REPORT ON ONRCCONFERENCE ON DOLPHIN BEHAVIOR AND COGNITION: COMPARATIVE A. (U) HUBBS-SEA WORLD RESEARCH INST SAN DIEGO CA R BUHR ET AL. NOV 83 HSWRI/TR-83-162 UNCLASSIFIED N00014-83-G-0011 F/G 8/1
REPORT ON ONR CONFERENCE ON "DOLPHIN BEHAVIOR AND COGNITION: COMPARATIVE AND ECOLOGICAL ASPECTS"

HUBBS-SEA WORLD RESEARCH INSTITUTE
SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA 92109: July 6-9, 1983

Prepared by:
Robert Buhr and William E. Evans
REPORT ON ONR CONFERENCE ON
"DOLPHIN BEHAVIOR AND COGNITION: COMPARATIVE AND ECOLOGICAL ASPECTS"

HUBBS-SEA WORLD RESEARCH INSTITUTE

SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA 92109
July 6 - 9, 1983

Final Report
Office of Naval Research
Contract No. N00014-83-G-0011

Prepared by:

Robert Buhr
Department of Linguistics
Brown University
Providence, Rhode Island 02912

and

William E. Evans
Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute
1700 South Shores Road
San Diego, California 92109

November 1983

This document has been approved for public release and sale; its
distribution is unlimited.
A four-day conference sponsored by the Office of Naval Research on dolphin behavior and cognition was held at Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute in July, 1983. This conference was the result of an earlier three-day workshop, also sponsored by the Office of Naval Research, which was tasked with the planning of the conference. The conference had two principal objectives: (1) to survey the "state-of-the-art" of current research in dolphin behavior, cognition, and communication; and (2) to place the results of past and current research into a broader biological and psychological perspective. The conference was attended by 34 participants, including researchers from such disciplines as marine biology, bioacoustics, comparative psychology, cognitive psychology, the neurosciences, linguistics, ethology, primatology, sociobiology, and dolphin training. A list of conference participants is attached.

A keynote address was given by Donald Griffin on problems involved in defining and discussing animal intelligence and consciousness, the conference was divided into ten general topic areas over a three-day period. These were:

(1) Ecology and Evolution of Dolphin Behavior, moderated by F. G. Wood (NOSC, San Diego), with target papers by Bernd Wursig (Moss Landing Marine Laboratories) and Christine Johnson (California State University, Hayward), and commentaries by Jack Bradbury (U.C. San Diego) and John Eisenberg (Florida State Museum);

(2) The Dolphin Brain, moderated by Theodore Bullock (U.C. San Diego), with target papers by Peter Morgane (Worcester Foundation for
Experimental Biology) and Sam Ridgway (NOSC, San Diego), and a commentary by Helen Neville (Salk Institute);

(3) Defining the Perceptual World of Dolphins, moderated by Robert Buhr (Brown University), with a target paper by Harry Jerison (UCLA) and a commentary by Karl Pribram (Stanford University);

(4) Sensory Processing in Dolphins, moderated by William Evans (HSWRI), with target papers by Paul Nachtigall (NOSC, Hawaii) and C. Scott Johnson (NOSC, San Diego), and commentaries by Theodore Bullock and Sam Ridgway;

(5) Communication Processes in Comparative Perspective, moderated by Kenneth Norris (U.C. Santa Cruz), with target papers by William Evans and W. John Smith (University of Pennsylvania), and commentaries by Jeanette Thomas (HSWRI) and Bernd Wursig;

(6) A Panel Discussion on Dolphin Training, with the following as discussants: Bruce Stephens (Sea World, San Diego), Karen Pryor (Rutgers University), Ronald Schusterman (California State University, Hayward); Randy Brill (Brookfield Zoo, Chicago), David Butcher (Sea World, Florida), and Sue Savage-Rumbaugh (Yerkes Primate Research Center);

(7) Dolphin Play and Mimicry, moderated by Paul Nachtigall, with target papers by Douglas Richards (University of Hawaii) and Robert Buhr, and commentaries by Kenneth Norris and Emil Menzel (SUNY, Stony Brook);

(8) Dolphin Cognitive Characteristics in Comparative Perspective, moderated by Louis Herman (University of Hawaii), with target papers by James Wolz (University of Hawaii) and Duane Rumbaugh (Georgia State University), and commentaries by Ronald Schusterman and Thomas Bever (Columbia University);
(9) Language Learning by Dolphins, moderated by Ronald Schusterman, with target papers by Louis Herman and Sue Savage-Rumbaugh, and commentaries by Irene Pepperberg (Purdue University) and Robert Buhr; and

(10) Defining Mammalian Intelligence, moderated by Harry Jerison, with target papers by Emil Menzel and Earl Hunt (University of Washington), and commentaries by William Mason (U.C. Davis) and Donald Griffin (Rockefeller University).

The general consensus of the participants of the conference was that while there are many areas of dolphin behavior and cognition about which little is known, there are certain areas where cross-mammalian comparisons are possible. In the areas of foraging strategies and patterns of social organization, it is becoming clear that dolphin species conform to general mammalian patterns. Moreover, it appears as if further study of types of social interaction in different dolphin species may bear on several important socio-biological questions, including appreciations of cost-benefit analysis to behavior.

Recent research on morphology and neurophysiology of the dolphin brain has yielded more detailed information with which to make cross-mammalian comparisons. In particular, while it now appears that in some ways the dolphin brain is "undeveloped" as compared to primate brains, there are nonetheless certain neurophysiological similarities (as evidenced by evoked-potential research) to humans which bear further investigation.

In addition to state-of-art presentations on sensory processing in dolphins, there was considerable interesting speculation by Professors Jerison and Pribram about the nature of the perceptual world of the dolphin. Jerison broached the possibility that the dolphin's perceptual world may be a more social, communal world than that available to terrestrial mammals. This discussion led into several sessions on cognitive processing
in dolphins, including results of current research on learning, memory, and attention in comparative perspective, and discussion of the implications of vocal and behavioral mimicry and play for assessment of cognitive capacities.

Of special interest in this regard was the panel discussion on training, which included discussion of methodologies used in marine mammal training in a comparative perspective, particularly in comparison with experimental methodologies used in primate research. This panel thus represented the first attempt to put human-dolphin training interactions into a broader framework of formalized inter-species interactions.

The papers in communication processes and dolphin language-learning research were also placed in a comparative perspective, with specific reference to primates and birds. As in other areas, it is now becoming clear that there is enough emerging dolphin data to allow cross-specific comparisons of signalling processes and their underlying cognitive foundation. In particular, there was considerable discussion on the value of the notion of grammar as a device for cross-species analysis of both behavior and cognitive capacities.

The conference closed with general discussion on the biological nature of intelligence. There was general agreement that as amorphous as this concept is, it does have some empirical value, since researchers are once again attempting to formulate a conceptual vocabulary for defining what it means to say that an animal is intelligent.

The conference was significant in several respects. First, it provided a forum for presentation of the most recent research in the areas of dolphin brain research, sensory processing, and cognitive and behavioral research. Second, it created a broad biological framework for integrating this information on an ongoing basis during the conference. Third, it represented the first systematic attempt to integrate research on dolphins
with that on primates and other vertebrates. On all three counts, the conference was successful.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Topic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thomas Bever</td>
<td>Department of Psychology, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027</td>
<td>Cognition and language and everything in between</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann E. Bowles</td>
<td>Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute, San Diego, CA 92109</td>
<td>Avian communication, auditory perception, sound production</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jack Bradbury</td>
<td>Department of Biology, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, CA 92093</td>
<td>Socio-ecology in vertebrates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary Bradshaw</td>
<td>Kewalo Basin Marine, University of Hawaii, Honolulu, HI 96814</td>
<td>Training and sensory processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Randy Brill</td>
<td>Brookfield Zoo, Brookfield, IL 60513</td>
<td>Training and sensory processes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Buhr</td>
<td>Department of Linguistics, Brown University, Providence, RI 02912</td>
<td>Animal communication and cognition; neurolinguistics and neuropsychology biology of language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theodore Bullock</td>
<td>Department of Neurosciences, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, CA 92093</td>
<td>Comparative neurology; physiology of central sensory processing; invertebrates, fish, and all vertebrate classes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
David Butcher  
Department of Animal Behavior  
Sea World, Inc.  
7007 Sea World Drive  
Orlando, FL 32809  
Environmental intrinsic motivation

John Eisenberg  
Florida State Musuem  
University of Florida  
Gainesville, FL 32611  
Animal communication, socio-ecology

William Evans  
Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute  
1700 South Shores Road  
San Diego, CA 92109  
Animal behavior/bioacoustics/ functional morphology

Lisa Ferm (observer)  
Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute  
1700 South Shores Road  
San Diego, CA 92109  

Sheldon R. Fisher (observer)  
Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute  
1700 South Shores Road  
San Diego, CA 92109  
Bioacoustics, communication

Kimberley Goodrich (observer)  
Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute  
1700 South Shores Road  
San Diego, CA 92109  
Cetacean behavior and communication

Donald R. Griffin  
The Rockefeller University  
1230 York Avenue  
New York, NY 10021  
Cognitive ethology

Henry Halff (observer)  
Personnel and Training  
Research Program  
Code 442 PT  
Arlington, VA 22212
Louis Herman  
Department of Psychology  
University of Hawaii  
2430 Campus Road  
Honolulu, HI 96822  
and  
Kewalo Basin Marine Mammal Laboratory  
University of Hawaii  
1129 Ala Moana  
Honolulu, HI 96822

Earl Hunt  
Department of Psychology  
University of Washington  
Seattle, WA 98195

Harry Jerison  
Department of Psychiatry  
University of California  
760 Westwood Plaza  
Los Angeles, CA 90024

Christine Johnson  
Department of Psychology  
California State University  
Hayward, CA 94542

C. Scott Johnson  
Naval Ocean Systems Center  
Code 5102  
San Diego, CA 92152

John Lilly (observer)  
Human/Dolphin Foundation  
P.O. Box 4172  
Malibu, CA 90265

William Mason  
Department of Psychology  
University of California  
Davis, CA 95616

Emil Menzel  
Department of Psychology  
State University of New York  
Stony Brook, NY 11794

---

Cetacean behavior; animal cognition and communication

Human cognition - formal models of thought

Evolutionary biology of brain and cognitive behavior

Dolphin social behavior, communication, cognition

Dolphin hearing and bioacoustics

Brain, mind, communication, cognition central processing, mental telepathy  
Physiology, neurophysiology, self analysis

Primate social behavior

Primate behavior
Peter Morgane  
Worcester Foundation for Experimental Biology  
222 Maple Avenue  
Shrewsbury, MA 01545

Comparative and evolutionary anatomy of brain CNS plasticity - neuronal organization of cortex

Paul Nachtigall  
Naval Ocean Systems Center  
P.O. Box 997  
Kailua, HI 96734

Learning and sensory processes of marine mammals

Helen Neville  
The Salk Institute  
P.O. Box 85800  
San Diego, CA 92138

Human neuropsychology

Kenneth Norris  
Center for Coastal Marine Studies  
University of California  
Santa Cruz, CA 95064

Cetacean behavior

Irene Pepperberg  
Department of Biological Sciences  
Purdue University  
West Lafayette, IN 47907

Interspecies communication; referential vocalizations in the gray parrot

Karl Pribram  
Department of Psychology  
Stanford University  
Stanford, CA 94305

Neuropsychology: Brain/behavior relationships

Karen Pryor  
44508 1st Street, SE  
North Bend, WA 98045

Learning and social behavior in marine mammals

Douglas Richards  
Department of Psychology  
University of Hawaii  
2430 Campus Road  
Honolulu, HI 96822

present address:  
Booz-Allen & Hamilton  
4330 East West Highway  
Bethesda, MD 20814

Cetacean cognition and communication acoustic communication
Sam H. Ridgway
Naval Ocean Systems Center
Code 5142
San Diego, CA 92152

Duane Rumbaugh
Department of Psychology
Georgia State University
Atlanta, GA 30303

Sue Savage-Rumbaugh
Yerkes Regional Primate Research Center
Emory University
Atlanta, GA 30322

Ronald Schusterman
Department of Psychology
California State University
Hayward, CA 94542

W. John Smith
Department of Biology
University of Pennsylvania
Philadelphia, PA 19104

Bruce Stephens
Department of Animal Behavior
Sea World, Inc.
1720 South Shores Road
San Diego, CA 92109

Jeanette Thomas
Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute
1700 South Shores Road
San Diego, CA 92109

James Wolz
Department of Psychology
University of Hawaii
2430 Campus Road
Honolulu, HI 96822
and
Kewalo Basin Marine Mammal Lab
University of Hawaii
1129 Ala Moana
Honolulu, HI 96814

Cetacean physiology, brains, sounds
Comparative psychology, Primate learning and cognition, Requisites to first language skills
Animal cognition, Human and animal linguistic communication
Animal cognition, Marine Mammal communication, Pinniped behavior
Communication and all other aspects of social behavior; all vertebrate spp.
Dolphin behavior
Vocal communication in marine mammals
Comparative psychology, cetacean behavior, animal learning and memo
Forrest G. Wood  
Naval Ocean Systems Center  
Code 51  
San Diego, CA 92152  

Cetacean evolution, behavior

Dr. David Woods (observer)  
Veterans Admin. Medical Ctr.  
(612/127)  
150 Muir Road  
Martinez, CA 94553  

Human neuropsychology,  
evoked potentials

Donald Woodward (observer)  
Physiology and Neurobiology  
Research Program  
Code 441 NP  
Office of Naval Research  
Arlington, VA 22217

Bernd Wursig  
Moss Landing Marine Landing  
Moss Landing, CA 95039  

Cetacean behavior and  
social organization
Schedule for Conference on
"Dolphin Behavior and Cognition: Evolutionary and Ecological Aspects"
Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute
San Diego, CA 92109
July 6-9, 1983

Wednesday
July 6

5:30-7:30 pm  Hosted wine and cheese party orientation for conference participants
   - (Atlantis restaurant patio)

Thursday
July 7

8:00 am  Welcoming Address: William Evans (HWSRI)
         Keynote Address: Donald Griffin (Rockefeller University)
         "Defining the Animal Mind"

9:00  Ecology and Evolution of Dolphin Behavior
      Moderator: F. G. Wood (NOSC, San Diego)
      Target papers:

9:05  Bernd Wursig (UC Santa Cruz)
      Delphinid Foraging Strategies

9:30  Kenneth Norris (UC Santa Cruz)
      Patterns of Social Organization and Social Behavior
      Commentaries:

9:35  Jack Bradbury (UC San Diego)
9:50  John Eisenberg (Florida State Museum, Gainesville)

10:05  Discussion:
10:20  Coffee break
10:30  The Dolphin Brain
      Moderator: Theodore Bullock (UC San Diego)
      Target papers:

10:35  Peter Morgane (Worcester Foundation for Experimental Biology)
      Comparative Anatomy of the Dolphin Brain

11:05  Sam Ridgway (NOSC, San Diego)
      Neurophysiological Studies of the Dolphin Brain
Commentaries:

11:30 Robert Brownell (Smithsonian Institution, Washington)
11:45 Helen Neville (The Salk Institute, La Jolla)
12:00 Discussion
12:15 Lunch break
2:00 pm Defining the Perceptual World
Target paper:
2:00 Harry Jerison (UC Los Angeles)
   Perceptual Worlds in Mammalian Evolution
2:25 Commentator:
   Karl Pribram (Stanford University)
2:40 Discussion
3:00 Coffee break
3:15 Sensory Processing in Delphinids
   Moderator: W. E. Evans (HSWRI)
   Target papers:
3:20 Paul Nachtigall (NOSC, Hawaii)
   Mechanisms of Mechanical, Visual and Tactile Processing
3:45 C. Scott Johnson (NOSC, San Diego)
   Audition and Echolocation
Commentaries:
4:10 Theodore Bullock (UC, San Diego)
4:25 Sam Ridgway (NOSC)
4:40 Discussion
5:00 Adjourn
8:00-10:00 - Informal discussion groups at HSWRI. Topics of the day:
   Ecology and Evolution of Dolphin Behavior, the Dolphin Brain, Defining Perceptual World, Sensory Processing
Discussion
Friday
July 8

8:30 am  Communication Processes in Comparative Perspective
          Moderator: *Kenneth Norris (UC Santa Cruz)

          Target papers:

          8:35  William Evans (HSWRI)
                  The multi-modal communication system of Delphinids

          9:00  Frank Awbrey - Research on the function of singing (calling)
                  in animals

          Commentaries:

          9:25  (to be named)

          9:40  Jeanette Thomas (HSWRI)

          9:55  Discussion

10:15  Coffee break

10:30  Panel Discussion: Dolphin Training and Teaching
          Moderator: Bruce Stevens (Sea World)

          Participants: *Karen Pryor, Ron Schusterman, Randy Brill,
                        Dave Butcher, Sue Savage-Rumbaugh

11:45  Discussion

12:00  Lunch break

2:00 pm  Dolphin Cognitive Capacities in Comparative Perspective
          Moderator: *Paul Nachtigall (NOSC, Hawaii)

          Target papers:

          2:05  Robert Buhr (Brown University and HSWRI)
                  Dolphin Play Behavior and Its Cognitive Implications

          2:30  Douglas Richards (University of Hawaii)
                  Dolphin Vocal Mimicry and Imitation

          Commentaries

          2:55  Roger Gentry (UC Santa Cruz)

          3:10  Jack Bradbury, (William Mason, U.C. Davis alternate)

          3:25  Discussion

*Alternate moderator
Dolphin Cognitive Characteristics in Comparative Perspective (II)
Moderator: Louis Herman (University of Hawaii)

Target papers:

James Woltz (University of Hawaii)
Experimental Assessment of Cognitive Capacities of Dolphins

Duane Rumbaugh (Georgia State University)
Toward a Comparative Framework for Mammalian Learning

Commentaries

Ronald Schusterman (California State University, Hayward)
Earl Hunt (University of Washington)

Discussion

Adjourn

Informal discussion groups on topics discussed during the day.

Saturday
July 9

Language Learning by Dolphins in Comparative Perspective
Moderator: Ronald Schusterman (Cal State, Hayward)

Target papers:

Lou Herman (University of Hawaii)
Dolphin Language Learning: Current Status

Sue Savage-Rumbaugh (Yerkes Primate Laboratory)
Chimpanzee Language Learning: Current Status

Commentaries:

Duane Rumbaugh
Robert Buhr (Brown University and HSWRI)

Discussion

Coffee break

Defining Mammalian Intelligence
Moderator: (Harry Jerison, UC Los Angeles)

Target papers:
10:35  Emil Menzel (SUNY Stony Brook)
      Non-human Intelligence from a Primate Perspective

11:00  Earl Hunt (University of Washington)
      Criteria for Defining Intelligent Behavior

Commentaries:

11:25  William Mason (UC Davis)
11:40  *Donald Giffin (Rockefeller University)
11:55  *Harry Jenson

12:10  Discussion

12:30  Lunch break

2:00-5:00 pm  General overview and adjournment
**REPORT ON ONR CONFERENCE ON "DOLPHIN BEHAVIOR AND COGNITION: COMPARATIVE AND ECOLOGICAL ASPECTS" HUBBS-SEA WORLD RESEARCH INSTITUTE, SAN DIEGO, CA 92109, JULY 6-9, 1983**

**AUTHORS**
Robert Buhr, Brown University
William E. Evans

**PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME AND ADDRESS**
Hubbs-Sea World Research Institute
1700 South Shores Road
San Diego, CA 92109

**DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY OFFICE NAME AND ADDRESS**
N00014
Department of the Navy
Office of Naval Research
Arlington, VA 22217

**REPORT DATE**
November 1983

**NUMBER OF PAGES**
18

**DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT**
Document cleared for public release and sale: distribution unlimited.

**DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT** (of the abstract entered in Block 20, if different from Report)

**SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES**
Proceedings of conference to be printed in 1984-85.

**KEY WORDS**
dolphin behavior, cognition, communication, animal intelligence, comparative behavior, primates

**ABSTRACT**
A four-day conference sponsored by ONR on dolphin behavior and cognition was held July 6-9 in San Diego, California. Thirty-four scientists representing the disciplines of neurophysiology, animal behavior, bioacoustics, sociobiology and cognitive ethology participated. The objectives of the conference were to 1) survey the current research on dolphin behavior, cognition and communication and 2) place the results of past and
20. (continued)

Current research into a broader biological and psychological perspective. The conference was divided into 10 sections each with two target papers and two commentaries addressing the aforementioned objectives.