for the foreseeable future. During the course of this project, significant progress has been registered in a number of areas critical to such a development, which is described below.

# Enter List of papers submitted or published that acknowledge ARO support from the start of the project to the date of this printing. List the papers, including journal references, in the following categories:

(a) Papers published in peer-reviewed journals (N/A for none)

Received Paper

- 08/26/2012 9.00 Alper Ayvaci, Michalis Raptis, Stefano Soatto. Sparse Occlusion Detection with Optical Flow, International Journal of Computer Vision, (10 2011): 0. doi: 10.1007/s11263-011-0490-7
- 08/26/2012 10.00 E. S. Jones, S. Soatto. Visual-inertial navigation, mapping and localization: A scalable real-time causal approach, The International Journal of Robotics Research, (01 2011): 0. doi: 10.1177/0278364910388963

**TOTAL: 2** 

Number of Papers published in peer-reviewed journals:

(b) Papers published in non-peer-reviewed journals (N/A for none)

Received Paper

TOTAL:

# (c) Presentations

Number of Presentations: 0.00

Non Peer-Reviewed Conference Proceeding publications (other than abstracts):

Received Paper

TOTAL:

#### **Peer-Reviewed Conference Proceeding publications (other than abstracts):**

Received Paper

- 07/27/2014 13.00 V. Karasev, A. Ravichandran, and S. Soatto.. Active frame, location, and detector selection for automated and manual video annotation., Proc. of the IEEE Intl. Conf. on Comp. Vis. and Patt. Recog. (CVPR). 07-JAN-14, . : ,
- 07/27/2014 14.00 B. Taylor, A. Ayvaci, A. Ravichandran, and S. Soatto.. Semantic video segmentation from occlusion relations via convex optimization., Proc. of the EMMCVPR (energy minimization in computer vision and pattern recognition). 01-AUG-13, . : ,
- 07/27/2014 15.00 K. Tsotsos, A. Pretto, and S. Soatto. . Visual-inertial ego-motion estimation for humanoid platforms., Proc. IEEE Intl. Conf. Humanoid Robots. 12-JAN-12, . : ,
- 08/13/2011 1.00 Alper Ayvaci, Michalis Raptis, Stefano Soatto. Optical flow and occlusion detection with convex optimization, Proceedings of the Neuro Information Processig Systems (NIPS). 01-DEC-10. . : .
- 08/13/2011 5.00 Stefano Soatto, Michalis Raptis. Tracklet Descriptorsfor Action Modeling and Video Analysis

Eur. Conf. on Comp. Vis. 01-OCT-10, . : ,

- 08/13/2011 2.00 Alper Ayvaci, Stefano Soatto. Efficient model selection for detachable object detection, Proceedings of EMMCVPR. 24-JUL-11, . : ,
- 08/17/2011 4.00 Taehee Lee, Stefano Soatto. Learning and matching multiscale template descriptors for real- time detection, localization and tracking, Intl. Conf. on Comp. Vis. Patt. Recog.. 06-JAN-11, . : ,
- 08/26/2012 11.00 Michalis Raptis, Iasonas Kokkinos, Stefano Soatto. Discovering discriminative action parts from mid-level video representations, 2012 IEEE Conference on Computer Vision and Pattern Recognition (CVPR). 15-JUN-12, Providence, RI, USA. : ,
- 08/26/2012 12.00 Michalis Raptis, Stefano Soatto. multiple instance filgering, neuro information processing systems (NIPS). 08-DEC-12, . : ,

TOTAL: 9

# (d) Manuscripts

Received Paper

08/26/2012 8.00 Taehee Lee, Stefano Soatto. Video-based descriptors for object recognition, Image and Vision Computing (02 2011)

TOTAL: 1

#### Number of Manuscripts:

	Books				
Received	Book				
08/13/2011	6.00 Stefano Soatto. Actionable information in vision, Berlin: Springer Verlag, (06 2011)				
08/26/2012	00 Jingming Dong and Stefano Soatto. Visual Correspondence, the Lambert-Ambient Shape Space and the Automatic Design of Feature Descriptors, London: Springer, (08 2012)				
TOTAL:	2				
Received	Book Chapter				
TOTAL:					

#### **Patents Submitted**

# **Patents Awarded**

#### Awards

IEEE Fellow, 2013 Keynote Speaker: ICVSS2014, ICVSS2013, IEEE GlobalSIP 2014 Distinguished Seminars: Minnesota 2014, CVPR2014 Long-term detection and tracking, Mathematics and Image Analysis (Henri Poincare Institute, 2012) Program Co-Chair: SIAM Imaging 2016, ICCV 2017 Area Chair: ICCV 2013, ACCV 2014 Associate Editor: SIAM Imaging, Intl. J. of Comp. Vision, Foundations and Trends in Graphics and VIsion

Graduate Students						
NAME	PERCENT_SUPPORTED	Discipline				
Damek Davis	0.10					
Jingming Dong	0.10					
Georgios Georgiadis	0.20					
Nikolaos Karianakis	0.10					
Taihee Lee	0.10					
Daniel O'Connor	0.30					
Brian Taylor	0.10					
Konstantine Tsotsos	0.10					
Joachim Valente	0.10					
Zhao Yi	0.10					
FTE Equivalent:	1.30					
Total Number:	10					
Names of Post Doctorates						
NAME	PERCENT SUPPORTED					
Avinash Ravichandra	0.10					
Ganesh Sundaramoorthi	0.10					
FTE Equivalent:	0.20					
Total Number:	2					
Names of Faculty Supported						
NAME	PERCENT SUPPORTED	National Academy Member				
Stefano Soatto	0.33	National Abadomy Monibol				
FTE Equivalent:	0.33					
Total Number:	1					
	••					
Names of Under Graduate students supported						
NAME	PERCENT SUPPORTED	Discipline				
	0.20	Computer Science				
Timothy Brightbill FTE Equivalent:	0.20 <b>0.20</b>	Computer Science				

<b>Student Metrics</b> This section only applies to graduating undergraduates supported by this agreement in this reporting period						
The number of undergraduates funded by this agreement who graduated during this period: 1.00 The number of undergraduates funded by this agreement who graduated during this period with a degree in science, mathematics, engineering, or technology fields: 1.00						
The number of undergraduates funded by your agreement who graduated during this period and will continue to pursue a graduate or Ph.D. degree in science, mathematics, engineering, or technology fields: 0.00						
Number of graduating undergraduates who achieved a 3.5 GPA to 4.0 (4.0 max scale): 1.00 Number of graduating undergraduates funded by a DoD funded Center of Excellence grant for Education, Research and Engineering: 0.00						
The number of undergraduates funded by your agreement who graduated during this period and intend to work for the Department of Defense 0.00						
The number of undergraduates funded by your agreement who graduated during this period and will receive scholarships or fellowships for further studies in science, mathematics, engineering or technology fields: 0.00						
]	Names of Personnel receiving masters degrees					
<u>NAME</u> Joachim Valente <b>Total Number:</b>	1					
Names of personnel receiving PHDs						
<u>NAME</u> Taihee Lee Daniel O'Connor Zhao Yi						
Total Number:	3					
Names of other research staff						
<u>NAME</u> Jason Meltzer FTE Equivalent:	PERCENT_SUPPORTED 0.10 <b>0.10</b>					
Total Number:	1					
Sub Contractors (DD882)						
	Inventions (DD882)					
See attachments	Scientific Progress					
	Technology Transfer					

# Visual Information Theory and Visual Representation ARO 56765-CI Final Report – September 30, 2013

Stefano Soatto UCLA Vision Lab University of California, Los Angeles

This project pursued the development of representations of visual data suitable for control and decision tasks. The fundamental premise is that traditional notions of information developed in support of communication engineering – where the task is reproduction of the source data, and nuisance factors can be easily characterized statistically – are unsuited to visual inference, where the task is decision or control, and the data formation process include *scaling* (that makes the continuous limit relevant) and *occlusion* (that makes control relevant).

Specifically, the task (or classes of task) inform what portion of the data is "informative" and what is "nuisance variability." One of the peculiarities of visual processing is that most of the complexity in visual data can be ascribed to nuisance factors that affect the data but are irrelevant to the task. This notion has been made precise in [16], preceding the commencement of this project, where it was shown that the *quotient* of the (infinite-dimensional) set of image modulo changes of viewpoint and illumination is supported on a set of measure zero of the image domain. So, for any task that requires invariance to viewpoint and illumination (such as object detection, localization, recognition, categorization), a zero-measure set contains as much "information" as the original data. In other words, information is a *thin set* of visual data, for decision and control tasks.

The development of a theory of information in support of decision and control tasks, specific to visual data, is a long-term goal that has been under development since 2007, and will continue for the foreseeable future. During the course of this project, significant progress has been registered in a number of areas critical to such a development, which is described below.

Below is a summary of the research accomplishments achieved during the period of performance, including progress since the last report dated July 31, 2012.

## Actionable Information

We have continued progress on occlusion detection, previously reported in [1], that has been expanded and published in journal form in [2] and has been instrumental in the quantification of uncertainty in the presence of topological uncertainty due to occlusions. In fact, in the presence of visibility nuisances, the "innovation" (information increment) is precisely the complexity of the maximal invariant of the data relative to the nuisances *restricted to the discovered area* of the data domain. We have focused on images, but the results apply to any remote sensing modality including lidar, time-of-flight, etc.

While the formal definitions and the general principles cut across sensors, instantiating a model so that actual values can be computed can be quite challenging. Specifically, for passive remote sensing such as electro-optical, the *simplest model* that includes all the key ingredients (illumination, reflectance, shape, motion, occlusions, etc.) is the so-called *Lambert-Ambient* model, that is already rather complex to analyze. In [4] we have commenced an explicit analysis of this model for the purpose of characterization of Actionable Information. The quotient structure ("shape space") of this model has been fully characterized, and the results have been shown to yield explicit construction of visual feature descriptors that are – by construction – best suited for the specific task of object detection. This is another intermediate step in the design of a fully rational visual inference system that is driven by analytically sound principles as opposed to vague biological inspiration or trial-and-error practices.

One example of application of these principles is illustrated in [10], where we have been able to design descriptors that beat the state of the art in standard benchmark datasets, and in addition do so while significantly reducing the computational load, to the point where they can be implemented on mobile devices (smartphones) and operate in real-time (7-15FPS).

# Inference

In the early part of this project, we have focused on - to a large extent solved - the problem of **occlusion detection**. Occlusion plays a fundamental role in the theory of Actionable Information, for the maximal viewpoint invariant in the un-occluded region represents the *innovation process*, or "information increment" that comes as a result of a control action. Therefore, it was very important that efficient and provably optimal occlusion detection algorithms be developed. Most of the existing literature on the topic was flawed in fundamental ways: First, most literature on motion estimation characterizes occluding boundaries as *motion discontinuities*. This is because such a literature is rooted in variational image processing, where the limit  $dt \rightarrow 0$  is considered. When the inter-frame temporal interval goes to zero, clearly there are no occlusions. However, there is no motion either, so this literature completely neglected occlusions. More recent literature that tackles occlusion detection directly focuses on occluded regions as those where forward- and backward-motion are inconsistent. However, an occluded region is one that is visible in one image but not the next, and therefore the motion between these regions in the two images is not just inconsistent, *it is simply not defined*, it does not exist. We have formalized the problem as a variational (infinite-dimensional) optimization problem, where one simultaneously tries to estimate the motion that maps one image onto the next (a diffeomorphism), together with the portion of the domain where such a map is defined. These are the co-visible regions, and their complement is the (multiply-connected) occluded region. While this appears to be a very difficult optimization problem, under the assumptions of Lambertian Reflection and constant (or slowly varying) ambient illumination, we have been able to show that the problem can be framed as a mixed  $\ell^0/\ell^2$  optimization problem, whose re-weighted  $\ell^1$  relaxation yields a *convex optimization problem*. This has enabled us to exploit all the recent arsenal of efficient numerical schemes for convex optimization, including Augmented Lagrangian schemes such as Split-Bregman, as well as optimal first-order schemes due to Nesterov. We have made our source code publicly available, and many have been using it since. Furthermore, we have developed a GPU implementation of the algorithm, that exploits its parallelism, and achieved real-time implementation [5].

The importance of mobility for recognition is further emphasized in [9], that presents a real-time visual recognition system based on sparse representations that are guided by Actionable Information. Descriptors for static objects are built from multiple views, taken while the user moves around an object. While in this case the control loop is closed by the user, and the system assumes that the user acts rationally in collecting images of an objects that approximate a fair sample from the conditional distribution of a maximal invariant to nuisance factors, eventually we expect to design closed-loop robotic systems that perform such a "visual exploration" automatically.

#### Semantic Video Segmentation

Occlusion detection is critical to bootstrap the relation between structures in the *images* of a video, and the topology of the *scene*. In addition, one may be able to associate regions of images to "labels", in which case the notion of Detachable Object – bootstrapped from occlusion relations – provides a *semantic* segmentation of the video, where objects are represented as simply connected regions that back-project onto piecewise continuous surfaces in space that have *consistent labeling*. It also provides *relations* between objects, in the sense that the scheme does not just attach labels to object, but also determines whether there are multiple objects, and in what depth ordering they are presented relative to the viewer. The key results have been presented in [17], where the ideas have been tested on benchmark datasets.

# Active Learning and Active Inference

In order to infer semantic segmentation of a video, a probability of detection should be provided at each pixel of each frame, for each possible category label, which is clearly a tall order. In the presence of millions of pixels per frame, hundreds of frames, and tens of objects, that would mean running billions of object detection algorithms just to process a few seconds of video. Therefore, in [7] we have focused on *active inference*, where an information-gain criterion drives the decision as to *what frames* to process (when), *what pixels* within each frame (where), and *what detectors* to run (what), based on spatio-temporal regularity and context. While in principle one would not expect that running a subset of detectors on a subset of locations in a subset of frames could improve performance over the "paragon" setting, we have found that indeed full exploitation of spatio-temporal regularities and context enable *improving* the performance in the pixel-level detection of multiple classes in video, at a fraction of the computational cost. This may seem counter to the Data Processing Inequality, which is one of the driving principles of our work, with the conundrum addressed by the strong prior structure in natural and man-made scenes. In [7] we have performed test on benchmark video segmentation tasks with 19 categories.

# Visual-inertial sensor fusion with application to humanoid motion estimation

While detachable object detection and semantic video segmentation provide *topological* relations between surfaces in the scene, and their relation to the viewer, full *geometric* modeling of the scene requires the estimation of the Euclidean motion of the sensor platform. This is a long-standing problem, where the UCLA Vision Lab has played a pioneering role, starting with the first observability analysis, to the first demonstration of real-time estimation of general structure-from-motion, to the first analysis of the observability of visual-inertial fusion.

During this project we have further pushed the envelope to include motion priors suitable for human (or humanoid) motions that are not well approximated by tightly tuned random walks [18].

# Personnel supported on the project

See information uploaded on the ARO Report System.

#### Awards and honors

see list uploaded on ARO Report System

#### **Teaching and Mentoring**

In addition, material developed during the course of this project has been used in support of **teaching** and mentoring: Specifically, the fundamental building blocks and high-level concepts underlying Visual Information Theory [13] have been used to teach a quarter-long course at UCLA (CS269: Visual Information Theory), as well as to teach summer courses at the International Computer Vision Summer School (ICVSS) in Scicli, Italy, in 2011, 2012, 2013, and the US-Sino Summer School on Computer Vision, Pattern Recognition and Machine Learning in Chengdu, China in 2011. Some of the elements of the theory have been collected into a book chapter for the lecture notes of ICVSS [14], while [13] is an evolving manuscript that eventually will be turned into a textbook.

Several students who have been **mentored** during the course of this project (some supported directly by this grant, some interacting indirectly with critical personnel but supported on other sources) have moved on to key positions in industry and academia, including the University of Oxford, U.K. (Prof. Andrea Vedaldi), Temple University (Dr. Haibin Ling), KAUST (Dr. Ganesh Sundaramoorthi), Google INC. (Dr. Alessandro Bissacco, Dr. Teresa Ko, Dr. Taehee Lee, Dr. Zhao Yi), Amazon INC. (Dr. Avinash Ravichandran), Honda Research (Dr. Alper Ayvaci), Comcast (Dr. Michalis Raptis).

#### Publications

The following references describe work that has been conducted during this project and acknowledge support by ARO: Year 1: [14, 3, 9, 15, 1, 5, 8, 12], Year 2: [2, 4, 10, 6, 11, 19], Year 3: [7, 17, 18].

## Transitions

While complete **transitions** have not been accomplished during the period of performance, since the research focused on fundamental issues underlying the theoretical development of a theory of visual information, the research milestones accomplished enabled improvement of specific tasks that we envision will result in transitions in the near to mid-term future. These include visual-inertial sensor fusion [18], and semantic video segmentation [17].

# References

- A. Ayvaci, M. Raptis, and S. Soatto. Optical flow and occlusion detection with convex optimization. In Proc. of Neuro Information Processing Systems (NIPS), December 2010.
- [2] A. Ayvaci, M. Raptis, and S. Soatto. Sparse occlusion detection with optical flow. Intl. J. of Comp. Vision, 97(3):322–338, 2012.
- [3] A. Ayvaci and S. Soatto. Efficient model selection for detachable object detection. In *Proc. of EMMCVPR*, July 2011.
- [4] J. Dong and S. Soatto. Machine Learning for Computer Vision, chapter Visual Correspondence, the Lambert-Ambient Shape Space and the Systematic Design of Feature Descriptors. R. Cipolla, S. Battiato, G.-M. Farinella (Eds), Springer Verlag, 2014.
- [5] B. Fulkerson and S. Soatto. Really quick shift. In Workshop on GPU For Computer Vision, Crete, September 2010.

- [6] E. Jones and S. Soatto. Visual-inertial navigation, localization and mapping: A scalable real-time large-scale approach. *Intl. J. of Robotics Res.*, Apr. 2011.
- [7] V. Karasev, A. Ravichandran, and S. Soatto. Active frame, location, and detector selection for automated and manual video annotation. *Proc. of CVPR*, November 15, 2012, then April 15, then Nov. 8.
- [8] T. Ko, S. Soatto, D. Estrin, and A. Cenedese. Cataloging birds in their natural habitat. In *Proc. of the ICPR Workshop on Vision in Natural Environments*, September 2010.
- [9] T. Lee and S. Soatto. Learning and matching multiscale template descriptors for realtime detection, localization and tracking. In Proc. IEEE Conf. on Comp. Vision and Pattern Recogn., pages 1457–1464, 2011.
- [10] T. Lee and S. Soatto. Video-based descriptors for object recognition. Image and Vision Computing, 2011.
- [11] M. Raptis, Y. Kokkinnos, and S. Soatto. Discovering discriminative action parts from mid-level video representations. In Proc. of the IEEE Intl. Conf. on Comp. Vis. and Patt. Recog., 2012.
- [12] M. Raptis and S. Soatto. Tracklet descriptors for action modeling and video analysis. In Proc. of ECCV, September 2010.
- [13] S. Soatto. Steps Toward a Theory of Visual Information. http://arxiv.org/abs/1110.2053, Technical Report UCLA-CSD100028, September 13, 2010 2010.
- [14] S. Soatto. Machine Learning for Computer Vision, chapter Actionable Information in Vision. R. Cipolla, S. Battiato, G.-M. Farinella (Eds), Springer Verlag, 2011.
- [15] S. Soatto and A. Chiuso. Controlled recognition bounds for scaling and occlusion channels. In Proc. of the Data Compression Conference, March 2011.
- [16] G. Sundaramoorthi, P. Petersen, V. S. Varadarajan, and S. Soatto. On the set of images modulo viewpoint and contrast changes. In *Proc. IEEE Conf. on Comp. Vision and Pattern Recogn.*, June 2009.
- [17] B. Taylor, A. Ayvaci, A. Ravichandran, and S. Soatto. Semantic video segmentation from occlusion relations via convex optimization. In *Proc. of EMMCVPR*, August 2013 2013.
- [18] K. Tsotsos, A. Pretto, and S. Soatto. Visual-inertial ego-motion estimation for humanoid platforms. In Proc. IEEE Intl. Conf. Humanoid Robots, Dec. 2012.
- [19] K. Wnuk and S. Soatto. Multiple instance filtering. In Proc. of NIPS, 2011.