



MICROCOPY RESOLUTION TEST CHART NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS-1963-A

onc file copy

# SKILL MIX, EXPERIENCE, AND READINESS

Stanley A. Horowitz



84 05 21 054

DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT A Approved for public releases Distribution Unlimited PROFESSIONAL PAPER 411 / October 1983

# SKILL MIX, EXPERIENCE, AND READINESS

Stanley A. Horowitz

i.





Naval Planning and Management Division

# **CENTER FOR NAVAL ANALYSES**

2000 North Beauregard Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22311

The management of military manpower should focus on producing military readiness as cheaply as possible. Doing this requires information on the expected contribution to readiness of different kinds of people, and on how they can substitute for each other. That is, in economic terms, the implications for output of different skill mixes. The choice of a skill mix should depend, of course, on relative prices--how much various people are paid. The compensation system should, in turn, be determined by people's marginal contribution to output.

This sounds nice, but it's not how the system works now. Today's military personnel system is put together in a rather constrained way. First, required manning levels, disaggregated by occupation and paygrade, are determined using methods heavily dependent on current practice. Then, if we're lucky, compensation levels are set to fill the requirements. The notions of substitutability and tradeoffs between costs and productivity play no role.

The system evolved as it has because of the paucity of information on the contribution of people to military readiness. My purpose is to argue that we can do better. We know enough to begin to manage military manpower with an eye on readiness. We can begin to choose who we want based on what we expect to get from them, and to modify the compensation system accordingly.

ł

-1-

Skill has many facets, and many predictors. In the rest of this discussion I will concentrate on the relationship between experience and skill, and its implications for Navy manpower policy. I do this for three reasons. The system already focuses on experience and paygrade, which is closely related, as two of the principal determinants of pay. Shifting toward a more senior force, as I shall suggest, can help offset the effects of the shrinking youth population. Finally, I have relevant research to draw on. The Center for Naval Analyses has been doing studies on the productivity of enlisted personnel in the Navy for over 10 years. This paper reviews some of this work and discusses its implications for manpower policy.

Three broad questions will be addressed. Can it be shown that the experience and paygrade mix of military personnel generally affects the military performance of units? Can the magnitude of the effects be determined? How should this sort of information influence policy, in terms both of the experience mix of the force and the premium we are willing to pay for experience.

To answer these questions, I will start by describing two studies that relate experience to unit performance. The first of them examined the performance of maintenance personnel aboard surface combatants [1]. We looked at the readiness of 91 ships over a 3-year period. Our measure of ship readiness was the amount of mission degrading downtime suffered by the equipment maintained by men in each of six occupations.

-2-

Such downtime is routinely reported on casualty reports, or CASREPs. These were the source of our readiness data. The occupations studied were boiler technician (BT), machinist's mate (MM), gunner's mate (GM), fire control technician (FT), torpedoman's mate (TM), and sonar technician (ST).

We developed aggregate statistics describing the characteristics of each crew by occupation. This required weighting the characteristics of individuals by the fraction of the observation period they were assigned to the ship. The enlisted manning characteristics examined for our designated occupations were crew size, education, test scores, training, length of service, paygrade, turnover, race, and marital status.

Manning is not the only factor that affects material condition. The amount of time that equipment fails to function can also be expected to depend on the age of the ship, the length of time since it was last overhauled, and differences in the kind of equipment, among other things. We included these nonpersonnel factors in our analysis to hold them constant.

Table 1 summarizes the results we have obtained regarding the determinants of the condition of shipboard equipment for equipment operated and maintained by men in each of the six ratings. The equipment areas are listed across the top, and the determinants of readiness down the side. A check means that we found a relationship, and that its

-3-

direction was not unexpected. An X indicates an unexpected result. Blanks mean that no important relationship was found. The results are largely as expected, though they differ by occupation.

# TABLE 1

# DETERMINANTS OF PERSONNEL PRODUCTIVITY AND EQUIPMENT CONDITION AS MEASURED BY CASREPT DOWNTIME

<b>Crew Characteristics or Other</b> <b>Determinant of Material Condition</b>	BT	MM	<u> </u>	FT	TM	<u>ST</u>	
Crew size	く	く		√	$\checkmark$		
High school graduation • • • • •				$\checkmark$		く	
Entry test scores	~		. 🗸	√			
Paygrade	1	~	V	~	~	$\checkmark$	1
Length of service	√	く	く	$\checkmark$	x		
Prior sea experience • • • • • •		✓	$\checkmark$			く	
Turnover		1					
Training	く	$\checkmark$	~		~	く	
Marital status	く					く	
Race				$\checkmark$			
Ship age	く	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$		
Time between overhauls			$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	く		
Equipment complexity	~	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	~	

Experience is reflected in the three outlined factors in the middle of the table. It is the most consistent predictor of readiness. It enters in some way for every occupation. Almost all these effects are statistically significant, and only one is unexpected. For TM's longer service, holding paygrade constant seemed to hurt readiness. If paygrade is allowed to vary with length of service, as it actually does, this apparent anomaly is erased. It appears that experience does consistently contribute to the output of military units.

What are the implications of this for policy? To address this question, I'd like to turn to the results of another study, by my colleague, A. J. Marcus [2]. The work examines the performance of A-7 squadrons aboard aircraft carriers. Observations were obtained for 292 quarters of squadron operations between 1977 and 1980.

As noted earlier, the Navy's process for determining manpower requirements provides detailed descriptions of manning levels and experience mixes by paygrade. In an independent process, the Navy also sets minimum requirements for education and mental ability for incoming recruits. They are based on the probability of successfully completing the first enlistment and on estimates of probable A-school success. Neither process considers directly the possibilities for substitution that exists among personnel with different experience levels and other characteristics or the cost. The Marcus paper analyzes the tradeoffs among personnel with different characteristics with respect to their productivity and cost.

-5-

Squadron performance is measured principally by the number of flights (or sorties) flown by A-7s off the carrier in a quarter. The effect on the squadron's sortie rate of changing the experience level of enlisted personnel was estimated. Since we had no strong beliefs about how different levels of experience substitute for each other, a flexible production function was desired. The generalized Leontief production function suggested by Diewert was chosen [3].

~

Experience was characterized both in terms of years of service and paygrade. The latter formulation gave slightly better results, which are summarized in table 2. Notice that, on the margin, an additional junior person actually seems to harm squadron performance, presumably by requiring the attention of more senior people. In general, people in both of the more senior groups were found to enhance the performance of the junior group. The most senior group, which is relatively small, had by far the largest impact on the flying rate. This effect was quite statistically significant.

# TABLE 2

MARGINAL PRODUCT OF PAYGRADE GROUPS IN GENERATING SORTIES

<u>E1-E4</u> <u>E5-E6</u> <u>E7-E9</u> -0.5 6.2 29.1

-6-

In order to determine the implications of the analysis for squadron manning, costs needed to be brought into the picture. The costs of people in different paygrade classes were developed from the Navy's Enlisted Billet Cost Model [4]. The production function was used to determine alternative ways of achieving the same sortie rate. These were then costed out. The results of this procedure are shown in table 3.

# TABLE 5

CURRENT AND LEAST-COST FORCE BY PAYGRADE FOR 12-PLANE A-7 SQUADRONS

	<u>E1-E4</u>	<u>E5-E6</u>	<u>E7-E9</u>	\$ Cost (10 <sup>3</sup> )
Current	129	65	12	4,304
Least cost	<b>86</b>	60	23	3,796
Difference	-43	5	+11	508

Cost/Man (10<sup>3</sup>) E1-E4 (16.6), E5-E6 (24.5), E8-E9 (34.5)

It appears that moving to a force much heavier in the most senior people could maintain squadron performance with 18 percent less manpower at a life-cycle cost savings of 12 percent.

The squadron-effectiveness analysis balances the cost and effectiveness of people with different amounts of experience by varying their mix, but not their compensation. This makes the shift look easier than it really would be. We couldn't nearly double the number of people in paygrades E7-E9 without paying them more. Would it still be a good buy? Another study we performed sheds some light on this question.

This analysis, by Ellen Balis, was concerned with changing both the experience mix and the level of reenlistment bonuses in order to maximize the output of that portion of the enlisted force with less than 8 years of service [5]. Once again, the issue is balancing cost and effectiveness.

Three kinds of personnel costs are involved: (1) the cost to get a recruit to the reenlistment decision, which includes recruiting, AFEES processing, recruit and initial skill training, and 4 years of regular military compensation; (2) the cost of first-term selected reenlistment bonuses for 4-year reenlistments, and (3) the costs of second termers, which is regular military compensation for years 5 through 8. Earlier CNA work is drawn on to calculate recruiting costs and to calculate how retention responds to reenlistment bonuses [6], [7].

The effectiveness of first termers is estimated from the Enlisted Utilization Survey of Navy supervisors. It is expressed as the productivity per eligible reenlistee relative to that of the average 4-year specialist. For second termers, productivity after 4 years is assumed to remain constant, surely in underestimate.

K.

-8-

Cost and effectiveness data were developed for eight groups covering 20 Navy occupations. Both technical and nontechnical groups are included in the analysis. For each group, optimal levels of both accessions and reenlistment bonuses are derived for different assumptions about reenlistment decisions and recruiting costs. Table 4 shows the results of this derivation under one of the most conservative sets of assumptions.\*

## TABLE 4

Occupational	Cohort	Cohort Size		Bonus Level		
Area	Current	Optimal	Current	Optimal		
Health Care	2,503	2,117	0	5.0		
Logistics	3,609	2,873	1.1	5.1		
Aviation Mechanical .	1,691	1,398	2.7	9.1		
Marine Engineering .	2,190	2,058	6.0	7.8		
Radioman	550	384	6.0	13.1		
Mechanical	4,553	3,766	0	5.0		
Aviation Electronics	2,825	1,936	1.4	9.5		
Electronics	<u>1,763</u>	1,484	0	6.1		
Total	19,684	16,706	1.5	6.5		

## IMPLICATIONS FOR ACCESSIONS AND BONUS LEVELS

<sup>\*</sup> Indeed, the optimal bonus levels shown here are below any shown in the paper because I have used a zero discount rate.

Optimal bonus levels are all above current levels and some are well above the legal maximum of 6. This means that increasing the number of second termers relative to first termers is cost effective. The total number of people serving in the first two terms, however, decreases with optimal policies, because the increase in second termers is more than offset by the decrease in first termers that can accompany it without a loss in effectiveness. Accession levels could be cut 15 percent among these groups. This is of some interest in an era of fewer potential recruits. The resultant savings for these groups average 4 percent.

This substantially understates the full potential savings. If the Navy took in 15 percent fewer people each year, it could maintain the quality of its incoming people without paying them as much. The elasticity of high-quality accessions is probably about one [8]. If firstterm pay is cut 15 percent, major savings will accrue.

It seems to me that the research described in this paper should play an important role in shaping both manpower policy and manpower research. The relationship between experience and military performance can be quantified, and we should take advantage of it. It should play an important role in how we set our requirements for people with different levels of experience and on how we design the military compensation system. All the evidence indicates that we'd be better off with a more senior force. We should take fewer people into the Navy and do a better job of keeping those we take. We should pay more for experience, and

-10-

less for inexperience. This would save money, insulate us from the relative dearth of potential new recruits over the next 15 years, and ease the problem of manning the growing Navy.

۰. مب

ł

## REFERENCES

 Center for Naval Analyses, CNS 1090, "Crew Characteristics and Ship Condition (Maintenance Personnel Effectiveness Study (MPES)), by Stanley A. Horowitz and Allan Sherman, March 1977

- [2] CNA Professional Paper 363, "Personnel Substitution and Navy Aviation Readiness, by A. J. Marcus, October 1982
- [3] Diewert, W. E., "An Application of the Shephard Duality Theorem: A Generalized Leontief Production Function," <u>Journal of Political</u> <u>Economy</u>, Vol. 76, 1971
- [4] Naval Personnel Research and Development Center, SR 80-7, "Life Cycle Navy Enlisted Billet Costs--FY80," January 1980
- [5] CNA Professional Paper 380, "Balancing Accession and Retention: Cost and Productivity Tradeoffs," by Ellen Balis, March 1983
- [6] CNA Memorandum 82-1357, "Replacement Costs for Navy First Term Personnel by Rating," by Ellen Balis and Deborah Clay-Mendez, 3 Sep 1982
- [7] CNA Professional Paper 337, "The Influence of Non-Pecuniary Factors on Labor Supply," by John T. Warner and Matthew S. Goldberg, Unclassified, December 1981
- [8] CNA Study 1168, "Enlisted Supply: Past, Present and Future," by Lawrence Goldberg, September 1982

-12-

## CNA PROFESSIONAL PAPERS ~ 1978 TO PRESENT\*

## PP 211

Hizrahi, Naurice N., "On Approximating the Circular Coverage Function," 14 pp., Feb 1978, AD A054 429

#### P 212

Mangal, Marc, "On Singular Characteristic initial Value Problem with Unique Solution," 20 pp., Jun 1978, AD A058 535

## PP 213

Mangel, Marc, "Fluctuations in Systèmes with Muitiple Steady States. Application to Lanchester Equations," 12 pp., Feb 78 (Presented at the First Annual Workshop on the Information Linkage Batwaen Applied Mathematics and Industry, Nevel PG School, Feb 23-25, 1970), AD AD71 472

#### PP 214

visiniand, Robert G., "A Somewhat Different View of The Optimal Neval Posture," 37 pp., Jun 1978 (Presented at the 1976 Convention of the American Political Science Association (APSA/IUS Panel on "Changing Strategic Requirements and Military Posture"), Chicago, Ill., September 2, 1976), AD A056 228

#### PP 215

Colle, Russeil C., "Comments on: Principles of information Retrievel by Manfred Kochen," 10 pp-, Mar 78 (Published as a Letter to the Editor, Journel of Occumentation, Vol. 31, No. 4, pages 298-301), December 1975), AD A054 426

## # 216

Colle, Russell C., "Lothe's Frequency Distribution of Scientific Productivity," 18 pp., Feb 1978 (Published in the Journel of the American Society for information Science, Vol. 28, No. 6, pp. 366-370, November 1977), AD A054 425

## P 217

Colle, Russell C., "Bibliometric Studies of Scientific Productivity," 17 pp., Ner 78 (Presented at the Annual meeting of the American Society for information Science held in Sam Prescisco, California, October 1976), AD ADS4 442

### PP 218 - Classified

#### P 219

Huntzinger, R. LeVer, "Market Analysis with Rational Expectations: Theory and Estimation," 60 pp., Apr 78, AD A054 422

#### 7 220

Naurar, Donald E., "Diagonalization by Group Mutrices," 36 pp., Apr 78, AD A054 443

## PP 221

Weinland, Robert G., "Superpower Nevel Diplomacy in the October 1973 Arab-israeli Mar," 76 pp., Jun 1978 (Published In Sempower in the Hediterrement: Political Utility and Military Constraints, The Mashington Papers No. 61, Bowerly Hills and London: Sage Publications, 1979) AD A055 364

n Marine Marine Marine and Antonio and a state of the sta

## PP 222

Nizrehi, Maurice M., "Correspondence Rules and Path Integrals," 30 pp., Jun 1978 (invited paper presented at the CMRS meeting on "Mathematical Arobians in Feynman's Path Integrals," Marseille, France, May 22-26, 1978) (Published In Springer Variag Lecture Notes in Physics, 106, (1979), 234-253 AD A095 336

## PP 223

Nengel, Marc, "Stochestic Mechanics of Holeculeion Holecule Reactions," 21 pp., Jun 1978, AD A056 227

#### PP 224

Manger, Marc, "Aggregation, Biturcation, and Extinction in Exploited Animai Populations"," 48  $\rho_{P*}$ , Mar 1978, AD A038 536

\*Portions of this work were started at the institute of Applied Mathematics and Statistics, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, B.C., Canada

#### PP 225

Mangal, Marc, "Oscillations, Fluctuations, and the Hopf Biturcation", #43 pp., Jun 1978, AD A058 537

"Portions of this work were completed at the institute of Applied Mathematics and Statistics, University of British Columbia, Yancouver, Canada-

#### PP 226

Relaton, J. M. and J. W. Mann,<sup>4</sup> "Temperature and Current Dependence of Oegredation in Red-Emitting Geb LEDs,<sup>4</sup> 34 pp., Jun 1978 (Published in Journal of Applied Physics, 50, 3630, Ney 1979) AD A058 536

"Bell Telephone Laboratories, inc.

## PP 227

Mangel, Marc, "Uniform Treatment of Fluctuations et Critical Points," 30 pp., May 1978, AD A038 539

## PP 228

Mangel, Marc, "Relaxation at Critical Points: Deterministic and Stochestic Theory," 54 pp., Jun 1978, AD A058 540

## PP 229

Hengel, Harc, "Diffusion Theory of Reection Rates, iz Formulation and EinsteinsSmoluchowski Approximation," 50 pp., Jan 1978, AD A038 541

## PP 230

Mangel, Marc, "Diffusion Theory of Reection Rates, II Ornstein-Uhienbeck Approximation," 34 pps, Feb 1978, AD A058 342

## PP 231

Wilson, Desmond P., Jr., "Nevel Projection Forces: The Case for a Responsive MAF," Aug 1978, AD A054 543

## PP 232

Jacobson, Louis, "Can Policy Changes Be Nede Acceptable to Labor?" Aug 1978 (Submitted for publication in industrial and Labor Relations Review), AD A061 528

"CMA Professional Papers with an AD number may be obtained from the National Technical Information Service, U.S. Department of Commerce, Springfield, Virginia 22191. Other papers are available from the Managament Information Office, Conter for Navai Analysee, 2000 North Decuregard Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22311. An index of Selected Publications is also available on request. The Index Insides a Listing of Professional Papers; with abstracts; issued from 1969 to June 1981.

Jacobson, Louis, "An Alternative Explanation of the Cyclical Pattern of Quits," 23 pp., Sap 1978

PP 234 - Revised

Jandrau, Jamas and Lovy, Robert A., "Dass Federal Expanditure Displace State and Local Expanditures The Case of Construction Grants," 25 pp., Oct 1979, AD A061 529

PP 235

Higrahi, Naurica N., "The Samiclassical Expension of the Anharmanic-Ouclistar Propagator," 41 pp., Oct 1978 (Published in Journal of Hathamatical Physics 20 (1979) pp. 844-8553, Ap Addi 538

PP 237

Neuror, Donaid, "A Matrix Criterion for Normal Integral Bases," 10 pp., Jan 1979 (Published in the Illinois Journal of Nothematics, Vol. 22 (1976), pp. 672-681

## PP 236

Utgotf, Kathieen Classen, "Unamployment insurance and The Employment Rate," 20 pp-, Qct 1978 (Presented at the Conference on Economic Indicators and Performance: The Current Dilemma Facing Bovernment and Business Looders, presented by Indiana University Graduate School of Business)- AD AD61 527

#### PP 239

Trost, R. P. and Warner, J. T., "The Effects of Hilltary Occupational Training on Civilian Earnings: An income Selectivity Approach," 38 pp., Nov 1979k, AD AD77 831

#### PP 240

Powers, Gruce, "Bosis of the Center for Nevel Analyses," 13 pp., Dec 1970, AD A063 750

## PP 241

Mangol, Marc, "Fluctuations at Chanlasi instabilities," 24 pp., Dec 1976 (Published in Journal of Chanical Physics, Vol. 69, No. 8, Oct 15, 1978). AD A063 787

## PP 242

Simpson, William R., "The Analysis of Dynamically interective Systems (Air Comber by the Numbers)," 160 pp., Dec 1978, AD A063 760

## PP 243

Simpson, William R., "A Probabilistic Formulation of Murphy Dynamics as Applied to the Analysis of Operational Research Problems," 18 pp., Dec 1978, AD A063 761

## PP 244

Sharman, Allan and Horovitz, Stanley A., "Muintunance Costs of Couplex Equipment," 20 pp., Dec 1978 (Published by The American Society of Havui Engineers, Navei Engineers Journei, Vol. 91, No. 6, Dec 1979) AD A071 473

## PP 245

Slapson, William R., "The Accelerometer Nethods of Obtaining Alrarett Performance from Filght Test Data (Dynamic Performance Testing)," 403 pp., Jun 1979, AD A075 226

## PP 246

Brechting, Frank, "Layoffs and Unamployment Insurance," 35 pp., Feb 1979 (Presented at the Near Conference on "Low Income Labor Merkets," Chicago, Jun 1978), AD A096 629

#### P 246

Thema, James A., Jr., "The Transport Properties of Dilute Gases in Applied Fields," 183 pp., Nar 1979, AD A096 464

## PP 249

Glasser, Kenneth S., "A Secretery Problem with a Rendom Number of Cholces," 23 pp., Her 1979

#### PP 250

Hangel, Marc, "Nodeling Fluctuations in Macroscopic Systems," 26 pp., Jun 1979

## PP 251

Treat, Robert P., "The Estimation and Interpretation of Several Selectivity Hodels," 37 pp., Jun 1979, AD A075 941

## PP 252

Num, whiter A., "Position Finding with Prior Knowledge of Coverience Peremeters," 5 pp., Jun 1979 (Published in IEEE Trensections on Aerospece & Electronic Systems, Yoi. AES-15, No. 3, Nor 1979

## PP 253

Glasser, Kenneth S., "The d-Choice Secretary Problem," 32 pp., Jun 1979, AD A075 225

#### PP 254

Mangal, Marc and Quanback, David B., "Integration of a Biveriate Normal Over an Offset Circle," 14 pp., Jun 1979, AD A096 471

## PP 295 - Classified, AD 8051 441L

## PP 256

Meurer, Donaid E., "Using Personnel Distribution Models," 27 pp., Feb 1980, AD A082 218

## PP 257

Counting is Always Right," 10 pp., Aug 1979, AD A075 224

#### PP 256

Hangel, Herc S. and Thomas, James A., Jr., "Anelytical Hothods in Search Theory," 86 pp., Nov 1979, AD AD77 832

#### PP 259

Glass, David V.; Hau, Ih-Ching; Hunn, Weiter R., and Parin, David A., "A Class of Commutative Markov Matrices," 17 pp., Nov 1979, AD A077 633

#### PP 260

Mangal, Marc S. and Oopa, Davis K., "Detection Rate and" Sumap Width in Visual Search," 14 pp., Nov 1979, AD AD77 834

## PP 261

Vila, Carlos L.; Zvijac, Devid J. and Ross, John, "Frenck-Condon Theory of Chemical Dynamics. Vi. Angular Distributions of Reaction Products," 14 pp., Nov 1979 (Reprinted from Journel Chemical Phys. 70(12), 15 Jun 1979), AD A076 287

#### PP 262

Petersen, Charles C., "Third World Hilltery Eiltes in Soviet Perspective," 50 pp., Nov 1979, AD A077 835

#### PP 263

Robinson, Kathy I., "Using Commercial Tenkers and Containerships for Nevy Underway Replanishment," 23 pp., Nov 1979, AD A077 836

Mainland, Robert G., "The U.S. Nevy in the Pacific: Past, Present, and Gilmpses of the Future," 31 pp., Nov 1979 (Delivered at the international Symposium on the Sea, sponsored by the international institute for Strategic Studies, The Brookings institution and the Yomiuri Shimbun, Tokyo, 16-20 Oct 1978) AO A066 837

## PP 265

Moinland, Robert G., "Nor and Peace in the North: Some Political Implications of the Changing Hilitary Situation in Northern Europe," 18 pp., Nov 1979 (Prepared for presentation to the Conterence of the Nordic Balance in Perspective: The Changing Hilitary and Political Situation," Conter for Strategic and International Studies, Georgetown University, Jun 15-16, 1978) AD A077 838

#### PP 266

utgott, Kathy Classen, and Brochling, Frank, "Taxes and Inflation," 25 pp., Nov 1979, AD AD81 194

## PP 267

Trast, Robert P., and Vogel, Robert C., "The Response of State Government Receipts to Economic Fluctuations and the Allocation of Counter-Cycilcal Revenue Sharing Grants," 12 pp., Doc 1979 (Reprinted from the Review of Economics and Statistics, Vol. LXI, No. 3, August 1979)

## PP 268

Thomason, James S., "Seeport Dependence and inter-State Cooperation: The Case of Sub-Seheren Africa," 141 pp., Jan 1980, AD A081 193

#### PP 269

È

Weiss, Kenneth G., "The Soviet involvement in the Ogeden War," 42 pp., Jan 1980 (Presented at the Southern Conference on Sigvic Studies in October, 1979), AD A082 219

#### PP 270

Remnek, Alcherd, "Soviet Policy in the Horn of Africa: The Decision to intervene," 52 pp., Jan 1980 (To be published in "The Soviet Union in the Third World: Success or Fallure," ed, by Robert H, Consideon, Westview Press, Boulder, Co., Summer 1980), AD ADB1 195

## PP 271

McConnell, Jame, "Soviet and American Strategic Doctrines: One Mare Time," 45 pp., Jan 1980, AD A081 192

#### PP 272

Welss, Kanneth G., "The Azores in Diplomacy and Strategy, 1940–1945, 46 pp., Mar 1980, AD A085 094

## PP 273

Nakada, Hichael K., "Labor Supply of Vives with Husbands Employed Either Full Time or Part Time," 39 pp., Nar 1980, AD A082 220

## PP 274

Numm, Maiter R., "A Result in the Theory of Spiral Search," 9 pp., Mar 1980

## P 275

Goldberg, Lawrence, "Recruiters Advertising and Navy Enlistments," 34 pp., Mar 1980, AD A082 221

## PP 276

Goldborg, Lawrence, "Delaying an Overheul and Ship's Equipment," 40 pp., May 1960, AD A085 095

## PP 277

Mengel, Marc, "Small Fluctuations in Systems with Multiple Limit Cycles," 19 pp., Mar 1980 (Published in SIAM J. Appl. Math., Vol. 38, No. 1, Feb 1980) AD A086 229

## PP 278

Nizrahi, Maurice, "A Targeting Problem: Exect vs., Expected-Value Approaches," 23 pp., Apr 1980, AD A085 096

#### PP 279

Weit, Stephen N., "Causal Inferences and the Use of Force: A Critique of Force Without War," 50 pp., Ney 1980, AD A085 097

## PP 280

Goldberg, Lawrence, "Estimation of the Effects of A Ship's Steaming on the failure Rate of its Equipment: An Application of Econometric Analysis," 25 pp., Apr 1980, AD A085 098

## PP 281

Nizrahi, Maurice M., "Comment on "Discretization Problems of Functional Integrais in Phase Space'," 2 pp., May 1960, published in "Physical Review D", Vol. 22 (1960), AD A094 994

## PP 283

Dismukes, Bredford, "Expected Demend for the U.S. Navy to Serve as An Instrument of U.S. Foreign Policy: Thinking About Political and Hilltary Environmental Factors," 30 pp., Apr 1960, AD A085 099

#### PP 284

J. Kellson," W. Nunn, and U. Sumita," "The Laguerre Transform," 119  $p_{\rm P}$  , May 1980, AD A085 100

"The Graduate School of Managament, University of Rochester and the Center for Naval Analyses

\*\*The Graduate School of Management, University of Rochester

#### PP 285

Ramnek, Richard 8., "Superpower Security Interests in the Indian Ocean Area," 26 pp., Jun 1980, AD A087 113

#### PP 286

Mizrahi, Maurice H<sub>e</sub>, "On the MCB Approximation to the Propagator for Arbitrary Hamiltonians," 25 pp., Aug 1980 (Published in Journal of Math, Physe, 22(1) Jan 1981), AD AD91 307

#### PP 287

Cope, Davis, "Limit Cycle Solutions of Reaction-Diffusion Equations," 35 pp., Jun 1980, AD A087 114

## PP 288

Golman, Weiter, "Don't Let Your Sildes Filp You: A Psiniess Guide to Visuels Thet Really Aid," 28 pp., (revised Aug 1982), AD A092 732

## PP 289

Robinson, Jack, "Adequate Classification Guidance - A Solution and a Problem," 7 pp., Aug 1980, AD A091 212

## PP 290

Watson, Gregory H., "Evaluation of Computer Software in an Operational Environment," 17 pp., Aug 1980, AD A091 213

## PP 291

Naddala, G. S.<sup>o</sup> and Trost, R. P., "Some Extensions of the Nariove Press Hodel," 17 pp., Oct 1980, AD A091 946 "University of Fiorida

## -}-

11-13 h 16416 (16416 (16416 (16416 ))

Themas, James A., Jr., "The Transport Properties of Binery Gas Hixtures in Applied Megnetic Fields,: 10 pp., Sep 1980 (Published in Journal of Chemical Physics 72(10), 15 May 1980)

## PP 293

Themas, James A., Jr., "Evaluation of Kinetic Theory Collision integrals Using the Generalized Phase Shift Approach," 12 pp., Sep 1980 (Printed in Journal of Chemical Physics 72(10), 15 May 1980)

## PP 294

Roberts, Stephen S., "French Navai Policy Outside of Europe," 30 pp., Sep 1980 (Presented at the Conference of the Section on Hilltery Studies, international Studies Association, Klaush Island, S.C.), AD A091 305

#### PP 295

277 Roberts, Stephen S., "An indicator of informal Empire: Patterns of U.S. Nevy Cruising on Overseas Stations, 1869-1897," 40 pp., Sep 1980 (Presented at Fourth Nevsi History Symposium, US Nevel Academy, 25 Oct 1979), AD A091 316

#### FP 296

Dismukas, Bradford, and Patarsan, Oxerias C., "Maritime Pectors Affecting Iberian Security," (Pectores Maritimos que Afectan la Seguridad Iberias) 14 pp., Oct 1980, AD A092 733

## PP 297 - Classified

#### PP 296

Nizrahl, Hourice H., "A Markav Approach to Large Nissile Attacks," 31 pp., Jan 1961, AD A096,159

#### PP 299

Jondrow, James M., and Levy, Robert A., "Mage Leadership in Construction, 19 pp., Jan 1961, AD A094 797

#### PP 300

Jandrow, James, and Schuldt, Peter,<sup>9</sup> "On the Estimation of Technical Inefficiency in the Stochastic Frontier Production Function Model," 11 pp., Jan 1981, AD A096 160 "Michigan State University

## PP 301

Jondrow, James H.; Levy, Robert A.; and Hughes, Claire, "Technical Change and Exployment in Steel, Autos, Aluminum, and iron Oro," 17 pp., Nor 1981, AD A099 394

## PP 302

Jondrow, James H., and Levy, Robert A., "The Effect of imports on Employment Under Rational Expectations," 19 pp., Apr 1981, AD A099 392

## PP 303

Thomson, James, "The Renest Commodity in the Coming Resource Wars," 3 pp., Aug 1981 (Published in the Mashington Star, 15 Apr 1961), AD A104 221

## PP 304

Daffy, Michael K.; Grasmuood, Michael J.;<sup>4</sup> and NaDouell, John N.,<sup>44</sup> <sup>46</sup> A Grass-Sectional Model of Annual Interregional Higratian and Employment Grawth: Intertemporal Evidence of Structural Change, 1956–1975,<sup>4</sup> 31 pp., Apr 1961, AD A099 393 <sup>4</sup>University of Calorado <sup>49</sup>Arizana Statu University

#### PP 30:

Nunn, Loura H., "An introduction to the Literature of Search Theory," 32 pp., Jun 1981, AD A100 420

#### PP 306

Anger, Thomas E., "What Good Are Wortere Hodeis?" 7 pp., New 1981, AD A100 421

#### PP 307

Thomason, James, "Dependence, Risk, and Vulnerability," 45 pp., Jun 1961, AD A102 698

#### PP 306

Hizrahi, N.H., "Correspondence Rules and Path Integrais, 17 pp., Jul 1961. (Published in "Nuovo Cimento B", Voi. 61, 1961), AD A102 699

## PP 309

Weinland, Robert G., "An (The?) Explanation of the Soviet Invesion of Afghanistan," 44 pp., May 1961, AD A100 422

#### P 310

Stanford, Janette H., and Mu, Tal Te,<sup>a</sup> "A Predictive Method for Determining Possible Three-dimensional Foldings of Immunoglobulin Backbones Around Antibody Combining Sites," 19 pp., Jun 1981 (Published In J. Theor. Biol., 1981), 88, AD A100 423 "Northwestern University

orthwestern Universi

## PP 311

Source, Marianne, Brechilng; Frank P. R.; and Utgoff, Kathiean P. Classen, "An Evoluation of Ul Funds," 13 pp., May 1981 (Published in National Commission on Unemployment Compensation's "Unemployment Compensation: Studies and Research," Volume 2, Jul 1980), AD A100 424

## PP 312

Jondrow, James; Bouse, Merianne; and Levy, Robert, "The Optimum Speed Limit," 25 pp., Jul 1983 (Revised), AD A100 425

#### PP 313

Roberts, Stephen S., "The U.S. Nevy in the 1980s," 36 pp., Jul 1981, AD A102 696

## PP 314

John, Christopher; Horowitz, Stanley  $A_{\rm o};$  and Lockman, Robert F., "Examining the Dratt Debate," 20 pp., Jul 1981, AD A106 192  $\cdot$ 

## PP 315

Buck, Reiph V. (Capt., USH), "Le Catestrophe by any other name...," 4 pp., jul 1961, AD A102 697

PP 316 Roberts, Stephen S., "Nestern European and NATO Nevies, 1980," 20 pp., Aug 1981, AD A104 223

## PP 317

Roberts, Stephen S., "Superpower Nevel Crisis Management in the Maditerranean," 35 pp., Aug 1981, AD A104 222

#### PP 318 Vers. Miles X., Wurse

ኯኯዀኯዀዀዀዀዀዀዀዀዀዀ

Yego, Hilan N., "Yugoslavia and the Soviet Policy of Porce in the Mediterranean Since 1961," 187 pp., Aug 1981

Smith, Michael W., "Antiair Wartere Defense of Ships at See," 46 pp., Sep 1981 (This talk was delivered at the Nevai Wartere System and Technology Conference of the American Institute of Aeronautics and Astronautics in Mashington on 12 Dec 1980; In Boston on 20 Jan 1981; and in Los Angeles on 12 Jan 1981.), AD A106 191

#### PF 320

Trast, R. P.; Lurie, Philip; and Berger, Edward, "A Note on Estimating Continuous Time Decision Models," 15 pp., Sep 1981, AD A106 193

## PP 321

"Associate Professor of Economics, Arizona State University

#### PP 322

Marner, John T., "Issues in Nevy Manparer Research and Policy: An Economist's Perspective," 66 pp., Dec 1981, AD A110 221

#### PP 323

Bomes, Frederick H., "Generation of Correlated Log-Normal Sequences for the Simulation of Clutter Echoes," 33 pp., Dec 1981

## PP 324

Horaritz, Stanley A., "Quantifying Saapaver Readiness," 6 pp., Dec 1961 (Published in Detense Management Journel, Vol. 18, No. 2), AD AllO 220

## PP 326

Roberts, Stephen S., "Mestern Europeen and NATO Navies, 1981," 27 pp., Jul 1982, AD Al15 703

## PP 327

Hammon, Colls (Capt., USN), and Graham, David R., "Estimation and Analysis of Navy Shipbuilding Program Disruption Costs," 12 pp., Mar 1980, AD A112 514

#### PP 328

Weinland, Robert G., "Northern Waters: Their Strategic Significance," 27 pp., Dec 1980, AD A112 509

#### PP 329

Mangel, Marc, "Applied Mathematicians And Naval Operators," 40 pp., Nar 1962 (Revised), AD A116 598

#### PP 330

Lockman, Robert F., "Alternative Approaches to Attrition Management," 30 pp., Jan 1982, AD All2 510

## PP 331

Roberts, Stephen S., "The Turkish Straits and the Soviet Navy in the Maditerraneen," 15 pp., Mar 1962 (Published in Navy International)

#### PP 332

and the second second

John, Christopher, "The RDF and Amphibious Warfare," 36 pp., Mar 1902, AD All3 992

## PP 333

Lee, Lung-Fel,<sup>a</sup> and Trost, Robert P., "Estimation of Some Limited Dependent Variable Models with Application to Housing Demand," 26 pp., Jan 1982, (Published in Journal of Econometrics 8 (1978), AD A 112 536 "University of Minnesota

## PP 334

Konny, Lawrence W.;\* Les, Lung-Fel;\*\* Maddala, G. S.;\* and Trost R. P., "Returns to Obliege Education: An investigation of Self-Selection Blas Based on the Project Talent Data," 15 ps., Jan 1982. (Published in International Economic Review, Yol, 20, No. 3, Oct 1979), AD A112 480 "University of Fiorida

\*\*University of Minnesota

## PP 335

Lee, Lung-Fei;<sup>e</sup> Maddala, G. S.;<sup>ee</sup> and Trost, R.P. "Asymptotic Covariance Matrices of Two-Stage Probit and Two-Stage Tobit Mathods for Simultaneous Equations Models with Selectivity," 13 pp., Jan 1962, (Published In Econometrica, Vol. 48, No. 2, Mar 1960), AD Al12 483 "University of Minnesota "University of Minnesota

University of Fior

## PP 336

O'Nelli, Thomas, "Nobility Fuels for the Navy," 13 pp., Jan 1982. (Accepted for publication in Navai institute Proceedings), AD Al12 511

#### PP 337

Warner, John T., and Goldberg, Natthew S., "The influence of Non-Pocuniary Fectors on Labor Supply: The Case of Navy Endlistment Personnel," 23 pp., Doc 1981, AD A113 094

## PP 339

Wilson, Desmond P., "The Persian Guit and the National Interest," 11 pp., Feb 1982, AD A112 505

#### PP 340

Lurie, Philip; Trost, R. P.; and Berger, Edward, "A Method for Analyzing Multiple Speil Duration Data," 34 pp., Feb 1982, AD Al12 504

#### PP 341

Trost, Robert P., and Yogel, Robert C.,<sup>a</sup> "Prediction with Pooled Cross-Section and Time-Series Data: Two Case Studies," 6 pp., feb 1982, AD Al12 303 "Southern illinois University

#### PP 342

Lee, Lung-Fel;" Maddala, G. S.;"" and Trost, R. P., "Testing for Structural Change by D-Mathods in Switching Simultaneous Equations Models," 5 pp., Feb 1982, AD All2 482 "University of Minnesota "University of Florida

#### PP 343

Goldberg, Matthew S., "Projecting the Navy Enlisted Force Level," 9 pp., Feb 1962, AD All2 484

#### PP 34

Flatcher, Jean, W., "Navy Quality of Life and Reenlistment," 13 pp., Nov 1981, AD At13 095

200 R

3

7

Urgoff, Kathy, and Theler, Dick,<sup>e</sup> "The Economics of Multi Year Contracting,<sup>#</sup> 47 pp., Mar 1982, (Presented at the 1982 Annual Maeting of the Public Choice Society, San Antonio, Texas, 5-7 Mar 1982), AD All4 732 "Cornell University

### PP 346

Rostker, Bernard, "Selective Service and the All-Volunteer Force," 23 pp., Her 1962, AD All3 096

#### PP 347

McConnell, James, M., "A Possible Counterforce Role for the Typhoon," 24 pp., Mar 1962, AD All6 601

## PP 348

Jondrau, James, and Trost, Robert, "An Empirical Study of Production institicioncy in the Presence of Errors-in-The-Variables," 14 pp., Feb 1902, AD A113 391

## PP 349

Brackenridge, W. H.,<sup>a</sup> and Maimin, O. Kim, "Collisional intramultiplet Relaxation of Cd( $555p^3p_{0,1,2}$ ) by Alkane Hydrocarbons," 7 pp., Jul 1981. (Published in Journal of Chemical Physics, 76(4), 15 Feb 1962), AD All3 093 "University of Utah, Dept. of Chemistry

## PP 350

Levin, Marc, "A Method for increasing the Firepower of Virginia Class Cruisers," 10 pp., Apr 1982, (To be published In U.S. Navel Institute Proceedings), AD A116 602

#### PP 351

Coutre, S. E.;\* Stenford, J. M.; Hovis, J. G.;\* Stevens, P. M.;\* and Mu, T. T.,\* "Possible Three-Dimensional Backbone Folding Around Antibody Combining Site of immunoglobulin MOPC 167,\* 18 pp., Apr 1982 (Published in Journal of Theoretical Biology)

Morthwestern University, Depts. of Biochemistry & Molecular Biology and Engineering Sciences & Applied Mathematics

#### PP 352

Bertoot, C. Bernard, "Aggregation of Conditional Absorbing Markov Chains," 7 pp., Jun 1982 (Presented to the Sixth European Meeting on Cybernetics and Systems Research, held at the University of Vienne, Apr 1982), AD All6 603

#### PP 353

Bertoot, C. Bernerd, "Some Mathematical Mathods for Modeling the Performance of a Distributed Data Bese System," 18 pp., Jun 1982. (Presented to the International Working Conference on Model Resilsm, held at Bed Honnek, West Germany, Apr 1982), AD Al16 604

## PP 354

Hall, John V., "Why the Short-Her Sceneric is Wrong for Nevel Planning," 6 pp., Jun 1982., AD All8 702

#### PP 356

Cylke, Steven; Goldberg, Matthew S.; Hogen, Paul; and Mairs, Les; "Estimation of the Personal Discount Rate: Evidence from Military Reenlistment Decisions," 19 pp., Apr 1982, AD A122 419

## FP 357

Goldborg, Hotthew S., "Discrimination, Nepotism, and Long-Run Wage Differentlais," 13 pp., Sep 1982 (Published in Quarterly Journal of Economics, Ney 1982)

## PP 358

Akst, George, "Eveluating Tectical Command And Control Systems-A Three-Tiered Approach," 12 pp., Sep 1982, AD 122 478

## PP 359

Quester, Aline; Fletcher, Jean; and Marcus, Alan; "Veteran Status as a Screening Device: Comment," 26 pp., Aug 1982, AD A123 658

## PP 361

Quanback, David B., "Hethods for Generating Aircraft Trajectories," 51 pp., Sep 1982, AD A122 386

## PP 362

Horowitz, Stanley A., "Is the Hilltary Budget Out of Balance?," 10 pp., Sep 1962, AD A122 368

#### PP 363

Marcus, A. J., "Personnel Substitution and Nevy Aviation Readiness," 35 pp., Oct 1982, AD A122 420

#### PP 364

Quester, Aline, and Nakada, Michael, "The Military's Monopsony Power," 29 pp., Oct 1982, AD A123 657

#### PP 365

Greer, William L., and Bertholomew, James C., (Cdr.USN), Pscychological Aspects of Nine Warfare," 15 pp., Oct 1982 AD A128 244

## PP 366

Spruill, Nency L., and Gestwirth, Joseph L.,<sup>e</sup> "On the Estimation of the Correlation Coefficient From Grouped Data,<sup>e</sup> 9 pp., Oct 1982, (Published in the Journal of the American Statistical Association, Sep 1982, Vol. 77, No. 379, Theory and Methods Section], AD A122 382 "George Meshington University, Dept. of Statistics

## PP 367

Petersen, Charles C., "Soviet Tectics for Herfare at See (Two Decades of Upheavai)," 57 pp., Nov 1982

#### PP 368

Weinland, Robert G., "The Evolution of Soviet Requirements for Nevel Forces-Solving the Problems of the Early 1960s," 41 pp., Dec 1982, AD A123 655

#### PP 369

Quester, Aline, and Lockman, Robert, "The Ali-Volunteer Force: A Positive Perspective," 29 pp., Nov 1962, AD A128 279

## PP 370

Rostker, Bernerd D., "Human Resource Models: An Overview," 17 pp., Nov 1982, AD A123 656

## PP 372

Hurley, Wiillam J., "An Overview of Acoustic Analysis," 46 pp., Jan 1983, AD A128 316

### PP 373

Jacobson, Louis, "Research to Quantify the Effect of Permenent Change of Station Moves on Wives' Wages and Labor Supply," 35 pp., Jan 1983, AD A128 300

## PP 374

Clay-Mendez, Deborah, and Balis, Ellen, "Belancing Accession and Retention: The Disaggregate Model," 27 pp., Aug 1962

21. C. C. C.

Ż

S

Feidman, Paul, "Privatizing Airports in Washington, D.C.," 17 pp., Feb. 1983, AD A128 236

### PP 376

Weiss, Kenneth G., "Power Grows Out of the Barrel of a Gunboet: The U.S. in Sino-Soviet Crises," 136 pp., Dec 1982

## PP 377

Anger, Thomas E., "The Outlook for Military Operations Research," 14 pp., Apr 1983

#### PP 379

Jondrow, James H.; Chase, Devid E.; and Gambie, Christopher L., "The Price Differential Between Domestic and Imported Steel," 17 pp., May 1983

#### PP 380

Balis, Eilen, "Balancing Accession and Retention: Cost and Productivity Tradeoffs," 38 pp., Mar 1983

## PP 381 Ree

Reeves, John M. L., "CNA's Conceptual Design and Cost Models for High-Speed Surface Craft," 23 pp., Apr 1983, AD A128 245

## PP 362

Levy, Robert  $A_{\rm e}$ , and Jondrow, James H, "The Adjustment of Employment to Technical Change in the Steel and Auto Industries," 40 pp., May 1983

## PP 383 (Revised)

Thomes, James A., Jr, and Mangel, Marc, "Properties of Quick Look Passive Localization," 39 pp., Jul 1963

#### PP 384

Goldberg, Matthew S., and Heger, Michael F., "A Comparison of the Prophet and ACOL Force Projection Hodels, " 35 pp., Jun 1981

## PP 385

Angler, Bruce; Driscoil, Kurt; and Gregory, Devid, "Menpower Requirements Derivation for the Nevy Comprehensive Compensation and Supply Study," 22 pp., Sep 1982

#### PP 386

Angler, Bruce N.; Driscoli, Kurt A.; and Carpenter, Kathy A., "Construction of 'Training Cost Per Graduate' for the Navy Comprehensive Compensation and Supply Study," 67 Pp., Nov 1982

## PP 367

Bells, Ellen, and Clay-Mendez, Deborah, "Balancing Accession and Retention: The Aggregate Model," 20 pp., Jul 1982

#### PP 380

Clay-Mendez, Deborah, "Models of Accession and Refertion," 11 pp., Oct 1982

## PP 389

Clay-Mendez, Deborah, "A Minimum Recruiting Cost Function for Male High School Greduetes," 31 pp., Jan 1982

## PP 390

Clay-Mendez, Deboreh, "Documentation for the Recruiting Cost Estimates Utilized in the Navy Comprehensive Compensation and Supply Study," 30 pp., Sep 1982

#### PP 391

Goldborg, Larry, "Summary of Nevy Enlisted Supply Study," 11 pp., Jul 1981

## PP 392

Werner, John T., and Simon, Bruce, "An Empirical Analysis of Pay and Navy Enlisted Retention in the AVF: Preliminary Results," 51 pp., Dec 1979

## PP 394

McGibney, Donald; Camerini, Ugo; Roberts, Arthur; and Winston, Roland, "Development of an Underwater High Sensitivity Cherenkov Detector: Sea Urchin," 20 pp., Aug 1983

#### PP 396

Jondrow, James H.; Brechling, Frank; and Marcus, Alan; "Older Workers in the Market for Part-Time Employment," 34 pp., Aug 1983

## PP 398

Lavy, Robert A.; Bowes, Marianne; and Jondrow, James M.; "Technical Change and Employment in the Steel, Auto, Aluminum, Coal, and iron Ore Industries," 25 pp., Sep 1983

## PP 399

Roberts, Stephen, "Western European and NATO Navies," 23 pp., Nov 1982

## PP 400

Laird, Robbin F., "French Nuclear Forces in the 1980s and 1990s," 37 pp., Aug 1983

#### PP 401

Naloney, Arthur P., "The Berlin-Baghdad Raliway es a Cause of World War I," 27 pp., Jan 1964

## PP 402

Herz, Henry L., "A Perametric Analysis of Duels," 41 pp., Mer 1984

## PP 405

Petersen, Charles C., "Alrcraft Carriers in Soviet Neval Theory From 1960 to the Falklands Wer," 20 pp., Jan 1964

#### PP 406

Bowes, Marianne, "Profit-Maximizing vs. Optimal Bahavior in a Spatial Satting: Summary and Extensions," 10 pp., Jan 1984

## PP 407

Laird, Robbin F., "The French Strategic Dilemma," 41 pp., Nar 1964

## PP 408

Marcus, Ålan, and Quester, Aline, "Massuring the Productivity of First Term Navy Enlistees," 30 pp., Apr 1984

#### PP 411

Horowitz, Stan, "Skill Mix, Experience and Readiness," 12 pp., Oct 1983

## PP 412

McConnell, James H., "The Interacting Evolution of Soviet and American Military Doctrines," 119 pp., Sep 1980

