



.



# Carnegie-Mellon University

PITTSBURGH, PENNSYLVANIA 15213



W.P.#20-76-77

RR- 1 398 WP-26-76-77 Management Sciences Research Report No.

(6) A NOTE ON DUALITY IN DISJUNCTIVE PROGRAMMING. by Egon/Balas Research rep April 1976 15 Noop14-75-C-p621, Revised Nove WSF-MPS-73-48534 This report was prepared as part of the activities of the Management

NSF- MPS73-08534 A02 of the National Science Foundation and Contract NO014-75-C-0621 NR 047-048 with the U.S. Office of Naval Research. Reproduction in whole or in part is permitted for any purpose of the U.S. Government.

> Management Science Research Group Graduate School of Industrial Administration Carnegie-Mellon University Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15213

403 426

12

## Abstract

We state a duality theorem for disjunctive programming, which generalizes to this class of problems the corresponding result for linear programming.

.



### A NOTE ON

### DUALITY IN DISJUNCTIVE PROGRAMMING

by

Egon Balas

#### 1. Introduction.

A disjunctive programming problem is a linear programming problem with disjunctive constraints. Mixed integer programs and many other nonconvex programming problems can be stated in this form. One advantage of this formulation is that it yields a variety of cutting planes with desirable properties (see Refs. 1,...,4; and, for an early version, 5). Another one is that it leads to nice theoretical characterizations: a disjunctive program can be shown to be equivalent to a linear program; the family of all valid inequalities can be described in terms of a scaled polar set; the facets of the convex hull of fessible points are the extreme points or extreme halflines of this polar set; for a large family of disjunctive programs (which includes the zero-one mixed integer program, the linear complementarity problem and other familiar models), the convex hull of fessible points can be generated sequentially, imposing the disjunctions of a conjunctive normal form one by one (see Ref. 6).

In this note we state a duality theorem for disjunctive programs, which generalizes to this class of problems the duality theorem of linear programming.

÷

......

2. The Duality Theorem.

Consider the disjunctive program

(P)  
$$z_{0} = \min cx$$
$$\bigvee_{h \in Q} \left( A^{h} x \ge b^{h} \\ x \ge 0 \right)$$

where  $A^h$  is a matrix and  $b^h$  a vector,  $\forall$  heQ. The constraint set of (P) requires x to satisfy at least one of the |Q| bracketed systems of inequalities.

We define the dual of (P) to be the problem

(D) 
$$\bigwedge_{h \in Q} \begin{cases} w - u^{h}b^{h} \leq 0 \\ u^{h}A^{h} \leq c \\ u^{h} \geq 0 \end{cases}$$

The constraint set of (D) requires each  $u^h$ , heQ, to satisfy the corresponding bracketed system, and w to satisfy each of them.

Let

$$\begin{split} \mathbf{x}_{h} &= \{\mathbf{x} | \mathbf{A}^{h} \mathbf{x} \ge \mathbf{b}^{h}, \ \mathbf{x} \ge \mathbf{0}\}, \quad \overline{\mathbf{x}}_{h} &= \{\mathbf{x} | \mathbf{A}^{h} \mathbf{x} \ge \mathbf{0}, \ \mathbf{x} \ge \mathbf{0}\}; \\ \mathbf{v}_{h} &= \{\mathbf{u}^{h} | \mathbf{u}^{h} \mathbf{A}^{h} \le \mathbf{c}, \ \mathbf{u}^{h} \ge \mathbf{0}\}, \quad \overline{\mathbf{v}}_{h} &= \{\mathbf{u}^{h} | \mathbf{u}^{h} \mathbf{A}^{h} \le \mathbf{0}, \ \mathbf{u}^{h} \ge \mathbf{0}\} \end{split}$$

Further, let

 $q^* = \{heq|x_h \neq \emptyset\}$ ,  $q^{**} = \{heq|v_h \neq \emptyset\}$ .

-2-

We will assume the following

Regularity condition:

 $(Q^* \neq \emptyset, Q \setminus Q^{**} \neq \emptyset) \Rightarrow Q^* \setminus Q^{**} \neq \emptyset;$ 

i.e., if (P) is feasible and (D) is infeasible, then there exists heQ such that  $X_h \neq \emptyset$ ,  $U_h = \emptyset$ .

Theorem. Assume that (P) and (D) satisfy the regularity condition. Then exactly one of the following two situations holds.

1. Both problems are feasible; each has an optimal solution and  $z_0 = w_0$ .

2. One of the problems is infeasible; the other one either is infeasible or has no finite optimum.

<u>Proof.</u> (1) Assume that both (P) and (D) are feasible. If (P) has no finite minimum, then there exists heQ such that  $\overline{X}_{h} \neq \emptyset$  and  $\overline{x} \in \overline{X}_{h}$  such that  $c\overline{x} < 0$ . But then  $U_{h} = \emptyset$ , i.e., (D) is infeasible; a contradiction.

Thus (P) has an optimal solution, say  $\overline{x}$ . Then the inequality  $cx \ge z_0$ is a consequence of the constraint set of (P); i.e.,  $x \in X_h$  implies  $cx \ge z_0$ ,  $\forall$  heQ. But then for all heQ\*, there exists  $u^h \in U_h$  such that  $u^h b^h \ge z_0$ . Further, since (D) is feasible, for each heQ\Q\* there exists  $\hat{u}^h \in U_h$ ; and since  $X_h = \emptyset$  (for heQ\Q\*), there also exists  $\overline{u}^h \in \overline{U}_h$  such that  $\overline{u}^h b^h > 0$ ,  $\forall$  heQ\Q\*. But then, defining

$$u^{h}(\lambda) = \hat{u}^{h} + \lambda u^{h}, heq \langle q \star \rangle,$$

for  $\lambda$  sufficiently large,  $u^{h}(\lambda) \varepsilon U_{h}$ ,  $u^{h}(\lambda) b^{h} \geq z_{o}$ ,  $\forall h \varepsilon Q \setminus Q^{*}$ .

Hence for all heQ, there exist vectors  $u^h$  satisfying the constraints of (D) for  $w = z_0$ . To show that this is the maximal value of w, we note that since  $\overline{x}$  is optimal for (P), there exists heQ such that

- 3-

But then by linear programming duality,

$$\begin{split} \mathbf{c} \mathbf{x} &= \max\{\mathbf{u}^{h} \mathbf{b}^{h} | \mathbf{u}^{h} \mathbf{\varepsilon} \mathbf{U}_{h}\} \\ &= \max\{\mathbf{w} | \mathbf{w} - \mathbf{u}^{h} \mathbf{b}^{h} \leq 0, \ \mathbf{u}^{h} \mathbf{\varepsilon} \mathbf{U}_{h}\} \\ &\geq \max\{\mathbf{w} | \bigwedge_{h \in \mathbf{Q}} (\mathbf{w} - \mathbf{u}^{h} \mathbf{b}^{h} \leq 0, \ \mathbf{u}^{h} \mathbf{\varepsilon} \mathbf{U}_{h})\} \end{split}$$

i.e.,  $w \leq z_0$ , and hence the maximum value of w is  $w_0 = z_0$ .

(ii) Assume that at least one of (P) and (D) is infeasible. If (P) is infeasible,  $X_h = \emptyset$ ,  $\forall h \in Q$ ; hence for all  $h \in Q$ , there exists  $\overline{u}^h \in \overline{U}_h$  such that  $\overline{u}^h b^h > 0$ .

If (D) is infeasible, we are done. Otherwise, for each heQ there exists  $\hat{u} \epsilon U_h$ . But then defining

$$u^{h}(\lambda) = \hat{u}^{h} + \lambda \overline{u}^{h}$$
, heq,

 $u^{h}(\lambda) \epsilon U_{h}$ , heQ, for all  $\lambda > 0$ , and since  $u^{-h}b^{h} > 0$ ,  $\forall$  heQ, w can be made arbitrarily large by increasing  $\lambda$ ; i.e., (D) has no finite optimum.

Conversely, if (D) is infeasible, then either (P) is infeasible and we are done, or else, from the regularity condition,  $Q^* Q^{**} \neq \emptyset$ ; and for heQ\*\Q\*\* there exists  $\hat{x} \in X_h$  and  $\bar{x} \in \overline{X_h}$  such that  $c\bar{x} < 0$ . But then

is a feasible solution to (P) for any  $\mu > 0$ , and since cx < 0, z can be made arbitrarily small by increasing  $\mu$ ; i.e., (P) has no finite optimum.

Q.E.D.

3. Discussion.

The above theorem asserts that either situation 1 or situation 2 holds for (P) and (D) <u>if</u> the regularity condition is satisfied. The following Corollary shows that the condition is not only sufficient but also necessary.

<u>Corollary</u>: If the regularity condition does not hold, then if (P) is feasible and (D) is infeasible, (P) has a finite minimum (i.e., there is a "duality gap").

<u>Proof.</u> Let (P) be feasible, (D) infeasible, and  $Q*Q** = \emptyset$ , i.e., for every heQ\*, let  $U_h \neq \emptyset$ . Then for each heQ\*, min{cx | x \in X\_h} is finite, hence (P) has a finite minimum. <u>Q.E.D</u>.

<u>Remark</u>. The theorem remains true if some of the variables of (P) [of (D)] are unconstrained, and the corresponding constraints of (D) [of (P)] are equalities.

The regularity condition can be expected to hold in all but some rather peculiar situations. In linear programming duality, the case when both the primal and the dual problem is infeasible only occurs for problems whose coefficient matrix A has the rather special property that there exists  $x \neq 0$ ,  $u \neq 0$ , satisfying the homogeneous system

$$Ax \ge 0$$
 ,  $x \ge 0$   
 $uA \le 0$  ,  $u \ge 0$ 

(see reference 7 for a discussion of this and some equivalent conditions). In this context, our regularity condition requires that, if the primal problem is feasible and the dual is infeasible, then at least one of the matrices  $A^{h}$  whose associated sets  $U_{h}$  are infeasible, should not have the above mentioned special property.

Though most problems satisfy this requirement, nevertheless there are situations when the regularity condition breaks down, as illustrated by the following example.

-5-

Consider the disjunctive program

(P) 
$$\begin{cases} -\mathbf{x}_{1} + \mathbf{x}_{2} \ge 0 \\ -\mathbf{x}_{1} - \mathbf{x}_{2} \ge -2 \\ \mathbf{x}_{1} - \mathbf{x}_{2} \ge 0 \end{cases} \quad \bigvee \quad \begin{cases} -\mathbf{x}_{1} + \mathbf{x}_{2} \ge 0 \\ \mathbf{x}_{1} - \mathbf{x}_{2} \ge 1 \\ \mathbf{x}_{1} - \mathbf{x}_{2} \ge 0 \end{cases}$$

and its dual

The primal problem (P) has an optimal solution  $\overline{x} = (0,2)$ , with  $c\overline{x} = -4$ ; whereas the dual problem (D) is infeasible. This is due to the fact that  $Q \setminus Q^{**} = \{2\}$  and  $X_2 = \emptyset$ ,  $U_2 = \emptyset$ , i.e., the regularity condition is violated. Here

$$\mathbf{X}_{2} = \left\{ \mathbf{x} \in \mathbf{R}_{+}^{2} \middle| \begin{array}{c} -\mathbf{x}_{1} + \mathbf{x}_{2} \geq 0 \\ \mathbf{x}_{1} - \mathbf{x}_{2} \geq 1 \end{array} \right\}, \quad \mathbf{U}_{2} = \left\{ \mathbf{u} \in \mathbf{R}_{+}^{2} \middle| \begin{array}{c} -\mathbf{u}_{1}^{2} + \mathbf{u}_{2}^{2} \leq -1 \\ \mathbf{u}_{1}^{2} - \mathbf{u}_{2}^{2} \leq -2 \end{array} \right\}.$$

The duality theorem discussed in this paper can be used to derive strong lower bounds on the value of  $z_0$  in the context of a branch and bound procedure. This is best done by using an appropriate relaxation of (P). For instance, in the case of a zero-one program the relaxation may consist of considering only one or two of the disjunctions  $x_j = 0$  or 1, the locally most relevant ones. In that case the linear program (D) is of manageable size; furthermore, (D) need not be solved completely, any feasible solution to it provides a valid lower bound on the value of  $z_0$ .

Another potential use is the derivation of strong cutting planes. If  $(\overline{w},\overline{u})$  is any feasible solution to (D) and  $a_j^h$ , jeN, are the columns of  $A^h$ , heQ, then

 $\sum_{j \in N} (\max_{i \in Q^{\star}} \frac{h_{i}h_{i}}{u_{i}}) x_{j} \geq \overline{w}$ 

is a valid cutting plane for (P) (see ref. 2).

#### References

- E. BALAS, Intersection Cuts from Disjunctive Constraints, MSRR #330, Carnegie-Mellon University, February 1974.
- E. BALAS, <u>Disjunctive Programming</u>: <u>Cutting Planes from Logical</u>
  <u>Conditions</u>, Nonlinear Programming 2, edited by O. L. Mangasarian,
  R. R. Meyer and S. M. Robinson, pp. 279-312, Academic Press, 1975.
- F. GLOVER, <u>Polyhedral Annexation in Mixed Integer and Combinatorial</u> <u>Programming</u>, Mathematical Programming, Vol. 9, pp. 161-188, 1975.
- R. G. JEROSLOW, <u>Cutting Planes for Relaxations of Integer Programs</u>, MSRR #347, Carnegie-Mellon University, July 1974.
- G. OWEN, <u>Cutting Planes for Programs with Disjunctive Constraints</u>, Journal of Optimization Theory and Applications, Vol. 11, pp. 49-55, 1973.
- E. BALAS, <u>Disjunctive Programming</u>: <u>Properties of the Convex Hull of</u> <u>Feasible Points</u>, MSRR #348, Carnegie-Mellon University, July 1974.

C. BERCTHALLER, <u>On the Duality Theorem of Linear Programming</u>, Revue Roumaine de Mathématiques Pures et Appliquées, Tome XII, pp. 611-616, 1967.

.

	IL FORE COMPLETING FORM
REPORT NUMBER 2. GOVT ACCESSION	NO NECIPIENT'S CATALOG NU LICE
Technical Report No. 398	
Technical Report No. 596	S TYPE OF REPORT & PERIOD COVERS
	Technical Benart
A Note on Duality in Disjunctive Programming	April 1976 Por Nov 107
	April 1970, Rev. Nov. 1970
	S. PERFORMING ORG. REPORT MOMBER
AU HORE	. CONTRACT OR GRANT NUMBER(+)
	N00014-75-C-0621
Egon Balas	MPS73-08534 A02 NSF
PERFERMING ORCANIZATION NAME AND ADDNESS	10. PRCCRAM - EMENT. F
Graduate School of Industrial Administration	ARCA & WORK UNIT NUMBERS
Carnegie-Mellon University	NR 047-048
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15213	
CANTELLING DEFICE NAME AND ADDRESS	12 REPOST DATE
Personnel and Training Research Programs	April 1076 Per Nov 1076
Office of Naval Research (Code 434)	13 NUMSER OF PAGES
Arlington, Virginia 22217	8
MOAITOPING AGENCY NAME & AUDRESS(If different from Controlling Out	Ice) 18 SECUAITY CLASS for the ante
	Unclassified
	154 DECLASSIFICATION DOWNGRAUTH
	ni Inan Basari
2.57 × D	nt from Report)
SUFFICENENTAGY NOTES	nt from Report)
SUFFICENENTARY NOTES	ni tran Report) mihurj
SUFFECENENTARY NOTES	ni from Report) mibsr) duality
SUPFICE FRITARY SOLL SUPFICE FRITARY SOLL Key WORDs (Convinue on recessor wide if necessar) and feandly by Mack on disjunctive programming, integer programming,	mit from Report) mithwr) duality
SUPPLEMENTARY NOTE: Key WOPD: (Continue on receive ende 11 necessary and teaming by Mark on disjunctive programming, integer programming,	mi from Report) mihar) duality
SUPPLIES IN STATEMENT of the scores and state and loss 20, 11 different SUPPLIES HOPDS (Continue on section wide if necessary and loss offs by block on disjunctive programming, integer programming, supplies "Continue on section die if necessary and identify of the score	mi from Report) mihari duality
SUPPOCEMENTARY world SUPPOCEMENTARY world Key words (continue on section wide theorement) and toundly by block on disjunctive programming, integer programming, world a continue on section of the theorement and toundly by block on We state a duality theorem for disjunctive pr to this class of problems the corresponding of	mi from Report) mither duality
SUPPOCEMENTARY world SUPPOCEMENTARY world Key WOPDs (continue on section wide three events and toundity by block on disjunctive programming, integer programming, Key first Continu on section wide three events and the block of the section We state a duality theorem for dif junctive pr to this class of problems the corresponding r	mi from Report) mithur, duality ogramming, which generalizes esult for linear programming.
SUPPOCEPHITALS SOIL SUPPOCEPHITALS SOIL Key WOPD's (continue on several enderth necessary and hermity by block on disjunctive programming, integer programming, SUPPOCE Continue on several distinctions and hermity of the soul We state a duality theorem for dif junctive pr to this class of problems the corresponding r	und from Report) mathematical duality duality ogramming, which generalizes esult for linear programming.
SUPFLEMENTARY world SUPFLEMENTARY world Key WOPD's (continue on several ended) in eccessory and houndly by block on disjunctive programming, integer programming, We state a duality theorem for disjunctive pr to this class of problems the corresponding r	multum Report) multum duality ogramming, which generalizes esult for linear programming.
SUFFICEEENTARY world SUFFICEEENTARY world Key HOPDs (continue on reason ende three every and heardly by block on disjunctive programming, integer programming, Continue on reason ende three every and heardly or not a number We state a duality theorem for disjunctive pr to this class of problems the corresponding r	multum Report) multum duality duality
SUPFLEMENTARY world SUPFLEMENTARY world Key WOPD: (continue on resear ende three every and harnoly by block on disjunctive programming, integer programming, We state a duality theorem for disjunctive pr to this class of problems the corresponding r	mu from Report) muthur muthur duality equation ogramming, which generalizes esult for linear programming.
Sufficient of the second of the second of the second secon	mi from Report) mahari duality ogramming, which generalizes esult for linear programming.
SUPPORTATION STATEMENT (In a contract anticipal in Block 20, 11 different SUPPORTATION AND AND CONTRACT AND REAL AND ADDRESS AND REAL PORTATION AND ADDRESS AN	mi from Report) mithur, duality e.s. ogramming, which generalizes esult for linear programming

.

SECONTY CLASSI ICATION OF THIS PAGE (MING DATE TO THE

1.

