	1 08 2 AD ADE6 25	он. С										
		£		ЭŤ.							Lucari	
T.T.T.		- <b>**</b>	¥ Я Х Л Х Л					, seben vers Spisseren Spisseren				
						•						
			5				गहतू. इंग्रेल्या		хц) 12			
				 	12.696	iit.		i.	k.	IE	•	2



COMPLEX. PRECISION CAST COLUMBIUM ALLOY GAS TURBINE ENGINE NOZZLES COATED TO RESIST OXIDATION

L., Hsu, W.G., Stevens and A. R., Stetson Solar/International Harvester 2200 Pacific Highway P.O. Box 80966 San Diego, CA 92138

March 1980

FINAL REPORT

C

Contract No. DAAG46-76-C-0053

80 6 25 051



Approved for public release; distribution unlimited

United States Army AVIATION RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT COMMAND

ş

The findings in this report are not to be construed as an official Department of the Army position, unless so designated by other authorized documents.

Mention of any trade names or manufacturers in this report shall not be construed as advertising nor as an official indorsement or approval of such products or companies by the United States Government,

## DISPOSITION INSTRUCTIONS

Destroy this report when it is no longer needed. Do not return it to the originator.

Nichton

AVEAUCOM Peport No. TBB0-F-2       JoovY ACCESSION NO.       A RECIPENTS CATAGORNUMBER         AVEAUCOM Peport No. TBB0-F-2       John Mile 128       First Catalog Number         MILE (and Samuto)       First Catalog Number         Complex, Precision Cast Columnia       Alloy Gas Turbine Engine Nozzles       First Peport.         Conted to Resist Oxidation       Automate Peport.       August 2, 1976-Fugust 2, 17         Automate       Accessing Group of International Harvester       Schart Content Peport.         Schart Turbines International       Harvester       D/A Proj: 1758129         Ar. Operating Group of International Harvester       D/A Proj: 1758129         Sch Turbing Orgon of International Harvester       D/A Proj: 1758129         Sch Torbulue OfFict NAME & ADDRESS       D/A Proj: 1758129         AVPALCOM       12       Recogn Catifornia 92138         MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS       D/A Proj: 1758129         Anterials & Mechanics Research       D/A Pril 1980         Center       Materion, MA 02172       13         Schwedule       Schwedule       N/A         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abureat entered in Black 20, if different from Report)       N/A         Schwedule       Schwedule       N/A         Schwedule       Schwedule       N/A         S	REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE	READ INSTRUCTIONS BEFORE COMPLETING FORM
APPELCOM Peport No. TR80-F-2       W.AUKA [28]         ITTE (and Submits)       Final Peport A precision Cast Columnal         Complex, Precision Cast Columnal       Final Peport         Alloy Gas Turbine Engine Nozzles       Final Peport         Coated to Resist Oxidation       5 PERFORMAGEOR DEFORT NUMBER         Autrone,       5 PERFORMAGEOR DEFORT NUMBER         Minore,       5 Contract on chair number         May, L., Stevens, W.G. and Stetson, A.P.       DAAG66-76-C-0053 A         Performing Organization NAME IND Appress       Contract on chair numbers         Schar Turbines International       Harvester         Scharbourg of International       Harvester         Scharbourg of International       Harvester         Macharbourg of Scharbourg of International       Harvester         Scharbourg of International       Harvester	REPORT NUMBER 2. GOVT ACCESSION N	D. J. RECIPIENT'S CATALOG NUMBER
THILE (and Submits)       Interformation (Complex, Precision Cast Columbium Alloy Gas Turbine Engine Nozzles Control to Resist Oxidation (Complex, Precision Cast Columbia (Control to Resist Oxidation (Complex, Precision Control (Complex, Precision Cast Columbia (Control to Resist Oxidation (Complex, Precision Complex, Precision Complex, Precision Control (Complex, Precision Cast Columbia (Complex, Precision Cast Columbia (Complex, Precision Cast Columbia (Complex, Precision Cast Columbia (Control (Complex, Precision Complex, Precision Co	AVPADCOM Peport No. TR80-F-2 AD-AFX 128	
Complex, Precision Cast Columnian Alloy Gas Turbine Engine Nozzles Coated to Resist Oxidation       Final Peport         Coated to Resist Oxidation       August 2, 17         Authoms,       Burges 2, 17         Burges 2, 17       Contract OF GRANT NUMBER (SRC)-R-4444-25         Authoms,       Burges 2, 17         Burges 2, 17       Burges 2, 17         Burges 2, 17       Burges 2, 17         Performing of Anternational F: Operating Group of International Harvester Scilar Turbines International F: Operating Group of International Harvester Scilar Turbines International F: Operating Group of International Harvester Scilar Turbines International Harvester Scilar Straing Group of International Harvester Scilar Straing Scilar Scilar Straing Straing Scilar Scilar Straing Straing Scilar Scilar Strange Scilar Straing Scilar Scilar Straing Scilar Scilar S	TITLE (and Sublitie)	S TYPE OF REPORT & PERIOD COVERED
Alloy Gas Turbine Engine Nozzles Coated to Resist Oxidation	Complex. Precision Cast Columbium	Final Peport
Control to Resist Oxidation	Alloy Gas Turbine Engine Nozzles	August 2, 1976-August 2, 197
AutroWa, HSU, L., Stevens, W.G. and Stetson, A.R. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME IND ADDRESS Solar Turbines International A: operating Group of International Harvester Solar Turbines International Solar Turbines International A: operating Group of International St. Louis, Missouri 63166 Atroy Materials & Mechanics Research Center Watertown, MA 02172 DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for the above of the above of the above of the Booth Approved for public release; distribution unlimited DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for the above of the above of the Block 20, If different from Reperty AMPC TP80-23 XEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number) Castings Solid Tensile Solid Tensile Stress rupture	Coated to Resist Oxidation -	5 PERFORMING ORG REPORT NUMBER
HSU, L., Stevens, W.G. and Stetson, A.P.       DAAG46-76-C-0053 /**         PERFONDING ORGANIZATION NAME IND ADDRESS       10 PROGRAM ELEMENT PROJECT TASK AREA BOOKS UNIT NUMBERS         Schar Turbines International Act operating Group of International Harvester Schar Turbines International Harvester       10 Program ELEMENT Project Task AREA BOOKS UNIT NUMBERS         Controlling OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS       D/A Proj: 1758123 AMCMS Code: 1497.94.5.511         CONTROLLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS       12 REPORT DATE APPIL 1980         AMPADOM       Distribution of Action and Address         ALTY MALE I ADDRESS// different from Controlling Office)       13 SECURITY CLASS of this report         ALTY MALETIALS & Mechanics Research Center       Unclassified         Watertown, MA 02172       15 DECLASS of this report         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for interest distribution unlimited       N/A         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for the aburget entered in Block 20. If different from Report)         SuppleLEMENTARY NOTES         AMMPC TPR0-23         XEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number)         Colding alloys       Oxidation       Burner rig NS-4 coating         Castings       Solid Cored       Tensile	AUTHOR/a,	A SHOT RACT OF GRANT NUMBER(N)
Hsu, L., Stevens, W.G. and Stetson, A.P.       DAAG46-76-C-0053 A         Performing Ordering Store of International Ar. Operating Group of International Harvester San Diego, California 92138       D/A Proj: 1758129 AProj: 1758129         Controlling of International Ar. Operating Group of International Harvester San Diego, California 92138       D/A Proj: 1758129         AVPADCOM St. Louis, Missouri 63166       12. Report Dave April 1980         MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS AVPADCOM St. Louis, Missouri 63166       13. Number of Paces 133         MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESSI different from Controlling Office)       15 SECURITY CLASS for this report         Army Materials & Mechanics Research Center       Unclassified         Watertown, MA 02172       15 SECURITY CLASS for this report         Approved for public release; distribution unlimited         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for the abstract entered in Block 20, If different from Report)         SupPLEMENTARY NOTES         AMMPC TP80-23         KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number)         Collow alloys       Oxidation         Burner rig Castings       Solid		
PERFONNING ORGANIZATION NAME AND ADDRESS       10 PROGRAM FLEMENT PROJECT TASE         Solar Turbines International       4. Operating Group of International Harvester       D/A Proj: 1758129         San Diego, California 92138       D/A Proj: 1758129         CONTROLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS       APRIL 1497.04.5.5213         CONTROLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS       APril 1920         St. Louis, Missouri 63166       12 NETHER OF PACES         AMMADCOM       13 April 1920         Atmy Materials & Mechanics Research       133         Center       Unclassified         Watertown, MA 02172       15 SECURITY CLASS for Musing office         Approved for public release; distribution unlimited         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report)         Supplementation on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number;         Colifor 1100       Oxidation         Burner rig         C129Y       Nozzle vane         Castings       Solid         Cored       Tensile	Hsu, L., Stevens, W.G. and Stetson, A.P.	DAAG46-76-C-0053
PERFORMING ORDANIZATION NAME AND ADDRESS       19 PROJECT TAXY         Solar Turbines International       Arry Andress         Ar Operating Group of International Harvester       D/A Proj: 1758129         San Diego, California 92138       D/A Proj: 1758129         CONTROLLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS       12 Report Dave         AVPALICOM       April 1980         St. Louis, Missouri 63166       12 NewBerg Dave         AND ADDRESS       13 SECURITY CLASS for introlling Office)         Arry Materials & Mechanics Research       Unclassified         Center       Watertown, MA 02172         Watertown, MA 02172       The DECLASSIFICATION DownGRADING         CostRibution Statement for the abstract entered in Bluck 20, if different from Report)         Approved for public release; distribution unlimited         Supplementary notes         AMMEC TP80-23         KEY WORDS (Continue on revease use of intered in Bluck 20, if different from Report)         Col Deliver alloys       Oxidation         Burner rig         CT29Y       Nozzle vane         Cored       NS-4 coating         Tensile       Stress rupture	and the second s	
ACT TURDINES International         Ac Operating Group of International Harvester         San Diego, California 92138         CONTROLLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS         AVPADCOM         St. Louis, Missouri 63166         A MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS// different hom Controlling Office)         A MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS// different hom Controlling Office)         A monitoring Materials & Mechanics Research         Center         Watertown, MA 02172         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT folling Report         Approved for public release; distribution unlimited         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT folling allock 20, il different hom Report         Supplementary notes         AMMPC TP80-23         KEY WORDS /Continue on reverse side if necessary ond identify by block number;         Colfection alloys       Oxidation         Burner rig         C129Y       Nozzle vane         NS-4 coating         Castings       Solid	PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME AND ADDRESS	10 PROGRAM ELEMENT PROJECT TASK AREA & WORK UNIT NUMBERS
AMCMS Code: 1497.94.5.5217 AMCMS Code: 1497.94.5.5217 Approved for public formation controlling Office: 13 Approved for public release; distribution unlimited CostRIBUTION STATEMENT for the absiract entered in Block 20. If different from Report; AMMPC TP80-23 AMMPC TP80-23 AMMPC TP80-23 AMMPC Costing Costing Costing Cost of the	Solar Turbines International	D/A Proj: 1758129
CONTROLLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS AVEADOM St. LOUIS, MISSOURI 63166  MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS// different from Controlling Office) Army Materials & Mechanics Research Center Watertown, MA 02172  DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for this Report;  Approved for public release; distribution unlimited  DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for the absirect entered in Block 20, if different from Report;  SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23  KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number; Colfination alloys Citien Castings Solid Cored	San Diego, California 92138	AMCMS Code: 1497.94.5.581:0
AVPADCOM St. Louis, Missouri 63166 A MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS// different from Controlling Office) Army Materials & Mechanics Research Center Watertown, MA 02172 DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT /of the Report/ Cost of public release; distribution unlimited DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT /of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report/ SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS /Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number/ Col Station alloys Col Station alloys Col Station alloys Castings Solid Cored Marce Stress rupture	CONTROLLING OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS	12. REPORT DATE
St. Louis, Missouri 63166       139         MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS(i different from Controlling Office)       15 SECURITY CLASS (of this report)         Army Materials & Mechanics Research Center       Unclassified         Watertown, MA 02172       16 DECLASS(FICATION DOWNGRADING SCHEDULE         * DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of this Report)         Approved for public release; distribution unlimited         * DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report)         * SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES         AMMPC TP80-23         *         *         Coloring         Classing         Supplementary Notes         AMMPC TP80-23         *         Coloring         Supple Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number)         Coloring         Coloring         Supple Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number)         Coloring         Coloring         Solid         Cored	AVEADOOM	April 1980
133         A MONITORING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS(if different from Controlling Office)         Army Materials & Mechanics Research Center         Waterials & Mechanics Research Center         Waterials & Mechanics Research Center         Waterials & Mechanics Research Center         Waterials & Mechanics Research Center         Unclassified         Usclassified         Security CLASS (of this report)         Cost of public release; distribution unlimited         Distribution Statement (of the abstract entered in Black 20, If different from Report)         Supplementary notes         AMMPC TP80-23         KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number)         Colored       Nozzle vane         Nozzle vane       NS-4 coating         Castings       Solid         Cored       Stress rupture	St. Louis, Missouri 63166	12 NUMBER OF PASES
ALTY MATERIALS & Mechanics Research Center       Unclassified         Watertown, MA 02172       Unclassified         Distribution statement (of the Report)       Schedule N/A         Distribution statement (of the absiract entered in Black 20, if different from Report)       N/A         Distribution statement (of the absiract entered in Black 20, if different from Report)       N/A         Supplementary notes		139 /
ALTRY Materials & Mechanics Research Center       Unclassified         Watertown, MA 02172       15- DECLASSIFICATION DOWNGRADING SCHEDULE N/A         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the Report)         Approved for public release; distribution unlimited         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abs/rect entered in Black 20, if different from Report)         SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES         AMMEC TP80-23         r         Colonizion alloys       Oxidation         Burner rig Castings       Solid         Cored       WS-4 coating         Tensile         Stress rupture	MUNITOHING AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS/If different from Controlling Office)	IS SECURITY CLASS (of this report)
Watertown, MA 02172       Iso DECLASSIFICATION DOWNGRADING SCHEDULE         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (u) this Report;         Approved for public release; distribution unlimited         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report;)         SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES         AMMPC TP80-23         KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number;)         ColSubium alloys       Oxidation         Burner rig         C129Y       Nozzle vane         Solid       Tensile         Cored       Stress rupture	Aimy Materials & Mechanics Research	Unclassified
Approved for public release; distribution unlimited         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the aberrace entered in Block 20, if different from Report)         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the aberrace entered in Block 20, if different from Report)         DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the aberrace entered in Block 20, if different from Report)         SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES         AMMPC TP80-23         KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse endered if necessary and identify by block number)         Collablish alloys       Oxidation         Burner rig         C129Y       Nozzle vane         Castings       Solid         Cored       Stress rupture	Watertown, MA 02172	150 DECLASSIFICATION DOWNGRADING
Approved for public release; distribution unlimited Approved for public release; distribution unlimited DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report) S SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number) Collock-dom alloys Oxidation Burner rig C129Y Nozzle vane NS-4 coating Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	macor cowny far out fra	SCREDULE N/A
AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse aids if necessary and identify by block number) Colonizion Burner rig Classings Oxidation Burner rig Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Black 20, if different in	nited
AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number) Colonbian alloys Oxidation Burner rig C129Y Nozzle vane NS-4 coating Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlir DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different in	nited rom Report)
AMMPC TF80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse aide if necessary and identify by block number) Colonbian alloys Oxidation Burner rig Classings Oxidation Surner rig Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlir DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different in	nited rom Report;
KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number) Colonizion alloys Oxidation Burner rig C129Y Nozzle vane NS-4 coating Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different in S SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES	nited
KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number) Colonbium alloys Oxidation Burner rig C129Y Nozzle vane NS-4 coating Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlir DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the obstract entered in Black 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMEC TER0-22	nited rom Report;
KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number) Colorization Burner rig C129Y Nozzle vane NS-4 coating Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlir DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for the abstract entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23	nited
Colombium alloys Oxidation Burner rig C129Y Nozzle vane NS-4 coating Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the obstract entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23	nited
C129Y Nozzle vane NS-4 coating Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the observed entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMEC TEB0-23 / KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number	nited
Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the observent entered in Black 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block numbe Colembia of alloys Oxidation Bur	nited
Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the obstract entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMEC TEB0-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block numbe Colonia alloys Oxidation Bur C129Y Nozzle vane NS-	nited <b>rom Report</b> ) <b>r</b> om rig 4 coating
	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT for the abstract entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colforbium alloys Oxidation Bur C129Y Nozzle vane NS- Castings Solid Ten	nited rom Report; "" ner rig 4 coating sile
Castings Solid Tensile Cored Stress rupture	Approved for public release; distribution unlir 7 DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abatract entered in Block 20, if different in	nited
	Approved for public release; distribution unlir DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the observed on Block 20, if different is SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if neressery and identify by block numbe Colforbitum alloys Oxidation Bur C129Y Nozzle vane NS-	nited rom Report) "" ner rig 4 coating rilo
ABTTRACT (Continue on courses and if an ansatz and identify his black number)	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the obstract entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse ende if necessary and identify by block number Colorbation Bur Classings Oxidation Bur Castings Solid Ten Cored W	nited TOM Report) Ther rig 4 coating sile tess rupture
	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colorbiton alloys Oxidation Bur C129Y Nozzle vane NS- Castings Solid Ten Cored Str ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number	nited rom Report) "" ner rig 4 coating sile ess rupture )
The objectives of this program were to produce investment cast single vane	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the observed in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colonbian alloys Castings Castings ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Cored Str ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number The objectives of this program were to produce in	nited rom Report) "' "ner rig 4 coating sile ress rupture vestment cast single vane
The objectives of this program were to produce investment cast single vane nozzle segments in C129Y alloy (cb-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) and to coat these vanes	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the observect entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colorbium alloys Oxidation Bur Cl29Y Nozzle vane NS- Castings Solid Ten Cored Str ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number, The objectives of this program ware to produce in nozzle segments in Cl29Y alloy (CD-10Hf-10W-0.3Y)	nited rom Report) "" ner rig 4 coating sile ess rupture ) westment cast single vane and to coat these vanes
The objectives of this program were to produce investment cast single vane nozzle segments in C129Y alloy (db-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) and to coat these vanes with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coating. Initially, both cored	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the observed in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TPB0-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colonbian alloys Oxidation Bur C129Y Nozzle vane NS- Castings Solid Ten Cored Str ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number, The objectives of this program ware to produce in nozzle segments in C129Y alloy (fD-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coatin	nited rom Report; " ner rig 4 coating sile ess rupture ) westment cast single vane and to coat these vanes ig. Initially, both cored
The objectives of this program were to produce investment cast single vane nozzle segments in C129Y alloy (cb-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) and to coat these vanes with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coating. Initially, both cored and solid vane segments were specified but due to problems experienced	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the observed in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colonbian alloys Oxidation Bur Ci29Y Nozzle vane NS- Castings Solid Ten Cored Str ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number The objectives of this program were to produce in nozzle segments in C129Y alloy (db-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coatin and solid vane segments were specified but due to	"" "" "" "" "" "" "" "" "" ""
The objectives of this program were to produce investment cast single vane nozzle segments in C129Y alloy (p-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) and to coat these vanes with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coating. Initially, both cored and solid vane segments were specified but due to problems experienced in the consumable arc process, cored vanes were deleted from the program	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the observed in Block 20, 11 different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colonbia alloys Oxidation Bur C129Y Nozzle vane NS- Castings Solid Ten Cored Str ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number The objectives of this program ware to produce in nozzle segments in C129Y alloy (CD-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coatin and solid vane segments were specified but due to in the consumable arc process, cored vanes were d	"" " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " "
The objectives of this program were to produce investment cast single vane nozzle segments in C129Y alloy ( $fb-10Hf-10W-0.3Y$ ) and to coat these vanes with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coating. Initially, both cored and solid vane segments were specified but due to problems experienced in the consumable arc process, cored vanes were deleted from the program scope. $-3 e^{i + K} Max_{i}$	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different in SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colfabling alloys Oxidation Bur C129Y Nozzle vane NS- Castings Solid Ten Cored Str ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number The objectives of this program were to produce in nozzle segments in C129Y alloy (CD-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coatin and solid vane segments were specified but due to in the consumable arc process, cored vanes were d scope + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + +	"" " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " " "
The objectives of this program were to produce investment cast single vane nozzle segments in C129Y alloy ( $2b-10Hf-10W-0.3Y$ ) and to coat these vanes with the NS-4 ( $50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V$ ) silicide coating. Initially, both cored and solid vane segments were specified but due to problems experienced in the consumable arc process, cored vanes were deleted from the program scope. $-3 e^{i/R} f_{MAR}$	Approved for public release; distribution unlin DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT (of the obsized entered in Block 20, if different is SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES AMMPC TP80-23 KEY WORDS (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number Colonbiation Bur Clondiation Bur Clondiation Bur Clondiation Bur Clored NS- Castings Solid Ten Cored Str ABSTRACT (Continue on reverse side if necessary and identify by block number The objectives of this program were to produce in nozzle segments in Cl29Y alloy (fb-10Hf-10W-0.3Y) with the NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-10V) silicide coatin and solid vane segments were specified but due to in the consumable arc process, cored vanes were d Scope * * * Market	"' "' "' "' "' "' "' "' "' "' "' "' "' "

\_

۲

Ż

# UNCLASSIFIED

Block No. 20

## ABSTRACT

REM Metals of Albany, Oregon was the casting subcontractor and though they have had previous experience with this alloy and other columbium alloys in general, several problems developed. The electrode material supplied was low in yttrium, which might have contributed to the poor fluidity during arc melt and incomplete fill of thin walled sections. The solid nozzles and round test bars were acceptable and were used in coating processing and testing.

Process specifications for both slurry spray and dip applications of the NS-4 modifier were prepared. Tensile and stress rupture tests of coated specimens displayed exceptional properties at elevated temperatures and showed superiority to cobalt-base vane alloys. Isothermal oxidation lives in excess of 5500 hours (at 760 and 1093°C) were exhibited by NS-4 coated C129Y specimens. In rig testing, under the severe thermal cycles and profiles imposed, the airfoil specimens typically survived about 100 hours.

#### UNCLASSIFIED SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF THIS PAGE(Then Data Entered)

#### FOREWORD

This final summary report covers the work performed under Contract DAAG46-76-C-0053 from August 5, 1976 to August 2, 1979. This program was sponsored by the U. S. Army Aviation Research and Development Command, St. Louis, Missouri through a contract with the Army Materials and Mechanics Research Center (AMMRC), Watertown, MA. The technical activities were performed at the Harbor Drive facilities of Solar Turbines International, an Operating Group of International Harvester. AMMRC Program Monitors were Milton Levy and Robert French.

V. S. Moore was the original Principal Investigator with A. R. Stetson as the Technical Director. With the demise of V. S. Moore, Dr. W. G. Stevens and Lulu Hsu then assumed control of the program with the assistance of A. N. Hammer in the casting phase.

Acknowledgement is extended to J. Wolman and J. Leggett for their assistance in the technical activities.

	1	
Access	lon for	
NTI3	€lùI	
DOC TA	.5	<u>L</u>
62°° 020 5	uncea	
Ju: 113	ic.tion_	
By		
<u></u>	hu ten/	
1.71	nbility_	Cades
1	Availand	l/or
Dist	specia	1
A		

PRECEDING PAGE BLANK - NOT FILMED

TABLE OF CONTENTS

2

27

**\***: 7

-

Section				Page
1	INTRO	DUCTION		1
	1.1	Backgrou	ınd	1
		1.1.1 1.1.2	Formability Surface Protection	1
	1.2	Program	Objectives	3
2	EXPERI	IMENTAL		5
	2.1	Program	Materials	5
	2.2	Program	Specimens	5
	2.3	Mechanic	al and Environmental Testing	7
		2.3.1	Tensile Tests	7
		2.3.2	Stress-Rupture Tests	8
		2.3.3	Furnace Oxidation Tests	11
		2.3.4	Burner Rig Oxidation Tests	12
	2.4	Diagnost	ic Techniques	15
3	PHASE	I - CASTI	NG DEVELOPMENT	19
	3.1	Casting	Process Development	19
		3.1.1	Alloy Selection	19
		3.1.2	Foundry Practice	21
		3.1.3	Process Development	26
		3.1.4	Casting Properties	33
	3.2	Producti	on of Optimized Test Specimens	35
		3.2.1	Casting Production	35
		3.2.2	Casting Properties	36
4	PHASE	II - COAT	ING AND TESTING OF COMPONENTS	47
	4.1	Task I -	Optimization of Coating Application	47
		4.1.1	Specimen Configuration	48
		4.1.2	Dip Application Apparatus	50
		4.1.3	Slurry Dip Coating Slip Formation	50
		4.1.4	Slurry Dip Coating Slip Characterization	50
		4.1.5	Specimen Orientation During Dipping	56

v

TABLE OF CONTENTS (Cont)

Section				Page
		4.1.6	Rate of Withdrawal	56
		4.1.7	Dip/Spray Overlap	59
		4.1.8	Multiple Dipping	59
		4.1.9	Sintering and Siliciding	60
		4.1.10	Summary of Task I	63
	4.2	Coating	of Components	63
	4.3	Coated	Casting Properties	66
		4.3.1	Tensile Properties	66
		4.3.2	Stress-Rupture Testing	68
		4.3.3	Furnace Oxidation Testing	71
		4.3.4	Dynamic Oxidation Burner Rig Testing	85
5	CONCL	USIONS AN	D RECOMMENDATIONS	111
6	REF ER	ENC ES		113
AP PEND IC E	S			
A	PROC E	DURES FOR	HYDRIDING TITANIUM AND VANADIUM	115
B	SPRAY	SLURRY P	REPARATION PROCEDURE	117

с	TELEDYNE WAH CHANG ALBANY COLUMBIUM AND COLUMBIUM	1 19
	ALLOY PLATES, SHEETS AND STRIP, SPECIFICATION	
D	PROCESS SPECIFICATION FOR THE NS-4 COATING	123

(

## LIST OF FIGURES

1

1231

i

1

1

1

i

Figure		Page
1	First-Stage Centaur Double Vane Nozzle Segment	4
2	Stress-Rupture Test Specimen	6
3	Tensile Test Specimen	6
4	Coupon Cut From Sound Section of Casting	7
5	Tensile Test Setup	8
6	Schematic of Stress-Rupture Test Setup	10
7	Setup for Stress-Rupture Evaluations on C12Y Alloy	11
8	Gas Turbine Environmental Simulator	13
9	Schematic of Burner Rig Test	13
10	Shroud Fixture With Viewing Slot	14
11	Single-Vane Nozzle Located at Exit Nozzle of Combustor Plate - System 1	15
12	NS-4 Coated C129Y Nozzle Prepared for Burner Rig Testing - System 2	16
13	Side and Front Views of Assembled "Tree" of Molds Used in Investment Casting	22
14	Consumable Electrode Arc Melting and Casting Vacuum Furnace	23
15	Flat Tensile Specimen - Pin Hole	24
16	Erosion Bar Figure	24
17	Threaded Tensile Specimen	25
18	Hollow Vane Segment	25
19	Solid Vane Segment	25
20	Steel Core Pull for Investment of Hollow Wax Patterns	26
21	Cast Solid Nozzles of C129Y Alloy, Pour No. 1	27

Figure		Page
22	Radiograph of Solid Nozzles, Pour No. 1	28
23	Radiograph of Round Test Bars, Pour No. 1	29
24	As-Cast Hollow Vanes, Pour No. 2	30
25	As-Cast Flat and Round Test Specimens, Pour No. 2	30
26	Radiograph of Hollow Vanes, Pour No. 2	31
27	Radiograph of Flat and Round Test Specimens, Pour No. 3	32
28	Cast Round Test Bars of C129Y Alloy	37
29	Radiograph of Round Test Bars	40
30	Brittle Secondary Cracking in Tensile Sample No. 18	42
31	Shrinkage Porosity in Tensile Sample No. 18	42
32	Tensile, Ultimate and 0.2% Yield Strengths of C129Y and X-45M Alloys at Ambient and Elevated Temperature	43
33	Scanning Electron Micrograph of Residue on Fracture Surface and Gage Length of Stress-Rupture Specimen No. 1	44
34	Energy Dispersive X-ray Analysis Spectrum of White Residue on Stress-Rupture Specimen No. 1	44
35	Larson-Miller Plots of Stress-Rupture Life	45
36	Weight Change Versus Time of Oxidation Specimens	46
37	Columbium Metal Coupon Specimen	49
38	Coating Development Specimen	49
39	Simulated Airfoil Specimen Fabricated From Columbium Metal	49
40	Test Setup for Dip Application of Development Coating	51
41	Test Setup for Dip Application With Ultrasonic Bath	52
42	Average Particle Size Versus Milling Time	54
43	Correlation of Coating Weight Deposited on Simulated Airfoils and Withdrawal Rate	57
44	Weight of Coating Versus Rate of Withdrawal	58

Figure		Page
45	Dip/Spray Interface	59
46	Microstructure of Dipped/Sintered/Dipped Specimen	60
47	Microstructures of NS-4 Coating Formation	62
48	NS-4 Bisque Weight Versus Silicon Pickup Weight	63
49	Microstructures of Sprayed Specimens	64
50	NS-4 Coated Stress-Rupture Bars in As-Coated Condition	65
51	NS-4 Coated Tensile Bars in As-Coated Condition	66
52	Correlation of Bisque Weight With Silicon Pickup	67
53	Creep Rates of C129Y Specimens at 2000°F	70
54	Creep Rates of C129Y Specimens at 2200°F	70
55	Surface Appearance of NS-4 Coated Oxidation Specimens After Various Exposure Times at 760°C	73
56	Surface Appearance of NS-4 Coated Oxidation Specimens After Various Exposure Times at 1093°C	73
57	Microstructures of NS-4 Coated C129Y Specimens After Oxidation Testing at 760°C	74
58	Microstructures of NS-4 Coated C129Y Specimens After Oxidation	75
	Testing at 1093°C	
59	NS-4 Coated C129Y Specimen in As-Coated Condition	76
60	EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 4 After 1259 Hours at 760°C	77
61	EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 2 After 4841 Hours at 760°C	78
62	EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 1 After 5561 Hours at 760°C	79
63	EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 6 After 1259 Hours at 1093°C	80
64	EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 7 After 4841 Hours at 1093°C	81

ix

Figure		Page
65	EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 5 After 5561 Hours at 1093°C	82
66	Hafnium-Rich Areas in the Alloy Grain Boundary	83
67	SEM Photomicrographs of Inhomogeneous Substrate Areas on Specimen No. 2 Showing Hafnium Agglomeration and Porosity	84
68	NS-4 Coated Test Specimen No. 6-2 After 10 Hours of Burner Rig Testing	87
69	NS-4 Coated Test Specimen No. 1-3 After 57 Hours of Burner Rig Testing	88
70	NS-4 Coated Test Specimen No. 5-3 After 66 Hours of Burner Rig Testing	89
71	NS-4 Coated Test Specimen No. 3-4 After 132 Hours of Burner Rig Testing	90
72	Schematic of Tensile and Compression Strains Induced at a Specimen Edge During Thermal Cycling	91
73	Sketch of Hypothetical Isotherms Showing Thermal Profile by Vane During Rig Testing	92
74	Low Magnification (17X) SEM Photo of Failed Area on Specimen No. 6-2	92
75	High Magnification (45X) SEM Photograph of Failed Area of Specimen No. 6-2	93
76	SEM Photograph of Leading Edge Failure of Specimen No. 1-3	94
77	Dark Streaking on Convex Side of Leading Edge of Specimen No. 1-3	95
78	MoO <sub>2</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> Binary System	96
79	Nb <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> Binary System	97
80	Cross-Section of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 1-3	97
81	Energy Spectra of Two Areas Near Failed Leading Edge of Specimen No. 1-3	98
82	Oxidized C129Y Substrate at Center of Leading Edge Failure	98

х

Figure		Page
83	SEM Photomicrograph of Oxidized C129Y Substrate on Leading Edge Failure in Specimen No. 1-3	99
84	Photomicrographs of Transition From Exposed Alloy to Coated Alloy at Leading Edge Failure of Specimen No. 1-3	100
85	SEM Photomicrograph of Edge of Failed Area on Leading Edge of Specimen No. 1-3	10 1
86	NS-4 Coating on Convex Side of Airfoil (Specimen No. 1-3) After 57 Hours Burner Rig Testing	10 1
87	Cross-Section of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 5-3	<b>1</b> 0 2
88	Oxidized C129Y Substrate at Center of Leading Edge Failure in Specimen No. 5-3	102
89	Transition From Exposed Alloy to Coated Alloy at Leading Edge of Specimen No. 5-3	102
90	NS-4 Coated C129Y (Specimen No. 5-3) After 66 Hours of Burner Rig Testing	103
91	SEM Photomicrograph of NS-4 Coated C129Y Alloy (Specimen No. 5-3) After 66 Hour Burner Rig Test	104
92	EDX Analysis Results of NS-4 Coating	104
93	Cross-Section of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 3-4	105
94	Concave and Convex SEM Views of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 3-4	106
95	SEM Photomicrograph of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 3-4	107
96	Photomicrographs of Failed Area on Leading Edge of Specimen No. 3-4 Showing Oxide Formation	108
97	NS-4 Coated C129Y After 132 Hours of Burner Rig Testing	109

xi

ł

2

FRECEDING PAGE BLANK - NOT FILMED

## LIST OF TABLES

Table		Fage
1	Oxidation Burner Rig Test Parameters	16
2	Combustion Products Calculated From Fuel/Air Consumption	17
3	Typical Physical and Mechanical Properties of Columbium and Cobalt Alloys	20
4	Chemical Analyses of Electrode Stock	21
5	Tensile Properties of Cast C129Y Specimens (Lot A)	۶4
6	Tensile Properties of Cast C129Y Specimens (Lot B)	34
7	Chemical Analyses of Casting Pours	35
8	Chemical Analyses of Casting Pours	38
9	Vacuum Furnace Data Sheet	39
10	Tensile Test Data of C129Y Cast Specimens	41
11	Stress-Rupture Life of C129Y Castings	43
12	Characteristics of Development Coating Batches	53
13	Density of Developmental Coating Constituents	53
14	Conditions and Results of Dip Application of Development Coating	54
15	Weight of Internal Coating Versus Rate of Withdrawal	57
16	Correlation of Weight of Coating and Rate of Withdrawal	58
17	Developmental Coating Thickness With Two Dip Applications	60
18	Weights of NS-4 Coated Specimens	61
19	NS-4 Coated C129Y Alloy Specimens	65
20	Coating Weight Gain of Cast Columbium Nozzle Vanes	67
21	Tensile Test Data of C129Y Alloy	68
22	Test Results on C129Y Alloy	69

Table		Page
23	Weight Change Data for Furnace Oxidation Test Specimens	71
24	Microhardness (KHN-100g Load) Measurements of C129Y Oxidation Specimens	83
22	1315°C Burner Rig Test Results	86

11 J

## INTRODUCTION

## 1.1 BACKGROUND

Conventional superalloys and second generation materials such as directionally solidified (DS), oxide dispersion strengthened (ODS), mechanically alloyed and single crystal alloys are currently temperature limited to around 1100°C for useful, long-term service. Above 1100°C, the principal materials capable of high-temperature, high-strength performance are ceramics and refractory alloys of columbium and tantalum (Ref. 1). As a result of the efforts invested in development of columbium alloys and oxidation-resistant coatings in the last two decades, the state-of-the-art of this technology has been significantly advanced.

The application of coated columbium technology to high-temperature component fabrication must be considered critically in two important aspects:

- 1. Formability
- 2. Oxidation-resistant surface modification

1.1.1 Formability

As with any candidate alloy system, it is necessary to establish forming capabilities which, in turn, will effect the scope of its usability. Prior to investment casting of columbium alloys, columbium alloys were primarily available in wrought form, and applications were limited to simple components that can be readily fabricated. In 1971, an AMMRC sponsored investigation (Ref. 2) reported that cast alloy materials exhibited a two-fold improvement in stress rupture life at 1204°C (2200°F) when compared to equivalent wrought material. Additional work by REM Metals Corp. in 1975 (Ref. 3) demonstrated that relatively complex configurations including thin-walled components (1.02 mm) can be poured with fairly high melting, high-strength alloys such as SU31 and CB752. Significant advances were also made in foundry practice which were extremely encouraging in advancing the state-of-the-art toward the goal of production of cast engine hardware.

## 1.1.2 Surface Protection

The efforts expended in coating development were concurrent with casting investigations and were largely spurred on by the susceptibility of columbium alloys to catastrophic oxidation failure. Starting in the late 1950's, the development of coatings for columbium alloys has progressively evolved from relying solely on  $CbSi_2$  for oxidation resistance to multi-component coating systems. Upon exposure to air at elevated temperatures, the  $SiO_2$  scale formed from  $CbSi_2$  was found to contain significant quantities of  $CbO_x$  which is highly undesirable due to the premeability of  $O_2$  through the high anion vacancy of the columbium oxide lattice. In subsequent work, the goal has been to design and develop a coating that will furnish an adherent and continuous layer of pure  $SiO_2$  for oxidation resistance.

Most columbium substrate alloys (and also tantalum alloys) are essentially continuous solid solutions with typically 20 percent alloying elements and vapor deposition of silicon results in formation of  $CbSi_2$  at the substrate surface. In order to provide better oxidation resistance than that afforded by  $CbSi_2$  alloy, the surface was modified by depositing an overlay coating that can be silicided to form a stable silicon rich layer which will continually replenish the SiO<sub>2</sub> scale as it is removed.

In the early 1960's, TRW developed a (CrTiCb)Si2 coating that was applied in a two-stage process. Chromium and titanium were codeposited and were subsequently silicided. The resulting coating composition was much lower in columbium than the substrate itself. The presence of chromium and titanium imparted increased resistance to oxidation, 50 to 100 hours at 1316°C (2400°F) by lowering the fusion temperature of the coating for use in the range of 1316-1427°C (2400-2600°F). However, a major drawback to the widespread use of this system was the size and configuration limitations imposed by the codeposition process. This disadvantage was eliminated in a system developed at Sylvania Electric, Inc. which contained titanium and iron as the modifying constituents. The coating itself, R512E, was a fusion type and its ease of applicability coupled with its 50 to 100 hour life at 1316°C (2400°F) made this coating very attractive for applications requiring short-term (<50 hours) protection.

About the time Sylvania was working on its R512E coating, Solar was also actively pursuing a new approach to surface protection of columbium and tantalum alloys. The key concept behind Solar's approach was to minimize the presence of columbium and other undesirable elements in the coating and to maximize the elements that form outstanding oxidation-resistant silicides. In the Solar process, the slurry of the metallic modifier is applied to the substrate and vacuum sintered at temperatures between 1480 and 1700°C (2700 and 3100°F). This is followed by a pack siliciding process which essentially reduces the porosity in the coating as the formation of disilicides is accompanied by 150 percent volume growth. This reaction sintering approach produces a coating that is free of the undesirable substrate elements and can be readily modified for optimized protection in the range of 1316 to 1650°C (2400 to 3000°F) (Ref. 4). Another advantage of the Solar series of coatings is the lower coefficient of thermal expansion as noted below.

	Coefficient
	of
	Thermal
	Expansion
	(RT-1800°F)
	•F x 10 <sup>6</sup>
R512A (TiCrCb)Si <sub>2</sub> - Sylvania	6.9
R512E (TiFeCb)Si <sub>2</sub> - Sylvania	6.9
NS-4 (50W-20Mo-15Ti-15V)Si <sub>2</sub> - Solar	5.2
TNV-7 $(35W-35Mo-15Ti-15V)Si_2$ - Solar	5.2
TNV-12 (95Mo-5Ti)Si <sub>2</sub> - Solar	4.8
TNV-13 (97.5W-2.5Ti)Si <sub>2</sub> - Solar	4.7
Cb752 Alloy	4.3

The thermal expansion mismatch between these silicide coatings and the underlying substrate typically results in the formation of craze cracks in the coating at room temperature. At elevated temperature, the coating rapidly expands and the refractory layer softens to form a continuous protective surface. In order to increase the temperature range over which this class of coating is effective, the level of titanium and vanadium can be adjusted. The vanadium and titanium modification of the SiO<sub>2</sub> lattice decreases the softening temperature of the surface glass, essentially eliminating the lowtemperature 649-760°C (1200-1400°F), 'pest' oxidation problem. For hightemperature application, the TNV-12 and -13 coatings are excellent while the TNV-7 and NS-4 coatings perform best at medium and lower temperatures, <1427°C (<2600°F). The NS-4 coating, in particular, has been demonstrated to be very satisfactory (Ref. 5,6). Long-term ( up to 1000 hours) oxidation exposures at 1316°C (2400°F) revealed little microstructural change, indicating excellent coating stability and retained tensile properties are superior to R512E coated specimens.

#### 1.2 PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

The goal of this program was to utilize the state-of-the-art in the columbium casting and coating technologies to produce fully coated, investment cast single vane first-stage Centaur nozzles. Figure 1 shows a paired nozzle vane although the actual configuration used in the casting sequence was essentially one half of the paired segment. The C129Y alloy (Cb-10W-10Hf) was selected for this investigation based on its superior weldability, castability, lower melting temperature and strength (Ref. 3), together with Solar's NS-4 coating.

The program was divided into two phases - Phase I was concerned with development of the casting process with establishment of process parameters for producing single vane Centaur nozzles (both cored and solid) and test specimens; Phase II was scoped to contain the coating process development work and process specification for coating application to the cast components produced in Phase I. Mechanical property tests were used to evaluate both the quality of the cast material and also the extent of coating/substrate interaction. Finally, environmental (static and dynamic) tests were performed in Phase II on coated components to demonstrate the effectiveness of cast and coated materials under simulated service conditions.



Figure 1. First-Stage Centaur Double Vane Nozzle Segment

ļ

#### EXPERIMENTAL

2.1 PROGRAM MATERIALS

The program alloy C129Y (Cb-10W-10Hf-Y) is a product of Wah Chang of Albany, Oregon and 4-inch diameter electrode and starter materials were purchased per TWCA-CB-MS-1. Lot certification as received from the supplier is reported in Section 3 and discussed in context with casting development.

The casting subcontractor was REM Metals Corp., an organization also located in Albany, Oregon, which has had over seven years of experience in casting of columbium alloys.

Initial work in coating development and optimization was done using pure, recrystallized columbium sheet metal which was formed to simulate airfoil configurations.

The composition of the modifier used in the NS-4 coating was 50W-20Mo-15Ti-15V. Particle sizes of the tungsten and molybdenum powders were  $\langle 5 \mu m$ . The titanium and vanadium were originally -325 and -200 mesh and were converted to their respective hydrides before grinding in Burundum mills. The hydriding procedures are descriped in Appendix A. After the metal powders were mixed together in the proper percentages, the mixture was ground to finer sizes, as described in Appendix B. A liquid-to-solid ratio of 2.5/1 to 3.0/1 by volume was used for spray applications and the modifier slurry was stored in glass bottles purged with argon prior to sealing.

The -200 mesh silcon used in the pack siliciding operations was obtained from Keokuk Electro-Metals Company as Lot No. 3991. The impurity analysis yielded 0.33% Fe, 0.04% Ca and 0.21% M.

#### 2.2 PROGRAM SPECIMENS

At the beginning of the program, the contracted scope of work called for the following configurations to be cast, coated and tested:

- Round, 1/4-inch diameter threaded tensile bars
- . Flat 0.065-inch stress-rupture bars
- . 15 degree wedge shaped, thermal fatigue bars

- . 30 degree wedge shaped, thermal fatigue bars
- 0.5 inch diameter oxidation coupons.

However, in the course of the program, the scope of work was changed as a result of problems encountered in the casting phase and the specimen configurations actually used are as indicated below:

- . Stress-rupture specimens, Figure 2
- Tensile specimens, Figure 3
- Oxidation coupons (cut from sound sections of flat tensile specimens), Figure 4.



Figure 2. Stress-Rupture Test Specimen



Figure 3. Tensile Test Specimen



Figure 4.

Coupon Cut From Sound Section of Casting

#### 2.3 MECHANICAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL TESTING

The scope of testing utilized to evaluate the soundness of the cast material and the interaction of coating with substrate alloy included the following:

- Tensile (ambient, 1093°C + 1204°C)
- Stress rupture (1093°c + 1204°C)
- Furnace oxidation (760°C + 1093°C)
- . Dynamic oxidation or burner rig ( 816°C to 1316°C).

#### 2.3.1 Tensile Tests

The effects of the coating process and the interaction of the coating with the strength and ductility of the cast columbium alloy was evaluated in tensile tests at room temperature, 1093°C and 1204°C. Testing was done using an Instron Model TTD Universal screw-driven testing machine and load strain curves were autographically recorded from an extensometer attached to each specimen at room temperature. For elevated-temperature tests, a special setup was designed and fabricated, as illustrated in Figure 5, in order to minimize oxidation attack. A major consideration in designing the test system was the limitation imposed by the reaction of silicon with nickel forming a low melting eutectic. Therefore, couplings fabricated from molybdenum were used, both to eliminate this problem and to provide high-temperature strength. Since molybdenum has relatively poor resistance to  $O_2$  at elevated temperatures, a special shroud was built to provide a low oxygen, argon-rich environment during testing. Tubes leading into a sleeve fitted around the extension rods fed the argon gas in around the specimen to maintain the inert atmosphere. The furnace extended past the molybdenum coupling to the extension rods and the entire shroud was kept inert by purging prior to testing and maintaining a positive pressure throughout the tests. For the elevated-temperature runs, instead of an extensometer, gage marks and heat-resistant paint were used to mark the elongation.



Figure 5. Tensile Test Setup

## 2.3.2 Stress-Rupture Tests

Elevated-temperature stress-rupture tests were performed at Southern Research Institute (SoRI) in Birmingham, Alabama. Since both uncoated and coated C129Y alloy were to be evaluated, it was decided that all tests were to be conducted in helium atmosphere.

The tests were conducted in a 12,000 pound Arcweld creep machine. The standard furnace had been removed and replaced with a specially designed environmental chamber and furnace in order to provide the controlled helium environment.

The test setup for the environmental chamber and furnace is shown schematically in Figure 6. The environmental chamber is a clear quartz tube with stainless steel endcaps. The seals between the pullrods and endcaps and the quartz tube and endcaps were made with O-rings. The helium was introduced into the chamber through the lower endcap after passing through a liquid  $N_2$  cold trap. The helium was released from the chamber through the upper endcap where it was carried to a trap and then to a bubbler which was used to set the back pressure in the system. This back pressure was nominally 15 cm  $H_2O$ . A small tube of desiccant was placed in the purge line between the upper endcap and the bubbler to prevent the back diffusion of water vapor into the chamber. The dryer was inserted in the line after the second run. The water vapor content in the environmental chamber for the first two runs was unknown. Nominal water vapor content in the helium was 8 to 10 ppm but diffusion from the bubbler would have increased the water vapor present. After the tube with the desicant was placed in the line, the water vapor in the system was monitored on the outlet line with a Beckman Trace Moisture Analyzer. For the final seven runs the water vapor present in the system ranged from 8 to 12 ppm. After the second run a gas sample was taken. The results of the analysis of the gas sample showed less than 100 ppm of  $O_2$  and  $N_2$ . Since the preliminary analysis showed no evidence of an air leak, the analyses were not pursued to establish actual levels.

The pullrods and threaded couplings were made of molybdenum and supplied by Solar. The threaded couplings were silicided at Solar; the pullrods were used as-machined. The surfaces of the pullrods were cleaned and polished after each run. Observation of these surfaces during a run provided a ready means of determining whether there were any air leaks into the system. No oxidation was observed on the molybdenum parts in the hot zone of the furnace. An overnight purge, was used prior to starting a run.

Dead weights were used to supply the load through a 20:1 lever arm. Strain measurements were made using dual Gaertner Filer microscopes sighting on platinum wire targets. The wires were wrapped around the gage section of the specimen, 1.52 to 1.78 cm (0.6 to 0.7 inch) apart. The gage length was measured using the traveling microscopes prior to the start of each test. The traveling microscopes can be seen in Figure 7, which is a photograph of the test setup.

Temperature was monitored using a Type S thermocouple wired in the center of the gage section. This thermocouple was used as input to an L and N Electromax III temperature controller which in turn provided control signals to a SCR power controller. A second thermocouple was also wired on the specimen for backup in case the primary thermocouple failed. The furnace was a fourelement tungsten-quartz furnace and each element was rated at 2000W.



1

1

į

Figure 6. Schematic of Stress-Rupture Test Setup



Figure 7. Setup for Stress-Rupture Evaluations on C129Y Alloy

2.3.3 Furnace Oxidation Tests

Static oxidation tests were conducted at two temperatures, 760 and 1093°C, in air. The 760°C furnace was a resistance heated, multiple unit furnace made by Hevi Duty Electric Company. A Lindberg/Hevi Duty globar furnace was used to provide the 1093°C environment. The coated specimens were placed on pieces of clean dynaquartz and were visually inspected at 24-hour intervals, except for weekends, without removal from the furnace. The specimens were allowed to cycle down to room temperature only when gravimetric measurements were to be taken.

## 2.3.4 Burner Rig Oxidation Tests

In order to evaluate further the performance of the NS-4/C129Y system in a dynamic oxidizing environment, environmental simulator or burner rig tests were performed. The rig itself consists of a straight-through, can-type combustor with a double liner mounted vertically such that the combustion gases can be vented to an exhaust stack, as shown in Figure 8. JP-5 fuel was used (MIL-J-5634F) and the sulfur content analyzed was 0.047 percent.

A schematic of the rig system is shown in Figure 9. The objective of this test was to subject the leading edge of the coated turbine vane (mounted on the nozzle plate of the combustor can) to 1316°C for 50 minutes followed by 10 minutes at a cooldown temperature of <816°C. The thermal cycle was achieved through control of the fuel and air supply to the combustor such that a fuel-rich, high temperature stream was produced during the high flow period of 50 minutes and a lean, secondary air diluted and cooler flame was effective for the cooldown period. Two pressure needle valves were installed on the fuel line and, with the aid of a solenoid valve mounted on one arm of the bypass, the fuel flow was controlled to alternate between high flow and low flow conditions. Similarly, a three-way solenoid on the primary air line allowed the air supply to be synchronized to the fuel flow levels. The burner rig was operated in the automatic mode with daily inspections.

Specimen leading edge temperature was read optically using a calibrated pyrometer sighted on the hot spot of the leading edge through a viewing slot out in the specimen shroud, see Figure 10. During testing, it was found that the leading edge temperature can be directly used to control the combustion level by means of a infrared probe containing a set of thermophiles that transmitted the voltage signal to a transducer that was part of the feedback system to the fuel controller. Confirmation of leading edge temperature was made daily by means of a calibrated pyrometer.

One of the major problems encountered in the burner rig test was the mounting of the NS-4 coated single vane segment. The high-velocity gas stream and the geometry of the part were such that the part needed to be secured firmly in place. At the same time, the presence of silicon on the coating surface required that contact areas be non-reactive with silicon. Consequently, all contact surfaces on the mounted specimen were protected by a magnesium zirconia coating applied to the mounting fixture. Two specimen mount systems were tried, and these are shown in Figures 11 and 12. The latter method, which turned out to be the better one, called for welding (EB welding) a piece of FS-85 alloy onto the outboard sidewall of the vane segment which then allowed the entire specimen to be securely fastened down. The combustor nozzle orifice was 2.5 cm in diameter and the leading edge was positioned 3.1 cm above the orifice.



Figure 8. Gas Turbine Environmental Simulator



Figure 9. Schematic of Burner Rig Test

13

. .

T#42 /

;

----



Figure 10. Shroud Fixture With Viewing Slot



Figure 11. Single-Vane Nozzle Located at Exit Nozzle of Combustor Plate - System 1

Typical test parameters for both high and low flow conditions are reported in Table 1. Note that during the 10-minute low-temperature period, the fuel flow was reduced 33 percent while the air was significantly increased, thus raising the air-to-fuel ratio to levels typically found in gas turbines. The products of combustion, as calculated from the total consumption of fuel and air, are listed in Table 2.

## 2.4 DIAGNOSTIC TECHNIQUES

Metallography was employed routinely throughout the program to monitor microstructural changes as a result of exposure to the various test regimes. The main difficulty encountered in preparing metallographic mounts was that the NS-4 coating itself was brittle and polished differently from the C129Y substrate alloy and produced less than satisfactory photomicrographs. For specimens that were to be examined by scanning electron microscopy (SEM), a cerium oxide polishing compound was used instead of chromium oxide. Energy dispersive X-ray analysis (EDX) capabilities were available on the SEM and semi-quantitative and qualitative anayses were utilized when necessary to provide further insight into the phenomena of coating/substrate interaction and coating deposition.



Figure 12. NS-4 Coated C129Y Nozzle Prepared for Burner Rig Testing - System 2

## Table 1

Oxidation	Burner	Rig	Test	Parameters	

	High Temperature	Low Temperature
Air flow Fuel flow Air-to-fuel	3.9 to 4.2 Kg/min. 0.15 to 0.16 Kg/min. 24 to 28	4.8 to 6.3 Kg/min. 0.09 to 0.12 Kg/min. 40 to 70
ratio Specimen leading edge temperature	1316 <u>+</u> 30°C	<816°C
Flame temperature	~1540°C	~860°C
Incoming air temperature	~192 °C	112°C
Mach number	0.87	1.07
Air velocity	690 m/sec.	645 m/sec.

Fuel/	Air/		P	ercent Vol	ume	
Air Ratio	Fuel Ratio	н <sub>2</sub> 0	co <sub>2</sub>	°2	N <sub>2</sub>	Argon
0.040	25 30	8.67 7.44	7.95 6.67	8.18 10.21	74.27 74.75 75.36	0.93
0.025	40 70	3.82	2.91	16.16	76.15	0.95

Combustion Products Calculated From Fuel and Air Consumption

Table 2

0 1.

FRECEDING PAGE BLANK - NOF FILMED

3

PHASE I - CASTING DEVELOPMENT

3.1 CASTING PROCESS DEVELOPMENT

3.1.1 Alloy Selection

Columbium-base alloy C129Y was selected for production of the cast nozzle vanes based upon the mechanical properties of similar parts produced by REM Metals Corp. (Ref. 3). In order for columbium alloy nozzles to be competitive both with superalloy and ceramic parts, high tensile and creep strength is necessary at operating temperatures of 1204° to 1371°C, coupled with adequate room-temperature ductility. Of the four alloys evaluated in casting by REM, C129Y was second only to SU31 in hightemperature strength, significantly above either C103 or Cb752. Table 3 presents typical properties for four columbium-base alloys, together with those of the superalloy presently used for nozzle production, the point being that the columbium-base alloy should equal, at much higher temperatures, the properties of the superalloy at 871° to 927°C. While SU31 demonstrates higher strength at temperature, neither room-temperature nor elevated-temperature ductilities are adequate.

While the above-referenced report indicates some degree of difficulty in casting C129Y alloy, it was decided in conjunction with REM that the advantages of this alloy were worth pursuing. REM felt, initially, that the melting problems could be satisfactorily identified and resolved by variations in the consumable electrode arc melting procedure. Accordingly, 450 pounds (204 kgm) of 4 inch (100 mm) diameter electrode and 50 pounds (23 kgm) of starter stock chips were ordered in C129Y alloy from Wah Chang, Albany, Oregon. Crystal grade hafnium was specified to minimize oxygen and nitrogen content of the composition which was specified as per Wah Chang TWCA-CB-MS-1 (Appendix C).

Analysis of the material supplied indicated it to have much less than the required yttrium content. Analyses are seen in Table 4. This circumstance presumably is due to failure to compensate for evaporation in vacuum melting. (Yttrium content of the C129Y alloy castings previously poured by REM, Ref. 3, was about 0.07%.) It was determined in conference with REM and Wah Chang that remelting the alloy to add yttrium could raise the interstitial levels beyond acceptable levels; and secondly, that the requisite delay in melting and forging of new ingots would seriously jeopardize the conclusion of the program. As such, the decision was made to proceed with the material as

Table 3

Í.

1997

Typical Physical and Mechanical Properties of Columbium and Cobalt Alloys

		Coefficient of Thermal	1	0.2 1 Yield	Percent Tensile 1 Strength (ksi)	Tenst	lle Elongation (4)	Modulus	
Designation	Major Alloying	(Btu/hr/ft²/	Point (•F)	70°F	El evated Temperature	70*F	Elevated Temperature	Elasticity (pei x 10 <sup>6</sup> )	Comments
C103									
Wrought	10H <i>E</i> , 1T1	25.8	4260	86.0	20.0 (2000°F) 10.5 (2500°P)	>30.0	>50.0 (2200°F)	12.6	Highest ductility Most widely used in Cb
Cast				46.0	24.5 (2200°F)	17.8	9.2 (2200°F)	13.1	investment contings
CB752									
Wrought	10%, 2.5Zr	1	4400	85.0	30.0 (2200°F)	I		15.0	Poor weldahility
Cast				56.0	20.0 (2200°F)	8.3	4.5 (2200°F)	15.0	
su-31									
Wrought	17W, 3.5HE	1	5020	77.0	40.0 (2000°F) 38.0 (2200°F) 24.0 (2500°F)	25.0- 28.0	18.0 (2200°F)	18.0- 19.0	Probable susceptibility to embrittlement by interstitial contemination
Cast				75.0	35.0 (2200°F)	1.5	3.5 (2200°F)	18.5	
C129Y									
Wrought	104, 10HF	44.4	4350	102.0	40.0 (2000*P) 20.0 (2500*P)	1	>45.0 (2200*F)	16.0	Good weldability
Cast				66.0	35.0 (2200°F)	7.5	8.5 (2200°F)	16.3	
X-45N									
Cast	10N1, 25Cr, 8W	12.8	2450	64.5	25.0 (1600°F)	0.6	22.0 (1700°F)	29.0	Cobalt-base alloy used in Solar Centaur 1st-stage
									nozzle vane at 1600°F
Note: Ca 1. Mech	mpilation of data from anical Properties of (	m: Columbium Alloy Motoboli muchi	su-31", A.	A. Tavasmoll	, private communicati	lon, KBI.			
B. Produ	iston Casting of Columbium	loy SU-31, Kawee mbtum-Based Alle	actons. cki Berylco sys for Tur	bine Applica	tions", DAAG46~75-C-0	1007, REM Me	talo, 1975.		
5. Solar 6. "Colum	data mbium (Niobium) Alloys	s for Structural	l Applicati	ons", A.A. T	avassoli, SAMPE Journ	11 . Vol. 11	, No. 1, 1975.		

20

1

**.**...

## Table 4

## Chemical Analyses of Electrode Stock

		Pric	or Work ef. 3		Percent	by Weight		
Element	Requirement TWCA-CB-MS-1	Тор	Bottom	Тор	Bottom	Тор	Bottom	
		4		<u>Heat 5721</u>	22	Heat 5721	23	
Нf	9.0-11.0	9.0	8.5	10.7	9.9	10.1	8.8	
w i	9.0-11.0	9.6	9.7	9.9	10.2	10.0	9.6	
Y	0.05-0.3	0.067	0.074	0.0200	0.0200	<0.0050	<0.0200	
С	0.015 max	0.0060	0.0060	0.0110	0.0060	0.0070	0.0070	
н	0.0015 max	<0.0005	<0.0005	0.0006	0.0009	0.0006	0.0005	
N	0.0100 max	0.0040	0.0035	0.0065	0.0072	0.0060	0.0056	
0	0.0225 max	0.0050	0.0050	0.0220	0.0210	0.0100	0.0120	}
Ta	-	-	1 -	0.4390	0.4460	0.4700	0.4365	
Zr	-	-	-	0.4120	0.3490	0.3050	0.2650	
Ср	-	-	-	Balance	Balance	Balance	Balance	
Element	Тор	Bottom	Тор	Bottam	Тор	Bottam	Тор	Bottom
	Heat 572124		Heat 57212	5	Heat 57212	<u>6</u>	Heat 57212	<u>27</u>
Нf	9.7	9.4	9.3	9.5	10.1	9.3	9.9	9.4
w	10.2	10.4	9.8	10.5	9.8	10.3	10.2	10.3
Y	0.0140	0.0230	0.0100	0.0190	0.0270	0.0200	0.0190	0.0220
с	0.0080	0.0090	0.0090	0.0100	0.0080	0.0070	0.0060	0.0075
н	<0.0005	0.0006	0.0025	0.0006	<0.0005	0.0007	<0.0005	0.0014
N	0.0076	0.0084	0.0074	0.0084	0.0094	0.0088	0.0047	0.0053
0	0.0060	0.0110	0.0070	0.0110	0.0140	0.0130	0.0090	0.0080
Та	0.4850	0.4700	0.4270	0.4320	0.3940	0.4350	0.4640	0.4700
Zr	0.2860	0.2920	0.3990	0.3450	0.3840	0.3380	0.3430	0.3220
СЪ	Balance	Balance	Balance	Balance	Balance	Balance	Balance	Balance

supplied and to attempt to add yttrium to the casting melt in elemental form. None of the castings produced in three foundry melts, however, had more than 0.011 percent yttrium, a fact which may have contributed to the observed poor fluidity of the alloy in all three pours.

## 3.1.2 Foundry Practice

REM Metals Corp. was selected as the foundry source of columbium alloy castings for this program. The decision was based mainly upon their greater experience in investment casting of columbium, as demonstrated in prior work (Ref. 3). Purchase orders were let for two sets of specimens to be used, first, in iterative development of casting processes, and second, in production of optimized specimens. The reference nondestructive inspection standard was specified as ASTM-E-155, Grade C, and provision was made for weld repair to this quality level.

REM employs a proprietary tungsten face mold system in production of reactive metal castings, columbium- or titanium-base. Wax patterns are fabricated by injection molding in steel dies and are assembled with gates and risers to form a pattern tree such as seen in Figure 13. This is then coated with a series of



Figure 13. Side and Front Views of Assembled "Tree" of Molds Used in Investment Casting

refractory compound dips, the first of which is a tungsten compound, to form a shell mold. As the mold is fired, the wax melts away leaving a void in the shape of the nozzle and test specimens. The wax patterns and consequently the voids are slightly larger than the final castings, compensating for metal solidification shrinkage and providing material for chemical machining of the surfaces. REM skull melts a consumable columbium electrode, in vacuum, dumping the molten metal directly from the water cooled crucible into the preheated mold. The furnace is seen in Figure 14. The final step of the casting process is to break away the refractory mold material and to saw and snag the gates and risers from the castings. All casting surfaces are chemical machined 2 to 3 mils (0.05 to 0.08 mm) to remove the metal/mold reaction zone, and the castings are then nondestructively inspected by radiography, visual and penetrant methods.


Figure 14. Consumable Electrode Arc Melting and Casting Vacuum Furnace; REM Metals, Albany, Oregon

The wax patterns for this program were ordered from Howmet Corp., LaPorte, Indiana, which is the foundry which currently produces the first-stage nozzle of the Centaur engine in cobalt-base X-45M. The total production included:

- Thirty-six (36) solid, single blade nozzles, Solar P/N 115893
- Thirty-six (36) hollow, single blade nozzles, Solar P/N 115893
- . Forty-five (45) erosion test specimens, Howmet P/N 1807.

Engineering sketches for these castings, and for flat and round tensile specimens, which waxes were supplied by REM, are seen in Figures 15 through 19. The patterns were produced in McCaughin 2P31 wax, this being most compatible with REM's processing. Hollow nozzles are usually produced from patterns comprised of wax injected around a leachable ceramic core. This technique is not compatible with the higher melting and reactive columbium alloys, however, and it was necessary to fabricate a core pull, Figure 20, which could be removed from the center of the blade shape after wax injection, leaving the wax itself hollow.



Figure 15. Flat Tensile Specimen - Pin Hole



Figure 16. Erosion Bar Figure

**\***\*C )



ł

Figure 17. Threaded Tensile Specimen



Figure 18. Hollow Vane Segment



Figure 19. Solid Vane Segment

25



Figure 20.

Steel Core Pull For Investment of Hollow Wax Patterns (Shown Full Size)

3.1.3 Process Development

The initial task of casting development was intended as a three-stage iterative process, optimizing the techniques and parameters of investment casting in columbium alloys. Because of the delays occasioned by alloy procurement, it was decided that this task would proceed only with two iterative steps, each including half again as many specimens. Total requirement of the task was:

- Six (6) solid nozzles
- Six (6) hollow nozzles
- . Twelve (12) round tensile bars
- . Twelve (12) flat tensile bars

The first mold tree was prepared containing six of each of the flat and round tensile bars and the six solid nozzle sections. Three attempts at this first pour were made, spanning a time period of about two months. In the first attempt, the electrode melted at its welded connection to the attachment stub, falling into the crucible. In the second attempt, it was determined that the crucible had been damaged in the first try, and this attempt too was aborted. Subsequently, a series of difficuties ensued with the DC power supply and the vacuum system. The final pour of this series was successfully accomplished and filled five of six solid nozzle shapes and all six round tensile specimens. The flat tensile bars did not fill, nor did the nozzle platforms totally, owing to poor fluidity of the alloy in thin sections. The products of pour No. 1 are seen in Figure 21, together with their radiographs, Figures 22 and 23. As can be seen, all of the nozzles are flawed by what appears to be gas porosity. Three of the five which filled satisfy Class C radiographic requirements. There is no indication of microshrinkage either in the nozzles or platforms, the latter of which did not fill completely. The surface was excessively rough in the radii between the airfoil and platform, due to heat retention in that area. The round tensiles appeared to be free of all defects. Gating was revised for the flat specimens and nozzle platforms. The next pour was comprised of six each hollow nozzles, flat tensiles, and round tensiles. This pour, No. 2, proceeded without the difficulties experienced in the first. Again the flat specimens failed to fill properly, although they were much improved over those of the first pour. None of the hollow vane sections filled



Figure 21. Cast Solid Nozzles of C129Y Alloy, Pour No. 1



Figure 22. Radiograph of Solid Nozzles, Pour No. 1

28

----

. . . . .

. . . .





Figure 23. Radiograph of Round Test Bars, Pour No. 1

sections filled completely, attributable to lack of fluidity of the alloy. The products and radiographs of pour No. 2 are seen in Figures 24 through 27. Again the round tensiles appear to be sound. Subsequent tensile testing, however, disclosed serious gas porosity in at least two.



Figure 24. As-Cast Hollow Vanes, Pour No. 2



Figure 25. As-Cast Flat and Round Test Specimens, Pour No. 2





Ì

2

7#1C ,



.

- -

Ì

Despite a lower melting point than several other cast columbium-base alloys, C129Y appears to require much higher amperage to establish a molten pool in the crucible. Current in excess of 10,000 amps is required for C129Y, in contrast to other alloys which typically melt in the range of 4000-5000 amps. The elements contained in C129Y and in all other castable alloys display similar alloying behavior (in the range of interest), i.e., the formation of continuous solid solutions with columbium. Other castable alloys contain as much or more tungsten and hafnium as C129Y, although not in the same combination. The behavior of yttrium is an exception to that of other elements in the alloy. Its solid solubility is limited to about 0.05 atomic percent and it is a monotectic system at 0.5 atomic percent yttrium. This behavior does not explain the melting difficulties and, even if salient, can be disregarded due to the almost complete lack of yttrium in the Wah Chang supplied material.

In summary, the behavior of C129Y in melting remains unexplained and the poor reliability tends to discourage its near-term use in castings despite excellent ambient and elevated temperature properties.

3.1.4 Casting Properties

Tables 5 and 6 describe the results of REM and Solar mechanical property tests on the two development pours. Chemical analyses are seen in Table 7.

Only Solar conducted elevated-temperature tests of the castings, using an Instron model TTD tensile test machine, as described in Section 2. Both the ambient and elevated temperature results of casting pour No. 1 compare favorably with prior castings produced by REM (Ref. 3), which properties are included for reference in Tables 5 and 6. As noted, only the specimens from pour No. 1 were tested at elevated temperature. Of the two from pour No. 2 intended for elevated-temperature testing, one broke in machining and the second was seen to be seriously flawed by gas porosity, despite acceptable radiographic results.

No flat specimens were produced in pour No. 1; and the flat specimens from pour No. 2 which had been scheduled for mechanical property determination were largely unacceptble for this purpose due to extensive unfilled areas and shrinkage. They were instead sectioned into smaller pieces and used for coating and oxidation studies.

Regarding the round test specimens, a direct correlation is evident between the levels of interstitial element concentration in pours No. 1 and No. 2 and their relative ductility. Pour No. 1 was higher than REM's previous work (Ref. 3) in all interstitial elements but hydrogen. Despite this, the ambient and elevated temperature mechanical properties of Pour No. 1 castings were significantly improved over those of the previous program, suggesting that hydrogen contents, even below specification maximum, have a profound influence on ductility of this alloy. There is a very loose confirmation of this hypothesis in the behavior of Pour No. 2, which far exceeded maximum allowable hydrogen content of the specification and which displayed exceedingly low tensile ductility, both at room temperature and 2000°F. It should be noted that carbon, nitrogen, and oxygen contents of this pour were all marginal or slightly over allowable limits, as well.

ł

	Temperature (°F)	Strain Rate (in./in./min.)	Offset (%)	Ultimate Tensile Strength (ksi)	Yield Strength (ksi)	Reduction in Area (%)	Elongation (%)	
Solar	70	0.005(1)	0.2 0.6	96.9	80.1 83.6	18.8	19.7	
Solar	70	0.005(1)	0.2 0.6	96.1	77.8 81.7	25.7	23.6	
Solar	2000	0.003(2)	0.2	48.5	48.2	52.7	22.5	
Solar	2000	0.003(2)	0.2	45.6	44.6	43.3	20.4	
REM	RT	N.S.	0.2	98.3	76.8	36.4	24.0	
Ref	RT	N.S.	0.2	82.7	65.6	11.0	10.5	
Ref	2200	N.S.	0.2	37.3	28.3	9.0	8.5	
(1) Aft	er 0.6 percer	nt offset, 0.050	in./in./mi	n to failure	3			
(2) Calculated from crosshead speed of 0.050 in./in./min and Young's modulus of 15.7 x 10 <sup>6</sup> at room temperature								

# Tensile Properties of Cast C129Y Specimens (Pour No. 1)

N.S. = Not Specified

## Table 6

# Tensile Properties of Cast C129Y Specimens (Pour No. 2)

	Temperature (°F)	Strain Rate (in./in./min.)	Offset (%)	Ultimate Tensile Strength (ksi)	Yield Strength (ksi)	Reduction in Area (%)	Elongation (%)
Solar	70	0.005(1)	0.2 0.6	91.0	81.5 85.2	3.1	4.2
Solar	70	0,005(1)	0.2 0.6	81.8	79.1 Broke be	0.75 fore 0.6%	1.3
Solar	2000	Broken in ma	chining				
Solar	2000	Ecessive po	rosity				
RIM	RT	N.S.	0.2	85.1	79.9	2.0	2.5
Ref	RŤ	N.S.	0.2	82.7	65.6	11.0	10.5
Baf	2200	N.S.	0.2	37.3	28.3	9.0	8.5

### Chemical Analyses of Casting Pours

		Percent by Weight				
Element	Requirement TWCA-CB-MS-1*	Pour No. 1 REM Analysis	Pour No. 2 REM Analysis	Prior Work (Ref. 3)		
w	9.0-11.0	9.9	10.4	Not reported		
Нf	9.0-11.0	9.7	11.9	11 11		
Y	0.05-0.3	0.011	0.0100	0 H		
с	0.015 max.	0.0060	0.0200	0.0040		
н	0.0015 max.	0.0005	0.0042	0.0013		
N	0.0100 max.	0.0080	0.0100	0.0038		
о	0.0225 max.	0.0240	0.0250	0.0110		
Zr	0.5000 max.	0.3790	0.3040	Not reported		
Та	0.5000 max.	Not reported	Not reported	et 13		

The addition of elemental yttrium to the foundry melt obviously did little to correct the alloying of the C129Y. The maximum percentage recorded (in Pour No. 1) is only about one-fifth of the minimum required by the material specification. A final yttrium content was not reported for the previous work, but it is noted that the analysis of the consumable electrode used for that melt was 2-1/2 to 15 times that of the present program, Table 4. The effect of yttrium dilution in the alloy is not noted in comparison of the tensile results of the two programs. The probable rationale for yttrium addition is as a scavenger for oxygen and a grain refiner. Lack of scavenging action may have had an adverse effect on the fluidity of the molten alloy, although evidence is scant either way.

### 3.2 PRODUCTION OF OPTIMIZED TEST SPECIMENS

## 3.2.1 Casting Production

On the basis of Task I iterative pours, it became apparent that thin-wall sections, e.g., flat test bars and hollow nozzle vanes, cannot be cast in C129Y alloy. A series of gates to the unfilled areas of the vanes might solve the filling difficulties, but the cast part would be far from net shape and would require extensive finishing of the airfoils to smooth the surface.

ł

Since one goal of the program was to produce precision C129Y nozzle vane castings to near-net shape, the re-gating of the hollow vane nozzles was discarded and a decision made to proceed with the solid vane configuration only. This decision also obviated the need for flat tensile bars since their function was to evaluate the mechanical, metallurgical, and coating interaction properties of the thin wall hollow vanes.

Subsequent to this decision, REM proceeded with the preparation of mold trees to include:

- . Thirty (30) thermal fatigue specimens (30° angle)
- . Sixteen (16) solid vane nozzles
- . Forty-eight (48) round test specimens.

The first pour of this series was accomplished without incident (except for the "unusually high" amperage required to effect melting) and resulted in filling 22 of the 24 round test specimens in one mold tree, Figure 28.

A second pour attempt was aborted due to the arc inadvertently penetrating the copper liner of the crucible. Two welding repair sequences were conducted to repair the damage but the pour was not completed.

Subsequently, the unavailability of a qualified vacuum casting operator forced a decision between REM, Solar and AMMRC to reduce the program scope to ensure that the coating and testing phases could be completed within a reasonable time frame. Accordingly, a revised program plan was developed and testing proceeded with the cast materials on hand:

- . Five (5) solid vane nozzles Task I, Pour 1
- . Six (6) hollow vane nozzles Task I, Pour 2
- . Four (4) flat tensile specimens Task I, Pour No. 2
- . Twenty-two (22) round test bars Task II, Pour No. 3.

3.2.2 Casting Properties

## Chemical Analysis

Table 8 shows the analysis of pour No. 3, comprised of 22 round test bars. Again it is evident that addition of elemental yttrium did nothing to alloy the castings. The level of yttrium in these castings, 0.006 weight percent, is even less than that of the electrodes from which they were made.

Carbon and nitrogen levels of pour No. 3 are somewhat higher than those of the first two pours; the latter exceeding specification limits. Hydrogen, similarly, increased beyond the maximum limit, being four times that of pours No. 1 and 2;



Figure 28. Cast Round Test Bars of C129Y Alloy

		Percent by Weight					
Element	Requirement TWCA-CB-MS-1*	Pour No. 3 Koon-Hall Analysis	Prior Work (Ref. 3)				
w	9.0-11.0	9.7	Not reported				
Hf	9.0-11.0	9.5	•• ••				
Y	0.05-0.3	0.0060	н и				
с	0.015 max.	0.0080	0.0040				
Н	0.0015 max.	0.0021	0.0013				
N	0.0100 max.	0.0130	0.0138				
о	0.0225 max.	0.1330	0.0110				
Zr	0.5000 max.	0.3960	Not reported				
Та	0.5000 max.	0.4000	<b>H</b> 11				
* Electrode specification							

## Chemical Analyses of Casting Pours (Percent by Weight)

and oxygen increased to almost six times the allowable limit. The preponderance of hydrogen and oxygen in the analysis may indicate an air or water vapor leak in the vacuum system; however, the melting data shown in Table 9 do not suggest any anomolies.

# Nondestructive Inspection

Radiographic inspection of pours indicated most specimens to be internally sound. A reproduction of this film is seen in Figure 29. Exceptions were:

Number						
9	Gas	porosity,	Grade	А,	ASTME	155
10	н	4	**	в,	**	**
11		**	**	c,		18
13	Crac	:k				
15	Gas	porosity,	Grade	в,	4	
17	80	11	88	c,		
19	**	P9		c,	**	n
20	н	**	*	в,	н	

ì

## Vacuum Furnace Data Sheet

	D	David No. 3	Drawn March
	Pour No. 1	Pour No. 2	Pour so. 3
Date:	5/13/77	7/22/77	12 /9 / 77
Mold:	6 solid nozzle 6 round tensile 6 flat tensile	6 hollow nozzle 6 round tensile 4 flat tensile	24 round tensile
El e strue de			
Electrode:		4 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1 6 - h
Size	3 inch round	4 inch round	4 inch round
Weight: Before	64.5 1bs	78 1bs	/3 1bs
After	32.5 lbs	38 lbs	N.R.
Skull	old	ola	
Weight: Before	23 lbs	26 lbs	21.4 Ibs
After	26.5 1bs	21 lbs	33 lhs
Pot Size (Ti)	50 lbs	50 1bs	50 1bs
_			
Base	5 lbs chips	None	1.5 LDS Chips
Mald Dailte Ta	ND	ND	19 1bc
Mold Weight: In	N.R.	N•K•	19 105
Out	67 IDS	N • K •	47.5 IDS
Vacuum at start	12 microns	13 microns	10 microns
Vacuum rise, melting	180 microns	90 microns	115 microns
Furnace leak rate, Hot:			
(Vac. rise) Start	11 microns	10 microns	4 microns
1st min	18 microns	26 microns	18 microns
2nd min	25 microns	36 microns	22 microns
Arc voltage, max	34	35.5	39-40
Amps, start	4000	4000	4000
Amps, max	13,000	13,000	10,500-11,000
Melt time	10 min	N.R.	10.6 min
Pour speed	70%	70%	80%
Pour time	3.2 sec	3.1 sec	2.8 sec
		05045	100007
Mold temperature	N • K •	900 °F	1000-2

Penetrant inspection revealed two pieces with one or two cracks initiating from the ends of center gates (on the gage length) which were scrapped. The balance of the pieces showed occasional shallow indications which, REM indicated, were typical of columbium alloy castings.

# 



Figure 29. Radiograph of Round Test Bars

Mechanical Properties

Results of tensile and stress rupture testing of castings are presented and discussed here. For additional mechanical property data on coated castings, reference should be made to sections 4.3.1 and 4.3.2.

Tensile Testing. Tensile testing of cast specimens were performed at room temperature, 1093°C (2000°F) and 1204°C (2200°F). Results are reported in Table 10. Due to the scarcity of available test pieces, only a limited number of tests were run. Room temperature results were inconclusive since specimen No. 11 was badly flawed by gas porosity (see Sec. 3.2.2) probably explaining its lack of ductility and failure to reach 0.2 percent offset yield strength. This was the only as-cast specimen tested at ambient temperature and it is not possible to determine what effect the high level of interstitials had

1

\*## A ...

Specimen Number		Temperature		Ultim. Tensile	Ultimate Tensile Strength		Yield Strength		
	Coating	(°F)	(°C)	(ksi)	(MPa)	(ksi)	(MPa)	(%)	(%)
11	No	77	25	81.0	558	-	-	0.6	-
18	No*	74	23	78.7	542	77.2	532	0.2	1.4
15	No	2000	1093	47.6	328	39.7	274	45.0	27.9
12	No	2200	1204	40.5	279	33.1	228	22.6	18.5
14	No	2200	1204	41.2	284	33.4	230	7.4	22.2

### Tensile Test Data of C129Y Cast Specimens

on mechanical properties. The relatively poor ductility of specimen 18, which was submitted to the coating heat cycle treatment but not actually coated, is not explained by radiographs or penetrant inspection results. Metallographic examination of the broken specimen indicates an extremely brittle, nondeformed fracture path with extensive secondary cracking in many areas of the specimen, including the non-reduced diameter. Figure 30 is a typical example. Also noted was one area of shrinkage porosity in the gage length which was exposed to the surface by machining, Figure 31. Peculiarly, no fracture was noted to have extended from this defect. The extensive surface cracking observed in this sample suggests that premature failure and low ductility may have been the result of defects generated in the simulated coating cycle and/or machining of the specimen.

Figure 32 is a graph based upon the averages of data in Table 10 and (Table 21 in Section 4.3.1) and upon manufacturer's literature for X-45M cobalt-base alloy showing an approximate comparison of their tensile and yield strengths. C129Y columbium alloy demonstrates at 2000 and 2200°F tensile strength ductility equivalent to the 1600°F properties of the cobalt-base X-45M from which the Solar Centaur first-stage nozzle is presently cast. Room temperature ductility of C129Y, pour No. 3, is suspect but was demonstrated in pour No. 1 (Table 5) to be the equal of the cobalt-base alloy.

Stress Rupture Testing. Stress rupture life of as-cast C129Y specimens are given in Table 11. The poor showing of specimem No. 5 (uncoated) at 1093°C (2000°F) is explained, correctly, by SoRI as atmospheric contamination of the test chamber. Specimen No. 1, which was tested immediately prior to No. 5, can similarly be explained in terms of contamination. The fracture surface was seen to be covered with a white, fibrous residue, Figure 33, which in energy dispersive X-ray analysis proved to be oxides of columbium, hafnium and tungsten. The spectrum, seen in Figure 34, also shows traces of iron, silver and aluminum which are explained as extraneous indications from the scanning electron



Figure 30.

Brittle Secondary Cracking in Tensile Sample No. 18

Hf-HNO<sup>3</sup> Etch

Magnification: 250X



Figure 31.

Shrinkage Porosity n Tensile Sample No. 18

Hf-HNO3 Etch

Magnification: 250X

microscope used in the analysis. The fibrous residue became highly charged during the analysis, typical of oxide behavior, and the relative absence of other elements in the specimen suggests that contamination of the test chamber is responsible for the reduced ductility and strength of this specimen. At 2200°F the premature fracture of specimen No. 13 is explained by a radiographic anomoly, appearing to be a crack or possibly a cold shut.

In general, the material displays significantly better creep resistance at 2200°F than was noted by prior investigators (Refs. 3, 8). Creep-rupture strength demonstrated for the test specimens at 2200°F was, at 20 ksi, 10 to 100 hours greater than comparable tests of FS-85, Cb752 or C129Y alloys in the wrought condition. Only alloy SU-31 exceeded the time to rupture of the present cast C129Y test results.



Figure 32. Tensile, Ultimate and 0.2 Percent Yield Strengths of C129Y and X-45M Alloys at Ambient and Elevated Temperature

Table	1	1
-------	---	---

Specimen Number	Test Temperature °C (°F)	Test Stress MPa (ksi)	Total Hours to Failure
1	1093 (2000)	103 (15) to 138 (20)	~35.0
5	1093 (2000)	103 (15)	~15.0
13	1204 (2200)	138 (20)	35.3
22	1204 (2200)	138 (20)	60.0

Stress-Rupture Life of C129Y Castings

The cast C129Y test bars demonstrate significantly higher rupture strength than does X-45M cobalt-base superalloy from which the nozzles are presently fabricated. This superalloy has a 100-hour rupture limit of about 13,000 psi at 1600°F. Figure 35 presents relative Larson-Miller plots of stress-rupture life based upon these limited data showing the significant temperature increase available



Figure 33.

Scanning Electron Micrograph of Residue on Fracture Surface and Gage Length of Stress-Rupture Specimen No. 1

----

.

.. .. . ..

----

----

Magnification: 24X



Figure 34. Energy Dispersive X-ray Analysis Spectrum of White Residue on Stress-Rupture Specimen No. 1

44

\_

· · - ---

- -



Figure 35. Larson-Miller Plots of Stress-Rupture Life

with coated C129Y. The upper data point (2000°F) represents run No. 4 of specimen No. 2, 26.1 hours at 27,500 psi, and actually should be farther to the right as the specimen has already sustained over 150 hours at lower stresses. The lower data point (2200°F) is an average of all five 2200°F runs. Alloy X-45M data points are from the manufacturers' literature.

Producers' literature for C129Y wrought alloy indicates a 10-hour rupture life at 15,000 psi and 2000°F. The properties developed in stress-rupture testing of casting pour No. 3 exceed this value by wide margins. Figure 36, extrapolated slightly, shows the value to be closer to 30,000 psi stress for 10-hour life at 2000°F.

In summary, creep-rupture properties of C129Y specimens cast in pour No. 3 of this program are significantly higher than those of the previous cast columbium alloy work (Ref. 3); higher than those of wrought columbium alloys, except SU-31, tested by KBI (Ref. 8); and superior to published data for X-45M cobalt-base alloy castings, comparing the alloys at 2000-2200 F versus 1600 F, which strength advantage was a minor goal of this program.



Figure 36. Weight Change Versus Time of Oxidation Specimens

## PHASE II - COATING AND TESTING OF COMPONENTS

Phase II of the program was concerned with process development and process optimization for coating application to the relatively complex shapes of solid and cored airfoils and evaluation of coating/substrate interaction by various mechanical property and environmental tests. This phase was divided into three tasks, as follows:

Task I - Optimization of Coating Application
Task II - Coating of Components
Task III - Property Evaluation

All Phase II activity was completed in the early months of the program. As casting difficulties developed in Phase I and program scope changes were initiated to allow for the reduced number of cast specimens available from the casting subcontractor, Tasks II and III were also modified. With hollow nozzle vanes eliminated from the program, the need for processing both internal and external surfaces of hollow vanes was also eliminated. However, process optimization will be discussed in full in this section even though all program specimens were coated using the conventional slurry spray technique.

4.1 TASK I - OPTIMIZATION OF COATING APPLICATION

The reaction sintered concept as applied to the NS-4 coating consists of three major steps:

- 1. Application of modifier bisque to prepared surface  $(50W-20Mo-15VH_2-15TiH_2)$  typically in order of 50-125 m.
- 2. Vacuum sintering of modifier at  $<10^{-4}$  Torr at 1516°C (2760°F) for three hours.
- Pack siliciding of sintered modifier to form disilicides (W, Mo)Si<sub>2</sub> at 1149°C (2100°F) for eight hours.

The standard procedure for application of modifier is by slurry spraying which has proved to be excellent for imparting momentum to the modifier particles, thus producing a dense, well packed bisque. During the vacuum sintering step, much of the vanadium and titanium are volatilized, leaving behind sufficient amounts to lower glass softening temperature at 538-816°C. The final

siliciding step results in approximately 150 percent volume growth as the refractory elements are converted to the disilicide form, thus creating a reserve of silicides to replenish surface oxides which are, in effect, the true oxidation barrier.

The hollow cast and columbium coated nozzle vane configuration was originally conceived of having the advantages of both high-temperature durability and increased thrust-to-weight ratio. However, this implies that the particular coating must be applied to all internal and external surfaces. The approach taken in this program was to use the slurry dip technique for the internal surfaces followed by standard spray techniques for the external airfoil. While dipping is by no means a new process, it is very much dependent on the process variables which vary with configuration. The following investigation is presented under the following process variables:

- Specimen configuration
- Dip application apparatus
- . Slurry dip coating slip formulation
- Slurry dip coating slip characterization
- Specimen orientation during dripping
- . Rate of withdrawal
- Dip/spray overlap
- . Multiple dipping
- . Sintering and siliciding.

4.1.1 Specimen Configuration

Due to the high cost and exceedingly long lead time involved in procurement of columbium alloy castings, process optimization and development was conducted utilizing specimens fabricated from either 310 stainless steel or columbium metal. Several configurations were used, each increasing in degree of geometrical complexity in order to study different aspects of the dipping process. Stainless specimens were used primarily for dipping only, while columbium specimens were used for full process treatment, sintering and siliciding.

Initially, coupons such as shown in Figure 37 were cut from sheet metal of both stainless steel and recrystallized columbium as the fundamental and simplest form. A second specimen configuration was fabricated stainless steel tubing and rolled and welded columbium, see Figure 38, with the wall thickness approximating that typically found in cooled airfoils. The radius was chosen to simulate the internal radius at th trailing edge. The next level in specimen configuration is shown in Figure 39 which was fabricated from columbium sheet



Figure 37.

Columbium Metal Coupon Specimen



0.76 mm Internal Radius Figure 38. Coating Development Specimen



41.

Figure 39.

Simulated Airfoil Specimen Fabricated From Columbium Metal

metal formed and cold worked around a dye made in the shape of the core of an airfoil. By fitting two flanges over the ends of the airfoil, as shown in Figure 39, the specimen was made to closely resemble the actual vane segment. Each of the above specimen configurations was utilized for a specific purpose and for establishing empirical values between critical parameters involved in the slurry dip process.

## 4.1.2 Dip Application Apparatus

The apparatus used for dip application studies is shown in Figure 40. The setup consisted of a Bodine Electric motor and a Minarek speed control box, both of which were rigged and calibrated such that the rate at which a specimen was withdrawn from a slurry dip was readily controlled. Figure 41 shows a similar arrangement with the addition of an ultrasonic bath to aid in agitation of the slip during withdrawal. Various alligator clips and clamps were used to fasten the specimens. Clamp marks were subsequently repaired by hand.

### 4.1.3 Slurry Dip Coating Slip Formation

The composition of the slurry dip used in this dipping study was 50W-20Mo-30Ti. The vanadium had been deliberately left out due to its high cost factor. Therefore, this experimental slip was designated NS-4X.

Five batches of powder were prepared by milling the appropriate quantities of <44  $\mu$ m tungsten, molybdenum and TiH<sub>2</sub> into a ball mill for different lengths of time. The first batch was milled for 24 hours in an E-4 vehicle (ethyl cellulose binder in xylene) and subsequent batches have either xylene or cellulose vehicles only, which were more readily removed by drying than E-4. The characteristics of batches 2 to 5 are shown in Table 12.

The specific gravities of the powder mixture were verified using the measured densities of the constituents given in Table 13. The calculated value of the NS-4X composition is 7.88 g/ml. This value was quite close to the measured values reported in Table 11 and the small differences noted were probably due to entrapped air bubbles in the powder during measurement.

In Reference 6 the particle size of the powders was maintained at <3  $\mu$ m and it was believed that small particle sizes improve the suspension characteristics and thereby the quality of the coating. The particle size versus milling time of batches 2 to 5 are plotted in Figure 42. It can be seen that milling times of 40 hours or more are required to produce particles with an average size of <3  $\mu$ m. However, it was found that with batches 3 and 4, i.e., particle size <3  $\mu$ m, the bisques obtained were unacceptable due to streaking on the flat surfaces of the coupon specimen. From a visual aspect, batches 1, 2 and 5 were satisfactory. For all subsequent work, a milling time of 24 hours was employed.

Reference 6 reported that the NS-4 coating slip was milled in E-4 followed by drying and suspension of the fine powders in equal portions of acetone and Rohm and Hass acryloid B-7. This process was reproduced here and, using flattened stainless steel tubing specimens, a number of specimens were dip coated. The results are given in Table 14. (The effects of withdrawal rates will be discussed in a later paragraph.) Bisque thicknesses varied from 0.03 mm to as high as 0.20 mm. The major drawback to the use of this vehicle system was the fact that the bisque could not be readily duplicated because of the significant loss of acetone through evaporation, thus in effect, the specific gravity of the slip was slowly changing even as the specimens were drawn up.



Figure 40. Test Setup for Dip Application of Development Coating

Furthermore, the rapid drying of the slip prevented the formation of usually acceptable coatings as the bisque tended to "cake" and form agglomerates as the acetone vaporized. Since the surface tension of a liquid is a factor in determining the degree of wetting, the addition of petroleum ether, a liquid of lower surface tension than acetone, to the slip was investigated. Once again, the high vapor pressure of this solvent resulted in less than satisfactory bisques due to premature drying. The high evaporation rates of acetone and petroleum ether were somewhat minimized by conducting the dipping operation in an equilibrium vapor over a pool of the solvent. While additions of surface active compounds such as petroleum ether did not alleviate the non-uniform coating problem, the use of a pool of acetone surrounding the dipping operation has led to a more uniform, albiet thinner, coating.



Figure 41. Test Setup for Dip Application With Ultrasonic Path

One other investigation in slip solvent was conducted using only ethylene dichloride to make the slip. When this was ultrasonically agitated, stratification of the slip occurred and therefore efforts to employ a one solvent slip was abandoned.

The above work indicated the need for a more suitable vehicle and this was realized in Cellosolve, a glycol ether commercially available from Union Carbide. The viscosity of the vehicle is 2.1 cps at 20°C and combined with Romn and Hass Acryloid B-7, the bisque produced was very satisfactory and reproducible. The good suspension characteristics of this slip is probably due to the fact that the structured cellulose can hydrogen bond to the surface of the metallic particles to form micellar species that remain in suspension. In addition, the higher boiling point (136°C) minimized evaporation and handling problems. The cellosolve and acryloid slip was selected for further investigation of dipping parameters.

Batch Number	Mill Time (Hours)	Specific Gravity 25°C (Note 1)	Fraction Less Than 10 um (Note 2 - %)	Average Particle Size (Lm) (Note 3)		
2	30	7.86	28	3.85		
3	45	7.85	49	2.69		
4	45		62	2.12		
5	23	7.84	55	4.1		
Notes: 1. Measured by a pycnometric method employing condensed xylene as the pycnometric fluid. 2. This fraction was measured by noting the weight percent of material passing a 10 µm screen.						

Characteristics of Development Coating Batches

# Table 13

Density of Developmental Coating Constituents

Constituent	Literature <sup>1</sup>	Measured (25°C)				
Tungsten	19.35 (20°C)	18.79				
Molybdenum	10.2	9.97				
Titanium Hydride	3.9 (92°C)	3.74				
Xylene <sup>2</sup>	0.8642 (20°C)	0.8597				
Notes: 1. Handbook of Chemistry and Physics, Robert C. Weast ed., CRC, Cleveland, OH 56 ed. (1975). 2. Pycnometric Fluid.						

TR#12 2



Figure 42. Average Particle Size Versus Milling Time

Conditions and Results of Dip Application of Development Coating

				Coating Thickness				
Specimen Number	Withdrawal Rate (mm/min.)	Weight of Coating Applied (gms)	Ultrasonic Stirring of Slip	Inside Flat mm	Bottom Edge mm	Inside Radius mm		
2	3.3	1.05	No	0.041-0.061	0.061-0.20	0.20		
3	6.6	0.75	Yes	0.030-0.051	0.10-0.14	0.10		
5	3.3	1.06	Yes	0.051	0.071-0.12	0.11		
6	2.5	0.82	Yes	0.051-0.10	0.051-0.061	0.15		
Note 1. Slip mixture 445 gm of Batch No. 2 of developmental coating suspended in 50 ml of acetone and 50 mls of B-7 acryloid, Specific gravity 3.31.								
2.	Specimens us	ed are flat	tened SS tub	ing as shown	in Figure 31			

### 4.1.4 Slurry Dip Coating Slip Characterization

Slip characterization was established to monitor that we include mposition as a result of solvent evaporation and unequivocal losses to core drying or taking of powder in handling. The following techniques were investigated:

- Specific gravity
- . Deposition on standard specimens under specified conditions
- . Rotational viscometry
- . Settling or 'set' property.

The latter two techniques were dismissed as unsuitable for the following reasons.

Rotational viscometry is commonly employed to measure viscosities of enamel slips and has the advantage of making the measurements at consistent rates of shear and can be adapted to estimate such properties as thixotropy and dilatancy. The operating principle is based on the fact that an object rotated a given speed develops a torque which is directy proportional to the viscosity of the fluid in which it is immersed. However, the setting tendency of the coating slip was such that significant error resulted from the change in viscosities in the time required to take a reading due to settling of the metal powder which was not compensated for by the rotational agitation of the spindle.

Another method of monitoring the slip is to allow a standard aliquot of sample to stand undisturbed for a fixed period of time during which particle size, range and solvent viscosity determines the rate at which the particles can move to the bottom and settle out. The amount of clear solvent formed at the top in the fixed period of time was used as an indication of composition. In the case of the NS-4X modifier slip (acryloid/cellosolve), the time required for this phenomenon to occur was prohibitively long, in the order of hours, and thus render this method impractical.

The two methods chosen for characterization of slip were specific gravity (pycnometry) and the use of a stainless steel flattened tubing specimens (see Fig. 38) dip coated under specified conditions. The reproducibility of the two methods are noted below and both were used when needed to monitor and maintain the desired slip characteristics.

Method	<u>Trial 1</u>	<u>Trial 2</u>	Average	
Specific gravity	3.67 g/ml	3.66 g/ml	3.67 g/ml	
Coating weight	0.70 g	0.74 g	0.72 g	
(Withdrawal rate =	3.81 mm/min.)			

## 4.1.5 Specimen Orientation During Dipping

A problem encountered during dipping studies was that of beading, i.e., the excessive buildup of bisque at that part of the specimen which was withdrawn last from the slip. This buildup caused major spalling at the edges where it was often found. Fortunately, this can be minimized by orienting the specimen such that the last part of the specimen to leave the slip was a point or tip of an edge and the beading effect was confined to a smaller area which was sub=sequently repaired by hand. The flattened tubing configuration was successfully coated with an orientation angle of about 30 degrees from the normal.

On withdrawal of a specimen from the slip, a flow field is established within the non-Newtonian fluid around the object. This flow field is dependent on the configuration of the object and controls to varying degrees the slip drainage. The presence of flanges, a relatively large surface area on the plane perpendicular to the direction of withdrawal, was found to result in increased deposition on the internal surfaces of the simulated airfoil specimens. A reasonable explanation was that as the flanged specimen was moved upward in the slip, the area immediately below the flange area underwent pressure reduction. The net effect of this was to cause adjustments of the flow field such that the slip drained down the inside of the airfoil at a rate greater than expected with the rate of withdrawal. This was compensated for by adjusting the withdrawal rate to achieve the desired bisque thickness.

#### 4.1.6 Rate of Withdrawal

A sixth development batch of NS-4X was prepared by milling in xylene for 24 hours followed by removal of xylene and adding acryloid/cellosolve to a specific gravity of 3.44 g/ml. Using this slip, and the flattened stainless steel tubing specimens, the correlation between withdrawal rate and internal bisque weight was obtained. The results are shown in Table 15 and plotted in Figure 43. The internal weight was determined by carefully removing the bisque from the outer surfaces. From Figure 44, it can be seen that there appears to be an almost linear relationship between bisque weight and withdrawal rate. Once established for the particular specimen configuration, this proportionality can serve as the basis for selection of optimum withdrawal conditions for dipping application.

Another experiment monitored the bisque weight deposited on both external and internal surfaces of the airfoil specimen. The results, Table 16 and Figure 44, show that bisque deposition on any surface appears to be primarily a function of withdrawal.

Number	Rate (mm/min)	Internal Weight (g)
6A	6.2	0.35
2	8.2	0.30
1	12.4	0.34
6	17.3	0.48
3	22.6	0.48
-4	29.5	0.61
7	46.2	0.83
5	59.2	0.88

Weight of Internal Coating Versus Rate of Withdrawal



Figure 43. Correlation of Coating Weight Deposited on Simulated Airfoil and Withdrawal Rate

57

£

Table	16
-------	----

Withdrawal Rate (mm/min.)	A Total Wt. (g)	B Int. Wt. (g)	C Ext. Wt. (g)	D Total Wt. (g)
3.81	0.644	0.276	0,368	0.520
4.70	0.764	0.319	0.445	
6.22				0.630
9.65	1.040	0.447	0.593	0.859
12.45	1.342	0.576	0.956	1.043

Correlation of Weight of Coating and Rate of Withdrawal



Figure 44. Weight of Coating Versus Rate of Withdrawal

ł
#### 4.1.7 Dip/Spray Overlap

An important aspect of this study was to evaluate the overlap at the rim of the hollow airfoil where the dipped bisque overlaps the spray bisque. The goal was to achieve a uniform, well feathered and continuous coating at the overlap region. By careful manipulation and orientation of both dipping and spraying processes this was achieved, as illustrated in Figure 45.



Figure 45. Dip/Spray Interface Magnification: 250X

#### 4.1.8 Multiple Dipping

Another approach to bisque application control is the multiple dip coating. This was demonstrated using two recrystallized columbium speciens which were first dipped and withdrawn at 3.81 mm/min and 12.45 mm/min. They were then sintered at 1516°F for three hours, cooled to room temperature and dipped again under identical conditions. The weight gains are reported in Table 17. Note that the second dipping operation essentially deposited equivalent amounts of bisque on the part. The microstructure of the specimen withdrawn at 3.80 mm/min after dip/sinter/dip operation is shown in Figure 46. There appeared to be some diffusion across the substrate/coating boundary (light gray) and no discernible demarcation was noted between the two coats. Therefore, this represented an alternative, albiet more time consuming, route to achieving desired coating thickness.

# Table 17

Developmental Coating Thickness With Two Dip Applications

Rate (mm/min.)	1st Coat (mm)	2nd Coat (mm)	Total (mm)
3.80	0.030	0.051	0.081
12.45	0.0609	0.069	0.129



Figure 46.

Microstructure of Dipped/ Sintered/Dipped Specimen

Magnification: 250X

#### 4.1.9 Sintering and Siliciding

A seventh powder batch was prepared using the correct composition for NS-4. The characteristics of this mill are reported in Table 18. An acryloid/ cellusolve slip was prepared and a total of 16 specimens were coated.

A deviation from previous experimental dip studies was the elimination of ultrasonic agitation during dipping. It was established by X-ray fluorescent analysis of dipped bisques that due to the disparity of atomic weights of titanium, vanadium, molybdenum and tungsten, stratification within the ultrasonically agitated slurry occurred during dipping, thus resulting in low molybdenum and tungsten levels in the coating bisque. Consequently, instead of ultrasonic agitation, the slip was thoroughly stirred between each dip application to ensure homogeneity.

#### Table 18

## Weights of NS-4 Coated Specimens

		A Averade		Weight (mg/cm <sup>2</sup>	B Averade Weight Gain After Silicitics Imgrameth		
	Number	Weight - As-Coated (mg.cm <sup>2</sup> )	As- Dipped	As- Sintered <sup>(3)</sup>	As- Silicided <sup>(4)</sup>	Experimental	Jalouta*e:
LS 1.5 <sup>(1)</sup>	1A 1B 17 10/ 1E	52.0	45.85 53.44 47.40 54.32 54.68	47.78 42.17 48.66 48.85	- 71.38 79.86 80.31	30.0	- - 285.8
L'S 2.0 <sup>(2)</sup>	2A 2B 23 20 2E	28.0	27.22 16.15 28.86 25.61 29.18	13.35 24.53 21.71 24.70	- 47,53 43,74 47,61	23.0	- - 12.0
E4 Vehicle	3A 3B 3c*	46.0	47.62 45.52 43.93	42.92 40.88 39.06	71.68 68.88 66.62	28.0	23.0
Acryloid/Cello- solve Vohicle	4A 4B 4C	32.0	34.61 33.59 28.92	29.84 28.93 24.87	54.49 53.08 47.74	24.0	15.0
Notes:	1. Ra 2. Ra 3. 15 4. 11	te of withdraw te of withdraw 16°C, 3 hours. 49°C, 8 hours.	al = 0.96 mm al = 29.5 mm	√min. √min.	L	<u> </u>	·

In Table 18, two liquid-to-solid (L/S) ratios were studied, 1.5 and 2.0, and the rates of withdrawal for each dip slurry were 0.96 and 29.5 mm/min, respectively. Baseline specimens were prepared by spraying NS-4 with both E4 and acryloid/cellusolve vehicles. Figure 47 shows the microstructures of the 1.5 L/S slip, No. 1A, 1B and 1C. The as-dipped bisque No. 1A appeared to be very porous; this is in fact an artifact resulting from handling of the soft, unfired bisque. The polishing process pulled out the unsintered particles from the bisque which was only held together by a cold epoxy compound. After sintering, the specimen showed good bonding to the substrate a though porosity was still a distinguishing feature. Specimen No. 1C, having undergone both sintering and siliciding, showed a wide interface which contained some silicon. Note the cracks in the coating induced by thermal mismatch.

Figure 48 is a plot of the as-dipped bisque weight versus weight due to silicon pickup. Note that while both calculated and experimental curves appear to be almost linear, there is significant displacement indicating that not only is silicon consumed to form disilicides with the coating elements, but some silicon penetration probably occurred in the columbium substrate itself.



As-Dipped - No. 1A Magnification: 250X



As-Sintered - No. 1B Magnification: 250X



As-Silicided - No. 1C Magnification: 250X

Figure 47. Microstructures of NS-4 Coating Formation



Figure 48. NS-4 Bisque Weight Versus Silicon Pickup Weight

Figure 49 shows the sprayed NS-4 coating using the two vehicle systems. The E-4 bisque exhibited lower porosity than the acryloid/cellusolve system.

4.1.10 Summary of Task I

The end point of the process development study was coating of the simulated airfoil specimen. Lacking the cast columbium vane segment to bring the study to its final point, the findings of this study were extrapolated in order to prepare process specifications for the cored vane segments. Complete specifications are incuded as Appendix D.

#### 4.2 COATING OF COMPONENTS

As a result of the change in scope of the program, only external surfaces of test specimens and solid airfoils required coating; consequently only the slurry spray technique was used, as described in Appendix D. The actual coating weights are reported in Table 19. Since the test bars were threaded, the NS-4 modifier was applied to the reduced gage section only (see Figs. 50 and 51), although the subsequent siliciding operation resulted in the formation of silicides on all surfaces. The final pre-oxidation treatment involved a 1-hour exposure in air at 1371°C.



A. As-Silicided - No. 3C Sprayed in E-4 Vehicle Magnification: 250X



B. As-Silicided - No. 4B

Sprayed in Acryloid/ Cellosolve Vehicle

Magnification: 250X

. . . . . . .

9

Figure 49. Microstructures of Sprayed Specimens

------

Table	19
-------	----

		Weight	Bisque	Weight S	intered	Weight S	ilicided	Weight Pr	e-Oxidized
Specimen Number	Area (cm <sup>2</sup> )	(g)	(m.g/cm <sup>2</sup> )	(g)	(mg/cm <sup>2</sup> )	(g)	(mg/cm <sup>2</sup> )	(g)	(mg/cm <sup>2</sup> )
Coupons									
1	5.58	0.1845	33.1	0.1750	31.4	0.3022	54.2	0.3128	56.1
2	4.78	0.1714	5.9	0.1625	34.0	0.2717	56.8	0.2861	59.9
3	4.92	0.2092	42.5	0.1996	40.6	0.3305	67.2	0.3412	69.4
4	4.24	0.1525	36.0	0.1452	34.3	0.2465	58.1	0.2547	60.1
5	4.69	0.1685	35.9	0.1604	34.2	0.2716	57.9	0.2813	60.0
6	4.80	0.2199	45.8	0.2100	43.8	0.3405	70.9	0.3525	73.4
7	4.47	0.1966	44.0	0.1879	42.0	0.3068	68.6	0.3177	71.1
8	2.75	0.1203	43.8	0.1131	41.1	0.1925	70.0	0.1990	72.4
Bars (So	lar)								
4	2.82	0.1818	64.5	0.1810	64.2	0.5592		0,5760	
6	2.82	0.1567	55.6	0.1550	55.0	0.4853		0.5003	
7	3.65	0.2064	56.6	0.2032	55.7	0.5937	1 I	0.6097	1
10	3.44	0.1653	48.1	0.1631	47.4	0.5502		0.5665	
Bars (SR	<u>()</u>								
2	6.64	0.2520	38.0	0.2490	37.5	0.6680		0.6889	
9	6.83	0.2662	39.0	0.2614	38.3	0.6949	!	0.7192	
16	6.80	0.2092	30.8	0.2039	30.0	0.6213		0.6445	
23	6.81	0.2149	31.6	0.2120	31.1	0.6385	1	0.6619	
					1		1 1		1

NS-4 Coated C129Y Alloy Specimens



Figure 50. NS-4 Coated Stress-Rupture Bars in As-Coated Condition

.....



Figure 51. NS-4 Coated Tensile Bars in As-Coated Condition

From the weight change data derived from coating test coupons, the relationship between modifier bisque to silicon pickup is shown in Figure 52. The data points appeared to be best fitted by a second order polynomial. This non-linear function would imply that under the imposed limits of 8 hours in a siliciding pack at 1149°C, the amount of silicon deposited in the coating would gradually taper off as the coating becomes excessively thick.

Table 20 shows similar coating weight changes for the four solid cast columbium vanes processed similarly.

4.3 PROPERTIES OF COATED SPECIMENS

4.3.1 Tensile Properties

This section presents both the as-cast and as-coated properties of test bars from pour No. 3. Data are seen in Table 21. At room temperature, specimen No. 4 exhibited excellent strength and ductility compared to the two uncoated bars, Nos. 11 and 18. Since No. 18 was also subjected to the same thermal cycles used in coating processing, it should be compared to No. 4. The difference in tensile and yield strengths can be attributed to scatter in data points but some embrittlement was noted in the low values in elongation and area reduction in No. 18.



Figure 52. Correlation of Bisque Weight With Silicon Pickup Computer Fit to Equation:  $Y = 0.165X^2 + 0.580X + 0.0003$  Where Y is Weight and X is Weight of Silicon

# Table 20

Specimen Number	Weight of Bisque (g)	Weight After Sintering (g)	Weight After Siliciding (g)	After Pre- Oxidating (g)
6-2	3.54	3.30	5.71	-
1-3	4.40	4.07	6.83	7.17
5,3*	3.79	3.42	5.89	6.17
3,4*	4.03	3.55	6.07	6.34

Coating Weight Gain of Cast Columbium Nozzle Vanes

#### Table 21

		Tempe r	ature	Ultim Tensile	Ultimate Tensile Strength		Yield Strength		!
Specimen Number Coating	Coating	(°F)	(°C)	(ksi)	(MPa)	(ksi)	(MPa)	Area (%)	Elongation (%)
11	No	77	25	81.0	558	-	-	0.6	-
18	No*	74	23	78.7	542	77.2	532	0.2	1.4
4	Yes	77	25	89.7	618	75.8	522	23.8	9.7
15	No	2000	1093	47.6	328	39.7	274	45.0	27.9
7	Yes	2000	1093	51.5	355	37.2	256	35.3	23.9
10	Yes	2000	1093	49.6	342	37.4	244	23.2	13.0
12	No	2200	1204	40.5	279	33.1	228	22.6	18.5
14	NO	2200	1204	41.2	284	33.4	230	7.4	22.2
6	Yes	2200	1204	41.8	288	31.8	219	10.8	18.3
17	Yes	2200	1204	40.8	274	30.4	209	27.1	20.4

#### Tensile Test Data of C129Y Alloy

Results of the 2000 and 2200°F tests are uniformly good. There is no significant difference between as-cast and coated properties, verifying the viability of the system. Specimens No. 15, 10 and 17 display adequate strength and ductility although slightly flawed with gas porosity.

#### 4.3.2 Stress-Rupture Testing

Stress-rupture test results as reported by Southern Research Institute are shown in Table 22. Creep rates are plotted in Figures 53 and 54 for 2000°F and 2200°F, respectively.

Specimen No. 2 was tested at 2000°F after modification of the test chamber to eliminate leakage and contamination of the inert environment. The stress level for this specimen was increased from 13 ksi to 34 ksi as creep rate was extremely low. At 100 hours, the thermocouple failed but the specimen had only increased by <1 percent. The stress was increased subsequently, which led to sudden onset of third-stage creep followed by failure at 81 hours, or 181 hours total.

Of the specimens at 2200°F, No. 9 was found to be flawed with gas porosity, detectable in the radiograph, but in this case no adverse effects were seen in the creep results, the sample demonstrating adequate ductility to relieve the stress concentration effect of the flaw. The remaining specimens appeared, in radiographic inspection, to be sound and, as such, the creep results may be viewed as valid. Specimen No. 23 did not fracture. It elongated such that the laoding arm activated the furnace cutoff switch which normally happened only upon failure.

Table 22

1442

# Test Results on C129Y Alloy

	Reduction	In Area (a)		-	T/C failed but specimen was still intect.	16.9 Spec. 12 reran at 20.000 psi after 4.7 hrs increased stress to	22,500 psi. After 49.1 hts increased stress to 27,500 psi.	21.6		None	17.5	14.3 Did not fail specimen	
Total	Change in	$(\Delta I)$ $\Delta I/I$	0.0064 0.0057	0+00265 0+0030	0.00437 0.00437	0.14120 0.1885		0.2168 0.2787	0.0419 0.0617	0.0205 0.0306	0.1203 0.1762	0.1825 0.2520	
	Speciation Gage	(1) (1)	1.1170	0.6741	0.5901	0.7489		0.7779	0.6791	0.6692	0.6828	0.7241	
	Specimen Gage Diameter	(inch) Coated/Uncoated	0.00	0.205	0.2292	0.2287		0.2360 0.2247	91.22.0	0.205	0.206	0.2240	
	Total Hours	at Failure	35.0	15.0	100.61	80.9		57.5	25.8	35.3	60.0	30.02	-
	Test	Stress (ksi)	15 and 20	15	13 and 35	20, 22.5 and 27.5		2	20	20	20	20	
	Test	Temp. ( °F )	2000	2000	2000	2000		2200	2200	2200	2200	2200	
		Spec Leen Condition	Uncoated	Uncoated	Coated	Coated		Coated	Coated	Uncoated	Uncoated	roated	
		Run Number	-	2	~	•		\$	ە	٢	æ	•	
		Specimen Number	-	•	~	N		6	ę	=	R	33	-

69

ź







70

÷

The curves in Figure 54 seem to be almost linear for uncoated bars while the creep rates changed from second- to third-stage before failure occurred. The scatter in stress-rupture life suggests an inhomogeneity in the base metal. However, in spite of the scatter, results did demonstrate equivalency in stress-rupture lives for both coated and uncoated specimens.

#### 4.3.3 Furnace Oxidation Testing

Eight coated specimens were prepared for static oxidation testing at furnace temperatures of 760 and 1093°C (1400 and 2000°F). Weight changes monitored are reported in Table 23. Specimens 1 through 4, which were exposed to air at 760°C, typically exhibited weight gains of less than 1 mg/cm<sup>2</sup> while the specimens tested at 1093°C, Nos. 5 through 8, gained up to 2 mg/cm<sup>2</sup> during the 5500-hour test. The data points are plotted in Figure 36 and generally, two trends can be detected. The 760°C specimens fall in an envelope which appear to level off around 0.5 mg/cm<sup>2</sup>. The upper band represents the 1093°C specimens which have a greater spread. The kinetics of chemical reaction and transport (diffusion) phenomena are dependent on temperature and, therefore, proceed at a greater rate at the higher temperature. At elevated temperature, it is believed that oxidation proceeds in a parabolic manner while at lower temperature, the trend tends to be exponential (Ref. 9). In this case, the stabillity and crystal structure of the SiO2 scale formed at each temperature will determine the rate of oxidation as lattice defects will promote diffusion and enhance the rate of oxidation. Under the nominally static conditions (minimal thermal cycling), the NS-4 coating at 760°C appeared to be highly protective with no evidence of "pesting" previously noted. This could be indicative of relatively slower formation of SiO<sub>2</sub> resulting in a dense, adherent scale, impervious to O2 diffusion during the long uninterrupted time periods between weighing.

#### Table 23

				Weight	Change at I	inspection (m	g/cm <sup>2</sup> )		
Specimen Number	Temperature (°C)	1015 Hours	1259 Hours	1491 Hours	2132 Hours	3402 Hours	4314 Hours	4841 Hours	556 1 Hours
1	760	0.39	-	0.41	0.41	0.36	0.43	-	0.56*
2	760	0.40	-	0.33	0.38	0.36	0.50	0.56*	-
3	760	0.39	-	0.43	0.41	0.39	0.51**	-	-
4	760	0.42	0.33*	-	-	-	-	-	-
5	1093	0.98	-	1.00	1.17	1.47	1.73	-	2.07*
6	1092	1.35	1.35*	-	-	-	-	-	-
7	1093	1.12	-	1.07	1.16	1.48	1.74	1.74*	-
8	1093	1.05	-	1.09	1.27**	-		-	-
* R ** D	emoved for me amage' in han	tallography dling	,						

#### Weight Change Data for Furnace Oxidation Test Specimens

Figures 55 and 56 show the physical appearance of coated specimens. Note that no surface penetration was observed and no evidence of coating failure was found at any time. The excellent appearance after 5561 hours at both temperatures is indicative of the remarkable durability of this coating under static isothermal conditions.

A total of six specimens taken at various times from the test were prepared for metallographic analyses. Typical microstructures are shown in Figures 57 and 58 with baseline microstructures of an as-coated specimen shown in Figure 59. The as-coated specimen exhibited a narrow interface region; with thermal expansion, especially at the higher temperature, the interfacial band increased noticeably. (The lateral cracks observed in the interface are probably caused by stresses induced during cutting.) The cracking in the coating, normal to the plane of the surface, is typically found in this coating as a result of thermal mismatch.

Comparison of coating microstructures reveal that with increasing exposure, porosity in the coating also increases. Close examination shows that in the porous outer portions of the coatings, two phases can be noted - a light grey phase and a darker, mottled grey phase. Energy dispersive X-ray analysis indicated the presence of columbium in the latter dark grey phase together with greater quantities of vanadium and titanium. The lighter grey phase had an X-ray energy spectrum very similar to the standard NS-4 coating. Therefore, it can be assumed that with thermal exposure, columbium diffused outward from the substrate into the coating and concentrated around coating porosity, probably contributing to oxide formation and thus reducing the effectiveness of the SiO<sub>2</sub> scale.

The primary difference between the two sets of microstructures (Figs. 57 and 58) is the slightly narrower interfacial band (as a result of lower reaction rates) and the relatively greater areas of the light grey coating phase on the 760°C specimens.

In order to study the compositional changes in the coating during oxidation exposure, a series of EDX elemental line scans were performed. The six sets of profiles are shown in Figures 60 through 65. The vertical axes shown are only indicative of the increasing trend in concentration. No attempt was made to directly quantitize the concentration of each element. Molybdenum was not shown because of the >50 percent overlap of the molybdenum L-lines with columbium, and since columbium had the stronger signals, L-lines of molybdenum were completely masked.

The elemental profiles for test specimens at 760°C show that, initially, silicon was found throughout the coating, and at the end of 5561 hours, a definite gradient can be noted as silicon was consumed to form surface oxides and also by diffusion into the substrate. In the case of titanium and vanadium, there was little noticeable difference in concentration distribution across the coating. the columbium scan showed a trend opposite to the of silicon; with increasing exposure times, columbium diffused into the coating, as did hafnium. However, after 5561 hours, the retention of hafnium in the coating appeared to have leveled off. Tungsten was initially randomly



As-Coated (No. 1)

1015 Hours (No. 1) 4841 Hours (No. 2)

5561 Hours (No. 1)

Figure 55. Surface Appearance of NS-4 Coated Oxidation Specimens After Various Exposure Times at 760 °C



Figure 56. Surface Appearance of NS-4 Coated Oxidation Specimens After Various Exposure Times at 1093°C



A. Specimen No. 4 After 1259 Hours

Magnification: 200X

B. Specimen No. 2 After 4841 Hours

Magnification: 250X

C. Specimen No. 1 After 5561 Hours

Magnification: 250X

į

Figure 57. Microstructures of NS-4 Coated C129Y Specimens After Oxidation Testing at 760°C; Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch



- A. Specimen No. 6 After 1259 Hours
  - Magnification: 200X

- B. Specimen No. 7 After 4841 Hours
  - Magnification: 250X

C. Specimen No. 5 After 5561 Hours

Magnification: 250X



Figure 58. Microstructures of NS-4 Coated C129Y Specimens After Oxidation Testing at 1093°C; Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch



As-Coated Hf-HNO<sub>3</sub>-Lactic Etch Magnification: 250X

Figure 59. NS-4 Coated C129Y Specimen in As-Coated Condition; With Pre-Oxidation

distributed in the coating but in time, there appeared to be a definite concentration near the coating surface, indicating a possible role in stabilizing the oxide scale.

A similar study of the X-ray line scans for the 1093°C specimens (Figs. 63-65) revealed characteristics of the elemental distribution that correspond to the 760°C specimens. An interesting feature can be noted in the hafnium substrate scan region where theundulating concentration can be related to the presence of hafnium-rich 'nodules' in the alloy grain boundary. Figure 66 is a high magnification SEM photo of the grain boundary typically found in all test specimens regardless of test parameters. Referring to the SEM photomicrographs in Figures 60 through 65, the same light intergranular markings of hafnium can also be distinguished. Since hafnium formes a series of continuous solid solution with columbium, a possible explanation of this discrete hafnium precipitate is that during casting, insufficient heat was provided to produce the super heated alloy melt and, therefore, hafnium could have been precipitated.

Further evidence of hafnium was found in specimen No. 2 (Fig. 67) which had two large agglomerations of hafnium, with a substrate matrix studded with dark grey hafnium precipitates. Alongside the hafnium agglomerate was also found shrinkage porosity. It is not clear from the photomicrograph as to the effect of the porosity and hafnium on coating/substrate integrity, but since no coating failure was noted in the test, the effects could not be significant in an isothermal situation.

Finally, microhardness measurements (100g load) were taken and the results show (Table 24) that the interface was an extremely hard and brittle layer and some hardening of the substrate next to the coating was noted. The C129Y alloy itself tends to be somewhat less brittle with increasing exposure.



Figure 60. EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 4 After 1259 Hours at 760°C; Magnification: 205X



Figure 61. EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 2 After 4841 Hours at 760°C; Magnification: 115X

WRAD /



Figure 62. EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 1 After 5561 Hours at 760°C; Magnification: 235X

i. T



Figure 63. EDX Elemental Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 6 After 1259 Hours at 1093°C; Magnification: 110X



Figure 64. EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 7 After 4841 Hours at 1093°C; Magnification: 125X

ET.



Figure 65. EDX Elemental Line Scan of Oxidation Specimen No. 5 After 5561 Hours at 1093°C; Magnification: 125X



Specimen No. 4 Magnification: 4500X

Figure 66. Hafnium-Rich Areas in the Alloy Grain Boundary

## Table 24

# Microhardness(KHN-100g Load) Measurements of C129Y Oxidation Specimens

		Micr	ohardness (	KHN)
Exposure (hrs)	Temperature (°C)	Interface	Substrate Near Interface	Alloy
				·
1259	760	1350	280	260
4841	760	1230	280	230
5561	760	1390	250	250
1259	1093	1500	270	270
4841	1093	1540	230	250
5561	1093	950	230	210
	Ex pos ure (hrs) 1259 4841 5561 1259 4841 5561	Exposure (°C) 1259 760 4841 760 5561 760 1259 1093 4841 1093 5561 1093	Exposure (hrs)     Temperature (°C)     Micr       1259     760     1350       4841     760     1230       5561     760     1390       1259     1093     1500       4841     1093     1540       5561     1093     950	Exposure (hrs)     Temperature (°C)     Microhardness ( Substrate Near       1259     760     1350     280       4841     760     1230     280       5561     760     1390     250       1259     1093     1500     270       4841     1093     950     230

APR 80 L HSU, W & STEVENS' A R STETSON DAMAGE THE NOZZ-ETC(U) UNCLASSIFIED SR80-R-9999-25 USAAVRADCON-TR-80-F-2 HL											
2 /# 2. A0 A0 A0 A0 A0 A0 A0 A0 A0 A0 A0 A0 A0	4			-	а 2	<b>X</b> -	3			2	
	FI T		IJŗ	1 6		12			R		
							END hate rilmed 8-80				
							DTIC	J			
		4									



A. Light Microscopy

Magnification: 250X



B. Shrinkage Porosity
Magnification: 1050X

ţ

Figure 67. SEM Photomicrographs of Inhomogeneous Substrate Areas on Specimen No. 2 Showing Hafnium Agglomeration and Porosity; 4841 Hours at 760 °C

#### 4.3.4 Dynamic Oxidation Burner Rig Testing

The objective of the burner rig oxidation test was to subject the NS-4 coated C129Y single vane segment to the hot combustion gases such that the leading edge temperature was at 1315°C (2400°F). The thermal cycle of 50 minutes at temperature followed by 10 minutes rapid cooldown induced thermal stresses that can severely tax the coefficient of thermal expansion mismatch between the NS-4 coating and the substrate. Since the combustor nozzle is only 2.5 cm in diameter, only the center of the leading edge was maintained at the desired test temperature while the rest of the airfoil and the side walls were cycled through different thermal cycles, depending on the mass, distance from the flame and radiation heat losses. The varying temperatures throughout the specimen were not monitored due to poor visibility through the viewing slit, excepting the mid airfoil and trailing edge temperatures which were visible to the radiation pyrometer. Measurements taken indicate that the 1315°C leading edge temperature produced temperatures of approximately 1200 and 1090°C at the mid-chord and trailing edges, respectively.

#### Results

A total of four specimens were tested with the results shown in Table 25. Specimens 6-2 and 1-3 were processed conventionally (1515°C/3 hours sinter, 1149°C/8 hours siliciding) while the last two, specimens 5-3 and 3-4, had the eight-hour sintering cycle. The first specimen tested, No. 6-2, was cycled for 10 hours before the specimen fixture failed and caused the airfoil to be carried upward by the high-velocity gas stream and thrown against the walls of the exhaust stack. The airfoil itself sustained minimal visual damage but this test was terminated. Figure 68 showed that the leading edge was still sound, although some coating breakthrough was noted at the sidewalls.

A second specimen, No. 1-3, was installed in a modified fixture assembly which necessitated the attachment of an "appendage" to the sidewall, as shown in Figure 69. Specimen 1-3 survived 57 hours of testing before leading edge failure was obtained. Upon removal from the nozzle plate, several areas of coating penetration were found on the side wall and "appendage" areas. The "appendage" failures were disregarded as they were caused by high loading levels imparted by the fixture screws to ensure secure installation. Optical examination of the leading edge failure revealed streaking of what appeared to be a liquid phase product down both convex and concave sides of the leading edge. This observation led to a decision to increase vacuum sintering time for subsequent specimens in order to minimize the lower melting, higher vapor pressure elements such as vanadium and titanium.

Specimens No. 5-3 and 3-4 were tested and survived 66 and 132 hours, respectively. The visual appearances are shown in Figures 70 and 71. Leading edge failure on specimen No. 5-3 was significant and areas on the side walls also suffered slight damage. Specimen No. 3-4 showed minimal damage at the leading edge and coating spallation on the affixed appendage areas with the side wall attack also noted on other vanes (Fig. 71).

#### Table 25

Specimen Number	Number of Hours Exposed	Failed Area
6-2	10	Side walls
1-3	57	Leading edge and side walls
5-3*	66	Leading edge and sidewalls
3-4*	132	Discoloration at leading edge and side wall failure

1315°C Burner Rig Test Results

Before proceeding to a discussion of metallographic, SEM and EDX analyses of the specimens, some thought should be given to the repeated side wall failure found in all specimens. These side wall failures were invariably found on the corners of both inboard and outboard walls. Close scrutiny of the convex sides of all four specimens show failure on the outboard corner (<90° angle) adjacent to the leading edge. Another location highly susceptible to coating spallation and failure was found on the inboard corner (>90° angle) near the trailing edge.

It is not possible without additional information to explain fully the cause of these coating failures. However, two factors which may have contributed to the failures are mentioned here:

1. <u>Configuration Factor</u> - Previous work with NS-4 (and other thick overlay coatings) has shown that specimen edges are much more prone to spallation due to configuration aggravated trailing edge mismatch during thermal transients, as illustrated in Figure 70. The oxide layer formed at the coating surface is strained similarly, resulting in rapid oxide spallation and consumption of the coating to replenish the surface oxides.



Figure 68. NS-4 Coated Test Specimen No. 6-2 After 10 Hours of Burner Rig Testing (Arrows Show Failed Areas)

1001-1

# A. Concave Surface



B. Convex Surface

ž



Figure 69. NS-4 Coated Test Specimen No. 1-3 After 57 Hours of Burner Rig Testing (Arrows Show Failed Areas)



A. Concave Surface



19981 7

B. ConveX Surface

Figure 70. NS-4 Coated Test Specimen No. 5-3 After 66 Hours of Burner Rig Testing (Arrows Show Failed Areas)



A. Concave Surface



B. Convex Surface

Figure 71. NS-4 Coated Test Specimen No. 3-4 After 132 Hours of Burner Rig Testing (Arrows Show Failed Areas)



Figure 72. Schematic of Tensile and Compression Strains Induced at a Specimen Edge During Thermal Cycling

2. Equilibrium Temperature Factor - Radiation convection heat losses from areas not directly exposed to the hot gas stream may have imposed considerable temperature gradients at the side walls. As previously mentioned, no measurements were taken of temperature in these cooler areas but visual sightings through the viewing slit during testing revealed that the trailing edge corners were below the infrared emittance level while the corner near the leading edge end on the outboard side was highly emittive. Based on visual inspection, a thermal profile, such as in Figure 73, may have been in effect. Other than the "pest" temperatures of 649°C (1200°F) to 760°C (1400°F), little is known about the low temperature (<645°C) performance of the coating. Therefore, since the NS-4 coating was optimized for high temperature use and not for cooler temperatures, it may have failed rapidly at the cooler locations.</p>

#### Specimen No. 6-2 (10 Hours)

- 1

This specimen was exposed to only 10 hours of testing and little useful information can be gleaned from the part. The most interesting item noted was the small circular failure noted at the outboard corner, see Figure 67(B). The oxidation process had just initiated and a 45X picture taken on the SEM shows a pit at the very tip of the corner, Figure 74. Energy dispersive analysis, Figure 75, indicated that light colored areas A at the bottom of the pit was a final remnant of coating in the alloy matrix. B marks the "walls" of the pit and the exposed C129Y alloy. Near the 'rim' of the pit, marked by C, are fibrous stringers which were found to be mostly silicon



Figure 73.

Sketch of Hypothetical Isotherms Showing Thermal Profile of Vane During Rig Testing

1 = HOT TEST ISOTHERM 4 = COOLEST ISOTHERM



Figure 74. Low Magnification (17X) of SEM Photo of Failed Area on Specimen No. 6-2

(probably  $SiO_2$ ) with some titanium. The area indicated by D is silicided substrate exposed to the environment and E points to the dark gray coating surface (in contrast to coating surfaces further away which are lighter in color) which has notable amounts of hafnium and columbium in the energy spectrum typical of NS-4.

₹..



Figure 75. High Magnification (45X) SEM Photograph of Failed Area of Specimen No. 6-2

To summarize the morphology of coating failure, as seen above, the pit is primarily exposed substrate with traces of coating entrapped at the bottom. Moving up the side of the 'pit', which is still exposed C129Y alloy, fibers of SiO<sub>2</sub> are found. As the 'rim' is approached, the alloy changes to silicided C129Y. Past the 'rim', there is a ring of darkened coating which is columbium and hafnium contaminated NS-4. Beyond that, the NS-4 coating is unaffected.

#### Specimen No. 1-3 (57 Hours)

The failed leading edge was viewed on both concave and convex sides as shown in Figure 76. Note that dark streak were found on both sides which appear to be liquid phase swept past the leading edge by the high-velocity gases. A closeup picture of the streaking is shown in Figure 77. Electron dot mapping of this particular region is also shown for the elements columbium, silicon, titanium and molybdenum. The electron images indicate that the dark areas contain columbium and molybdenum with a little silicon. The possibility of liquid phase formation at 1315°C or lesser could be attributed to eutectics of oxides such as  $MoO_3-WO_3$  and  $Nb_2O_5-WO_3$ . The binary phase diagrams are shown in Figures 78 and 79 (Ref. 6). Molybdenum oxide is a oxide is a low-melting compound and the presence of up to 2 mole percent  $WO_3$ depresses the melting point even further to 770°C. The  $Nb_2O_5-WO_3$  is a much higher melting system but the eutectic formed at 1340°C could also produce localized liquid phase in  $WO_3$ -rich areas in the presence of  $Cb_2O_3$ .


A. Concave View Magnification: 12X



ŝ

Figure 76. SEM Photomicrograph of Leading Edge Failure of Specimen No. 1-3



Figure 77. Dark Streaking on Convex Side of Leading Edge of Specimen No. 1-3



The failed area itself was composed of the elements of the C129Y alloy, tungsten, hafnium and columbium. The leading edge surface of both sides of the failed areas were stained brown-grey; this discoloration is typically found on burner rig specimens due to deposition of contaminants. The energy spectrum obtained of the stains showed detectable quantities of aluminum, iron and nickel. These elements were probably derived from moisture in fuel and compressed air.

The airfoil was sectioned and prepared for metallography. The cross-section at the failure is shown in Figure 80. Note a distinct demarcation line across the airfoil near the leading edge. Further metallographic examination did not reveal any additional information as to the reason for the phase difference and recourse to SEM/EDX was made. Scans made under identical parameters in both areas showed spectra that are similar with one exception.

In the low-energy region around 1.7 KeV, the emission lines of silicon ( $K_{\alpha}$  and  $K_{\beta}$ ), hafnium (M line) and tungsten (M line) all overlap. An expanded look at the band shape in this region is shown in Figure 81.

Note the distortion in the near gaussian peak shape in the 1.7 KeV region caused by the increased silicon X-ray emittance in the A region. Consequently, it can be deduced that with leading edge failure, silicon can diffuse rapidly through the C129Y substrate in a frontal manner, as seen in Figure 80.

ţ



87



Figure 79.  $Nb_2O_5-WO_3$  Binary System



Figure 80.

Cross-Section of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 1-3

Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 20X



Figure 81. Energy Spectra of Two Areas Near Failed Leading Edge Of Specimen No. 1-3 (Bars = A, Dots = B)



Figure 82.

Oxidized C129Y Substrate at Center of Leading Edge Failure in Specimen No. 1-3

Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 20X

Figure 82 shows the oxidized substrate at the center of the leading edge failure. The surface oxides exhibit a two-phase structure with intergranular diffusion from the surface, light grey regions in the substrte grain boundary. A SEM photograph of the same area (Fig. 83) shows the dark phase extending from the interface into the substrate. EDX analysis determined these areas to be tungsten-rich. In addition, comparison of peak height intensities also indicated that the two-phase surface layer has the alloy elements with a difference in relative quantities of hafnium and tungsten. The outer zone had more tugnsten but less hafnium than the inner zone. The discrete, intergranular, hafnium-rich areas extend from the substrate to the surface, which had significant porosity.



Figure 83. SEM Photomicrograph of Oxidized C129Y Substrate on Leading Edge Failure in Specimen No. 1-3 (Arrows Indicate Hafnium-Rich Areas); Magnification: 1140X

At the edge of the failed area was found partial layers of NS-4 coating. Figure 84 shows the transition from bare alloy to coating at the concave and convex edges. Note the oxides produced on the coating surface and the depletion of the outer layers of coating in the convex side. In order to examine this area in greater detail, EDX work was performed and Figure 85 shows the light grey granular areas of hafnium, both at the coating/substrate and in the coating itself. Small quantities of hafnium-rich 'pockets' are located in the oxide layer which was found to be primarily columbium and silicon.

The rest of the coating away from the leading edge area was still 100 percent intact, as can be seen in Figure 86. Note that with thermal exposure, the outermost 50 percent of the coating had developed a high degree of porosity and oxidation attack was initiated at the coating/substrate interface through the cracks in the coating. The substrate immediately below the coating appeared to be affected and the grain boundaries enhanced by diffusion reaction.

#### Specimen No. 5-3 (66 Hours)

Visual appearance of the leading edge failure of Specimen No. 5-3 was identical to that of Specimen No. 1-3. The diffusion of silicon through the exposed leading edge forming a silcon contaminated C129Y region was also found in this specimen, Figure 87. The two-zone surface at the leading edge previously noted in Specimen No. 1-3 was also evident here. One notable difference was the absence of tungsten diffusion into the substrate grain boundaries. (Compare Figure 88 with Figure 82). Near the edge of the failed area,



A. Concave
Hf-HNO<sub>3</sub>-Lactic Etch
Magnification: 500X



B. Convex
Hf-HNO<sub>3</sub>-Lactic Etch
Magnification: 200X

Figure 84. Photomicrographs of Transition From Exposed Alloy to Coated Alloy at Leading Edge Failure of Specimen No. 1-3

89. Furthermore, precipitation of a finely structured secondary phase was found near the coating interface in the alloy. Note the presence of large quantities of a dark grey phase in the coating, especially below the thick oxide layer on the right-hand side. The presence of this phase seems to be an indication of imminent coating failure as it was also found in the oxidized coating layers near the surface, see Figure 90.



Oxides (Columbium, Silicon)

Coating

Magnification: 1650X

Figure 85. SEM Photomicrograph of Edge of Failed Area on Leading Edge of Specimen No. 1-3



Figure 86.

NS-4 Coating on Convex Side of Airfoil (Specimen No. 1-3) After 57 Hours Burner Rig Testing

Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 200X



Figure 27.

Cross-Section of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 5-3

Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 500X

Figure 88.

Oxidized C129Y Substrate at Center of Leading Edge Failure in Specimen No. 5-3

Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 500X



41

Figure 89.

Transition From Exposed Alloy to Coated Alloy at Leading Edge of Specimen No. 5-3

Hg-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 500X



Figure 90.

NS-4 Coated C129Y (Specimen No. 5-3) After 66 Hours of Burner Rig Testing

Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 200X

A SEM photomicrograph of a coated surface that was still fully protected is shown in Figure 91. The coating can be divided into three zones, and each zone was scanned using similar scan parameters. The energy spectra obtained were smoothed statistically (six-point smooth) and background noise/emittance was subtracted. The final corrected spectra were converted to a titanium ratio mode; the integrated peaks for each element formed was divided by the integrated area of titanium. The reason for choosing titanium was because the amount of titanium in each zone appeared to be fairly constant. The ratio values are plotted in a bar graph in Figure 92. As expected, silicon increased in concentration from zone 1 to 3 as  $SiO_2$  formed. Of the four coating elements, tungsten and vanadium appeared to have diffused to the coating surface with a positive gradient in that direction while most of the molybdenum remained in zone 1. Columbium and hafnium had diffused from the substrate into the coating during the thermal exposure with the highest concentrations in zone 1. The presence of columbium in the coating would result in formation of Cb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> which is more volatile and is less effective than the refractory oxides.

## Specimen No. 3-4 (132 Hours)

The last specimen evaluated had the longest rig test life. A look at the leading edge cross section (Fig. 93) shows the absence of demarcation line found in Specimen Nos. 5-3 and 1-3 that marked silicon diffusion through exposed alloy surfaces into the substrate. The implication here is that the penetration at the leading edge did not expose the substrate. Examination of Figure 94 shows some damage in the coated leading edge but the extent of the damage is not clear. A closeup of the failure is shown in Figure 95 and again, fibers are noted. The light grey fibrous materials were found to be rich in titanium with tungsten and columbium. The dark background appeared



Magnification: 500X







Figure 93.

Cross-Section of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 3-4

HF-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 20X

to be silicided C129Y. The dark stains found on the leading edge adjacent to the failed area (Fig. 94) were contaminants deposited by the combustor gases and included trace quantities of nickel, calcium, iron and aluminum.

After sectioning the airfoil, the leading edge was examined in cross section and the areas of maximum failure/penetration are shown in Figure 96. Complete penetration to the substrate was minimal although the remaining coating appeared to be partially oxidized. Large clumps of oxide were noted and EDX analysis indicated the presence of silicon and columbium. The NS-4 coating, or what was left of the coating, had a high columbium concentration with significant amounts of hafnium, pointing to the advanced state of degradation as a result of columbium and hafnium diffusion outward. Note the interfacial crack extending from the flaw on the left hand side in Figure 96A. It is difficult to determine the exact cause of the crack; the cracks could have been induced during cutting or were the result of thermal stresses. Small, discrete pockets of hafnium were also detected in the coating matrix.

Figure 97 shows a relatively sound coated area although evidence of oxidation attack can be noted in the outer portion of the coating.



A. Concave

Magnification: 11X

- B. Convex
  - Magnification: 11X

Figure 94. Concave and Convex SEM Views of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 3-4



Figure 95. SEM Photomicrograph of Failed Leading Edge on Specimen No. 3-4



SEM Α. Magnification: 340X



B. Hf-HNO<sub>3</sub>-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 200X

Figure 96. Photomicrographs of Failed Area on Leading Edge of Specimen No. 3-4 Showing Oxide Formation (Arrows Indicate Hafnium-Rich Areas)



Figure 97.

NS-4 Coated C129Y After 132 Hours of Burner Rig Testing

Hf-HNO3-Lactic Etch

Magnification: 200X

- - - -

FRECEDING PAGE BLANK - NOT FILMED

#### CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- It is clear from the casting effort of this program that considerably more development is needed in foundry techniques for columbium-base alloys. Any assumption that all the ills visited upon the foundry phase of the program were caused by selection of uncastable alloy is not valid unless a reasonable explanation can be advanced as to why C129Y reacts as it does.
- 2. The choice of C129Y above other columbium-base alloys considered is validated by the superiority of mechanical properties generated in tensile and stress-rupture tests. The choice is less desirable when viewed from the standpoint of castability, and this has shaded the results of the program to some extent. In comparing the technology of the present efforts to that of a prior casting program (Ref. 3), it is apparent that the selected alloy offers much more potential in terms of elevated-temperature strength, being competitive with ceramics and ODS superalloys. The quality of the hardware fabricated therein, however, was considerably superior to the C129Y castings. The choice of another alloy, while perhaps assisting in the foundry process, would not have yielded a mechanical property data base with advantage over other materials.
- 3. Difficulties in arc melting C129Y have not been resolved satisfactorily. For reasons yet unexplained, this alloy requires two to three times the amperage of other columbium-base alloys to initiate a melt.
- 4. In view of the difficulties encountered in melting C129Y by the consumable arc process, coupled with the observed poor fluidity of the alloy, it is suggested that an alternate melting procedure be considered in pursuing further casting work with thin sections. A method such as electron beam melting which can induce superheat into the melt is clearly indicated.
- 5. The use of a superheat melting technique may also have beneficial effects on strength and ductility. It was noted in X-ray dispersive analyses that the alloy was not in complete solution, hafnium, notably, being concentrated in segregations.
- 6. The above-mentioned fluidity problem may be, in part, related to an alloying error in the program material, i.e., virtual absence of yttrium in the material. The gettering action of this element or the lack of same may have had adverse effects on the castability of the alloy.

- 7. Despite the several difficulties in foundry procedure the C129Y castings display exceptional properties at elevated temperature and technically show superiority to cobalt- and nickel-base alloys for advanced engines.
- 8. Columbium-base alloy C129Y, in the cast and coated condition, displays mechanical properties in the 2000-2200°F temperature range which are the equivalent to those of cobalt-base X-45M at 1500-1800°F.
- 9. The alloy displays, in the absence of detrimentally high interstitial levels or physical flaws such as porosity, room-temperature ductility adequate for consideration of engineering use. It is clear, however, that impurities and defects must be closely controlled if practical applictions are to be achieved.
- 10. The effect of the NS-4 coating on the C129Y alloy system is minimal. Mechanical properties evaluated (tensile, stress-rupture) were virtually identical for both coated and uncoated configurations.
- 11. Isothermal oxidation life of NS-4 coated C129Y alloy at 760 and 1093°C is excellent, in excess of 5500 hours.
- 12. One-hour burner rig tests of a coated airfoil at 1316°C indicated that in rapid cycling (1 hour cycles from 1316 to <816°C), coating life was limited to about 10<sup>2</sup> hours. However, it should be pointed out that the test rig cannot be directly related to an engine since the temperature distribution across the airfoil does not simulate that in an engine. In the absence of the nozzle shroud and discs, one can expect tht the thermal stresses in the test is much more severe than is typically found, thus resulting in premature coating breakdown.
- 13. NDT methods are needed to critically examine castings and coated parts to detect flaws. Standards or criteria whereby nonacceptable defects could be judged need to be established to provide guidelines for quality control.
- 14. The unique conditions created by the rig test resulted in a combination of both applied stress and high thermal gradient. However, the NS-4 class of coatings for protection of columbium alloys can be readily modified and optimized to improve its resistance to thermal cycling and stress oxidation.

#### REFERENCES

6

- Ohynsty, B. and Stetson, A.R., "Evaluation of Composite Materials for Gas Turbine Engines", AFML-TR-66-156, Part II, Final Report (1967).
- Beauregard, R.J., "Feasibility Study of Columbium Alloy Castings", AMMRC Contract DAAG46-69-C-0163, Final Report (1971).
- 3. Humphrey, J.R. and Nievath, A.J., "Investment Casting of Columbium Alloys", AMMRC Contract DAAG46075-C-0007, Final Report (1975).
- 4. Shoemaker, H.E. and Stetson, A.R., "Silicide Coatings for Tantalum and Columbium Alloys", NASA Contract NAS3-9412, Final Report (1969).
- 5. Levy, M., Falco, J.J. and Herring, R.F., "Oxidation of Cb(Nb) and Coated Columbium Alloys", J. of Less Common Metals, 34 (1974) pp. 321-343.
- Moore, V.S. and Stetson, A.R., "NS-4 Coating Process Development for Columbium Alloy Airfoils", AMMRC Contract DAAG46-74-C-0089, Final Report (1976).
- 7. Levin, E.M., Robbins, C.R. and McMurdier, H.F., "Phase Diagrams for Ceramics", Am. Ceram. Soc. (1964), 1969 Supplement.
- 8. Private communication, A.A. Tavassoli, KBI, to A.N. Hammer, Solar.
- 9. Hauffe, K., "Oxidation of Metals", Plenum Press, New York (1965).



i

#### APPENDIX A

PROCEDURES FOR HYDRIDING TITANIUM AND VANADIUM

HYDRIDING TITANIUM

The titanium sponge (-20 +50 mesh) is placed in an unlined Inconel retort which is subsequently sealed by fusion welding. Following pressurizing of the retort to 34.5 kPag with argon, the welds are soap-bubble leak checked. The retort and the palladium alloy hydrogen purifier are vacuum-argon cycle purged a minimum of three times. Under dynamic vacuum, the hydrogen purifier is heated to 454°C at which point it is back filled with hydrogen. The retort is then vacuum-hydrogen cycle purged a minimum of three times at room temperature before hydrogen pressure in the retort is adjusted to 10 mm Hg above atmospheric pressure preparatory to placing the retort in a furnace preheated to 427°C. The furnace containing the retort is then heated to 677°C over a 30-minute period. The retort is soaked in the furnace at 677°C for one hour. The hydriding reaction, however, should be complete in 30 to 40 minutes at 677°C, as indicated by the flow meter in the hydrogen supply line from the palladium purifier. The hydrogen pressure is maintained above atmospheric pressure while the retort is removed from the furnace and allowed to cool to room temperature.

#### HYDRIDING VANADIUM

Vanadium granules (approx. 13 mm sponge) are pickled in nitric acid, rinsed in distilled water and subsequently methanol. After vacuum drying at room temperature, the vanadium is placed in an Inconel retort which is sealed by fusion welding. After pressurization with argon, the retort is soap-bubble leak checked. The retort and palladium hydrogen purifier are vacuum-argon cycle purged a minimum of three times. After evacuation, the palladium membrane is heated and the retort vacuum-hydrogen purged as recommended in the "Hydriding Titanium" section.

With the hydrogen pressure from the palladium alloy purifier adjusted to 10 mm Hg above atmospheric pressure, the retort is inserted into a furnace preheated to 649°C. The furnace is then heated to 927°C over a one-hour period and held at temperature for a period of not less than 12 hours. After the 927°C soak, the control temperature is reduced to 593°C. Eicht hours later the furnace control is reduced to 260°C. When it reaches 260°C, it is removed from the furnace and allowed to air cool while maintaining a hydrogen pressure above atmospheric pressure.

PRECEDING PAGE BLANK - NOT FILMED 5 7 ...

4

APPENDIX B

#### SPRAY SLURRY PREPARATION PROCEDURE

A description of the process used in preparing the slurries based on a vehicle containing an ethyl cellulose binder is given in the following paragraphs.

Thirty grams of ethyl cellulose<sup>(1)</sup> is dissolved in a mixture of 0.200 l of secondary butyl alcohol and 0.800 l of xylene. One litre of Stoddard solvent (a petroleum distillate having a boiling point range of 156 to 199°C) is added to this solution to obtain the desired vehicle, which was designated E-4.

Bewteen 0.180 and 0.220l of the vehicle and the appropriate quantity of powdered elemental metals needed to give a fuids-to-solids true volume ratio of 2.5 (approx. 770 g of NS-4 powder) are added to a one quart low-silica ball mill<sup>(2)</sup> that is slightly more than half filled with balls.

After the ball mill has been tumbled for a period of 20 hours, the slip is transferred to a preweighed graduated cylinder for the determination of the specific gravity (by weighing the observed volume of slip) prior to spray application.

<sup>(1)</sup> N-200 grade ethyl cellulose as supplied by the Polymers Department, Hercules Power Company, Wilmington, Delaware.

<sup>(2)</sup> Burundum fortified mills and balls are purchased from U.S. Stoneware Company, Akron, Ohio.

		FRECEDING PAGE BLANK - NOT FILMED		
		Specification No.		
P O BOX 460		TWCACb-MS-1		
ALBANY OREGO	IN 97321	Rev.		
(503) 926-4211	TWX (510) 595-0973	ISSUED:		
	COLUMBIUM	October 7, 1970		
Specification	Cb & Cb Alloy Plates, Sheets and Str	ip		

## 1. SCOPE

1.1 Scope. This specification establishes the requirements for Columbium alloy plates, sheets, and strip.

1.2 Classification. Columbium alloy plates, sheet, and strip procured to this specification shall be supplied in the following types:

Type	Composition
Cb	Cb
WC103	Cb-10Hf-1Ti
WC129Y	Cb-10Hf-10W1Y
Cb–1Zr	Cb—1Zr
Cb 752	Cb-10W-2.5Zr.

# 2. APPLICABLE DOCUMENTS

2.1 The following documents of the issue in effect on the date of invitation for bids or request for proposal, form a part of this specification to the extent specified herein.

STANDARDS Federal	
Federal Test Method Standard No. 151	Metals; Test Methods
MIL STD 271	Non-Destructive Testing (X-Ray, Sonics, Dye Penetrant)
American Society for Testing Materials	
ASTM-E112	Methods for Determining Average Grain Size.
National Academy of Science	
Material Advisory Board, MAB-216-M	Evaluation Test Methods for Refractory Metal Sheet Material
Aeronautical Material Specifications	
AMS 2242c	Tolerance

#### 3. REQUIREMENTS

3.1 Materials

3.1.1 Production Methods. The ingot metal shall be double Vacuum melted in a furnace of a type suited for reactive metals. The starting ingot shall be free of voids and defects as determined by ultrasonic inspection.

3.1.2 Alloy Identification. The identity of all alloys with respect to input melt number shall be maintained at all stages of fabrication.

3.1.3 Condition. Unless otherwise specified, all material shall be supplied in the recrystallized annealed condition in accordance with Table I.

Tabla I

		1 4014					
THICKNESS	% RECRYSTALLIZATION						
	Сь•	WC103	WC129Y	Cb-1Zr	Cb752		
Less than .005	A/W	A/W	A/W	A/W	A/W		
.005— .150	80	95 - 100%	95 - 100%	<b>95 - 100</b> %	95 - 100%		
.151— .250	75	<b>90 - 100%</b>	90 - 100%	90 - 100%	90 - 100%		
.251—1.00	50	85 - 100%	85 - 100%	85 - 100%	85 - 100%		

\* Material supplied in the As Worked (A/W) condition unless otherwise specified by the P/O.

3.2 Chemical Composition. The Chemical Composition of each alloy ingot shall conform to Table II.

#### COLUMBIUM ALLOY PLATES, SHEETS AND STRIP. (2)

#### Table () Cb-1Zr WC103 WC129Y Cb-752 Element Cb 500 ppm\* 9-111 Tungsten 500 ppm\* 5000 ppm\* 9-11% 200 ppm\* 2000 ppm\* Hafnium 9-1117 9-1177 1000 ppm\* 5000 ppm\* Tantalum 5000 ppm\* 5000 ppm\* 1000 ppm\* Yttrium .05-.3% Titanium .7-1.3% .8-1.277 2.0-3.0% Zirconium 500 ppm\* 7000 ppm\* 5000 ppm\* 150 ppm\* 150 ppm\* 200 ppm\* 150 ppm\* Carbon 100 ppm\* 250 ppm\* 225 ppm\* 300 ppm\* 225 ppm\* Oxygen 200 ppm\* Nitrogen 100 ppm\* 100 ppm\* 100 ppm\* 100 ppm\* 100 ppm\* Hydrogen 15 ppm\* 15 ppm\* 15 ppm\* 15 ppm\* 15 ppm\* Columbium Bal. Bal. Bal. Bal. Bal.

\* Maximum limits unless otherwise indicated. ppm = Parts Per Million.

3.2.1 Product Analysis. If specified, product analysis shall be performed on C, O<sub>2</sub>, N with maximum levels specified as follows on Parts Per Million (ppm).

Eleme	ent	Сь	WC103	WC129Y	Cb-1Zr	Cb-752
С		100	150	150	200	150
$O_2$		200	225	225	300	225
Ν	••••	100	100	100	100	100
Н	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	15	15	15	15	15

3.3 Tensile Properties. Elongation, yield strength, and ultimate tensile strength shall be measured at room temperature on samples transverse to final rolling direction on material which is 0.010" thick or greater. The strain rate shall be maintained at  $0.005 \pm 0.001$ "/per inch per minute through the 0.2% offset yield strength and at 0.05  $\pm 0.005$ "/per inch per minute thereafter. The material shall have minimum transverse tensile property values as specified in Table III.

#### Table (() СЪ WC103 WC129Y Cb-1Zr Cb-752 25 Ultimate tensile strength, 1000 psi 54 80 35 75 11 38 15 55 Yield strength, 0.2% offset, 1000 psi 60 35 20 20 20 20 Elongation, G in one inch

3.4 Bend Ductility. Representative samples of the materials in final form shall withstand the following bend test at room temperatures without failure when tested according to procedures described in the most recent revision of the Materials Advisory Board report MAB-216-M, "Evaluation Test Methods for Refractory Metal Sheet Materials". The samples shall be sectioned with the long axis of the bend specimens perpendicular to the final rolling direction.

3.4.1 Sheet 0.060" in thickness and under shall be bent over a 1T radius through 105 degrees at a ram speed of one inch/per minute.

3.4.2 Sheet over 0.060" to 0.187" in thickness shall be bent over a 2T radius through 105 degrees at a ram speed of one inch/per minute.

3.5 Grain Size. Unless otherwise specified, the minimum average ASTM grain size number shall be in accordance with Table IV.

Table IV					
Thickness	WC103	WC129Y	Cb-1Zr	Cb-752	
.006150"	6	6	5	6	
.151 – .500″	5	5	4	5	
Greater than .750"	••••				

COLUMBIUM ALLOY PLATES, SHEETS AND STRIP (3)

## 4. DIMENSIONS AND TOLERANCES

4.1 Dimensions and Tolerances. Unless otherwise specified, tolerances shall be as defined in AMS 2242c.

4.2 Flatness. Total deviation from flatness of sheet and strip shall not exceed 6'i as determined by the following formula:

 $\frac{H}{L}$  × 100 = percent of flatness deviation.

where H = maximum distance from a flat reference deviation.

and L = minimum distance from this point to the point of contact with the reference surface.

4.3 Marking for Identification. Each plate, sheet, and strip shall be suitably marked with the contract number or order number, ingot melt number, specification number, and composition number.

# 5. QUALITY

RT 17

5.1 General. The finished product shall be visibly free from oxide or scale of any nature, grease, oil residual lubricants, and other extraneous materials. Cracks, laps, seams, gouges, and fins shall be unacceptable.

5.2 Surface Rework. All surface pores, gouges, and other defects deeper than 0.005'' or 3'c of the thickness, whichever is smaller, shall be unacceptable. Surface imperfections may be faired smooth to remove any notch effect provided dimensional tolerances are still lmaintained.

5.3 Edge. The edges shall be produced by shearing, slitting or sawing. The burr height shall not exceed five (5) percent of the thickness of the material.

6. REPORTS. The supplier shall submit three certified copies of reports indicating the ingot chemistries. In addition, a certification statement will be added stating that although not tested, the material is in conformance wih the specification. Additional test for tensile yield elongation, grain size and product analysis for oxygen, carbon, and nitrogen as well as other tests will be furnished when negotiated and specified in the purchase order.

#### 7. PREPARATION FOR DELIVERY

7.1 *Packaging.* All material shall be packaged in a manner that will prevent damage in transit and in storage.

8. REJECTIONS. Material not conforming to any of the requirements of this specification unless otherwise agreed upon by the purchaser.

9. DEFINITIONS. For the purposes of this specification, the following definitions shall apply:

9.1 Sheet. Sheet is flat, rolled material up to 0.125" thick, and other material not considered strip, normally supplied in widths to 24".

9.2 Plate. Plate is flat, rolled material 0.125" thick or greater.

9.3 Strip. Strip is flat, rolled material up to 0.060" thick in widths under twelve inches (12").



### APPENDIX D

# PROCESS SPECIFICATION FOR THE NS-4 COATING

# SPECIFICATION I NS-4 Coating Modifier Composition

1.0 SCOPE

This specification describes the composition and processing requirements for producing the modifier powder constituent of the NS-4 oxidation-resistant coating for Cl29Y and other columbium- and tantalum-base alloys.

2.0 APPLICABLE DOCUMENTS

R. T. Wimber and A. R. Stetson, "Development of Coatings for Tantalum Nozzle Vanes", NASA CR-54529 (July 1967).

H. E. Shoemaker and A. R. Stetson, "Silicide Coatings for Tantalum and Columbium Alloys", NASA CR-72519 (August 1969).

#### 3.0 REQUIREMENTS

The requirements of this specification apply to components designated as Solar controlled items applicable to S.O. 6-4444-7.

- 3.1 Responsibilities
  - 3.1.1 General

Each department at Solar engaged in the manufacturing of the NS-4 oxidation-resistant coating shall be responsible for implementing the provisions of this procedure.

3.1.2 Requests to deviate from any requirement herein shall be supported by comprehensive test data to substantiate the reliability of the deviation and indicate why the deviation is necessary. No deviation to the requirements of this procedure shall be made until written approval is obtained from both the cognizant Solar department, Solar Materials Engineering Laboratory.

#### 4.0 MATERIALS AND TEST EQUIPMENT

Tungsten <44 $\mu$ m powder, (O<sub>2</sub> 2000 ppm max; Mo 250 ppm max; Fe 30 ppm max; Al, Ca, C, Si, Cr, Ni, Cu, Mn, Mg and Sn 10 ppm max each).

Molybdenum <44 $\mu$ m powder (O<sub>2</sub> 2000 ppm max; W 250 ppm max; Fe 30 ppm max; Al, Ca, C, Si, Cr, Ni, Cu, Mn, Mg and Sn 10 ppm max each).

Vanadium Hydride VHx 99.5% <44µm powder (prepared from 99.5% vanadium and palladium diffused hydrogen).

Titanium Hydride TiH<sub>2</sub> 99.5% <44 $\mu$ m powder (prepared from 99.5% titanium sponge and palladium diffused hydrogen).

Argon: dew point -100°C, 1 ppm 0,

Acetone: Reagent grade

Alumina Ball Mill

Fischer Sub-Sieve Sizer

10µm Sieve

Analytical Balance

Vacuum Oven: 200°C temperature limit, 13 Pa capability.

#### 5.0 MODIFIER POWDER PREPARATION

- 5.1 Add powder mixture consisting of 50 weight percent tungsten, 20 weight percent molybdenum and 15 weight percent each of vanadium, 20 weight titanium hydride to alumina ball mill then wet powder with 10 weight percent xylene and mill for 22 to 26 hours.
- 5.2 Remove milled powder from mill and decant off excess xylene and allow remainder to evaporate.
- 5.3 Wash dried powder with two successive aliquots (10 weight percent) of acetone. After decanting the excess from the last wash, vacuum dry the powder at 100°C for 16 to 18 hours.

#### 6.0 QUALITY ASSURANCE

- 6.1 Particle size and distribution. The Fischer sub-sieve size of the product (ASTM B330-65) shall be between 4.0 and 5.0 µm and 40 to 50 weight percent should pass a 10 µm screen.
- 5.2 The density of the dried powder measured by a pycnometer shall be 8.5 to 8.6 gm/cc at 20°C.

# 7.0 STORAGE

Store powder in a sealed container under an argon atmosphere.

#### SPECIFICATION II

# NS-4 Modifier Coating Application to Internal Surface of C129Y Hollow Vane

1.0 SCOPE

This specification describes the processing and composition requirements for applying the NS-4 oxidation-resistant modifier constituent to the internal surface of a hollow Cl29Y nozzle vane.

2.0 APPLICABLE DOCUMENTS

NS-4 Coating Modifier Composition Specification I.

V. S. Moore and A. R. Stetson, "NS-4 Coating Process Development for Columbium Alloy Airfoils", AMMRC CTR-76-8, Final Report on Contract DAAG46-74-C-0089 (March 1976).

## 3.0 REQUIREMENTS

The requirements of this specification apply to components designated as Solar controlled items applicable to S.O. 6-4444-7.

3.1 Responsibilities

3.1.1 General

Each department at Solar engaged in the manufacturing of the NS-4 oxidation-resistant coating shall be responsible for implementing the provisions of this procedure.

3.1.2 Requests to deviate from any requirement herein shall be supported by comprehensive test data to substantiate why the deviation is necessary. No deviation to the requirements of this procedure shall be made until written approval is obtained from both the cognizant Solar department, Solar Materials Engineering Laboratory.

## 4.0 MATERIALS

Abrasive Blast Cabinet with 250 to 500  $\mu m$  garnet media and 0.4 to 0.55 MPa gauge air supply.

Vapor Degreaser filled with technical grade 1,1,1- trichloroethane.

Mechanical Mixer

Linear Withdrawal Apparatus with controlled range of 5 to 30 mm/min.

2-ethoxyethanol-reagent grade Acetone reagent grade Polymethylmethocrylate solution - Rohm and Hass B7 or equivalent Cotton tipped swabs Graduated cylinder - 50 cc capacity Light cotton gloves Analytical balance Vacuum oven - 200°C capability, 13 Pa capability NS-4 Modifier powder - NS-4 coating modifier specification or equivalent.

5.0 NS-4 Modifier Dipping Slurry Preparation

Blend with mechanical mixer equal volumes of the polymethylmethacrylate solution and 2-ethoxyethanol to prepare the vehicle, then add a weight of the modifier powder equal to 5.7 times the weight blended vehicle to the vehicle. Continue mixing until a viscous slurry free of lumps is obtained.

5.1 Quality Assurance

Specific gravity of the powder slurry shall be 3.9 to 4.0 at 20°C.

- 6.0 Cl29Y Surface Preparation and Application of NS-4 Modifier Powder Coating
  - 6.1 Abrasive blast both internal and external surfaces of Cl29Y vane.
  - 6.2 Vapor degrease.
  - 6.3 Record weight of part.
  - 6.4 Attach vane to linear withdrawal apparatus with the axis of the vane cavity inclined 20 to 30 degrees from the axis of withdrawal .
  - 6.5 Lower vane into NS-4 modifier slurry until completely immersed and wait until slurry surface is even and smooth.
  - 6.6 Withdraw vane at a rate of 11 millimeters per minute until completely clear of surface of slurry.
  - 6.7 Cover slurry container to minimize evaporation when not in use.
  - 6.8 Remove coated vane from linear withdrawal apparatus and allow to dry in air for two hours.

- 6.9 Using cotton gloves and cotton tipped swabs, moistened with reagentgrade acetone, carefully remove the dried slurry from the outer surfaces of the Cl29Y vane. Take care not to re-wet or remove the coating from the inner surface and feather a radius of the inner coating thickness at each cavity opening.
- 6.10 Vacuum dry the coated C129Y vane at 130°C for two hours at a pressure of less than 133 Pa.

## 7.0 QUALITY ASSURANCE

Weigh vacuum dried part. Modifier deposition shall be between 60 to 100 milligrams per square centimeter of internal area.

# <u>SPECIFICATION III</u> NS-4 Modifier Coating Application to External Surface of C129Y Vane

1.0 SCOPE

This specification describes the composition and processing requirements for applying the NS-4 oxidation-resistant modifier constituent to the external surface of a Cl29Y nozzle vane.

2.0 APPLICABLE DOCUMENTS

NS-4 Coating Modifier Composition Specification I

NS-4 Modifier Coating Application Specification II

3.0 REQUIREMENTS

The requirements of this specification apply to components designated as Solar controlled items applicable to S.O. 6-4444-7.

- 3.1 Responsibilities
  - 3.1.1 General

Each department at Solar engaged in the manufacturing of the NS-4 oxidation-resistant coating shall be responsible for implementing the provisions of this procedure.

3.1.2 Requests to deviate from any requirement herein shall be supported by comprehensive test data to substantiate why the deviation is necessary. No deviation shall be made until written approval is obtained from both the cognizant Solar department, Solar Materials Engineering Laboratory.

### 4.0 MATERIALS

Abrasive Blast Cabinet with 250 to 500 µm garnet media and 0.4 to 0.55 MPa gage air supply. Vapor degreaser filled with technical grade 1,1,1- trichloroethane. Mechanical Mixer or Alumina Ball Mill and Balls Spray Gun - DeVilbiss Model GGA-Series 500 with F-tip or equivalent Air supply - 0.2 to 0.55 MPa gage E-4 Vehicle - Ethyl cellulose, butyl alcohol, xylene, Stoddard solvent Graduated Cylinder - 50 cc capacity Light cotton gloves Analytical balance

NS-4 modifier powder - NS-4 coating modifier specification I or equivalent.

5.0 NS-4 MODIFIER SPRAY SLURRY PREPARATION

Mix 75 parts by weight of the modifier powder with 25 parts by weight of the E-4 vehicle until it is free of lumps.

5.1 Quality Assurance

Specific gravity of the spray slurry shall be between 2.3 and 2.8 at 20°C.

- 6.0 C129Y SURFACE PREPARATION AND APPLICATION OF NS-4 MODIFIER POWDER COATING
  - 6.1 If vane is hollow and uncoated on any surface, follow procedure in in NS-4 Modifier Coating Specification II.
  - 6.2 If vane is hollow and internal cavity is coated, procede to Step 6.6.
  - 6.3 If vane is solid, abrasive blast to clean surface.
  - 6.4 Vapor degrease vane.
  - 6.5 Record weight of cleaned vane.
  - 6.6 Using light cotton gloves to hold vane, uniformly apply the NS-4 powder bisque to the external surfaces of the vane by spraying the NS-4 modifier spray slurry.

#### 7.0 QUALITY ASSURANCE

Modifier deposition shall be between 60 and 100 milligrams per square centimeter of vane surface.

## SPECIFICATION IV

NS-4 Coating Bonding and Formation on Surface of C129Y Vane

1.0 SCOPE

This specification describes the processing and composition requirements for bonding and forming the NS-4 oxidation-resistant coating to the surface of a Cl29Y nozzle vane.

2.0 APPLICABLE DOCUMENTS

NS-4 Modifier Coating Application Specification II

NS-4 Modifier Coating Application Specification III

3.0 REQUIREMENTS

The requirements of this specification apply to components designated as Solar controlled items applicable to S.O. 6-4444-7.

- 3.1 Responsibilities
  - 3.1.1 General

Each department at Solar engaged in the manufacturing of the NS-4 oxidation-resistant coating shall be responsible for implementing the provisions of this procedure.

3.1.2 Requests to deviate from any requirement herein shall be supported by comprehensive test data to substantiate why the deviation is necessary. No deviation shall be made until written approval is obtained from both the cognizant Solar department, Solar Materials Engineering Laboratory.

## 4.0 MATERIALS

NS-4 modifier coated Cl29Y vanes per NS-4 Modifier Coating Application Specifications II and III.

Silicon 99.1 percent, 300 to 600  $\mu$ m particle size, maximum impurities 0.34 percent Fe, 0.03 percent Ca, 100 ppm 0<sub>2</sub>.

Titanium sponge, 99.5 percent pure.

Incomel 600 retort with tungsten covered bottom and double walled liner fabricated from B66 or Cb-lZr. Space between liner walls to be filled with titanium sponge as shown below.

Vacuum pump

Argon - 100°C dewpoint, <1 ppm 0, <1 ppm N

TIG Welder

MA 1

Leak Check solution - Snoop or equivalent

Oil trapped pressure release bubbler

Furnace with 1200°C capability

Vacuum furnace with 1550°C and 1.0 millipascal capabilities

Columbium or tantalum racks for holding vanes.

- 5.0 NS-4 MODIFIER SINTERING PROCEDURE
  - 5.1 Load NS-4 modifier coated vanes onto columbium or tantalum racks and place in vacuum furnace, taking care not to damage the modifier bisque.
  - 5.2 Evacuate furnace to 1.0 millipascal or less.
  - 5.3 Increase temperature of furnace to 1516°C while maintaining a pressure less than 13 millipascals and sinter modifier coated vanes for three hours at 1516 +5°C.
  - 5.4 Cool and reweigh parts.
- 6.0 QUALITY ASSURANCE

The sintered modifier weight shall be 87 to 90 percent of its initial value.

- 7.0 NS-4 COATING FORMATION AND BONDING PROCESS
  - 7.1 Partially fill the innermost cavity of the Cb-lZr or B-66 liner with the silicon powder.
  - 7.2 Imbed the sintered NS-4 modifier coated Cl29Y vanes and a control coupon of Cl29Y coated with the sintered NS-4 modifier in the powder and cover them with the silicon powder.
  - 7.3 Place the liner and its lid (covered with titanium sponge in the Inconel retort and seal it by TIG welding.
  - 7.4 Leak check the weld by pressurizing with argon and watching for bubbles along weld after wetting with leak check solution.
  - 7.5 Reweld if necessary to seal noted leaks.
  - 7.6 Evacuate retort to at least 26 pascals and backfill with argon three times, leaving retort under an argon blanket at 102 kPa pressure with the pressure release bubbler attached to vent the excess argon.

- 7.7 Place retort in furnace at  $1150 \pm 5$  °C and silicide NS-4 modifier coated vanes for eight hours.
- 7.8 Cool and record weight of NS-4 coated C129Y vanes.
- 8.0 QUALITY ASSURANCE
  - 8.1 The silicided modifier coating on the vanes shall have gained from 65 to 70 percent additional weight based on the modifier coating weight of the sintered vanes.
  - 8.2 Metallographic examination of a test coupon must indicate that the silicided layer extends 40 to 100 µm into the Cl29Y substrate beneath the silicided modifier.
- 9.0 POST-CASTING PROTECTION

WEAL V

Oxidize NS-4 coated Cl29Y vanes in furnace for one hour at 1371 + 15°C.

ł

PRECEDING PAGE BLANK - NOT FILMED

(zu

DISTRIBUTION LIST US ARMY AVIATION RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT COMMAND MANUFACTURING TECHNOLOGY (MANTECH) PROJECTS FINAL REPORT - AVRADCOM TR 80-F-2

Commander US Army Aviation Research & Development Command P.O. Box 209 St. Louis, MO 63166 Attn: DRDAV-EXT (10) Attn: DRDAV-D (1) Attn: DRDAV-N (1)

Project Manager Advanced Attack Helicopter P.O. Box 209 St. Louis, MO 63166 Attn: DRCPM-AAH-TM (2) Attn: DPCPM-AAH-TP (1)

Project Manager, Black Hawk P.O. Box 209 St. Louis, MO 63166 Attn: DRCPM-BH-T (2)

Project Manager CH-47 Modernization P.O. Box 209 St. Louis, MO 63166 Attn: DRCPM-CH47M-T (2)

Project Manager Aircraft Survivability Equipment P.O. Box 209 St. Louis, MO 63166 Attn: DRCPM-ASF-TM (2)

Project Manager, Cobra P.O. Box 209 St. Louis, MO 63166 Attn: DRCPM-CO-T (2)

Project Manager Advanced Scout Helicopter P.O. Box 209 St. Louis, MO 63166 Attn: DRDAV-ASH (2)

1000

Project Manager Navigation/Control Systems Ft. Monmouth, NJ 07703 Attn: DRCPM-NC-TM (2) Project Manager Tactical Airborne Remotely Piloted Vehicle/Drone Systems P.O. Box 209 St. Louis, MO 63166 Attn: DRCPM-RPV (2) Commander US Army Materiel Development and Readiness Command 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333 Attn: DRCMT (4) Director Applied Technology Laboratory Research & Technology Laboratories Ft. Eustis, VA 23604 Attn: DAVDL-ATL-ATS (2) Director Research & Technology Laboratories AVRADCOM Moffett Field, CA 94035 Attn: DAVDL-AL-D (2) Director Langley Directorate US Army Air Mobility R&D Laboratory (AVRADCOM) Mail Stop 266 Hampton, VA 23365 Attn: DAVDL-LA (2) Commander US Army Avionics Research & Development Activity Ft. Monmouth, NJ 07703

Attn: DAVAA-) (2)

#### DISTRIBUTION LIST (Cont)

Commander

Director, Lewis Directorate US Army Air Mobility R&D Labs 21000 Brookpark Road Cleveland, OH 44135 Attn: DAVDL-LE (2) Director US Army Materials & Mechanics Research Center Watertown, MA 02172 Attn: DRXMR-PT (25) Director US Army Industrial Base Engineering Activity Rock Island Arsenal Rock Island, IL 61201 Attn: DRXIB-MT (4) Director Air Force Materials Laboratory Wright-Patterson Air Force Base Dayton, OH 45433 Attn: AFML/LT (2) Commander U.S. Army Electronics Command Ft. Monmouth, NJ 07703 Attn: DRSEL-RD-P (1) Commander US Army Missile Command Redstone Arsennal, AL 35809 Attn: DRSMI-IIE (1) Mr. P. Baumgartner Chief, Manufacturing Technology Bell Helicopter Textron P.O. Box 482 Ft. Worth, TX 76101 (2) Mr. A. S. Falcone Chief, Materials Engineering Bloomfield, CT 06002 (2)

Mr. R. Pickney Manufacturing Technology Boeing Vertol Company P.O. Box 16858 Philadelphia, PA 19142 (2) US Army Troop Support & Aviation Materiel Readiness Command 4300 Goodfellow Blvd. St. Louis, MO 63120 Attn: DRSTS-PLC (1) Attn: DRSTS-ME (1) Attn: DRSTS-DIL (2) Commander US Army Armament Command Rock Island, IL 61201 Attn: DRSAR-PPR-1W (1) Commander US Army Tank-Automotive Command Warren, MI 48090 Attn: DRSTA-RCM.1 (1) Commander Defense Documentation Center Cameron Station, Building 5 5010 Duke Street Alexandria, VA 22314 (12) Hughes Helicopters-Summa Centinella Ave. & Teale St. Culver City, CA 90230 Attn: Mr. R. E. Moore Bldg. 314, MS T-419 (2) Sikorsky Aircraft Division United Aircraft Corporation Stratford, CT 06497 Attn: Mr. Melvin M. Schwartz Chief, Mfg. Tech. (2) Mr. J. E. Knott General Manager Detroit Diesel Allison P.O. Box 894 Indianapolis, IN 46206 (2) Mr. H. Franzen General Electric Company 10449 St. Charles Rock Road St. Ann, MO 63074 (2)

# DISTRIBUTION LIST (Cont)

Mr. V. Strautman, Manager Process Technology Laboratory AVCO-Lycoming Corporation 550 South Main Street Stratford, CT 08497 (2)

Grumman Aerospace Corporation Plant 2 Bethpage, NY 11714 Attn: Richard Cyphers, Mgr. Mfg. Technology (1) Attn: Albert Grenci, Mfg. Engineer, Dept. 231 (1)

Mr. D. M. Schwartz Dept. 55-10, Bldg. 572 Lockheed Missiles & Space Co., Inc. P.O. Box 504 Sunnyvale, CA 94086 (2)

MEL 7

Mr. Ray Traynor Mfg Research & Development Pratt & Whitney Aircraft Div. United Technologies Corp. East Hartford, CT 06108 (2)

Mr. R. Drago Advanced Drive Systems Technology Boeing Vertol Company P.O. Box 16858 Philadelphia, PA 19142 (2)

Mr. H. Dorfman Research Specialist, Mfg. Research 1111 Lockheed Way Sunnyvale, CA 94088 (2)
I The object term of the architecture wave is produced with the production of the wave of the production of the architecture of t The objective of this proper wave to proving transmost and antiple wave huntle wereness at the waity to an under object was at the proper and the start device transmoster and antiple wave huntle methods. Each was and wall was ablend for a method wave and a children transmoster and antiple wave and the better and provide an approximation. The way was at the start wave and the start wave and the device and provide an approximation with the start and and the start wave and the start wave and the device and provide an approximation with the start and and the start wave and the start wave and the device and thereafter a the provide water and a start and the start wave and the start wave and the device and thereafter a the provide water and water and the start wave and the start wave and the device and thereafter and the start wave and the start wave and the start wave and and the start and thereafter and the start wave and the start wave and the start wave and the start and thereafter wave and the start wave and the start wave and the start wave and the start at the start wave and and the start wave and the start wave and the start wave and and the properties at the start wave and wave and the start wave and the start wave and the start wave and the start at the start of the start wave and the start wave and the start wave and and the start wave and the start at the start of the start wave and the start wave and the start wave and and the start wave and the star olandizan al on ortani 1919 - Anno - Anno 1919 - Anno - Anno 1919 - Anno 1919 - Anno 1919 - Anno rokumektumeattavya (sotte nayaya (sotte nayaya Barreerot Martabasa (sotte Martabasana "nakua Karata wana "nakua I 1 e linelessi, saiterin. Siterseriee NULLARIASIA SALANA 1 1 1 1 2 M 1 4 4 Key Weith I ļ Any Meterials and Mechanica Penearist Serves. Meterions, adactowers (2017) repears particular scars of the Mark Mark of Theory Control North Serves and Als Nerves 1, North Varia Serves and Als Nerves 2, Star Theorem Devention (2017), An Weike, Ski (2007) 1, North Markers, Pr., Bak Marks, Serves (2017), Nathan Research (2017), An Marks, Ski (2007), 1, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2007), 1, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2007), 1, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2007), 1, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2017), 2, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2017), 2, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2017), 2, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2017), 2, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2017), 2, Shi (2017), An Marker (2017), An Marks, Ski (2017), 2, Shi (2017), An Marks, Ski (2017), 3, Shi (2017), An Marks, Ski (2017), 4, Shi (2017), 4, S ۱ Any Materials and Worhanica Remarks "Anney, Waterion, standonbarch (2017) Contract, Paterission, Narry Austing, Mallyr Ak, Thanke Contract, Paterission, Narry Ak, Shenkar Li Nau, Vic. Stevens and Ak. Shenkar Start Publican Retension and Ak. Shenkar Retentional Materia, Public Ake, Mariany of Retentional Materia, Public Ander-Shenkar (1974) (1981) - Marks Onder Shenkar (1974) (1981) - Marks Onder Shenkar Final Pepers, August 2, 1974 (1974) I I 1 ļ Ţ We objectives of this proper were to produce investment cast wingle were notice expends in Cityr wing vict-metrics. Yill and occurs the were were and the productive of the productive of the constraint of the product of the pro-ent were as a minimum of the proper state of the productive of the productive of the constraint of the productive of the pro-tem were as a minimum of the productive of the productive of the productive of the productive of the pro-tem were as a minimum of the productive of the productive of the productive of the productive of the pro-tem were as a minimum of the productive of the productive of the productive of the pro-tem and incomparison of the productive of the productive of the productive of the productive of the pro-tem and incomparison of the productive of the productive of the productive of the pro-ated and incompare static first the minimum of the productive of the productive of the pro-tem of the productive of the productive of the protein of the productive of the pro-ated and incompare static first the minimum of the productive of the productive of the pro-tem of the productive of the productive of the protein of the productive of the protein of the protein of the protein of the productive of the protein of protein of protein of the protein of protein of protein of the protein of the protein of the protein of the protein I The objectives of this program ware to produce investment cast wingle ware noted a semant in CDNM silvy the there objectives of this program ware to produce investment cast wingle ware noted a semant in CDNM silvy the semantal and selective and semantal the set of children's Program ware the seminal and the second term ware ablend the program ware to produce investment cast and hildren's Program ware the seminal semantal the term ware ablend the program ware to produce investment and the seminal second the seminal term in the second second second second second second second and the seminal second second the ablendance mere program ware set in price and and an able wave control server is second second the second second second second second second and an able wave control second and an able wave control second second second the second second second second second second second and an able wave second second second second the second second second second second second second second as a second second second second second program to a second program is a structure of problem inspection. The second second second second second second second second program to a second the second sec Columbtum alloya Solid C1239 Coreal C1241 Coreal Caratina Burreriq Burdarian NS-4 contine Marta rupture Streas rupture Columbtum alloys Solid C129y Corred Calating Burner 114 Calation NS-a routing Morale une Tenaile Stream opplure ļ UNCLASSIFIED UNLING UNCLASSIFIED UNLINITED DISTRIBUTION I Key Words Key Words 1 1 1 ۱ day Miserial and Mechanics Newarch Conter, conterns metanometers Newarch Conter, mature and Mechanics Newarch Control mature and All Station day the Law, ALL Stevens and All Station Clair Withinse International, Newarch of Copy of International Newserver, P.O. Day 80964, San Digeo, Claironnia 9118. Young Newyork - Walkow Control 2015 Flail Meport, NewarC, P.W. Co Manuel 91, 5973 Flail Meport, NewarC, New Con Manuel 2, 1953 Flail Meport, NewarC, New Con Mercul 2, 1953 ۱ ł I I I I I ł ۱ I

V ......

sterials and Machanics Research Center.	8	a stay rectified the sub rectified to set all the set	1 P
stertow, Messechusetta 02772		Matertown, Massachusetta 07172	
WPLER, PRECISION CAST COLUMBIUM ALLOY GAS TURBINE	DACLASSI PIZO	COMPLEX, PRECISION CAST CULUMBIUM ALLUM CAS TURBINE DECIME MORATES COMPED TO DESCET ONLIGATION	
	NALIVITED DISTRIBUTION	. L. Hatt. M.C. Stevens and M.D. Statento	
		The second se	:
Lar Turbines International, An Operating Group of	Tey Words	International Marwatar P C Dov Block for States	ACT NO. TIL
serverional marvagent, r-U. dou surad, sen viegu. 	Contraction of Land Contraction	a California 92138.	
1 Barness AURANCES PR AN2		Technical Report AVRADCOM TH 80-F-2	Activ
us - tabler. Contract DAAC46-76-C-0051	Castings Burber rid	silum - tables, Contract DAAG46-76-0-0051	Lawfinds Rurser
Protect 1758129, Auchos Code 1497,94,5,58129	Oxidation NS-4 continu	D/A Project 1758129, AMCMS rode 1497,94.5,58129	not spirit a cost spirit.
al menut Auture 2, 1974 to August 2, 1979	Mozele vene Tenarle	Final Report, August 2, 1976 for August 2, 1979	Nuvele vane Terrie
	Stress rupture		Stress rupture
ctives of this program were to produce investment cast single	e vane nozzle segmenta in C129% alloy (Cb-	The objectives of this program were to produce investment cast sind	die vane hnzzie wegmenen in vijny alley - b-
0.31) and to cost these vanes with the MS-4 (50M-20Mo-'571-1.	<pre>OV) silicide costing. Initially, both cured</pre>	TOWE-TUNGLAY) and to cost these vanes with the NS-4 (50M-20My-15T)-	"TOVI #slicide costinu. Initially, torth cored
I vane segments were specified but due to problems experiency	ed in the consumable arc process, cored	and solid vane sequents were specufied but due to problems experies	sced in the consumable art process, cored
re deleted from the program acope. NEW Metals of Albany, Or.	egon was the casting subcontractor and though	varies were deterred if on the program schools. How were is of Alhany, -	requiring the casting subminitactor and the up
• had previous experience with this alloy and other columbiu.	alloys in general, several problems developed.	THERE IS A LARK THE ACT TO BELL INTER SUCCESSION REPORTED IN A STATE AND A	alloys in general, several problems is sold and
trode esterial supplied was low in yttrium. which might have	contributed to the poor fluidity during arc	And the wards and the set and the best did a set of the set of the set	re contrabuted to the poor fluctury furing and
incomplete fill of thin welled sections. The solid nozzles	s and round test bars were acceptable and were	welt and incomplete fill of thin walled sections. The solid norgie	is and round test bars were as estably and were
costing processing and testing. Process specifications for 1	both slurry and we and die applications of	used in costing processing and testing. Process sperifications for	both slurry spray and din scripparions of
modifier were prepared. Tensile and stress rupture tests of	f conted specimena displayed exceptional	the NS-4 modifier were prepared. Tensils and miress rupture tests	of coated specimens fincieved every note
a at alastad testations and should sumirically to solution	these ware allows factbarrel	properties at elevated temperatures and showed superiority to cohe	1-hear ware allows facthermal
ances of \$500 bours (at 760 and 1093er) are arbibled (at 1	MS-4 control (1204 eventeens: in the testion	lives in excess of 5500 hours (at 760 and 1093*C) were exhibited hv	- NS-4 COMPAGE 1297 BRACKWARES IN THE PARTY
ervere thermal cycles and profiles imposed, the airfoil sp	weimens typically survived about 100 hours.	under the severe thermal cycles and profiles taposed, the airfoll s	serimens typically surviced an or for score.
<pre>mail.comments versus versus versus. we will be an end will setten versus mail.commenten.i. we have setten versus ver</pre>	UNCLUTED DEFINITION Rey Words Columbium alloys Solid Critypy Solid Critypy Solid Critypy Solid Critypy Solid Stream appears in Clify alloy (Ch- MU allocatis expendent in Clify alloy (Ch- WU allocatis expendent in Clify alloy (Ch- WU allocatis expendent in Clify alloy (Ch- WU allocatis expendent in Clify alloy (Ch- MU allocatis expendent in Clify alloy (Ch- and in the consumable arc pricela, cored with the consumable arc pricela, cored which is the consumable arc pricela, pricela	BOLL MCLARK CONTON UNDER OF ALL SECTION OF ALL SECTION OF ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL SECTION OF ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL ALL AL	<ul> <li>(including the Complements a complementation)</li> <li>(including a complementation)</li></ul>
soon meterial Buyparted was ton in yritium, which right nerv incomplete fill of thin welled sections. The solid noziles	contributed to the poor fluidity during are and round test bars were acceptable and were	The storthrow marental suppliced was low in yithting, which multimed the subject of the solution of the solution of the sectors.	一下来,这个人的是一个人们的自己的一个人,就是有这些一个的,就是我们的的事实也。 医口口管 化甲基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基乙酰基
mating processing and testing. Process specifications for b	which found their using were considered and were	used in costing processing and resting. Process specifications for	end distriction react series and an and the series and the series of the
modifies were prepared. Tensile and stress rupture tests of a st siewsted temperatures and abowed superiority to cohait- encess of \$500 hours (at 760 and 1093ec) were exhibited by N emerses thermal routes and rocking second sho surful to	costed specimens displayed exceptional base vane alloys. Tsothermal oxidation bed could (129) specimens. In rig testing, over	The MSA modifier are present. Transit and strain fugtors are a properties a slowest environment of the solution type of the strain them in evenes of 5000 hours (at 250 and 1001) were estimated	ок основно вреговени покульте и еристи. Светеже одно исто постеква, колатист У Мона совека Пола вресовениото со статикато
	coment of the state about the total the	in and a second se	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·