UNCLASSIFIED

AD NUMBER: AD0895141 CLASSIFICATION CHANGES FO: Unclassified FROM: Confidential LIMITATION CHANGES FO: Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. FROM: Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be referred to Chief of Naval Research, Washington, DC 20360.
TO: Unclassified FROM: Confidential LIMITATION CHANGES TO: Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. FROM: Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
FROM: Confidential LIMITATION CHANGES FO: Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. FROM: Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
LIMITATION CHANGES TO: Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. =ROM: Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
FO: Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. -ROM: Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. FROM: Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
ROM: Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
-ROM: Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
Distribution authorized to U.S. Gov't. agencies and their contractors; Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
Administrative/Operational Use; 18 Jan 1951. Other requests shall be
AUTHORITY
CNR ltr dtd 1 Aug 1957; (CNA) Notice dtd 19 Mar 1981.

BEST POSSIBLE SCAN

REPRODUCTION QUALITY NOTICE

This document is the best quality available. The copy furnished to DTIC contained pages that may have the following quality problems:

- Pages smaller or larger than normal.
- Pages with background color or light colored printing.
- Pages with small type or poor printing; and or
- Pages with continuous tone material or color photographs.

Due to various output media available these conditions may or may not cause poor legibility in the microfiche or hardcopy output you receive.

L If this block is checked, the copy furnished to DTIC contained pages with color printing, that when reproduced in Black and White, may change detail of the original copy.

nerfield is a construction of the

UNCLASSIFI

0;3"4:hr

Orr 05231

18 January 1951

Front Cdif of Savel grant's a Sci FESTRINTICI, SIGT

NANNOUNCE

4

951

AD8

1

1

1

(Addendum to FFF Study of 769) - forwarding of

Hef: (a) CNG Conf 1tr ser (10114 of 24 Nov 1948

incl: (1) OEG Study No. 430 % dd ndum to OEG Study Nc. 368) " Computation of Probability of Visual Detection in Air Prographion"

2. Reference (a) forwarded (* Study No. 368, "Visual Petection in Air Interception" inclosure (1), an addendum to that study prepare tor the Operations Evaluation Group, is forwarded for a ir information and retention. It is an extension of the work presented in Study No. 368, and has be used in conjunction with the theory contained therein. It is presented and associated working groups which employ one to calculate the probability of visual detention of a target sirer ft by an eleborne observer, index is blight conditions of illumination, for a wide conce of the parameters involved.

2. When no longer required, this publication should be destroyed by burning. We rejeve of destruction need ' submitted.

DISTRIBUTION: Attachod list	R. B. MICKERSON By direction
AUTHENTICATED BY:	CLASSIFIED
LCDR, USN	A Crines of a state of

p. *4				<u>. 1/1</u> : 0593"
51.LV 37				ale a seconda e
05 30 31			,	512. NTS (2)
55				J., H. S., Fatux ont River, Hd J. T. R., SEC (2) G. D.R., NEL
Buships				7, W. Mor, I: Hanapolis 19 In 5 ruireac.
100 BuOrd	(*) j			C to: of Steff, UDAP (1) Son: APDNG-DP/22 Son: of Staff, UDA (7)
A Re Re Re Re	(8,			
Buker				
AER AER-2 MR	(5)			
RS EL AC	(2)		- ·	
ONR				
10C 461	(3) (2)			
	¢			~
		-		
	••••			
17,	+			,

OFERATIONS EVALUATION DECUP STUDY NO. 430

ADDENDUN TO GES STUDY NO. 368 . . . /

COMPUTATION OF PROBABILITY OF VISUAL DETECTION IN AIR INTERCEPTION.

UNCLASSIFICO

the of Navni police

CMR:454:hT:vtm of 1 August 1907 This publication includes classified information of an operational, rather than technical, nature. It should be made available only to those who are authorized to receive such information.

Reproduction of this document in any form by other than Naval activities is not authorized except by special approval of the Chief of Naval Operations.

CEG Studies summarize the results of current analyses. While they represent the view of CEG at the time of issue, they are for information only, and they do not necessarily reflect the official opinion of the Chief of Naval Operations.

> Prepared by OPERATIONS EVALUATION GROUP Office of the Chief of Naval Operations

> > UNCLASSIFIED

7.6

270 700-

Coll comments

(I.0) 2235-50 21 November 1950

OPERATIONS EVALUATION GROUP STUDY NO. 430

ADDENDUM TO OES STUDY NO. 368

COMPUTATION OF PROBABILITY OF VISUAL DETECTION IN AIR INTERCEPTION

Ref:

(n) CEG Study No. 358 "Visual Detection in Air Interception" Conf 24 Nov 1948

ABSTRACT

This addendum is an extension of work previously presented in reference (a), and is to be used in conjunction with the theory contained therein. It presents a method and associated working graphs which enable one to calculate the probability of visual detection of a target aircraft by an airborne observer, under daylight conditions of illumination, for a wide range of the parameters involved.

INTRODUCTION

In reference (a) a theory of visual detection of target aircraft by an airborne observer under daylight conditions of illumination was developed. In addition, a method was presented for computing the probability of visually detecting the target by the time the observer had closed on a collision course to any given range. Working graphs obtained by this method were presented and were applicable in a limited number of specific cases. Since the publication of reference (a), the computational method has been improved and graphs have been obtained which apply under a much wider variety of operational conditions. This later work is presented in this addendum; the theory and assumptions on which it is based are presented in detail in reference (a).

UNCLASSIFIED

Reclassification outhorized by Chief of Naval Research letter OKB:454:RT:vbm of 1 August 1957

CONFILEDENITUR

CONFECTATION

12010235-07 1 1000-000 1350

In general, the type of problem is as follows:

An interceptor is being vectored by CIC (during daylight) to close within sighting range of an energy borber so that he may then position himself for a firing run. It is desired to determine the probability that he will sight the target at a range which will be great enough to allow this attack maneuver. As discussed in reference (a), this is a function of the relative closing speeds, the apparent size of the target, its brightness relative to the background, the visibility at flight altitudes, and the size of the field scanned by the interceptor pilot.

TERTINOLOGY

More specifically, the desired probability is a function of the following parameters:

 C_0 - intrinsic contrast of the target (?)

" - meteorological visibility (mi.)

R_o - maximum range in absence of haze (mi.)

W - gross weight of target (lbs.)

aspect angle of the target (degrees)

ø .- elevation scanning angle (dogrees)

I - azimuth scanning angle (degrees)

A - presented area of the target (sq. ft.)

R_m - maximum range at which detection is possible, under given conditions (mi.)

v - relative velocity (kts.)

 R_1 - range at which search is begun (mi.)

CONTRACTOR AND

The method of computing these probabilities will be illustrated by working out a specific example. Suppose the enemy is assumed to be a medium bomber weighing approximately 45,000 lbs., unmainted aluminum, and is heading due north at a speed of 400 knots. The interceptor is on a sollision course, 135° true heading, travelling at 500 knots, and the pilot is scanning 20° on either side of the expected position of the target and 3° above and below the expected relative altitude (i.e., $\bigcirc = 20^{\circ}, \neq = 3^{\circ}$). The meteorelogical visibility at flight altitude is about 20 miles. V = 20 mi.). The pilot scans in a regular and methodical fashion from the time search begins until be sincts the target. The computation of detection procedulities will be illustrated first for the case in which the pilot begins his search while still outside visual range of the target, (i.e., $R_1 \ge R_n$), and secondly, for the case in which search is not begun until the pilot is within visual range (i.e., $R_1 \le R_n$).

The probability of having detected the target by range R if search was begun at range R_1 is given by the equation

$$P(R) = 1 - e^{-\frac{R_c}{V}[I'R]} - I(R_1)],$$

where I(R) is a quantity obtained graphically (from Figure A2) and is a function of the parameters (1), β , C_0 , and $\frac{R_0}{V}$. If search is begun at or beyond the maximum possible detection range, i.e., $R_1 \ge R_m$, then $I(R_1) = 0$ and the probability can be written as

$$P(R) = 1 - e^{-\frac{R}{V}} I(R)$$

In altern mare, the computation would promeed as

11 The target and interpenter courses are plotted in a measurement board, the relative mation vector inawn, and the aspect endle and relative speed measured directly for Figure 111. For the siven conditions, the samest angle of is found to be 42.5°, and the relative speed v to be

1. 1. 100



(2) In reference (a), the intrinsic contrast, C_0 of unpainted aluminum is given as 27%. For the accuracy desired, it will be sufficient to use $C_0 = 30\%$ and avoid interpolation for C_0 .

Using the nomograph, Figure Al, and entering the known values $C_0 = 30\%$ and W = 45,000 lbs., one finds that the corresponding value of R_{00} (maximum range for tow aspect) is 15.0 miles, and that for aspect angle $\propto = 82.5^{\circ}$, the value of R_{00} is 24.0 miles. (R_{00} will now be referred to simply as R_0).

(3) Thus, $R_0/V = 24/20 = 1.2$; $R_0/v = 24/356 = .0674$.

(4) In Figure A2, choose the graph corresponding to the parameters $\textcircled{1}{10}$ = 20°; p = 3°; C₀ = 30%.

CO 'IFIDENTIAL

می میں در میں در ا

(6) When search is berun outside visual range of the target, it is necessary to determine the value of P_{1} , the mange at which detection first becomes possible. Tis can be obtained from Firme Ad, since R_{1}, R_{1} is the value of R_{2}, n which I = 0. The values of P_{2}, R_{2} for the $R_{2}/V = 1.0$ and $R_{2}/V = 1.5$ curves can be read directly from the araph, and are respectively, $P_{2}/R_{2} = .43$ and $P_{2}/R_{2} = .15$. "sing linear interpolation (sufficient for the accuracy destred in this problem) the value of P_{2}, R_{3} for $R_{3}/V = 1.2$ is found to be .40. Hence $R_{1} = R_{3}(\frac{R_{3}}{R_{3}}) = 24/(.47) = 3.3 miles.$

(7) It is now desired to find values of the detection probability, P(R), for several values of R/R_5 within the range $.05 \le R/R_5 \le .40$ so that a graph of F(R) vs. R can be drawn. For any particular value of R/R_5 , say. $R/R_5 = .25$, the corresponding probability is found as follows:

- (a) I(R) is found by using linear interpolation. When $R/R_0 = .25$, the values of I(R) for $R_0/V = 1.0$ and $R_0/V = 1.5$ as read from the graph are respectively I = 14.5 and I = 5.0 (Note: The ordinate of Figure A2 is I + 10; .'. subtract 10 from the ordinate to read I). Therefore, for $R_0/V = 1.2$, one obtains I = 14.5 - .4(14.5-5.0) = 10.7.
- (b) $\frac{R_{c}}{1}$ I(R) = .0674 (10.7) = .72
- (c) $\cdot \cdot \cdot P(R) = 1 e^{-.72} = .51$
- (d) The absolute range is $R_0(R/R_0) = 24 \times .25 = 6 \text{ mi.}$

	* *	4 						
n an				a di serie d	48 - 1 - 1 - 1 - 1 			
	1				-			
terre a series a serie La series a s	open sector in the providence of the sector of the	l de service de la com a completencie de la completencie d	and show a latter or any state or the termine strength	. L 				
یند. میں ک	-							
• • •								
	• • • •							

A start of the second of the s

If the stifut issues being us viewels were subling the time offer a surparied visual range of the terret, the entry, with the deputer will be demew at related. To illustrate: auround div and the interient r we use a cullered lies of the in the viewel deputer will be an all set to a range of theirs, all effer for the being weld constant.

Steps 1-8 of the computation still apply.

The proce of R/R, is now restricted to .15% R.R.S.S.S. since P = 1 when R/R_M.US (i.e. R#6 mi.) Since R.M.M. L^2R_2 has to be subtracted from all the values of 1(2). I P.) is the value of I for R.R. # .05 and as previously been found to be 12.7.

A craph of P(R) vs. P is then obtained by calculating $P(R) = 1 - e^{-\frac{1}{2}n} [\Gamma(R) - 10.7]$ for several values of R_1R_2 within the above range. Steps in the calculation are tobulated below. $R/R_2 = .000$ was included to not a value of P between 0 and .5.

Comments Exercise







TO:FIDENTIAL

CONTRACTAL

R, R,	.25	.225		.15	.10	05
I(R)	10.7	15.4	24	54	114	240
$I(R) = I(R_1)$	0	5.7	13	43	103	553
$\frac{R_0}{N} I(R) - I(R_1)$	0	.38	.88	2.20	6.3	15
P(R)	c	.32	.50	.34	1.0	1.0
R	6.0	5.4	4.3	3.6	2.4	1.2

A States States the

P(R) vs. R for this case is shown in (b) Figure 2. It shows, for example, that a probability of detection of .75 is reached at a range of 4.4 mi. when search is begun at 6 mi.

Submitted to the Director:

Marcuse

E. MARCUSE Mathematical Services Section Operations Evaluation Group

Approved by: the

E. S. LAMAR Deputy Director Operations Evaluation Group

APPENTIX A

CALCULATION OF FIGURES AL AND AS

Since the probability of detection P is dependent on the value of R₀, the maximum range in the absence of haze, our first problem is to determine R₁ as a function of given parameters. If the presented area of the target, A, is known, use can be made of the relation

(1) $R_0 = .1655 \sqrt{C_0} - 1.565$) A, which is presented in nomographic form in Figure 8 of reference (a). However, the area is soldom riven in aircraft specifications, so that it is desirable to determine R_0 as

a function of gross weight of target. In reference (a), the assumption that for a given aspect, square root of presented area is proportional to cube root of gross weight, was tested for a variety of aircraft, and appeared to be a sufficiently accurate assumption for purposes of computation. (See Figure 7, reference (a)). For how aspect, this approximation is given by

(2) $\Lambda^{\frac{1}{2}} = .4793 \text{ w}^{1/3}$.

Substitution of (8) in (7) will give us the maximum range at bow aspect, R_{00} , in terms of gross weight and intrinsic contrast, namely,

(3)
$$R_{00} = .0793 \sqrt{C_0} - 1.565 \text{ m}^{1/3}$$

The effect of target aspect on the maximum range is defined in reference (a) by the relationship

(4) $R_{oct} = R_{oo} \sqrt{\cos \alpha + 2.4 \sin \alpha}$, where R_{oct} is the value of R_o for aspect angle α .

The nomograph, Figure Al, combines equations (3) and (4) and thus enables us to solve for R_0 (= R_{000}), given C_0 , W, and ∞ . This replaces the use of Figures 6 and 8 of reference (a).



(10)2225-50 01 Divember 1950

As derived in reference (a), the probability of visual detection of a target by an interceptor on a collision course with the target, which has been searching from range R_1 to R_2 , is given by

(5)
$$P(R_1, R_2) = 1 - e$$

(6) $I(R_1, R_2) = \int_{R_2/R_0}^{R_1/R_0} -2.21(10)^3 \ln(1 - g) d(R/R_0),$

(7)
$$r_{5} = \frac{\theta^{2}}{[C_{1} \circ] [2 + \theta]}$$
, and

(8)
$$e = \frac{-1.75 + \sqrt{3.0625 - 4.936 C_0(C_0 - 1.565) e^{-3.44R/V}(R/R_0)^2}}{2.498 (C_0 - 1.565) (R/R_0)^2}$$

The detection lobe in dimensionless form is described by Cvs. \mathbb{R}/\mathbb{R}_0 , Θ being the polar angle. The probability of detection in one glimpse is g. \mathbb{R}_m and \mathbb{R}_L are solutions of the transendental equations obtained by setting $\Theta = .8^\circ$, 90° respectively in the equation of the detection lobe (which applies only between these values). These equations are respectively,

(10)
$$\left(\frac{R_{\rm T}}{R_{\rm o}}\right)^2 = \frac{C_{\rm o}e^{-(3.44R_{\rm o}/V)R_{\rm T}/R_{\rm o}-1.565}}{C_{\rm o}-1.565}$$
 and
(10) $\left(\frac{R_{\rm L}}{R_{\rm o}}\right)^2 = \frac{C_{\rm o}e^{-(3.44R_{\rm o}/V)R_{\rm L}/R_{\rm o}}-16.602}{112.4 (C_{\rm o}-1.565)}$

The integral I $(R_m R)$ was computed for a set of values of the parameters $C_0, R_0/V$, H, and ϕ . For $R_1 < R_m$, it is a simple matter to obtain I' R_1, R) by using the relation

CONFIDENTIAL

92

CAPPEL ENTIAL

(10)0205-00 01 Jober 1000

(11) $I(R_1,R) = I(R_n,R) - I(R_n,R_1)$

The values of the integral I were obtained in the following way:

1) For each combination of the parameters R_p/Y and C_0 , the transcendental equations (3) and (10) were solved, using the Newton-Raphson method of successive approximations, to determine the values of R_m/R_0 and R_L/R_0 .

2) For each case, the range band $R_L/R_0 \le R_m/R_0$ was divided into ten equal intervals, the last three of these being subdivided in two.

3) For each set of 13 values of R/R_0 obtained in this way, corresponding values of 9 were computed, using equation (3).

4) For every combination of values of (1) and \$\vec{\phi}\$, using the values of (2) computed above, 3 was computed, using equation (7).

5) For each value of g, -ln(l-g) was obtained.

6) Integration was done numerically, using Simpson's rule.

7) Multiplication by an appropriate constant was performed to obtain I.

(Steps 4,5,6, and 7 were done on IBM equipment)

8) Graphs were plotted on semi-log paper of I + 10 vs. R/R_o , each page containing one combination of the parameters C_o , \bigoplus , and ϕ , and the complete range of R_o/V .

Note: I + 10 was chosen as the ordinate rather than I in order that the whole range of values could be included on the semi-log scale.

Contents:

(I) Figure Al, page 10: Some much converting the parameters C_0 , α , R_{00} , $\alpha \in R_{000}$. To secure the determining the value of R_0 corresponding to given values of C_0 , α , and ∞ . Corresponding values of W, C_0 , and R_{00} are colinear; likewise, corresponding values of values of ∞ , R_{00} , and R_{000} .

(II) Figure AD, pages 15 to 89: Traphs to be used in determining the value of the internal I, used in equation (5) for computing the probability of visual detection of a single target by an interceptor on a collision course. These prophs are given for the following range of parameter values:

- (i) Azimuth scan angles N: 10°, 00°, 30°, 45°, 00°
- (11) Elevation scan angles: 0^2 , 3^2 , 5^2
- (iii) Intrinsic contrast of target, C₀: 1),20,30, 50, 100%
 - (1v) R₀/V: 0, .1,.2,.4,.6,.8,1.0,1.5,2.0

The limits of integration are from the variable lower limit R/R_0 to the fixed upper limit R_m/R_0 . The ordinate plotted is I + 10 in order to include the complete range of I on the logarithmic scale.

> 13 COMPT DENTI AL

مهار محمد در در ماند و بروم روم داری و ۲ مرد از ماند از ماند از م



.



-

















.





đ

4

f

•



.



4

¢





· ·



 $\langle q \rangle$

.




. .

.



I+10





-







.

.





H.











-- *





- -



-













ŧ























.








ŧ

+

(

ŧ

4

f

ŧ

.







•

......



•



ŝ





L













¢

¢





.



-









.....