

AL BALDA POLICE STATION
HILLA, IRAQ

SIGIR PA-05-015
JANUARY 27, 2006

Report Documentation Page

Form Approved
OMB No. 0704-0188

Public reporting burden for the collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden, to Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports, 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington VA 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to a penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number.

1. REPORT DATE 27 JAN 2006		2. REPORT TYPE		3. DATES COVERED 00-00-2006 to 00-00-2006	
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE Al Balda Police Station Hilla, Iraq				5a. CONTRACT NUMBER	
				5b. GRANT NUMBER	
				5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER	
6. AUTHOR(S)				5d. PROJECT NUMBER	
				5e. TASK NUMBER	
				5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER	
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) Office of the Special Inspector General for IRAQ Reconstruction,400 Army Navy Drive,Arlington,VA,22202-4704				8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER	
9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)				10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S)	
				11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S)	
12. DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution unlimited					
13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES					
14. ABSTRACT					
15. SUBJECT TERMS					
16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:			17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT	18. NUMBER OF PAGES	19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON
a. REPORT unclassified	b. ABSTRACT unclassified	c. THIS PAGE unclassified			



SPECIAL INSPECTOR GENERAL FOR IRAQ RECONSTRUCTION

January 27, 2006

MEMORANDUM FOR COMMANDER, GULF REGION DIVISION, U.S. ARMY
CORPS OF ENGINEERS AND DIRECTOR, PROJECT
AND CONTRACTING OFFICE
COMMANDER, JOINT CONTRACTING COMMAND-
IRAQ/AFGHANISTAN
DIRECTOR, IRAQ RECONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT
OFFICE

SUBJECT: Report on Project Assessment of the Al Balda Police Station in Hilla, Iraq
(Report Number SIGIR-PA-05-015)

We are providing this project assessment report for your information and use. We assessed the in-process construction work being performed for the Al Balda Police Station in Hilla, Iraq, to determine its status and whether intended objectives will be achieved. This assessment was made to provide you and other interested parties with real-time information on a relief and reconstruction project underway and in order to enable appropriate action to be taken if warranted. The assessment team included an engineer and an auditor.

We discussed the results of this project assessment with representatives of the Project and Contracting Office, Gulf Region Division of the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, and Joint Contracting Command-Iraq/Afghanistan, both of whom concurred with our conclusions. This report includes no recommendations that required management comments.

We appreciate the courtesies extended to our staff. This letter does not require a formal response. If you have any questions please contact Mr. Brian Flynn at (703) 343-9149 or brian.flynn@iraq.centcom.mil or Mr. Michael Stanka, P.E., at (703) 343-9149 or michael.stanka@iraq.centcom.mil.

Stuart W. Bowen, Jr.
Inspector General

Special Inspector General for Iraq Reconstruction

SIGIR PA-05-015

January 27, 2006

Project Assessment of the Al Balda Police Station in Hilla, Iraq

Synopsis

Introduction. This project assessment was initiated as part of our continuing assessments of selected sector reconstruction activities for Facilities and Transportation. The overall objectives were to determine whether selected sector reconstruction contractors were complying with the terms of their contracts or task orders and to evaluate the effectiveness of the monitoring and controls exercised by administrative quality assurance and contract officers. We conducted this project assessment in accordance with the Quality Standards for Inspections issued by the President's Council on Integrity and Efficiency. The assessment team included a professional engineer and an auditor.

Project Assessment Objective. The objective of this project assessment was to provide real-time relief and reconstruction project information to interested parties in order to enable appropriate action, when warranted. Specifically, we determined whether:

1. Project results were consistent with original objectives;
2. Project components were adequately designed prior to construction or installation;
3. Construction or rehabilitation met the standards of the design;
4. The Contractor's Quality Control plan and the U.S. Government's Quality Assurance program were adequate; and
5. Project sustainability and operational effectiveness were addressed.

Conclusions. This assessment determined that:

1. The completed project was consistent with the original task order objectives. Specifically, the rehabilitation work, which included the renovation and construction of buildings and/or facilities and all associated equipment required for a functional police station, was completed. This occurred primarily because the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Project Engineer and Quality Assurance Representative effectively managed the project.
2. This project consisted primarily of renovation work on an existing facility. The contract did not require submission and approval of design drawings for the new construction, but did include specifications for all work required. Although the contractor did not provide design drawings, this did not significantly influence the outcome of the project. Minimal design was required, which the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Project Manager and Quality Assurance Representative ultimately accomplished.

3. All work observed appeared to be consistent with the contract specifications except for the installed roof system. The contract required a one-year warranty and the contractor agreed to repair the roof. The Al Balda Police Station project will result in an operational police station.
4. The Al Balda Police Station contract did not specify a requirement for a Contractor Quality Control plan, Contractor Quality Control daily reports, or a Contractor Quality Control deficiency-tracking log. The Quality Assurance program was adequate due to the Quality Assurance Representative being on-site during rehabilitation and reconstruction events, monitoring field activities, and completing daily Quality Assurance reports. In addition, the Quality Assurance Representative's daily reports were sufficiently complete, and included project specific or detailed photographs that reinforced the narrative information provided in the reports.
5. The contract adequately addressed sustainability resulting in an operational police station. The contract included the training of police station personnel to operate the generator along with operational and maintenance manuals for the generator. A review of the Al Balda Police Station showed that it was operating in accordance with the Scope of Work's specific objective for a functional police station.

Recommendations. No adverse conditions were noted during this assessment and, as a result, this report does not contain recommendations. Therefore, written response to this report was not required.

Management Comments. Although not required, the Commander, Gulf Region Division, responded concurring with the report without comment.

Table of Contents

Synopsis	i
Introduction	1
Objective of the Project Assessment	1
Pre-Site Assessment Background	1
Contract, Task Order, and Costs	1
Project Objective	1
Description of Facility (preconstruction)	1
Scope of Work of the Task Order	2
Current Project Design and Specifications	2
Reported Project Work Completed and Pending	2
Site Assessment	2
Work Completed	3
Work in Progress	8
Work Pending	8
Project Quality Management	8
Project Sustainability and Operational Effectiveness	9
Project Sustainability	9
Operational Effectiveness	9
Conclusions	9
Management Comments	10
Appendixes	
A. Scope and Methodology	11
B. Acronyms	12
C. Report Distribution	13
D. Assessment Team Members	15

Introduction

Objective of the Project Assessment

The objective of this project assessment was to provide real-time relief and reconstruction project information to interested parties in order to enable appropriate action, when warranted. Specifically, we determined whether:

1. Project results are consistent with original objectives;
2. Project components were adequately designed prior to construction or installation;
3. Construction or rehabilitation met the standards of the design;
4. The Contractor's Quality Control (CQC) plan and the U.S. Government's Quality Assurance (QA) program were adequate;
5. Sustainability and operational effectiveness were addressed.

Pre-Site Assessment Background

Contract, Task Order, and Costs

The Al Balda Police Station project was completed under Contract W917BK-05-C-0005. Contract W917BK-05-C-0005, dated 15 January 2005, was a firm-fixed contract for \$120,350. The contract was made between the Gulf Regional Division – Southern District and Al Jadua Company for General Contracting, Babil, Iraq. The Notice To Proceed was issued at the pre-construction conference. There is currently one modification to the initial contract.

- Modification # P00001 was issued 13 July 2005, to revise the Bill of Quantities (BOQ). The fixed price amount was increased by \$14,305 from \$120,350 to \$134,655. All other terms and conditions remain unchanged.

Project Objective

The 15 January 2005 scope of work (SOW) stated the overall objective of this contract was to renovate and reconstruct the Al Balda Police Station. The specific objective for the Al Balda Police Station was to renovate or reconstruct existing buildings and/or facilities and all associated equipment required for a functional police station.

Description of the Facility (preconstruction)

The description of the facility (preconstruction) was based on information obtained from the contract and the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) project file. The Al Balda Police Station was an existing, active police station before renovation work was initiated. The station included perimeter walls, gates, and a building with office space and holding cells. The Al Balda Police Station is located in the downtown section of the city of Hilla, approximately 100 kilometers south of Baghdad, Iraq. The police station was structurally sound but in need of rehabilitation. The Al Balda Police Station was previously, and is currently, an operating facility.

Scope of Work of the Task Order

Based on the initial SOW for the project, dated 15 January 2005, and Modification P0001, dated 13 July 2005, the following major tasks for the rehabilitation of the Al Balda Police Station were:

- Upgrade perimeter security,
- Install water supply system,
- Install/rehab septic system,
- Supply and install electrical generator and fuel tank,
- Construct covered entrance,
- Construct dormitory building, and
- Construct new cafeteria.

Current Project Design and Specifications

The contract's SOW did not require project design submittals and approvals. Requirements for all construction and rehabilitation work included adherence to "International or Iraqi Code," as specified. Specific international or Iraqi codes were not identified in the contract. The contract did include general specifications for work to be completed under the contract.

Reported Project Work Completed, In Progress, and Pending

We determined the project's status prior to the site visit through discussions with the USACE Resident Engineer and Quality Assurance Representative (QAR), as well as a review of the contract. The 10 September 2005, Project and Contracting Office (PCO) database listed the overall project as 100% completed on 2 September 2005.

Project site work reported completed:

- Upgrade perimeter security,
- Installation of water supply system,
- Installation/rehab of septic system,
- Supply and install generator and fuel tank,
- Construct covered entrance,
- Construct dormitory building, and
- Construct new cafeteria.

Project site work reported in progress:

- Project 100% complete

Project site work pending:

- Project 100% complete

Site Assessment

On 26 September 2005, we visited the Al Balda Police Station to perform an assessment of the renovation of the facility. The project was reported to be 100% complete at the

time of the visit and there was no project work ongoing at the time of the visit. The assessment covered work previously completed through the renovation project. During the site assessment, the Al Balda Police Station Chief of Police and his staff were on-site.

Work Completed

Significant areas of work completed included the following:

- **Upgrade of perimeter security**

The contract's BOQ required new construction, repair, and upgrade (height) of the perimeter wall; construction of four corner guard towers; supply and installation of 250 meters of concertina barbed wire; installation of 300 square meters (M²) of paved parking area; installation of 150 M² of sidewalks; and installation of an entry gate. During our site visit, we observed that the perimeter walls were in place and were painted, and that four corner guard towers were complete. Concertina barbed wire was located on top of all perimeter walls and on the Police Station's roof. The parking area was paved with asphalt and concrete sidewalks were located around the police station buildings. The upgrade of perimeter security appeared consistent with contract requirements.

For an illustration of the corner guard tower and the main entry gate, see Site Photo 1 and Site Photo 2, respectively.



Site Photo 1. Corner Guard Tower



Site Photo 2. Main Entry Gate

- Installation/rehabilitation of septic system

The contract's BOQ required the installation of a septic tank and the repair of an existing septic tank. The site visit verified the septic tank location. The ground level surface of the septic tank (concrete slab) did not appear to have adequate drainage based on observed standing water in the area. After discussions with the USACE QAR, we learned this tank is not connected to a leach field or city wastewater collection system. This system was designed as a holding tank, requiring sewage to be pumped out on a recurring basis. A yellow drain pipe was observed leading from the new cafeteria building to the septic tank manhole. This line was partially encased in concrete and partially exposed. The installation/rehabilitation of the septic system appeared consistent with the contract requirements. During the rainy season, there may be water drainage problems. For an illustration of the concrete cover of the septic tank and the standing water above the concrete pad, see Site Photo 3.



Site Photo 3. Septic Tank Cover with Un-drained Water

- **Installation of generator**

Contract Modification #P0001 required the supply and installation of a generator and a fuel tank. The contract did not specify the size of the generator required. The generator and fuel tank were on site and located to the right of the inside perimeter main gate. The generator factory nameplate lists the following information: company name - FG Wilson (Engineering) Ltd, Model - XP83E1, Serial Number - FGWPEP03ED0A24307, Year of Manufacture - 2004, Rated Power - 82.5 kilo Volt Amp (kVA), Rated voltage - 400/230 V, Rated Frequency - 50 Hz, and Rated Current - 119 A. For an illustration of the generator housing, and the 82.5 kVA generator inside the housing, see Site Photo 4 and Site Photo 5, respectively.



Site Photo 4. Generator Housing



Site Photo 5. 82.5 kVA Generator

- Construction of covered entrance
Contract Modification #P0001's BOQ required the new construction of 99 M² of canopies with steel frame supports and corrugated steel sheet roofs. A new canopy was located between the pedestrian gate and the front door of the Police Station. In addition, a canopy used for automobile parking was located between the generator units and the newly constructed cafeteria building. Both canopies were composed of painted steel frames and corrugated metal roofs. During the site visit, no discrepancies were noted regarding the construction of the canopies. For an illustration of the entrance canopy and the automobile canopy, see Site Photo 6 and Site Photo 7, respectively.



Site Photo 6. Entrance Canopy



Site Photo 7. Automobile Parking Canopy

- Construction of four small building
The contract's BOQ required the construction of four small buildings with specific dimensions: (1) a dormitory building (4M x 9M), (2) a cafeteria building (4M x 5M), (3) an information building (4M x 6M), and (4) an arms storage facility building (4.11M x 5.62M). The site visit verified the buildings were constructed and were currently in use. For an illustration of the cafeteria building's exterior front, see Site Photo 8; the exterior of the information building can be seen in Site Photo 9. The buildings appeared to be consistent with the contract's requirements.



Site Photo 8. Exterior View of the Cafeteria Building



Site Photo 9. Exterior View of the Information Building

Project site work reported in progress:

No site work was in progress at the time of the site visit; the project is listed as 100% complete.

Project site work pending:

No site work was in progress at the time of the site visit; the project is listed as 100% complete.

Project Quality Management

The Al Balda Police Station contract did not specify requirements for a Contractor Quality Control (CQC) plan, CQC daily reports, or a CQC deficiency-tracking log, and the contractor completed none.

The USACE Engineering Regulation (ER) 1110-1-12 and the PCO Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) CN-100 specify requirements for a Government QA program. The USACE QA program was adequate. The USACE QARs were on-site during rehabilitation and construction events. The USACE QARs monitored field activities and completed daily QA reports, which the QAR forwarded to the USACE Resident Engineer for review and verification of progress completed for payment approval. The QAR reports were sufficiently complete, accurate, and timely. Furthermore, the QAR reports included project specific or detailed photographs that reinforced the narrative information provided in the QAR's daily reports. The USACE QARs also maintained the QA deficiency logs. The procedures in-place ensured that potential construction deficiencies were detected, evaluated, and properly corrected in a timely manner.

Project Sustainability and Operational Effectiveness

Sustainability

A review of the contract file, the site visit, and discussions with the USACE Resident Engineer and QAR disclosed that the Al Balda Police Station is an operating facility and that the maintenance of the 82.5 kVA generator unit was the only significant sustainability issue at this site under this contract. Requirements for operation and maintenance manuals for the generator were included in the contract, as well as the training of on-site personnel. According to the USACE QAR, the contractor trained two police station personnel on maintenance procedures and supplied the operation and maintenance manuals to the Al Balda Chief of Police.

Operational Effectiveness

A review of the Al Balda Police Station contract and work completed showed that the police station was operating in accordance with the SOW's specific objective for a functional police station.

Conclusions

Based upon the results of our site visit, we reached the following conclusions for assessment objectives 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5. Appendix A provides details pertaining to Scope and Methodology.

1. Determine whether project results are consistent with original objectives.
The completed project was consistent with original task order objectives. Specifically, the rehabilitation work, which included the renovation and construction of buildings and/or facilities and all associated equipment required for a functional police station, was completed. This occurred primarily because the USACE Project Engineer and QAR effectively managed the project. Consequently, the Al Balda Police Station renovation resulted in an operational police station. Therefore, the original objective of the task order to renovate the Al Balda Police Station was met. Corrective action and management comments pertaining to this positive finding were not required.
2. Determine whether project components were adequately designed prior to construction or installation.
This project was primarily renovation work of an existing facility and the new construction of guard towers and a three-room building. The contract did not require submission and approval of design drawings for the new construction, but did include specifications for all work required. Although the contractor did not provide design drawings, this did not substantially influence the outcome of the project. Based on the review of the USACE on-site construction photos and QAR reports, it appears the contractor was experienced in constructing small facilities. Minimal design was required, which the USACE Project Manager and QAR ultimately accomplished. As a result, the Al Balda Police Station renovation resulted in a functional police station.

Corrective action and management comments pertaining to this non-finding were not required.

3. Determined whether construction or rehabilitation met the standards of the design.
The contract did not require submission and approval of design drawings for the new construction, but did include specifications for all work required. All work observed appeared to be consistent with the contract specifications, except for the installed roof system. This occurred because the USACE Resident Engineer and USACE QAR effectively monitored and supervised the rehabilitation efforts of the contractor. The Al Balda Police Station renovation will result in an operational police station. Corrective action and management comments pertaining to this non-finding were not required.
4. Determine whether the Contractor's Quality Control plan and the Government Quality Assurance Program were adequate.
The Al Balda Police Station contract did not specify a requirement for a CQC plan, CQC daily reports, or CQC deficiency tracking log, and none were completed. The USACE ER 1110-1-12 and the PCO SOP CN-100 do specify requirements for a Government QA program. The QAR program was adequate due to the QARs being on-site during rehabilitation and reconstruction events, monitoring field activities, and completing daily QA reports. The procedures in-place ensured that potential construction deficiencies were detected, evaluated, and properly corrected. In addition, the QARs reports were sufficiently complete, and included project specific or detailed photographs that reinforced the narrative information provided in the reports. Corrective action and management comments pertaining to this non-finding were not required.
5. Determine if project sustainability and operational effectiveness were addressed.
Sustainability was adequately addressed in the contract and resulted in an operational police station. The contract included training police station personnel to operate the generator. Operational and maintenance manuals for the generator were provided by the contractor. A review of operations at the Al Balda Police Station showed that the Al Balda Police Station was operating in accordance with the SOW's specific objective for a functional police station. Corrective action and management comments pertaining to this non-finding were not required.

Recommendations.

No adverse conditions were noted during this assessment and as a result, this report does not contain recommendations. Therefore, written response to this report was not required.

Management Comments.

Although not required, the Commander, Gulf Region Division, responded concurring with the report without comment.

Appendix A. Scope and Methodology

We performed this project assessment from September through December 2005, in accordance with the Quality Standards for Inspections issued by the President's Council on Integrity and Efficiency. The assessment team included a professional engineer and an auditor.

In performing this Project Assessment we:

- Reviewed contract documentation to include the following: Contract, Contract Modification, Scope of Work, and Independent Government Estimate for the modification.
- Reviewed the design package (drawings and specifications), Quality Assurance Plan, Quality Control Plan, Contractor's daily Quality Control Reports, and Quality Assurance Reports;
- Interviewed the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Area Engineer, Resident Engineer, Quality Assurance Representative, and the Al Balda Police Station Chief of Police.
- Conducted an on-site assessment and documented results at Al Balda Police Station in Hilla, Iraq.

Appendix B. Acronyms

BOQ	Bill of Quantity
CQC	Contractor Quality Control
ER	Engineering Regulation
KVA	Kilo-Volt Amp
M	Meters
M ²	Square Meters
PCO	Project and Contracting Office
QA	Quality Assurance
QAR	Quality Assurance Representative
SOP	Standard Operating Procedure
SOW	Scope of Work
USACE	U.S. Army Corps of Engineers

Appendix C. Report Distribution

Department of State

Secretary of State

Senior Advisor to the Secretary and Coordinator for Iraq

U.S. Ambassador to Iraq

Director, Iraq Reconstruction Management Office

Inspector General, Department of State

Department of Defense

Deputy Secretary of Defense

Director, Defense Reconstruction Support Office

Under Secretary of Defense (Comptroller)/Chief Financial Officer

Deputy Chief Financial Officer

Deputy Comptroller (Program/Budget)

Inspector General, Department of Defense

Department of the Army

Assistant Secretary of the Army for Acquisition, Logistics, and Technology

Principal Deputy to the Assistant Secretary of the Army for Acquisition,

Logistics, and Technology

Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Army (Policy and Procurement)

Director, Project and Contracting Office

Commanding General, Joint Contracting Command – Iraq/Afghanistan

Assistant Secretary of the Army for Financial Management and Comptroller

Auditor General of the Army

U.S. Central Command

Commanding General, Multi-National Force – Iraq

Commanding General, Multi-National Corps – Iraq

Commanding General, Multi-National Security Transition Command – Iraq

Commander, Joint Area Support Group – Central

Other Defense Organizations

Director, Defense Contract Audit Agency

Other Federal Government Organizations

Director, Office of Management and Budget

Comptroller General of the United States

Inspector General, Department of the Treasury

Inspector General, Department of Commerce

Inspector General, Health and Human Services

Inspector General, U.S. Agency for International Development

Congressional Committees and Subcommittees, Chairman and Ranking Minority Member

U.S. Senate

Senate Committee on Appropriations
 Subcommittee on Defense
 Subcommittee on Foreign Operations
Senate Committee on Armed Services
Senate Committee on Foreign Relations
 Subcommittee on Near Eastern and South Asian Affairs
 Subcommittee on International Operations and Terrorism
Senate Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs
 Subcommittee on Government Efficiency and Financial Management
 Subcommittee on Financial Management, the Budget, and International Security

U.S. House of Representatives

House Committee on Appropriations
 Subcommittee on Defense
 Subcommittee on Foreign Operations, Export Financing and Related Programs
House Committee on Armed Services
House Committee on International Relations
 Subcommittee on Middle East and Central Asia
House Committee on Government Reform
 Subcommittee on Government Efficiency and Financial Management
 Subcommittee on National Security, Emerging Threats and International Relations

Appendix D. Project Assessment Team Members

The Office of the Assistant Inspector General for Inspections, Office of the Special Inspector General for Iraq Reconstruction, prepared this report. The principal staff members who contributed to the report were:

Michael Stanka, P.E.

Angelina Johnston