F	AD -	A149 2	36 TH Re L/	HE USE EDUCTIO ABS MEL RL-STRU	OF ADHI INS IN BOURNE IC 399	ESIVE-E FATIGUE TAUSTE	BONDED E LIF., RALIA)	RIVETS (U) AE J Y M	TO LES RONAUTI ANN ET	SEN TH CAL RE AL. MA F/	E SEARCH R 84 G 13/5	t NL	/1	
				л Ц										
									END faite 2 85					
(c)														



+ .



ARL-STRUC-REPORT-399

and a state of the state of the

AD-A149 236





# DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE DEFENCE SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANISATION AERONAUTICAL RESEARCH LABORATORIES

MELBOURNE, VICTORIA

**STRUCTURES REPORT 399** 

# THE USE OF ADHESIVE-BONDED RIVETS TO LESSEN THE REDUCTIONS IN FATIGUE LIFE CAUSED BY RIVET HOLES

by

J. Y. MANN, R. A. PELL, R. JONES and M. HELLER



OTIC FILE COPY

COPY No

AR-003-011

#### DEPARTMENT OF DEFENCE DEFENCE SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY ORGANISATION AERONAUTICAL RESEARCH LABORATORIES

STRUCTURES REPORT 399

# THE USE OF ADHESIVE-BONDED RIVETS TO LESSEN THE REDUCTIONS IN FATIGUE LIFE CAUSED BY RIVET HOLES

by

J. Y. MANN, R. A. PELL, R. JONES and M. HELLER

#### SUMMARY

River holes are potential sites for fatigue crack initiation in aircraft structures. Several methods for improving the life of such details were investigated including coating the surface of the hole with adhesive, cold-expansion of the holes, the insertion of close-fit rivets and the use of adhesively-bonded rivets.

Of the various techniques examined only that involving adhesively-bonded rivets provided any significant improvements in fatigue life. It resulted in a reduction in fatigue crack propagation rate of about  $50^{\circ}{}_{\circ}$  compared with that for specimens incorporating open holes.

A finite element analysis indicated that adhesive bonding significantly reduces both the local stress concentration at the hole and the stress intensities at the crack tips, thus retarding crack initiation and reducing fatigue crack propagation rates. However, the effective reduction in stress intensity resulting from bonding (about 17%) is much less than the 50% predicted by the finite element analysis. This discrepancy is attributed mainly to shortcomings in the model for defining the characteristics and behaviour of the adhesive,



Commonwealth of Australia 1984

POSTAL ADDRESS: Director, Aeronautical Research Laboratories, Box 4331, P.O., Melbourne, Victoria, 3001, Australia

# CONTENTS

-----

.....

7:#

1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. SPECIMENS AND LESTING PROGRAM	I
2.1 Type (a) specimens	1
2.2 Type (b) specimens	2
3. FATIGUE TESTS	2
4. DISCUSSION	3
5. CONCLUSIONS	6
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	6
REFERENCES	
APPENDIX 1—Properties of test materials	

A-1

1. m 8.

APPENDIX 2-Hole treatments

APPENDIX 3-Fractographic crack growth measurements

TABLES

•

FIGURES

DISTRIBUTION

DOCUMENT CONTROL DATA

# 1. INTRODUCTION

During the full-scale fatigue testing of Mirage III fighter wings at the Swiss Federal Aircraft Factory  $(I \rightarrow W)$ , Switzerland, fatigue cracks were discovered at the innermost bolt holes along the rear flanges of the main spars. Subsequently, crack indications were confirmed at identical locations in wings of the Royal Australian Air Force Mirage IIIO fleet (Ref. 1). As a consequence, several investigations were undertaken at the Aeronautical Research Laboratories (ARL) to explore methods for increasing the fatigue lives at critical sections of the spars (Refs 1-3).

An area in the wing main spar of particular concern was the first bolt hole in the lower rear flange. A detail of the spar in this region is shown in Fig. 1. The development of a lifeenhancement scheme for this portion of the spar was complicated by the presence of two throughthe-flange single-leg-anchor-nut (SI AN) riset holes located close to the bolt hole in a chordwise direction. Although the installation of interference-fit steel bushes at the bolt hole virtually inhibited crack initiation at the bolt hole (Refs 1, 2) and the adoption of a modified system for securing the SI AN obviated the need for through-the-flange risets, a consequence was that the SLAN riset holes then became the critical locations for fatigue crack initiation. Several alternatives including reaming, cold-expanding and the insertion of close-fit risets were tested as part of the main life-enhancement investigation for the spar, but these did not provide any significant improvements in life for cracks which initiated at the riset holes.

Adhesive bonding of close-fit rivets in the SLAN holes was then proposed as a method of improving tatigue life. This was based on the premise that the adhesive would result in better load transfer through the rivet (and in so doing reduce the stress concentrating effect of the hole) and, subsequent to crack initiation, reduce the stress intensity at the crack tip (Ref. 4). In addition, the adhesive could act as an environmental barrier (Ref. 5), or provide an interlayer which would reduce the effects of fretting between the rivet and hole surface. The proposal was investigated in two complementary series of fatigue tests which are covered by this report.

#### 2. SPECIMENS AND TESTING PROGRAM

Figure 2 illustrates the basic forms of the two types of fatigue specimens employed in this investigation. The use of two types was necessitated by the availability at the time of suitable test material. Type (a) being made from offcuts of  $BS/L168^\circ$  aluminium alloy extruded bar 63.5 mm  $\times$  31.75 mm in section (Serial GR) used for the investigation reported in Reference 6, while Type (b) were taken from offcuts of 32 mm thick 2014-1651. aluminium alloy rolled plate (Serial GF) covered by Reference 3. In both cases the axis of the specimen was parallel to the direction of extrusion rolling of the material. The chemical compositions, tensile properties and fracture to aghness of the materials are given in Appendix 1.

#### 2.1 Eype (a) specimens (total 21)

In these specimens, the pitch between the twin holes was the same as the nominal pitch of the two river holes in the SLAN, and the distance from the centre line of each hole to the closest side of the specimen was that from the inner side of the 8 mm spar bolt hole to the centre line of the tirst river hole i.e.  $8^{-70}$  mm. A specimen thickness of 30 mm was chosen to correspond to the thickness of the spar flange at the SLAN section.

a sa pangang tan

<sup>\*</sup> The chemical compositions and static properties of these materials are equivalent to those of the French alloy A-U4SC used for the manufacture of the spars.

Fight different hole treatments were investigated.

- (i) Holes drilled 3/3 mm diameter, 0/125 inch diameter universal head rivets inserted against a packing piece, with the tail of the rivet peened into the countersink. This generally represented the original condition in the RAAF Mirage IIIO wings.
- (ii) Holes drilled 3.3 mm diameter and left empty. A condition equivalent to that of river removal from the spar flange without any reworking of the rivet holes.
- (iii) Holes reamed to 4 mm diameter and left empty. Representing a situation in which the rivet holes were simply cleaned up for inspection.
- (iv) Holes as in (iii) incorporating selected 5.32 inch (4 mm) diameter countersink-head 2117 aluminium alloy rivets pressed-in by hand to provide a neat fit. Designed to allow some load transfer through the rivet but to enable easy rivet removal for hole inspection during testing if required.
- (v) Holes and rivets as in (iv), but with rivets permanently bonded in position using an epoxy adhesive Type K 138 \*
- (vi) Holes cold-expanded using the Boeing split-sleeve process (Ref. 7) to finish at 4 mm diameter \* Holes left empty. The cold-expanding process introduces a residual compressive stress field adjacent to the hole which can retard fatigue crack initiation and growth
- (vii) Holes as in (vi) but incorporating close-fit rivets as in (iv).
- (viii) Holes and rivets as in (vii) but with rivets adhesively bonded as in (v).

#### 2.2 Type (b) specimens (total 9)

In these specimens the distance from the centre line of the hole to the side of the specimen (8.70 mm) corresponded to that in the Type (a) specimens. The specimen thickness was, however, slightly less i.e. 28 mm. Four hole treatments were investigated.

- (i) Holes reamed to 4 mm diameter and left empty. Equivalent to Type (aiii).
- (ii) Holes reamed as in (i) and left empty, but a coating of adhesive applied to the hole surface.
- (iii) Holes reamed as in (i) but incorporating pressed-in close-fit rivets. Equivalent to Type (aiv).
- (iv) Holes reamed as in (i) but incorporating adhesive-bonded close-fit rivets. Equivalent to Type (av)

#### 3. FATIGUE TESTS

The multi-load-level fatigue testing sequence adopted for this investigation was identical to that used for the other Mirage life-enhancement programs (Refs 1-3, 6). It consisted of a 100-flight sequence of four different flight types as indicated in Fig. 3. Cycles of +6.5 g/-1.5 g and +7.5 g/-2.5 g (a total of 39 cycles in 100 flights) were applied at a cyclic frequency of 1 Hz, whereas the remaining 1950 cycles per 100 flights were at 3 Hz. Sine-wave loading was adopted throughout. All fatigue tests were carried out in a Tinius-Olsen servo-controlled electro-hydraulic fatigue machine, the 100-flight sequence being achieved using an EMR Model 1641 programmable function generator controlled by a punched tape.

<sup>\*</sup> Details of the hole preparation, etc. for the adhesive-bonding and cold-expansion processes are given in Appendix 2.

For Type (a) specimens fatigue loads were based on the assumption that  $\pm 7.5$  g corresponded to a gross-area stress of 235 MPa (34 100 psi) and that there was a linear stress/g relationship i.e. the 1 g gross-area stress was 31.3 MPa (4547 psi). This magnitude of stress was chosen on the basis of results from a previous investigation (Ref. 6) using the same batch of material so that individual fatigue specimens should have test durations of between about one and two days. Specimens with 3.3 mm diameter holes had a nominal nett area of 562 mm<sup>2</sup>, while those with 4 mm holes a nett area of 520 mm<sup>2</sup>. The resulting nett area stresses were 318 MPa (46 100 psi) and 344 MPa (49 900 psi) respectively - a difference of about 8 m<sub>0</sub>.

The nett area stress chosen for the Type (b) specimens was the same as that for Type (a) specimens incorporating 4 mm holes, i.e. 344 MPa (49 900 psi). In this case the gross area stress was 265 MPa (38 390 psi).

Tables 1 and 2 give the individual fatigue lives, log, average lives and standard deviations of log, life for the various groups of Type (a) and Type (b) specimens. The extent of the fatigue cracking and representative fractures for Type (a) specimens are illustrated in Figs 4 and 5 respectively, while similar information relating to Type (b) specimens is shown in Figs 6 and 7.

#### 4. DISCUSSION

The individual fatigue test series involving the twin hole and single hole specimens both demonstrate the effectiveness of adhesive-bonded rivets in providing a significant increase in the life to failure relative to those for other hole treatments. Compared with specimens having reamed open holes, the ratio of lives for specimens incorporating adhesive-bonded rivets in reamed holes are 2.65 and 2.61 for the twin-hole and single-hole specimens respectively. On the limited data available, the cold-expansion of the holes in the twin-hole specimens does not result in a significant increase in life compared with that of reamed open-hole specimens, but bonding of rivets in cold-expanded holes again provides a marked increase in life. Furthermore, an adhesive coating on the hole surface of the single-hole specimens has not resulted in an improvement in life.

For both types of specimens the lives of those incorporating pressed-in rivets were not significantly different to those of open-hole specimens with similar hole conditions. On the basis of nett area stresses, the 4 mm reamed open twin-hole specimens would have been expected (Ref. 6) to have an average life of about  $55^{\circ}_{0}$  that of the 3-3 mm drilled hole specimens, i.e. 4200 flights. The greater actual life (5929 flights) of the reamed hole specimens probably reflects the much better hole surface finish in these compared with the drilled-hole specimens.

Three reasons which could be advanced for the significant improvement in life associated with the use of adhesive-bonded rivets are:

 (a) the adhesive acting as a barrier to inhibit crack initiation which might otherwise have been accelerated by environmental interaction;

۲

- (b) the adhesive acting as a non-metallic interlayer, thus separating the rivets and hole surface and reducing the potentially deleterious effects of fretting;
- (c) the adhesive providing improved load transfer characteristics at the section, both before and after crack initiation.

The tests on single-hole specimens suggest that the adhesive coating, as such, does not play a major part in the increased life associated with adhesive-bonded rivets. An examination of the fracture surfaces of specimens with filled holes (i.e. incorporating either pressed-in or adhesivebonded rivets) indicated the presence of fretting at or close to the countersink-end of nearly every hole, with lesser or no fretting at the other end of the holes. Of the 20 'filled-hole' specimens (15 twin-hole and five single-hole) the primary crack initiation in 13 was some distance from the ends of the hole and in the other four close to the end opposite to the countersink. It was only in the other three cases (one twin-hole cold-expanded, adhesive-bonded specimen No GR22B, and two single-hole one each with pressed-in and adhesive-bonded rivets, GJIZ and GJIZA respectively) that the primary crack developed from close to the countersink and fretting apparently did play a significant part in its initiation. Thus, as fretting was not a major factor in crack initiation in the non-adhesive-bonded specimens, the anti-fretting properties of the adhesive interlayer are unlikely to be responsible for the benefits resulting from the use of adhesive-bonded rivets.

An improved load transfer at the section containing the holes would be expected to delay the initiation of fatigue cracks by reducing the effective stress concentration and, providing the continuity of the adhesive was maintained, to reduce the fatigue crack propagation rate because of a reduction in the stress intensity at the crack tip. In order to elucidate this matter fractographic crack growth studies were made on several single-hole specimens (these being chosen in preference to the twin-hole specimens because of their less complicated crack development and to avoid problems associated with crack interactions which were apparent when two holes were present), and a complementary finite-element analysis made of the stress distributions around uncracked and cracked open holes and holes containing adhesively-bonded rivets.

One specimen from each of the four single-hole types was selected for detailed fractographic examination, and the respective fracture surfaces are illustrated in Fig. 7. It is clear that there are significant differences in crack development in these four specimens, and although a basis for selection was that of approximately equal maximum crack depths on both sides of the hole this criterion could not be satisfied in the case of the specimen with a pressed-in rivet (Type (biii)). The fracture surface feature used as the reference for crack growth measurements was that produced by the 7.5 g load which occurs only once in the 100-flight sequence, during flight 42. In every case growth data were obtained for the cracks initiating at both sides of the hole.

Details of the fractographic techniques employed are given in Appendix 3. These included the use of macrophotographs, an optical stereo microscope and a metallographic microscope. Crack growth measurements were obtained at distances as close as 0.020 to 0.039 mm from the hole surface in the case of specimens with open holes and pressed-in rivets and 0.125 mm in the case of the specimens with adhesive-bonded rivets. The incremental crack growth data obtained using the three techniques were combined to provide the series of crack growth plots illustrated in Fig. 8, and the curves (for the longer crack in each of the four specimens) shown in Fig. 9.

These curves show that the fatigue crack propagation period covers a much greater part of the life in adhesively-bonded river specimens than in the other three types of specimens. However, as the maximum crack depth for a given crack geometry is defined by the fracture toughness of the material, no great differences in the crack growth characteristics between the four types of specimens would have been anticipated at crack depths approaching complete fracture. Because of the absence of definable features on the fracture surfaces of adhesive-bonded specimens at crack depths of less than 0-125 mm, the fractographic studies did not provide any evidence relating to the effects of adhesive bonding on fatigue crack initiation in these specimens

The fractographic crack growth measurements also allowed the determination of the incremental crack propagation rates at the different crack depths corresponding to the applications of the 7–5 g load. Two specimens were selected for detailed analysis. They were the open-hole specimen No-GJ1ZB and the adhesively-bonded rivet specimen No-GJ2B16, each of which had reasonably symmetric crack growth from both sides of the hole. This allowed the crack growth data for both sides of the holes in the individual specimens to be pooled. The crack depth versus incremental crack growth data were plotted on linear scales and second order polynomial curves fitted. (It should be noted however that there was considerable variability in the raw incremental growth data for crack depths of greater than about 2 mm). Calculated crack growth rates at selected crack depths are given in Table 3.

t

On the premise that (for similar crack geometries) any given crack propagation rate represents conditions of equivalent stress intensity factors in the two types of specimens, it can be seen from Table 3 that 0.5, 1.0, 1.5 and 2.0 mm deep cracks in adhesively-bonded rivet specimens are equivalent to those of 0.2, 0.6, 1.0 and 1.4 mm in depth respectively in open-hole specimens. Clearly, the percentage reduction in crack propagation rate associated with the use of bonded rivets decreases as the cracks become deeper, and would approach zero at final fracture conditions. Using data for a similar material published elsewhere. (Ref. 9) it was estimated that a reduction in fatigue crack propagation rate of 50% should represent a reduction in stress intensity at the crack tip of about 17%. Reductions of about 50% in crack propagation rate are evident for the open-hole specimen when comparing the rates at crack depths of 2.0 and 1.1 mm, and 1.0 and 0.5 mm, and for the adhesive-bonded rivet specimen at depths of 2.2 and 1.3 mm, and 1.2 and 0.7 mm. At a crack depth of 0.5 mm the crack growth rate in the bonded-rivet specimen is about half that in the open hole specimen.

In order to understand the mechanisms which resulted in the increase in fatigue life of the adhesively-bonded specimen a detailed finite element analysis (Ref. 10) was undertaken on the single-hole specimen containing a bonded rivet. Initially the specimen was considered to be uncracked and, due to symmetry, only a quarter of it was modelled. The resultant plane strain finite element model consisted of 38 eight-noded isoparametric quadrilateral elements and eight six-noded isoparametric triangular elements see Fig. 10(a). Element stiffness matrices were computed using reduced integration and double precision and the solution was also performed using double precision.

The aluminium alloy rivet and specimen were both assumed to have a Modulus of Elasticity of 73 000 MPa and a Poisson's ratio of 0.32, while the adhesive was assumed to have a Modulus of Elasticity of 700 MPa and a Poisson's ratio of 0.35. The adhesive layer was very thin and although its thickness was not precisely known it was, for the purpose of this analysis, taken to be 0.0127 mm. It was assumed that the applied tensile stress corresponded to the maximum load of 7.5 g in the fatigue sequence. This resulted in a gross area 'applied' stress of 265 MPa and a nett section stress at the hole of 344 MPa.

Unfortunately no information on the static tensile or fatigue strength of the adhesive was available and so two separate analyses were undertaken where:

- (i) the adhesive was assumed to not yield or fail,
- (ii) the adhesive was assumed to fail wherever the peel stress was tensile —this represented a condition by which at least  $50^{\circ}$ , of the glue line had failed.

The results of these analyses can be found in Table 4 as can the result for the case when the hole was unfilled. This shows that in each case the adhesively-bonded rivet has dramatically reduced the stresses around the hole and thus a significant increase in the life to crack initiation could be expected.

Attention is now directed to the situation when the hole is cracked. Cracks of various discrete depths, up to a maximum of 2-5 mm, were considered for the following cases:

- (i) a through crack on one side of the hole only (half the structure modelled).
- (ii) through cracks of equal depth, on each side of the hole (a quarter of the structure modelled)

The finite element model for these problems consisted of approximately 74 eight-noded isoparametric quadrilateral elements and 32 six-noded isoparametric triangular elements for case (i) and 36 and 24 espectively for case (ii) see Fig. 10(b). As before, reduced integration was used and the solution was performed in double precision. The results of this analysis are given in Tables 5 and 6. Also given are the values of the stress intensity factor for the case when the hole is unfilled and for the case when there is a crack but no rivet hole. The results for the doublesided crack case are shown plotted in Fig. 11.

There are a number of important points indicated by this analysis:

- (i) A bonded rivet significantly reduces the stress intensity factor, even after a significant proportion of the adhesive has failed. Thus the use of adhesive-bonded rivets would be expected to result in reduced fatigue-crack propagation rates.
- (ii) The values of stress intensity factors for the case of a crack on one side and for the case of a crack of the same depth on both sides of the hole are almost identical.

- (iii) As the crack depth increases a crack at a bonded rivet hole behaves as if the specimendoes not contain a hole. In the present case this asymptotic behaviour is effectively reached at a crack depth of approximately 2.5 mm. This is particularly important since it allows simple, and yet accurate, analytical estimates to be obtained for stress intensity factors of cracked holes which are to be repaired by a bonded insert.
- (iv) In the case of a crack on both sides of the hole the value of the stress intensity factor for a 3.0 mm crack at a bonded river hole (with adhesive failed in tension) is approximately the same as for a 0.5 mm crack at an unfilled river hole.

Whilst this summary of the finite element analysis has concentrated on bonded rivets with a particular adhesive thickness, the more detailed investigation presented in Ref. 10 covers the effects of variable adhesive thickness and the use of a bonded sleeve in larger fastener bolts.

A comparison of the results of the finite element analyses for cracked specimens and the data obtained from the fractographic analysis indicates that the finite element analysis successfully predicts the observed trends. Referring to the data in Table 3 and Fig. 11 for the open hole and adhesively-bonded rivet (adhesive failed) specimens, a  $50^{\circ}_{\circ}$  reduction in observed fatigue crack propagation rates between pairs of crack depths corresponds to about  $17^{\circ}_{\circ}$  is in excellent agreement with that obtained from Ref. 9. However, the effective reduction in stress intensity at any given crack depth as a result of the insertion of an adhesively-bonded rivet is much less than that predicted by the finite element analysis. For example, at a crack depth of 0.5 mm the 50 reduction in crack propagation rate would suggest a reduction in stress intensity of about 17° , whereas the finite element analysis predicts a reduction of greater than  $50^{\circ}_{\circ}$ .

Clearly the finite element model for determining stress intensities incorporated a number of simplifying assumptions of which the geometry of the crack front relative to those which developed in actual fatigue specimens and the characteristics of the glue line are probably the most significant. If one assumes that there are fewer uncertainties in representing the situation for an unfilled hole, then ion a relative basis) the major reason for the discrepancies between actual and predicted stress intensities for the open-hole specimens and those incorporating adhesively-bonded rivets is in the adequacy of the model for defining the properties and behaviour of the adhesive. Nevertheless, the findings outlined in this Report suggest that the concept of adhesively-bonded inserts is worthy of a more detailed study.

#### 5. CONCLUSIONS

- 1 The insertion of close-fit adhesively-bonded rivets in holes can provide significant improvements in fatigue life compared with that for specimens having open holes.
- 2. For small crack depths the rates of fatigue crack propagation in adhesively-bonded rivet specimens are only about half those in open-hole specimens.
- 3 Finite element analyses indicate that adhesive bonding significantly reduces both the local stress concentration at the hole and the stress intensities at the crack tips, thus retarding crack initiation and reducing fatigue crack propagation rates.
- 4 The effective reduction in stress intensity resulting from bonding (about 17%) is much less than the 50% predicted by the finite element analysis. This discrepancy is attributed mainly to shortcomings in the model for defining the characteristics and behaviour of the adhesive.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Authors' wish to express their thanks to Dr A. A. Baker of Materials Division for his advice and co-operation, and gratefully acknowledge the assistance of Corporal G. Vejle of the RAAF for bonding the rivets and Messrs W. F. Lupson, G. W. Revill and A. S. Machin of Structures Division for the conduct of the fatigue testing program.

#### REFERENCES

- Mann, J. Y., Kälin, R., and Wilson, F. E., Extending the fatigue life of a fighter aircraft wing *Aircraft tatigue in the Eighties*. (Editors: J. B. de Jonge and H. H. van den Linden). Netherlands, National Aerospace Laboratories, 1981, pp. 1.7.1–1.7/42.
- Mann, J. Y., Machin, A. S., and Lupson, W. F., Improving the fatigue life of the Mirage IIIO wing main spar - Dept. Defence, Aero. Rev. Labs, Structures Report 398, January 1984.
- 3. Mann, J. Y., Revill, G. W., and Lupson, W. F., Improving the fatigue performance of thick aluminium alloy bolted joints by cold-expansion and the use of interference-fit steel bushes. *Dept. Defence, Aero. Res. Labs, Structures Note* 486, April 1983.
- 4 Jones, R., and Callinan, R. J., New thoughts on stopping cracks which emanate from holes. Int. Jnl. Fracture, Vol. 17, 1981, pp. R53–R55.
- Gurney, T. R., Fatigue of welded structures. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2nd edition, 1979, pp. 334–335.
- 6 Mann, J. Y., Machin, A. S., Lupson, W. F., and Pell, R. A., The use of interference-fit bolts or bushes and hole cold-expansion for increasing the fatigue life of thick-section aluminium alloy bolted joints. *Dept. Defence, Aero. Res. Labs*, Structures Note 490, August 1985.
- 7 Phillips, J. L., Fatigue improvement by sleeve cold-working. SAE Paper No. 73095, October 1973.
- 8 Mann, J. Y., and Jost, G. S., Stress fields associated with interference-fitted and coldexpanded holes with particular reference to the fatigue life enhancement of aircraft structural joints. *Metals Forum*, Vol. 6, No. 1, 1983, pp. 43–53.
- 9 Finnes, J. M. et al., Modelling for fatigue crack growth prediction in Mirage IIIO frame 26. Dept. Defence, Aero. Rev. Labs, Structures Report 401, April 1984.
- Jones, R., and Heller, M., On the stress analysis of bonded inserts. Dept. Defence, Aero. Rev. Labs. Structures Report 000, 1984.

# APPENDIX 1

t

٨

**Properties of Test Materials** 

(a) Chemical composition $\binom{n}{2}$	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	

Element	British Standard 1 168 - 1978	Test Material GR	QQ-A-255a (2014)	Test Material GJ
Cu	3950	4 29	3950	4 48
Mg	0.2.0.8	0-43	0.2.0.8	0.60
Mn	0412	0.76	0412	0-91
Le	0.5 max	0.23	1.0 max.	0.45
Si	0509	0.74	0512	0.86
L.	0.15 max.	not analyzed		not analyzed
Ст.	0.10 max	0.01	0.1 max.	0.04
Zn	0.25 max	+ 0/20	0.25 max	0.12
• • •		:	i -	

(b) Static tensile properties

Property	British Standard	Test material	QQ-A-255a Test hat 1 GJ (2014-T651)			
,	1.168 1978	GR	(transverse)	(transverse)	(longitudinal)	
0.1 proof stress (MPa)		466		458	470	
0.2 proof stress (MPa)	44()	474	407 (59 (00 psi)	466	475	
Ultimate tensile stress (MPa)	490	524	462 (67 000 psi)	506	509	
Elorgation ( - )	-	11	4	8 S	93	
0 1° proof ultimate		0.89		0.91	0.92	

(c) Fracture toughness (**k**<sub>1</sub>c)

	Test material GR*	Test material GJ+
MPa m <sup>ilit</sup>	32/0	25/0
ksi in <sup>1,2</sup>	29-2	22 8

\* Average of five tests on 19 mm thick compact tension specimens.

\* Average of five tests on 25 mm thick compact tension specimens.

#### APPENDIX 2

# Hole Treatments

The holes in all specimens were initially drilled at 3-3 mm diameter (from the Datum Face), and countersunk (120), 5-5 mm diameter at the Datum Face. Final reaming for all except Type (at) and (aii) specimens was 4-010-4-028 mm diameter, also from the Datum Face.

4 Boeing split sleeve cold-expansion

Starting hole size	3-683/3+708 mm
Finished hole size (after reaming)	4-010-4-028 mm
Degree of cold-expansion	2.7 to 3.4"
Direction of expansion	Toward Datum Face

(1) lastic recovery of the test specimen material occurs after withdrawal from the hole of the coldexpansion tool. The degree of cold-expansion is defined as the percentage difference in diameter between the starting hole size, and the maximum mandrel diameter plus twice the sleeve thickness).

#### B. Adhesise bonding

The surface treatment of the holes consisted of a thorough degreasing using Methyl Ethyl Ketone followed by light abrasion using a stainless steel wire brush. Adhesive type K138, a two-part epoxy manufactured by CIBA, was then applied to the surfaces of the hole and the typet, and the rivet worked into the hole to ensure that the surfaces of both the hole and the rivet were fully coated. The adhesive was then cured overnight at 40 C.

#### **APPENDIX 3**

#### Fractographic Crack Growth Measurements

Each fracture was examined using three independent techniques:

- (i) a macrophotograph at about  $\times 15$  magnification to provide crack growth data at relatively large crack depths:
- (ii) an optical stereo microscope with diffuse illumination and magnifications of  $\times 100, 50$  and 25, and
- (iii) a metallographic microscope with polarized vertical illumination, using magnifications of x 500 or 50.

Both microscopes were fitted with a cross-hair in one eye piece. The specimens were mounted on an X, Y stage fitted with photo-electrical digital micrometers reading to 0.001 mm, and the crack depths corresponding to the applications of the 7.5 g load were accurately measured by traversing the specimens under the microscope objectives. Whenever possible the traverse of the fracture surface was perpendicular to the axis of the hole.

Because of the substantial overlapping of the region of the fracture by each independent visualization technique about  $80^{\circ}_{10}$  of the crack depth data were duplicated. However, measurements obtained using the metallographic microscope were considered to be the most accurate at short crack depths ( $\times$  500) and large crack depths ( $\times$  50), and those using the stereo microscope the most accurate at intermediate crack depths. Thus the crack depth versus life data presented are not a simple average of the measurements obtained by the different techniques but represent the actual measurements obtained using the technique considered to be most accurate over particular regions of the fracture. When combined together they provided a coherent set of data covering the entire line of traverse.

As a check on the validity of the interpretation of the individual fracture markings on each specimen all the data obtained for a particular fracture using the three independent techniques were combined and examined on the basis of a relationship between crack depth and incremental crack growth. For intermediate and large crack depths (e.g. for greater than about 0.5 mm) this relationship was found to be approximately linear. On the relatively rare occasions when individual measurements indicated wide departures from this relationship the particular data were reassessed. When data could not be validated by independent measurements using more than one technique (about 20% of the data), the validity of individual measurements in such cases were assessed by the individual relationship between crack depth and incremental crack growth.

	· - · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	Hole treatment	Specimen   No GR	Life (fluthes)
(1)	Drilled 3-3 mm, filled	18F	9547
	1.8 inch-rivets	138	10.042
		190	10.320
		î l	
		log, average life	9,963
		s.d. log life	0.017
		1	
(11)	Drilled 3-3 mm, open	26B	7,500
	holes	161	8,105
		log average life	7,797
		sid log life	0.024
6 7 9 9 1	Reamed 4 mm open halo		6 6 1 3
,,	Realized 4 min, open note	י גיא ועט	4.212
		10D	0.942
		log average life	5 979
		s d log life	0.041
		· · · •	
(15)	Reamed 4 mm, pressed-in	n 17 <b>8</b> -	3,735
	5.32 inch-rivets	238	3,842
		14B ·	6,335
		1 - E	
		log, average life	4,496
		s dolog, life	0 129
(x)	Reamed 4 mm adhesise	MD	11412
,	bonded 5.32 mch more	· _//D	14,04
		168	16.140
			100, 440
		log average life	15,688
		sid log life	0.026
(51)	Expanded 4 mm, open	19 <b>B</b>	7.142
	holes	24B	9,442
		log, average life	8.212
		s.d. log. life	0.086
(511)	Expanded 4mm pressedui	n 17(	5 9.17
	5.32 inch rivets	141	7 642
		21B	8.080
		log, average life	7,159
		s.d. log. life	0.071
(NHI)	Expanded 4 mm, adhesive	15B	10,542
	bonded 5.32 inch rivets	22B	23,542
		15C	26,130
		lon average bits	18 644
		iog. average me - s d. log. life	10,040
		and to Brilling	0 -10

TABLE 1 Fatigue test results, Type (a) specimens

•

.

Hole treatment	Specimen No. GJ	Life (flights)
(i) Reamed 4 mm, open holes	1U 1ZB	2,542 3,242
	log, average life s.d. log, life	2.871 0-075
(ii) Reamed 4 mm, open holes coated with adhesive	1 Y 1 V	2.742 2,842
 	log, average life s.d. log, life	2,792 0+011
(iii) Reamed 4 mm, pressed-in rivet	2A16 1Z	3,542 3,820
	log, average life s.d. log, life	3,678 0-023
(iv) Reamed 4 mm, adhesive- bonded rivet	1X 1ZA 2B16	5,742 7,942 8,942
1	log, average life s.d. log, life	7,415 0 100

**}**\*

į

# TABLE 2 Fatigue test results, Type (b) specimens

Crack	Crack propagation	Reduction in rate by		
(mm)	Open hole specimen GJ1ZB (A)	Bonded rivet specimen (JJ2B16 (B)	bonding (",) [(1 B A) × 100]	
0.1	0.026	0-0001	99.6	
0.2	0.038	0-009	76	
0.3	0.052	0-019	63	
0.4	0.065	0.028	57	
1) 5	0.080	0-039	51	
0.6	0-094	0-049	48	
0 7	0 109	0.060	45	
0.8	0.125	0.071	43	
0.9	0×141	0.082	42	
1.0	0.158	0-094	41	
11	0.175	0 106	39	
1.2	0 193	0.119	38	
13	0.211	0 131	38	
14	0.229	0 144	37	
1.5	0 248	0 158	36	
1.6	0 268	0 172	36	
1 ~	0.288	0-186	35	
1.8	0 308	0 200	35	
19	0.329	0-215	35	
2.0	0 351	0 230	35	
2.1	0 373	0.245	34	
2.2	0-395	0 261		
23	0.418	0 277	34	
2.4	0 441	0.293	34	
2.5	0.465	0 310	33	

.

TABLE 3 Crack Propagation Rates Determined from Fractographic Measurements

;

	TAB	LE	4		
Maximum principal	stress	for	the	uncracked	specimen

Case considered	Stress (MPa)
Unfilled hole	853
Bonded rivet (no adhesive failure)	337
Bonded rivet (adhesive failed in tension)	427

TA	BL	Æ	5
----	----	---	---

Stress Intensity Factors K (MPa m<sup>1/2</sup>) for a cracked hole—crack on one side only

rack depth	Bond	ed rivet	No hole	Open hole
(mm)	No adhesiye failure	Adhesive failed in tension		
u 5	9-1	12 1		25 6
() Y	11.3	15.0		27 - 8
1.5	14 3	18-4	13-1	29.9
2.0	15.9	20-1	14 8	.30-9
2.3	17-1	21.4	16-0	32

# TABLE 6

Stress Intensity Factors K (MPa m<sup>1/2</sup>) for a cracked hole—for a crack on both sides

	Bonde	ed rivet	
(mm)	No adhesive failure	Adhesive failed in tension	Open hole
0 S	91	12.2	26-4
0.9	11-3	15.3	29 7
15	14 5	18 8	33-9
2.3	17:6	22-6	39-2
2.5		23.6	

۲ •



~

\* <u>2</u>

**1**#



:

5

**\$** 

•			
•			
••			
			•
		i.	
			r
		•	
	•		
•	•	• • ·	
	· ·		<b>i</b> 
			•
			ş T
	··	•	1
:			
		•	
-	1	_ <b>5</b> *	
		· · ·	
<u> </u>	2		
	بر ا	2	
<u> </u>	ст. на 3-т. ст.		
	. :	77	
• •	••	•	1
· ···			
·			× 6
	•	· `	
			-
•		•	
•		·	
•	· •	•	
· ·			
	·· ·:	ш	: 7
•	•	· •	- <b>.</b> ,
			•
•	• •	•	•
•	· •	• •	, • • -
•	•	. •. 	 
•	•		· · · ·

e, este el societaren en collectier el comparte de la construcción el anomen el ANC 400 año en el

. . . . . . . . . ł a. 1 •. • ÷ л. • ' 1. . . .... • .1 



FIG. 3 FRENCH 100 FLIGHT MIRAGE T FLIGHT BY FLIGHT SEQUENCE

4

ŧ

٠.

t

ز.



FIG 4 (i) FRACTURES TYPE (ai) SPECIMENS. DRILLED 3.3 mm, FILLED 0.125 in. RIVETS



Specimen No. GR26B Flights 7,500

Specimen No. GR16E Flights 8,105



haile i -J' ett

Ano I



ł

4.

i.

Specimen No. GR25B Flights 5,542

.

Specimen No. GR18B Flights 6,342





A.B. and A.

٠.



+.

i

Specimen No. GR20B Flights 14,642

Specimen No. GR13C Flights 16,040



Specimen No. GR168 Flights 16,440

1



-

,,

e in Selfy selfy and

FIG. 4 (v) FRACTURES TYPE (av) SPECIMENS. REAMED 4 mm, ADHESIVE BONDED  $\gamma_{v_2}$  in. RIVETS



.

Specimen No. GR198 Flights 7,142

Specimen No. GR24B Flights 9,442



FIG. 4 (vi) FRACTURES TYPE (avi) SPECIMENS. COLD-EXPANDED 4 mm, OPEN HOLES



4 🔹

i

A B Single A

s.

-11

τ;

FIG. 4 (vii) FRACTURES TYPE (avii) SPECIMENS. COLD-EXPANDED 4 mm, PRESSED-IN 3/52 in. RIVETS



÷٠,

4 :

1

3 .s

. .

ſ

FIG. 4 (viii) FRACTURES TYPE (aviii) SPECIMENS. COLD EXPANDED 4 mm, ADHESIVE BONDED  $\frac{5}{12}$  in. RIVETS



Specimen No. GR18E Type (ai) – 3.3 mm drilled holes, 0.125 in. rivets





Specimen No. GR18B Type (aiii) – 4 mm reamed holes, open



FIG. 5 (a) FRACTURE SURFACES TYPE (a) SPECIMENS

Specimen No. GR14B Type (aiv) - 4 mm reamed holes, pressed in rivets



Specimen No. GR13C Type (av) - 4 mm reamed holes, adhesivebonded rivets



Specimen No. GR24B Type (avi) – 4 mm cold expanded holes, open



# FIG. 5 (b) FRACTURE SURFACES TYPE (a) SPECIMENS

Specimen No. GR14E Type (avii) – 4 mm cold expanded holes, pressed-in rivets



(

Specimen No. GR228 Type (aviii) - 4 mm cold-expanded holes, adhesive-bonded rivets



# FIG. 5 (c) FRACTURE SURFACES TYPE (a) SPECIMENS

٠.,





FIG. 6 (iii) FRACTURES TYPE (biii) SPECIMENS. Reamed 4 mm, pressed-in rivet



ŧ

Specimen No. GJ1X Flights 5,742

waterstation and the second states and the

.

۰.

Specimen No. GJ1ZA Flights 7,942

Specimen No. GJ2B16 Flights 8,942

FIG. 6 (iv) FRACTURES TYPE (biv) SPECIMENS. Reamed 4 mm, adhesive-bonded rivet Specimen No. GJ1ZB Type (bi) -- 4 mm reamed hole, open



′**B`** 

Έ'

**'B**'

Specimen No. GJ1Y Type (bii) - 4 mm reamed hole, adhesive cuated, open

Specimen No. GJ2A16 Type (biii) – 4 mm reamed hole, pressed-in rivet



Ά'



Specimen No. GJ2B16 Type (biv) -- 4 mm reamed hole, adhesive bonded rivet

Ά'



**'**B'

# FIG. 7 FRACTURE SURFACES TYPE (b) SPECIMENS

'A'

Ά.



ų



ς,

-

•



# FIG. 9 CRACK PROPAGATION, TYPE (b) SPECIMENS

1.



1 .

See Detail A



•

.

FIG. 10 (b) FINITE ELEMENT MESH FOR CRACKED SPECIMEN – BONDED RIVET (ONLY MESH IN REGION OF CRACK FOR QUARTER SECTION SHOWN)

> . .



FIG. 11 STRESS INTENSITY FACTORS FOR HOLES WITH CRACKS ON BOTH SIDES

# DISTRIBUTION

# AUSTRALIA

#### DEPARIMENT OF DEFENCE

# **Central Office**

Chief Defence Scientist Deputy Chief Defence Scientist Superintendent, Science and Technology Programmes Controller, Projects and Analytical Studies Defence Science Representative (UK.) (Doc. Data sheet only) Counsellor, Defence Science (USA.) (Doc. Data sheet only) Defence Central Library Document Exchange Centre, DTSB (18 copies) Joint Intelligence Organisation Librarian H Block, Victoria Barracks, Melbourne Director General – Army Development (NSO) (4 copies)

#### Aeronautical Research Laboratories

Director Library Superintendent Structures Superintendent Materials Divisional File Structures Authors J.Y. Mann R A Pell R. Jones M Heller G S Jost A.S. Machin B.C. Hoskin J. M. Emney 1 M Bland C. K. Rider J. M. Grandage J. G. Sparrow C. A. Patching

A A Baker

Materials Research Laboratories Director Library

# Defence Research Centre

Library

#### Navy Office

Navy Scientific Adviser Directorate of Naval Aircraft Engineering

#### Army Office Army Scientific Adviser

Engineering Development Establishment, Library

Air Force Office

Air Force Scientific Adviser Director General Aircraft Engineering - Air Force HQ Support Command (SLLNGO) Air Attache Paris (Sent direct from ARL)

## DEPARIMENT OF DEFENCE SUPPORT

#### Government Aircraft Factories

Manager Library

#### DEPARIMENT OF AVIATION

Eibrary Elving Operations and Airworthiness Division Melbourne Mr K. R. A. O'Brien Canberra, Mr C. Torkington

#### STATUTORY & STATE AUTHORITIES AND INDUSTRY

Australian Atomic Energy Commission, Director USIRO
Materials Science Division, Library
Trans Australia Airlines, Library
Qantas Airways Eimited
SEC of Vic., Herman Research Laboratory, Library
Ansett Airlines of Australia, Library
B H P - Melbourne Research Laboratories
Commonwealth Aircraft Corporation
Library
Mr K, J. Kennedy (Manager Aircraft Factory No. 1)
Manager, Design Engineering
Hawker de Havilland Aust. Pty Ltd, Bankstown, Library

# UNIVERSITIES AND COLLEGES

Adelaide	Barr Smith Library
Melbourne	Engineering Library
Monash	Hargrave Library
	Professor I. J. Polmear, Materials Engineering
Newcastle	Library
New England	Library
Sydney	Engineering Library
NSW	Metallurgy Library
Queensland	Library
Lasmania	Engineering Library
Western Australia	Library
RMIT	Library

ŧ.

#### CANADA

**CAARC** Coordinator Structures

International Civil Aviation Organization, Library

Energy Mines & Resources Dept Physics and Metallurgy Research Laboratories

NRC

Neronautical & Mechanical Engineering Library Division of Mechanical Engineering, Director

# Universities and Colleges

Loronto Institute for Aerospace Studies

#### FRANCE

ONERA, Library AMD-BA M. Peyrony D. Chaumette

#### INDIA

**CAARC** Coordinator Structures Defence Ministry, Aero Development Establishment, Library Hindustan Aeronautics Ltd, Library National Aeronautical Laboratory, Information Centre

# INTERNATIONAL COMMITTEE ON AERONAUTICAL FATIGUE

Per Australian ICAF Representative (25 copies)

# ISRAEL

Israel Air Force Israel Aircraft Industries Technion-Israel Institute of Technology Professor J. Singer Professor A. Buch

#### JAPAN

National Research Institute for Metals, Fatigue Testing Division Institute of Space and Astronautical Science, Library

#### **Universities**

Kagawa University Professor H. Ishikawa

#### NETHERLANDS

National Aerospace Laboratory (NLR), Library

**Universities** Technological University of Delft

Professor J. Schijve

# NEW ZEALAND

Defence Scientific Establishment, Library RNZAE, Vice Consul (Defence Liason)

## Universities

Canterbury

Library Professor D. Stevenson, Mechanical Engineering

## SWEDEN

Aeronautical Research Institute, Library Swedish National Defence Research Institute (FOA), Library

## SWITZERLAND.

Armament Technology and Procurement Group F - W (Swiss Federal Aircraft Factory) Mr E. Oirard Dr H. Boesch Mr A. Jordi

#### UNITED KINGDOM

Ministry of Defence, Research, Materials and Collaboration (AARC, Secretary (NPL) Royal Aircraft Establishment Bedford, Library Earnborough, Library Commonwealth Air Transport Council Secretariat Admiralty Marine Technology Establishment, Library National Gas Turbine Establishment Director, Prestock North National Physical Laboratory, Library National Engineering Laboratory, Library British Library, Lending Division CAARC Co-ordinator, Structures Fulmer Research Institute I td, Research Director Motor Industry Research Association, Director Rolls Rovee Ltd Aero Division Bristol, Library Welding Institute, Library British Aerospace Hatheld-Chester Division, Library British Hovercraft Corporation Ltd, Library Short Brothers Ltd, Technical Library

#### Universities and Colleges

Bristol	Engineering Library
Nottingham	Science Library
Southampton	Library
Strathclyde	Library
Cranheld Institute	
of fechnology	Library
Imperial College	Aeronautics Library

# UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

-

NASA Scientific and Technical Information Facility Applied Mechanics Reviews Metals Information The John Crerar Library The Chemical Abstracts Service Boeing Co. Mr.R. Watson Mr J. C. McMillan Lockheed-California Company Lockheed Georgia McDonnell Aircraft Company, Library Nondestructive Testing Information Analysis Center Fatigue Technology Inc., Mr.R. L. Champoux

# Universities and Colleges

lowa	Professor R. I. Stephens
Illinois	Professor D. C. Drucker
Massachusetts Inst	
of Technology	M.I.T. Libraries
Lehigh University	Professor G. C. Sih, Institute of Solid and Fracture
	Mechanics

SPARES (15 copies)

TOTAL (195 copies)



# Department of Defence DOCUMENT CONTROL DATA

I. a. AR No.	I. b. Establishment No.	2. Document Date	3. Task No.
AR 003-011	ARL STRUC R 399	March 1984	DST 83/005
			)
4. Title		5. Security	6. No. Pages
THE USE OF	ADHESIVE-BONDED RIVETS	a. document	17
TO LESSEN 1	THE REDUCTIONS IN FATIGUE	Unclassified	7 No. Bet
LIFE CAUSEI	D BY RIVET HOLES	D. CICIE C. ADSCRACE	7. NO. Ners
		U. U.	10
8. Author(s)		9. Downgrading Instruc	tions
J.Y. Mann, R.	A. Pell, R. Jones and M. Heller		
10 Corporate Aut	10 Corporate Author and Address		briate)
		a. Sponsor	c. Downgrading
Aaronautical Research Laboratories		b. Security	d. Approval
P() Box 4331	Melbourne Victoria 3001		
F O BOX 4001.	Mentourne, Mentha, 3000		
12 Secondary Dist	ribution (of this document	·	
,			
Approved for r	ublic release		
- ippinieu ni p			
Overseas enquirer	s outside stated limitations should be referred	d through ASDIS, Defence	Information Services
Branch, Departmen	nt of Defence, Campbell Park, CANBERRA, A	CT, 2601	
13 a This docume	nt may be ANNOUNCED in catalogues and a	wareness services available	1 to
No limitations			
13 b Citation for	other purposes (ce casual announcement) may	v be (select) unrestricted (	or) as for 13 a.
14 D		,	COSATI Group
Eatigue (materi	als) Adhesive bonding		1130
Holes tonening	si binite element analysis	1	3050
Stress analysis	Rivets	i i	1010
fuld work ma	Constinues	•	
CORE WORKING	( Gaungs		
14 Abstract	- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · ································	
River holes are	potential sites for fatigue crack initiatio	n in aircraft structures	. Several methods
for improving th	he life of such details were investigated	including coating the s	urface of the hole
with adhesive co	old-expansion of the holes, the insertion o	f close-fit rivets and the	use of adhesively-
bonded rivers		, , ,	,
()d also and	and early an around only that in	aluing adhanisals hand	and minate many day

Of the various techniques examined only that involving adhesively-bonded rivets provided any significant improvements in fatigue life. It resulted in a reduction in fatigue crack propagation rate of about 50%, compared with that for specimens incorporating open holes.

A finite element analysis indicated that adhesive bonding significantly reduces both the local stress concentration at the hole and the stress intensities at the crack tips, thus retarding crack This page is to be used to record information which is required by the Establishment for its own use but which will not be added to the DISTIS data base unless specifically requested.

.

78 19

16 Abstract (Contd)

initiation and reducing fatigue crack propagation rates. However, the effective reduction in stress intensity resulting from bonding (about 17%) is much less than the 50% predicted by the finite element analysis. This discrepancy is attributed mainly to shortcomings in the model for detining the characteristics and behaviour of the adhesive.

17 Imprint

Aeronautical Research Laboratories, Melbourne

18 Document Series and Number	19 Cost Code	20. Type of Report and Period Covered
Structures Report 399	257050	
21 Computer Programs Used		

